

REPORT OF THE COMMISSION
ON THE
CIVIL SERVICE OF THE GOLD COAST
1950 - 51



MESSRS C. F. HODGSON & SON, LTD.
PRINTING WORKS
PAKENHAM STREET
GRAYS INN ROAD
W.C.1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I.—INTRODUCTORY

Paragraphs

- 1- 7 Terms of reference, definitions and interpretations.
- 8- 13 Procedure and Programme.
- 14- 17 Acknowledgments.

CHAPTER II.—MACHINERY OF GOVERNMENT

Paragraphs

- 18 Co-ordination and prevention of overlapping.
- 19- 20 Position of Secretaries to Ministries and Heads of Departments.
- 21- 26 Ministry of Defence and External Affairs and the Office of the Chief Secretary.
- 27- 29 Post of Chief Establishments Officer.
- 30- 33 Establishment work in Ministries.
- 34- 38 Decentralisation at Headquarters.
- 39- 42 Decentralisation from Headquarters to Regions.
- 43 Exercise of devolved powers.
- 44- 51 Appeals.

CHAPTER III.—PUBLIC BOARDS AND CORPORATIONS

Paragraphs

- 52 Present position.
- 53- 54 Railways and Electricity.
- 55 Housing.
- 56 Education.
- 57 Hospitals.
- 58 Water.
- 59 Fisheries.
- 60 Co-operation.
- 61 Film Unit.
- 62 Bulk Purchase.
- 63 Town and Country Planning Board.

CHAPTER IV.—STRUCTURE OF THE CIVIL SERVICE

Paragraphs

- 64 General.
- 65- 72 Africanization.
- 73 Existing structure.
- 74- 75 United Kingdom system.
- 76- 82 Proposed Gold Coast structure.
- 83- 96 Administrative class.
- 97-115 Executive class.
- 116-120 Professional classes.
- 121-123 Technical classes.
- 124-135 Clerical and sub-clerical classes.
- 136-151 Typist and connected classes.
- 152-164 Semi-skilled and skilled labour, etc., including unestablished staff.
- 165-168 Position of women in the Civil Service.
- 169-173 Unified Colonial Service.

CHAPTER V.—PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Paragraphs

- 174-177 General.
178 Commission Judicial and *not* Executive body.
179-180 Scope and Functions.
181 Relations to Chief Establishment Officer.

CHAPTER VI.—COST OF LIVING

Paragraphs

- 182-184 Cost of Living Indices.
185-191 Cost of Living 1945-1950.
192 Cost of Living—present position.
193-196 Cost of Living—relationship to daily rates of pay.
197-198 Cost of Living—relationship to salaries of established civil servants.
199-201 Cost of Living Committee.
202-203 Introduction of new rates for daily paid and established staff.
204 Summary.

CHAPTER VII.—SALARY STRUCTURE

Paragraphs

- 205 General considerations.
206-207 Existing structure.
208 Territorial limitation of recommendations.
209 Salaries on an indigenous basis.
210 Consolidation and cost of living allowance.
211 Salary ladders.
212-214 Short and long scales.
215-216 Incremental credit.
217 Increments during probation.
218 Salaries of women officers.
219 Revision of present rates.
220-223 Overseas Pay.
224-227 Contract appointments.
228-229 Superscale Posts.
230-233 Special executive and technical posts and expatriate recruitment.
234 Teachers.
235 Junior Technical grades.
236 Clerical service.
237-239 Unskilled labour.
240-241 Regrading of subordinate staff.
242 Merit bonus should be allowed for skilled and semi-skilled labour.

CHAPTER VIII.—MISCELLANEOUS CONDITIONS OF SERVICE

Paragraphs

- HOUSING
243-244 Provision of houses for civil servants.
245-249 Rent.
250 Allocation of Government houses.
251-252 Police quarters and rent allowances.

- 253 Transit camps for Junior staff.
 254 Transit quarters for Senior staff.
 255 General housing shortage.
- LEAVE AND PASSAGES
- 256 General observations.
 257-258 African leave rates.
 259 Expatriate leave rates.
 260 Transport on leave.
 261-262 Length of tour.
 263 Local leave.
 264 Casual leave.
 265 Sick leave.
 266-270 Children's passages.
 271-274 Leave and other provisions for maternity.
- RETIRING BENEFITS
- 275-276 Pensions Ordinance.
 277 Pensions related to cost of living.
 278 Delays in payment of retiring awards.
 279 Retiring age, etc., applicable to non-pensionable employees.
 280 Widows and Orphans Pensions Scheme.
- ALLOWANCES
- 281-282 General Observations.
 283 Allowances for additional work, etc.—principles.
 284 Acting allowances.
 285 Reimbursement allowances—principles.
 286-289 Transport allowances.
 290 Use of Government Transport.
 291 Drivers' allowances.
 292 Travelling allowances.
 293 Commuted field allowances.
 294 General Order 457.
 295 Allowances on transfer.
 296 Allowance on temporary transfer.
 297 Table or entertainment allowance.
 298 Outfit allowance.
 299 Uniform allowance.
 300 Tools allowance.
 301-306 Northern Territories allowance.
- MISCELLANEOUS ALLOWANCES
- 307 General principles.
- MINOR CONDITIONS OF SERVICE
- 308 General observations.
 309 Canteens and Restrooms.
 310 Storage accommodation.
 311 Uniforms.

CHAPTER IX.—CONVERSION TO REVISED CONDITIONS

Paragraphs

- 312 Conversion Tables.
313 Conversion Principles.
314 Option of serving officers.
315–316 Operative date of new conditions.
317 Daily-rated employees.

✓
CHAPTER X.—RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING

Paragraphs

RECRUITMENT

- 318–322 Expatriate recruitment—present position.
323–326 Steps to facilitate expatriate recruitment.
327–335 African recruitment, standards, technical education, and organisation of recruitment.
336 Director of Recruitment and Training.

TRAINING

- 337–341 Need for Training facilities.
342 Initial training.
343 Clerical and sub-clerical.
344 Typists.
345 Graduates.
346–348 Technical and sub-technical.
349–351 Pay during initial training.
352 Probation and initial training.
353 Post-entry training.
354 External training.
355 Post-entry training as a step to promotion.
356–358 Urgent need for improvised training facilities.

✓
CHAPTER XI.—EFFICIENCY

Paragraphs

- 359 General.
360–362 Co-ordination of planning.
363–365 Planning of supplies.
366–373 Organisation and Methods.
374–387 Discipline.
388–389 Supervision.
390–395 Confidential Reports.
396–398 Promotion.
399–403 Transfers and closed services.
404–407 Hours of work.
408–409 Overtime.
410–411 Checking of Stores.
412–416 General Orders and manuals of procedure.
417–418 Correspondence.

CHAPTER XII.—MACHINERY FOR STAFF CONSULTATIONS

Paragraphs

- 419-421 Whitley Council functions.
- ✓ 422 Composition of the Civil Service Council of the Gold Coast.
- 423 Departmental Councils.
- 424-426 Regional General Councils.
- 427 Arbitration.
- 428-432 Trade Unions and Staff Associations.
- 433-436 Recognition of Government Staff Associations.
- 437-438 Summary.

CHAPTER XIII.—PRIVATE PRACTICE

Paragraphs

- 439-440 Definition.
- 441-443 History of Private Practice.
- 444 Sir Walter Harragin's Recommendations.
- 445 Sir Sydney Phillipson's Enquiry and Report.
- 446-447 Nigerian Government's conclusions on Phillipson Report.
- 448 Present position in Nigeria.
- 449 Injection Practice and Dentists.
- 450-452 Position in Gold Coast.
- 453 Abolition accepted in principle.
- 454-455 Difficulties and dangers of abolition.
- 456-459 Recommendations.
- 460 Supplies of Drugs and Equipment.

CHAPTER XIV.—MISCELLANEOUS DEPARTMENTS

Paragraphs

- 461 General.
- 462 Rates of pay for classes common to Government Departments.
- ✓ 463-468 Qualifications of professional Engineers.
- 469 Draughtsmen and Surveyors.
- 470-478 Apprentices, Artisans and their supervising grades.
- 479-486 Skilled and semi-skilled Labour.
- 487 Staff of Executive Council.
- 488-489 Staff of Speaker's Office.
- 490-496 Audit Department.
- 497 Staff of Public Service Commission.
- 498-500 Staff of Supreme Court (other than judicature).
- 501 Ministry of Defence and External Affairs.
- 502 Regional (now Political) Administration.
- 503-508 Police Department.
- 509-513 Printing Department.
- 514-519 Public Relations Department.
- 520 Ministry of Justice and Legal Officers.
- 521-523 Crown Counsel.
- 524-525 Magistrates.

CHAPTER XIV.—MISCELLANEOUS DEPARTMENTS—*continued*

Paragraphs

- 526–527 Assistant Commissioners of Lands.
 528 Solicitor, Income Tax Department.
 529 Registrar General and Chief Registrar.
 530 Registrar General's Department.
 531 Ministry of Finance (including Organisation and Methods Branch), Statistical Branch and Bulk Purchase Branch).
 532 Accountant General's Department.
 533 Customs and Excise Department.
 534 Income Tax Department.
 535 Ministry of Agriculture and Natural Resources.
 536–544 Agriculture Department.
 545–549 Animal Health Department.
 550 Cocoa Rehabilitation Department.
 551–552 Fisheries Department.
 553–556 Forestry Department.
 557 Game Department.
 558 Department of Rural Water Development.
 559 Tsetse Control Department.
 560 Ministry of Commerce and Industries.
 561–567 Commerce and Industry Department.
 568–569 Geological Survey Department.
 570–572 Mines Department.
 573 Ministry of Communications and Works.
 574–578 Civil Aviation Department.
 579–582 Electricity Department.
 583–584 Meteorological Department.
 585–607 Posts and Telegraphs Department.
 608–615 Public Works Department.
 616 Transport Department.
 617 Ministry of Education and Social Welfare.
 618 Co-operation Department.
 619–623 Education Department. ✓
 624–627 Prisons Department.
 628 Social Welfare Department.
 629 Ministry of Health and Labour.
 630–632 Labour Department.
 633–648 Medical Department.
 649 Ministry of Local Government.
 650–652 Lands Department.
 653–654 Survey Department.
 655–656 Ministry of Town and Country Planning and Housing.
 657 Housing Department.
 658 Ministry of Development.
 659–677 Gold Coast Railway and Harbour Administration.

Paragraphs
678–682 General.

APPENDICES

- I. Itinerary of the Commission's tour of the Colony, Ashanti and the Northern Territories.
- II. List of witnesses who gave oral evidence.
- III. Statement of written representations received by the Commission.
- IV. Housing Progress Report and Programme for 1951–1952.
- V. Extract from a 'Working Party' Report, dated 7th July, 1949.
- VI. Standards for Machine Operators.
- VII. 'Special entry points.'
- VIII. Rates of Overseas Pay.
- IX. Notes for assistance in assessing the value of industrial posts.
- X. Rental proposals.
- XI. Extracts from the evidence of the Director of Public Works and the Director of Agriculture.
- XII. Paper on 'Improving Public Management' by Mr. J. R. Simpson, C.B., Director Organisation and Methods Division, H.M. Treasury.
- XIII. Copy of Confidential Annual Report, as used in the Colonial Office.
- XIV. Note on Constitutional Position of Whitley Councils.
- XV. Extract from the Report of the Commission on the Private Practice of Medicine and Surgery by Officers of the Department of Medical Services, Nigeria, by Sir Sydney Phillipson, C.M.G.
- XVI. Holmes Report—Extract on Chief Establishment Officers.
- XVII. Salary proposals in detail.

TO THE SECRETARY OF STATE FOR THE COLONIES.

SIR,

We, the undersigned, were appointed by you on the 29th September, 1950, to execute a Commission in the Gold Coast with the following terms of reference :—

“ To investigate and report on changes which, in order to improve efficiency and economy in administration and to secure elimination of waste, are necessary in relation to organisation, staffing and cadre, and operative methods of all Government departments, and to make recommendations ; and further to investigate and report on changes in remuneration of all grades of the Public Service which are necessary to secure more efficient and economic administration, and to make recommendations.”

We have the honour to submit to you our Report.

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTORY

Terms of Reference

1. Our terms of reference seemed to impose on us the task of undertaking a detailed and comprehensive examination of the whole organisation of the machinery of Government in the Gold Coast, and in addition, of fixing rates of remuneration for every grade and class of Public Servant. To carry out effectively an enquiry of this nature would have taken a much longer time than was at our disposal, and we have therefore dealt in detail with those matters only in our terms of reference which appeared to us to be most important and on which we considered our advice would be most helpful.

Definitions

2. For the purpose of our enquiry we have adopted the following definitions :—

- (i) *Organisation*. A structure of the Public Service so designed as to achieve the maximum efficiency by the avoidance of overlap and lack of co-ordination, and to secure the proper classification and grading of functions and staff.
- (ii) *Staffing*. The function of recruiting and training the necessary staff, and maintaining favourable working conditions.
- (iii) *Cadre*. The complements of staff required.
- (iv) *Operative Methods*. The mechanism set up by a department to enable it to carry out its functions.
- (v) *Public Servants*. “ Those servants of the Crown other than holders of political or judicial posts, who are employed in a civil capacity, and whose remuneration is paid wholly and directly out of monies voted by Parliament.”*

Exclusions

3. In accordance with the above definitions we excluded the following from our consideration :—

- (i) The Governor.
- (ii) Unofficial Ministers, Ministerial Secretaries, and unofficial members of the Legislative Assembly.
- (iii) The Chief Justice and Judges of the Supreme Court. (In view of the interchangeability between Magistrates and Crown Counsel in the Gold Coast we decided to include Magistrates within the scope of our investigation.)
- (iv) Institutions and services maintained in conjunction with other Colonies—*e.g.* West African Cacao Research Institute.
- (v) Public Boards and Corporations—*e.g.* The Industrial Development Corporation. (Save as in Chapter III.)

Cadre

4. We have also decided that it is not possible in the time at our disposal to make detailed recommendations on the complements of staff required by each Department. Moreover, even if it were practicable to make such recommendations in our Report, we consider that they would be of little value since adjustments of cadre require to be under constant review by the Head of Department in the light of changes of policy and circumstances, and in consultation with the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office and the Ministry of Finance.

Grading

5. Later in this Report we recommend certain drastic alterations to the existing structure of the Public Service. To give effect to these recommendations will involve a comprehensive reclassification as well as grading of work. By classification we mean the determination of the broad character of the duties attached to posts in the Service, *i.e.* administrative, executive, clerical, sub-clerical, professional, technical, etc. By grading we mean evaluation of various duties within each class. In Chapter IV we classify the various types of work by definition. To a lesser extent we indicate how the grading of work within classes should be determined. The classification of duties must be determined by a rigid and uniform application of the accepted definitions throughout all branches of the Public Service. We have, in this way, classified the more important posts in each Department and we most

* Royal Commission on the Civil Service, 1929–31. (Cmd. 3909.)

strongly recommend that there should be no departure from this classification unless and until the nature of the duties of the posts are so materially changed as to bring them clearly into another class. Subject to certain general principles which we lay down, the grading of work and posts will have to be largely determined by the Heads of Departments in agreement with the Establishments branch and the Ministry of Finance. We give in Chapter XIV some examples of grading, but it is work requiring a detailed and intimate knowledge of the internal organisation of the Department and it did not seem to us worth while to devote too much of the limited time at our disposal to acquiring this knowledge which is presumably already available to Government through its departmental officers.

6. We would not wish to leave the impression that we consider grading and classification of work to be a straight-forward application of general principles in the light of local knowledge. In a reconstruction of the wide-reaching nature proposed it is inevitable that there will be many cases in which both the grading and the classification of posts is doubtful. In some cases it may be possible to rearrange the allocation of duties in order to clarify the class and grade of a post. We have ourselves met cases where an officer's duties involve sub-clerical, clerical, and executive work, and it seems likely that a number of administrative officers in Ministries are employed on work, much of which is executive in character. In such cases the duties should wherever possible be so rearranged as to give a clear preponderance to one class of work. It will not always prove possible to achieve this desideratum and for this reason we consider that the work of grading and classification should not be entrusted to a single officer but that special arrangements should be made to deal with the problem.

7. We have said that grading is largely a matter for Heads of Departments acting in consultation with the Establishments branch and the Ministry of Finance, but it is clear that a special team will have to be appointed to carry out the heavy task of the initial grading necessary for the implementation of the recommendations in our Report. It will not be possible to convert the Service to the new structure and salaries until this work has been done. It is highly specialised work and we are satisfied that the Gold Coast Service could not spare sufficient officers with the requisite knowledge and experience to undertake it as expeditiously as is clearly desirable. We therefore recommend that the United Kingdom Government should be asked to second about four to six officers with the necessary experience and qualifications for a period of about six months to assist generally in the application of the principles in our Report to the Gold Coast Civil Service and in particular to investigate and advise on gradings. These officers should work as a team under a Gold Coast officer of suitable experience and if possible one or two other Gold Coast officers should be attached to the team.

Procedure & Programme 8. The Chairman, Sir David Lidbury, left the United Kingdom on the *M.V. Apapa* on the 2nd November, 1950, and arrived at Takoradi on the 14th November. He was met on arrival by Mr. D. A. Anderson, who had been appointed Secretary to the Commission, and travelled to Accra the same day. Mr. A. R. Macdonald left Uganda by air on the 11th November, 1950, and arrived in Accra on the 13th November. In addition to the Secretary the Gold Coast Government had engaged Mrs. S. W. Cooper as stenographer and office assistant for the Commission. We started work in our offices in the King George V Memorial Hall, Accra, on the 15th November.

9. The appointment of the Commission and the terms of reference had been publicly announced by the Gold Coast Government before our arrival and Civil Servants Associations and Government Department Trade Unions had been invited to submit a statement of their views on the various problems with which we were concerned. On our arrival we announced that we were prepared to accept representations from any civil servant on any subject coming within our terms of reference provided they did not relate to individual claims or grievances.

10. In the meantime the Government of the Gold Coast had taken steps to make available to us certain factual information regarding salaries, establishments, etc., within each Department. Heads of Departments had been instructed to prepare for our information a review of the cadre and operative methods of their Departments, the causes of waste and inefficiency, and the steps which they considered should be taken to effect improvement. In addition, a working party,

composed of officers specially selected for their knowledge and experience had been appointed to make a study of the ground to be covered by the Commission and to formulate preliminary views of some of the more important problems. The information so made available to us was of very great assistance and we are deeply grateful to all the officers concerned.

11. At the start we decided that in order to enable us the better to appreciate the many problems of Government administration and the multiplicity of Government activities in the Gold Coast it would be necessary for us to undertake an extensive programme of touring. Out of a period of approximately five months in the Gold Coast we were on tour in various parts of the Colony, Ashanti, the Northern Territories and Togoland, for about six weeks. During these tours we took the opportunity to see for ourselves as many aspects of Government activities as possible and to have discussions with as many officers in the field, both senior and junior, as we could meet. A statement of our itinerary is to be found at Appendix I.

12. In addition to informal discussions both in Accra and on tour, we had at least one official discussion with every Head of Department; we granted interviews to representatives of both Associations of Civil Servants, and to representatives of their provincial branches where requested, and to representatives of all Government Department Trade Unions who applied; we also granted interviews to a number of individual civil servants or groups of civil servants who applied to give oral evidence on specific points. We can fairly say that we gave a hearing to every officer or group of officers who wished to see us on matters within the scope of our enquiry. In fact, the whole of our time in the Gold Coast was taken up with tours and interviews. A statement of interviews is to be found at Appendix II, and a statement of written evidence received, other than official submissions, is to be found at Appendix III.

13. We sailed from Takoradi together with our Secretary and Mrs. Cooper on the M.V. *Accra* on the 18th April, 1951, arriving in Liverpool on the 30th April. This Report was started on board ship and completed in London in offices kindly placed at our disposal by the Colonial Office.

Acknowledgments

14. We wish to place on record our high appreciation of the assistance we have received throughout our investigations from civil servants of all grades. Our requirements have placed heavy burdens on many officers who were already working under considerable pressure, but they have been met with unflinching readiness and promptitude. We would like to pay special tribute to the work of Mr. D. P. Tripp, who, as our Liaison Officer in the Chief Secretary's Office, rendered very valuable service, and to Mr. A. J. Newall, who was attached to us as Assistant Secretary during the latter half of our investigations. The work of both of these officers greatly facilitated our task. We also wish to express our thanks to Miss P. Thomas, who worked for us as a stenographer with pleasant and cheerful efficiency from January 1951 until our departure from the Gold Coast.

We owe a special debt to Brigadier J. B. B. Wakeford of Messrs. Rendel, Palmer & Tritton, who, as a personal favour and at some inconvenience to himself, placed offices at our disposal in Accra when the Budget Session of the Legislative Assembly necessitated our removal from the King George V Memorial Hall.

15. We have also had occasion to ask for information and opinions from representatives of banks, commercial houses, mines, and other non-government sources. These requests have been met in a spirit of co-operation, for which we are most grateful.

16. Apart from the facilities provided and assistance we have had in our official task, we are deeply indebted to officials and non-officials throughout the Gold Coast who provided us with generous hospitality and many kindnesses.

17. Finally it is in no formal sense that we record our indebtedness to our Secretary Mr. David Anderson and our Assistant Secretary Stenographer Mrs. Doris Cooper.

We cannot express too warmly our admiration and regard for Mr. Anderson. His knowledge of the Gold Coast, its peoples and its conditions is encyclopaedic; his wise judicious counsel and trenchant good sense have been invaluable; his pleasant personality has secured for us easy relations with people of all ranks both African and European; his devotion to duty is

remarkable ; and his ability in drafting is outstanding. In short, without him this Report could not have been written, and we are deeply indebted to him both for his work and his companionship.

We are also under great obligation to Mrs. Cooper, whose untiring energy and great experience in secretarial work have been invaluable. She has not only constructed and kept in good order our many voluminous files of evidence but has somehow succeeded in translating our badly written, muddled manuscript into presentable typescript. In addition, she has been a pleasant addition to our team and by her friendly personality done much to lighten our labours.

MACHINERY OF GOVERNMENT

18. The great change which has recently taken place in the form of Government in the Gold Coast obviously necessitates some fundamental re-designing of the Civil Service machine, and some steps have already been taken to adapt the machine from the service of a highly centralised, bureaucratic administration to that of a constitution involving the dispersion of administrative and executive responsibility to a number of Ministries and Regional bodies. It is never possible in such circumstances to produce at the first attempt a ready-made plan free from all anomalies and imperfections and the change-over will involve much experimentation. In the course of this process many examples of overlapping of function and lack of co-ordination in the existing machine will inevitably come to light and can then be eliminated. We have had a number of discussions with the officers responsible for the work of adapting and re-orientating the Civil Service machine to meet the new demands which will be made on it, and we have given our comments and advice informally before leaving the Gold Coast, since clearly this work cannot be held up pending the publication of our Report. We wish to state here that we are fully satisfied that this task is being tackled with the highest administrative ability and along lines with which we are in general agreement. Apart from the recommendations contained in the remainder of this Chapter and a few remarks later in this Report concerning the functions of certain Departments, we have nothing further to say on this subject. We would stress however that in all our recommendations we have had constantly in mind the present transitional position of the Civil Service and the new Constitution which it is to be re-designed to serve.

Position of Secretaries to Ministries & Heads of Departments

19. We have given much thought to the position and functions of Heads of Departments under the new Constitution. There has undoubtedly been a change of emphasis and this should be clearly stated and fully realised by all concerned since we have taken this change into account when making our recommendations. Prior to the introduction of the "Burns Constitution" in 1946, Heads of important Departments were members of the Legislative Council and some were members of the Governor's Executive Council. They were thus in the position of having a responsibility for the formulation of policy as well as for putting it into effect. Under the Burns Constitution there were no Heads of Departments in the Legislative Council and only the Director of Medical Services in the Executive Council, but Heads of Departments still retained a certain position as advisers to the Governor through the Colonial Secretary on matters of policy affecting their Departments. Under the new Constitution the Ministers with the aid of their ministerial staffs are responsible for the formulation of policy and Heads of Departments are removed one step further from the policy-making level. As technical experts they are qualified to supply information on the practicability of projects or on the methods which should be adopted to give effect to declared policy. But their main function is now executive. They are in charge of the machinery established to implement the declared policy of the Government. It is not irrelevant to observe here that in the paragraphs on decentralisation in this Chapter we recommend that officers in charge of the various executive branches of the Government including Heads of Departments should be given additional executive powers and responsibilities. To some extent these additional responsibilities offset the decreased advisory responsibilities.

Technical & Professional Advisers in Ministries

20. We have also considered whether under the new Constitution Ministers should have, within their Ministries, technical and professional advisers to assist them in discharging their responsibilities for the formulation of policy. There is already an Adviser on Local Government within the Ministry of Local Government and we recommend later that there should be a professional officer as Principal Assistant Secretary, Town & Country Planning, in the Ministry of Town & Country Planning & Housing. There are however special reasons why it is convenient to have these posts in those Ministries and we are not prepared in the present formative stage of the Gold Coast governmental organisation to recommend any further departure from the system at present in force, particularly as two Ministries have as permanent Secretaries professionally qualified officers

with departmental experience. We wish to record in passing however that if at a future date it is decided that there should be professional advisers within Ministries, the grading of existing Heads of Departments will have to be reviewed.

Ministry of Defence & External Affairs & Chief Secretary's Office

21. The Ministry of Defence & External Affairs as at present organised contains a Permanent Secretary, two Senior Assistant Secretaries in charge of Defence and External Affairs respectively, and four Assistant Secretaries. This Ministry has been assigned to the Chief Secretary, who, as the authority responsible for the Public Service under the new Constitution, has an additional staff of one Principal Assistant Secretary, two Senior Assistant Secretaries and six Assistant Secretaries to attend to establishment and personnel matters. The Principal Assistant Secretary submits papers to the Chief Secretary through the Permanent Secretary although, unless the latter has establishments experience, this procedure tends to become a formality. In paragraphs 23 *et seq.* below we make certain recommendations regarding the reorganisation of the Establishments and Personnel branches ; the creation of a full-time Public Service Commission should result in some reduction in the work at present being done in those branches ; and successful devolution to Ministries and Departments of authority in staff matters should lead to a further diminution of the staff in the Chief Secretary's Office. When these developments have fully matured the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office should consist of a small body of experts whose main duty will be to advise on and interpret rules and regulations.

Secretary for Development 22. When we left the Gold Coast the Secretary for Development held a special position in the Ministry of Defence and External Affairs and this position was reflected in the salary of the post which was higher than that of permanent Secretaries. We considered that, under the organisation then existing, the Secretary for Development justified a salary equal to that of the Governor's Secretary for which post we recommend £2,000. Since then however a Ministry of Development has been created. We have had no opportunity to study the effect of this change on the status and responsibilities of the post of Secretary for Development and have decided that it would be undesirable for us to recommend a salary for the new post.

Establishments

23. In the term " Establishments " we include both the present Establishments and Personnel functions of the Chief Secretary's Office, viz., all matters affecting the Public Service such as recruitment, appointment, training, pay, pensions, allowances, and conditions of service generally. The powers of the Chief Secretary as regards some of these subjects will, of course, be strictly governed by the direction of the Governor on the advice of the Public Service Commission.

24. The importance of maintaining a properly organised Public Service and ensuring that all matters affecting the Services are dealt with promptly, efficiently and tactfully, cannot be over-emphasised. In the course of our visits to Departments and to out-stations we were sorry to encounter a strong and almost universal antagonism to the " Secretariat ". An attitude of antagonism to the " Secretariat " is of course not peculiar to the Gold Coast nor is it necessarily due to inefficiency on the part of the hard-working Secretariat staff. It is due rather to a combination of system and circumstances. Staff matters are just one of the functions of an overworked Secretariat in which the most senior officers are mainly concerned with other affairs. No systematic training is given in dealing with staff, and the work has been assigned to whoever happened to be available to do it from time to time ; decisions are inclined to have a strong " fiscal " bias, and because of the unpopularity of the work, few officers are prepared of their own free will to enter or remain in an Establishment section. This attitude is also reflected in the Departments where interest is naturally concentrated on primary functions, such as producing crops or building roads and bridges. In those Departments staff matters tend to receive inadequate consideration, and to be presented to the Secretariat in a form which can rarely be accepted without reference back, a process which often leads to argument and ill-feeling.

25. The years since the last war have been marked simultaneously by a considerable increase in the activities of Government and by a shortage of staff to deal with this increase. Recruitment

to the administrative service was seriously arrested so that Government is now suffering from a virtual hiatus in the ranks of officers with 8 to 10 years' service, who in practice make the most useful schedule officers. In the Establishments, as in other sections, it follows that most of the work has to be done by senior officers who are consequently burdened by a weight of matters often of minor importance. In the result these officers are seldom able to do more than give quick decisions, and have no time to consider the question (always important in staff matters) of how decisions can be conveyed in the most palatable form.

26. It is hoped that these circumstances will improve as postwar recruits gain in seniority and experience. We know that Government is aware of the weaknesses of what might be called the old Colonial establishments system and is anxious to change it, but it is necessarily a slow business and must depend on the availability of suitable men, either for recruitment from elsewhere already trained in establishments work, or now serving in the Gold Coast who can be trained while in the service. We make the following recommendations and suggestions.

Chief Establishments Officer

27. A post of Chief Establishments officer, or Establishments Secretary, should be created immediately under the Chief Secretary with the status of a Secretary to a Minister. The reasons which lead us to

this recommendation are those which led the Holmes Commission to make the same recommendation in regard to East Africa—see Appendix XVI. The occupant of this post will carry the main responsibility for building up and maintaining a contented and efficient Public Service which, in the difficult years of construction, reconstruction, and development, ahead, will be of paramount importance. It will not be easy to find a suitable candidate for this onerous and important task. To qualify for consideration at all the candidate must have had extensive experience in Establishments work; but that is not enough. It is of at least equal importance that he should be well endowed with the qualities of tact, sympathy and understanding. He should be able to deal on equal terms with Secretaries to Ministries and Heads of Departments, and at the same time acquire the respect and confidence of the Services. His decisions should not primarily be governed by financial consideration, but it is advisable that he should have some financial experience as he must be able to command the confidence of the Ministry of Finance which would delegate to him authority to take decisions in all but major financial matters affecting staff. He would submit papers direct to the Chief Secretary. Eventually he may not require the assistance of a Principal Assistant Secretary in addition to the Director of Recruitment and Training—see paragraph 336, but he should have two Senior Assistant Secretaries in charge of Establishments and Personnel respectively.

28. It may be appropriate at this stage to give an outline of the work for which it is envisaged the Chief Establishments Officer will be responsible. In the first place he should be the chief technical adviser on recruitment, qualifications for posts, grading and classification of posts, rules of conduct for public officers, training, cadre, retiring awards, Civil Service negotiating machinery, miscellaneous conditions of service, and staffing of the Public Service generally. He will also be responsible for advising other Ministries and Departments on matters coming within his competence. He will take decisions on behalf of the Chief Secretary on questions of interpretation and application of rules and policy. He will receive and deal with, in the first instance, appeals to the Chief Secretary or the Governor concerning Public Officers, other than appeals relating to matters specifically reserved to the Governor under Section 66 of the Gold Coast (Constitution) Order-in-Council, 1950, which should be submitted direct to the Public Service Commission by the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry concerned. He should not be tied to his office but should make a point of visiting other offices and holding friendly discussions on staff problems not only with Heads of Departments and senior officers, but with any officer or group of officers who want advice or guidance. His visits should not be confined to offices in Accra. He should go on tour as extensively and frequently as possible and acquaint himself with the view of the man in the field to dispel the criticism that his decisions are coloured by Headquarters prejudice. He should not only state Government 'staffing' policy but be prepared to justify it in friendly discussion with officers affected by it but who may not be in a position to appreciate the reason which dictated it. We refer later to the relationship between the Chief Establishments Officer and the Public Service Commission.

29. It will be seen that much of the work of the Chief Establishments Officer has financial implications and it could be argued that, as in Ceylon, this post should be placed under the Minister of Finance. On organisational grounds this could be justified ; but while the Public Service in the Gold Coast is constitutionally the responsibility of the Chief Secretary, the Chief Establishments Officer must remain an officer of the Chief Secretary's Office. We are fully aware of the dangers of delay, duplication of work, and even disputes which a system of divided responsibility such as we recommend in this case may involve ; but we consider that these dangers can and should be reduced to a minimum. We have already suggested that the Ministry of Finance should delegate certain powers to the Chief Establishments Officer. A careful and detail definition of the delegated powers should do much to reduce any possible friction. At the same time, it will be necessary for the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office to maintain the closest liaison with the Ministry of Finance at all levels ; and whenever a difference of opinion occurs or seems likely to occur, the papers should be submitted to the Chief Establishments Officer for settlement with the Secretary to the Ministry of Finance. In the few cases where agreement cannot be reached the matter would presumably be taken up at Ministerial or even Executive Council level. We wish to emphasise here that we consider both Establishments work and Finance work to be highly technical in character, and differences of view are bound to occur. These should be settled on the basis of the best interests of the country as a whole, for, while a staff administration based purely on financial considerations invariably leads to a discontented Service, on the other hand, the Minister of Finance is ultimately responsible to the Legislature for the expenditure of public funds and can reasonably claim to have the last word.

30. The question how far the separate Ministries should be empowered to deal with staff matters in Departments under them has already been given much anxious thought by the Government, and we understand it was recently decided that for the present, Heads of Departments would deal direct with the Chief Secretary in staff matters unless they required Ministry support, in which case they should route correspondence through their Ministries, which would thereafter deal with the matter. The Ministry would in any case receive a copy of the final communication from the Chief Secretary to the Head of Department approving a proposal. We agree that in the interests of expediency and the quick despatch of business, Departments should continue to deal direct with the Chief Secretary's Office in all minor staff matters which cannot be devolved as suggested later in this Chapter, but we think that staff questions of any importance, including the scrutiny of departmental estimates should be dealt with in the first instance by Ministries. In forming this conclusion it appeared to us fundamental that Secretaries to Ministries should not be able to dissociate themselves from major staff questions in Departments under their supervision. At the same time it would be of considerable assistance to the Chief Secretary's Establishments staff if Ministries were made responsible for co-ordinating and correctly formulating applications before forwarding them.

31. To prevent misunderstanding we must emphasise the distinction between the functions of a Secretary to a Ministry *qua* Secretary and as permanent non-political head of a Ministry. As Secretary he must identify himself as far as possible with his Minister ; with all his experience and knowledge he must assist his Minister to carry out his ministerial functions. Broadly these are the formulation of policy, and the manner in which approved policy shall be carried out by the Departments under the Ministry. If the Minister is to enjoy as great a measure of freedom as possible to execute his high office as a Member of the Executive and Legislative Councils, he should in no way be concerned with details of staff management in Departments under him. This, as far as the Ministry is concerned, is entirely the responsibility of the Secretary in his second capacity as permanent non-political head of the Ministry, and it is the Secretary and not the Minister with whom the Chief Establishments Officer should have all dealings.

32. It necessarily follows that if the Ministries are to perform their part adequately they should contain at least one officer with some experience of Establishments work. It has been suggested to us that this officer should be a member of the Chief Secretary's staff specially posted to the Ministry, thus ensuring that the Ministry would take an objective view, free from departmental bias. We do not however feel that we can support a suggestion which would create the invidious position of officers being *in* a Ministry and yet not *of* it, owing no allegiance to the officer under

whom they were immediately serving. Officers in charge of Establishments in Ministries would normally be members of the administrative service and in accordance with the tradition of that Service would be unlikely to allow their posting to a Ministry to prevent them from taking a strictly objective view of any problems presented to them. We suggest that one officer in each Ministry, preferably of the rank of Senior Assistant Secretary, should be made responsible for Establishment matters under the Secretary. If possible, arrangements should be made to see that at least one officer from among those posted to a Ministry should have had Establishments experience ; but if this proves impracticable the Secretary to the Ministry would require to select one of this staff to be in charge of Establishments who would have to "pick up" the work in consultation with departmental officers under his Ministry and the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office.

33. We are aware that owing to the present dearth of officers with Establishments training in the Gold Coast, many of these suggestions for ensuring the proper administration of staff matters will appear to lack reality. We are convinced, however, that a properly organised and contented staff is essential for the successful functioning of any Government, and that this object can only be achieved if staff matters are handled promptly and efficiently yet sympathetically at every stage. We are reluctant in the present formative stage of the new Constitution to attempt to lay down any hard and fast rules for Establishment procedure which should in our opinion be allowed to devolve under the guidance of the Chief Establishments Officer. If he is to free his office from the mass of unnecessary detail and work, often of minor importance, which the present Establishments branch has to tackle, it will be one of his first tasks to ensure that proper attention is given to Establishment matters in Ministries and Departments. This will require a cadre of officers who will look upon this work as their primary concern, and who will act in the closest liaison with him and his officers, particularly during the earlier stages when Establishment knowledge will be mainly confined to his own office.

Decentralisation

34. Although a centralised system of administration has been a normal and indeed a natural feature of Colonial Government, the Gold Coast has for several years past attempted to achieve a measure of decentralisation, and to this end a number of posts of the status of Assistant Directors have been created at the headquarters of Chief Commissioners. Nevertheless, the increasing complexity of the administrative machine and the weight of the Gold Coast Development Plan, coupled with the necessarily restricted numbers of administrative staff available to cope with such a heavy load of work, do clearly indicate the need for a faster tempo in administration and more speedy decisions such as can only be secured by the greatest measure of devolution compatible with efficiency and economy. Judged by this test it must be admitted that, in this regard, the organisation of government business in the Gold Coast is still defective.

35. A considerable body of evidence came before the Commission pointing to undue centralisation at headquarters, particularly as regards personnel matters and questions of financial and accounting control, and there is no doubt that Heads of Departments generally feel strongly on this point. As an example of over-centralisation in personnel matters, Heads of Departments may not suspend or defer increments without reporting to the Chief Secretary's Office giving full reasons. Furthermore, we are given to understand that it is usual for headquarters to examine such "reasons" closely before approving the action proposed. The position is similar as regards the passing of efficiency bars and promotion bars. In general our evidence points to a centralised control of discipline by the Chief Secretary's Office to the exclusion of a proper delegation to Heads of Departments of such authority as would enable them to manage their Departments and control their staffs with due efficiency. We shall return to the question of discipline later in our Report. Similarly on the financial and accounting side representations were made as to the inadequacy of the powers of "Write-off" and "Local Purchase" granted to Heads of Departments ; the over-elaborate centralised procedure laid down in regard to transport advances, travelling claims, and payment vouchers.

36. The above points are cited only as examples of over-elaborate and centralised procedure. Some of the points raised were discussed by the Commission with the responsible authorities in

the Gold Coast and we understand that consideration is being given in those cases to some modification of the existing system. The Commission, however, was not in a position to cover in detail the whole of the field proper to this important and complex issue, both because of lack of time, and because of the transitional stage through which the governmental machine in the Gold Coast is now passing. This latter consideration applies not only to the fact that relations have still to be put on a final and settled basis between the Chief Secretary's Office and the Ministry of Finance on the one hand, and the other Ministries and their dependent Departments on the other, but also to the fact that relations between headquarters and regions have still to be determined in the light of the decisions to be made on Sir Sydney Phillipson's Report on the organisation of the Regional Administrations. In these circumstances this Commission feels obliged to content itself with general observations on the question of decentralisation.

37. In the first place decentralisation is not a single operation but a continuous process and the degree of decentralisation to be aimed at for a particular organisation must depend on the needs and nature of that organisation. The degree of decentralisation appropriate to the United Kingdom with its strong cadre of administrative staff, available at all levels where authority is exercised may well vary from that proper to the Gold Coast where the resources in trained administrative staff are very much less, particularly at the Departmental and Regional level. In such conditions the dangers resulting from an over-precipitate departure from a uniform and standardised procedure, which is characteristic of a centralised organisation, are much more to be feared in the Gold Coast than in the United Kingdom. This is particularly true of the field of personnel matters where equality and uniformity of treatment are essential in the interests of an efficient and contented service. Moreover the evidence tendered to this Commission indicates that in some cases at least failure to carry further the process of decentralisation in the Gold Coast is due not so much to unwillingness of central authority to devolve, as to the lack of trained staff which can safely be trusted with the devolved powers. There has also been evidence of a reluctance on the part of some officers to accept additional responsibility for one reason or another but mainly, it would appear, because of fears regarding the ability of their existing staff to cope with new and additional work. For instance, when the question of further devolution in personnel matters was discussed by Secretaries to Ministries shortly before our departure from the Gold Coast, they expressed some doubt whether their present staff was adequate either as regards numbers or experience in personnel and establishment problems to enable them to undertake additional responsibility for staff matters on any considerable or useful scale. While we are not entirely in accord with the view expressed by the Secretaries and have made specific recommendations in paragraphs 30-33 on this subject, it is an example of the misgivings with which decentralisation and devolution of responsibility is regarded.

38. Notwithstanding these difficulties the pressure of events in the Gold Coast dictates a much greater measure of decentralisation. Decentralisation is never an easy process. It demands the most intensive and prolonged preparation and careful preliminary planning. The first requisite so far as the Gold Coast is concerned is obviously the training of staff to the point at which they can competently exercise the devolved powers. Secondly, it will be essential that Headquarters should prepare detailed directives explaining the policy hitherto followed by Headquarters, the reasons and considerations underlying that policy, and the precise method by which that policy has been carried out. It will also be essential to codify the existing body of instructions so that officers exercising devolved powers may have all the necessary information readily available. All this takes time. On the basis of experience elsewhere the Commission recommends that Planning Groups be set up in the Chief Secretary's Office and the Ministry of Finance with representatives from other Ministries, Departments and Regions, to study the problem and to make the necessary long-term preparations. In this connection the Commission has observed that a much wider range of powers has been devolved upon the General Manager of the Gold Coast Railways than upon other Heads of Departments. It is easy to understand the need for an extensive devolution of powers upon the Head of the Railway, which in effect is a commercial undertaking with its own completely separate accounting system; but what has been done in the case of the Railways might well be a useful guide to further decentralisation to

Ministries, and, where appropriate, to Departments, from the Chief Secretary's Office and the Ministry of Finance.

39. What has been said above applies particularly to devolution from Ministries to Departments. It has possibly an even more important application to decentralisation from Headquarters to Regions. The "Coussey Report"* recommends that the Central Government shall, to the maximum degree possible, decentralise its powers, both administrative and executive, to the Regional Administration. The "Phillipson Report" also envisages the setting up of regional bodies armed with an extensive range of powers. The exact extent of these powers will of course depend upon the final decision taken in regard to that Report but it is fair to assume that the establishment of the Regional organisation under the new Constitution will involve a considerable devolution of authority to the new regional bodies. This being so it is essential that the Chief Commissioner, who as "Regional Administrator" will be the Chief Executive Officer of the Regional Council, shall be armed with the necessary administrative powers to carry out expeditiously the decisions of that Council within the framework of the policy laid down by the Central Government, but without being obliged to refer to headquarters on questions of administrative detail or matters of minor importance.

40. It is essential too that the Chief Regional representatives of the various Departments, whose activities the Chief Commissioner will co-ordinate in his capacity as "Regional Administrator" shall have devolved upon them from their headquarters the powers necessary to enable them to play their part in advising the Regional Councils as to the appropriate decisions to be taken and in giving effect to those decisions. In other words—to follow Sir Sydney Phillipson's idea—the general aim should be to devolve upon these Chief Regional departmental representatives such authority as will enable them freely to direct the activities of their Departments within the Region in conformity with the general policy prescribed.

41. As mentioned earlier a start has been made with this policy by the creation of posts for Assistant Directors who are intended to act within the Regions as the chief representatives of their Departments and to co-ordinate the activities of their subordinates. This Commission, however, has received a good deal of evidence that the powers devolved upon these Chief Regional representatives are generally by no means commensurate either with the status or pay which they enjoy. Clearly there is urgent need to devolve upon these chief departmental representatives within the Region authority appropriate to the important posts which they hold, and to select for these posts, either from within the Gold Coast Service or elsewhere, officers who not only have suitable experience but also are endowed with the requisite qualities of personality and leadership as well as organising ability and administrative flair.

42. In addition, as in the case of devolution to Ministries and Departments there is obvious need for careful and intensive planning to determine the precise level of decentralisation appropriate at the present stage of governmental development in the Gold Coast, for the drawing up and publication of directives explaining the considerations governing the policy followed by Headquarters in the past, and for the codification of the relevant General Orders and instructions. Here again we recommend the setting up of Planning Groups to undertake the necessary intensive preparatory work. This will involve a considerable amount of detailed analysis and research and will take some time to complete. We are convinced however that the effort will be fully justified by the results, and indeed that unless this preparatory work is thoroughly and carefully done the Regional Administrations will never achieve the degree of efficiency which is essential to the successful working of the system under which they are created.

Exercise of devolved powers 43. We hope we have made it clear that the aim should be to devolve upon Heads of Departments such powers as are necessary to enable them to accept full responsibility for the daily direction of the business of their Departments. The powers devolved must be clearly defined and the responsibility for decisions within these limits placed squarely on the shoulders of the Head of Department. There should normally be no question of his seeking "covering authority". If he wishes advice or guidance in the exercise of his powers he should do so informally by telephone or in personal

* Colonial No. 248.

discussion but such consultations will not in any way relieve him of the responsibility which has been devolved upon him. Similarly the Head of Department must devolve on his regional representatives such powers as are necessary for the conduct of the Department's business in regions. These powers must also be clearly defined and the officers concerned must be made to accept their full responsibilities. The devolution of authority should not stop at the regional level but should reach down to the field unit. In all cases instructions must be so framed that the officers concerned must be left in no doubt as to the powers which they possess and it must be impressed on them that they must accept responsibility for the exercise of these powers. We fully realise that in the early stages this policy may lead to an increase in the numbers of petitions. These should be dealt with on the basis that, subject to the over-riding principle of justice to the individual and providing there has been no misuse of powers or unjustifiable departure from the official directives, the decision of the officer to whom authority has been devolved should be upheld. We cannot stress too strongly that where a petition turns on a matter of opinion on a question within the power of the officer concerned to decide, the authority considering the petition should resist the natural temptation to deal with the case on the basis of his own independently formed opinion. Any other course will strike at the roots of the whole principle of devolution of responsibility and largely derogate from the efficacy of the policy.

Appeals & Petitions

44. Consideration of the problem of devolution of responsibility in matters concerning personnel would not be complete without reference to the provision which should be made to enable an officer to appeal against a decision adversely affecting himself. It is mainly through this right of appeal that the equality and uniformity of treatment referred to in paragraph 37 is ensured. We have however received evidence that there is a growing tendency for the right of appeal to be abused; that there is an increasing reluctance to accept adverse decisions from any but the highest authority; and that the resulting flow of petitions and appeals, many of them on the most trivial matters or on unfounded claims, is impeding the smooth running of the governmental machine to an extent out of all proportion to the issues involved. We believe the causes of this development are to be found to a large extent in the recent political unrest characterised as it has been by a certain amount of racial feeling which, regrettably, appears to have pervaded even the internal machinery of the Civil Service. This is a matter outside our scope but we earnestly hope that under the new Constitution recently granted to the Gold Coast its Civil Service will be able to perform its functions as servants of the Public and to manage its internal affairs completely uninfluenced by any considerations other than the Regulations governing the Service and the honourable traditions which it has inherited. There are however other causes for the growing volume of appeals and petitions, among which are economic pressure and lack of personnel management. We hope that the recommendations in this Report, if adopted, will largely remove these causes of discontent.

45. Nevertheless we are of the opinion that the faster tempo of administration and the changed constitutional position in the Gold Coast necessitate some amendment of the rules of appeal as applicable to Public Officers. The majority of appeals fall into three categories, namely:—

- (i) Appeals in disciplinary matters;
- (ii) Appeals regarding the application and interpretation of rules and regulations;
- (iii) Appeals for special exceptions to be made to rules and regulations.

46. Appeals in disciplinary matters specifically vested in the Governor under Section 66 of the Gold Coast (Constitution) Order-in-Council should be submitted to the Public Service Commission by the Permanent Secretary to the Ministry concerned. The Public Service Commission should submit the appeal to the Governor together with its advice as to the decision which should be taken. This procedure should cover all appeals in disciplinary matters—see also paragraphs 374 to 387.

47. As regards the second category, appeals regarding the application and interpretation of rules and regulations, the authority for the interpretation of rules and regulations governing the Public Service should be the Chief Establishments Officer acting on behalf of the Chief Secretary. We

recommend that all appeals of this nature should be forwarded to the Chief Secretary whether it is an appeal against a decision given by a Secretary to a Ministry, a Head of Department, or a Regional Head of Department. The officer against whose decision the appeal is made should forward it, through the Head of Department where applicable, together with his comments on the facts stated in the petition and any other relevant information. The Head of Department should not be required to make any recommendations or to comment except on matters of fact. Appeals against decisions made by officers below the status of a Regional Head of Department should be addressed to that officer. If he upholds the lower officer's decision appeal will lie as prescribed above.

48. As regards the third category, appeals for special exceptions to be made to rules and regulations, these will normally be made against the decision of an officer to whom power has been delegated to make such exceptions. It is in accordance with the general principle underlying the devolution of responsibility that the only appeal against the decision of an officer in such circumstances should be to the Governor as the source of all authority. Appeals should in such cases be addressed to the Governor through the Head of Department and the Chief Secretary. The officer forwarding the appeal should ensure that all relevant information is available and should add his recommendation in the light of his personal knowledge of the circumstances.

49. These rules, if adopted, should, by providing a more direct access to the source of authority, speed up the procedure by which civil servants seek redress of grievances.

50. It is, however, in our opinion, necessary to take measures to discourage frivolous appeals or appeals with little or no foundation. We recommend to this end :—

- (i) That no appeal should normally be entertained in respect of any matter which occurred more than three months before the date of the appeal,
and
- (ii) That in the event of an appeal to the Governor being adjudged to be frivolous or without adequate grounds the officer may be so informed officially and the fact recorded in his Service record as a reprimand.

51. There is one other aspect in which we consider that the rules regarding appeals require amendment. In the present stage of constitutional development in the Gold Coast it seems to us anachronistic that locally appointed civil servants should have the right of appeal to the Secretary of State for the Colonies in matters concerning the internal regulations of the Gold Coast Public Service. The Secretary of State has, of course, certain obligations, implicit or explicit, to officers whom he has selected for appointment, and those officers together with officers holding posts, appointment to which is subject to his approval, should clearly have the right to appeal to him on any matter affecting their terms or conditions of appointment or their prospects within the Service. In the case of officers whose appointment is wholly within the competence of the Government of the Gold Coast, however, we see no justification for the retention of the right of appeal beyond the Governor, and recommend that the rules be amended accordingly.

PUBLIC BOARDS AND CORPORATIONS

Present Position

52. Several Statutory Boards and Corporations have already been established in the Gold Coast (viz. two Development Corporations, two Marketing Boards, two prospective Loans Boards, and the Town & Country Planning Board). One of the working parties mentioned in our first Chapter has suggested to us that certain activities at present carried on by the Central Government are not proper functions of the Public Service which should concern itself rather with regulatory, advisory, supervisory, or inspecting responsibilities, and *not* with commercial or industrial activities which require quick decisions to be taken by the man on the spot and a degree of elasticity in the interpretation and application of regulations incompatible with the Civil Service organisation, and its direct responsibility to the Legislature. The working party also postulated that the activities of the Public Service being financed by the general taxpayer, should be directed in general to the benefit of the community at large and not of a particular section of the community. Our attention was directed in particular to the following activities which are now the responsibility of Government Departments :—

Railways & Harbours.

Electricity.

Housing (which involved both the provision of houses and the management of subsidised housing estates).

Water Supplies, both rural and urban.

Fisheries.

Co-operation, both on its production and distribution side.

Film Unit.

The Bulk Purchase Scheme.

Hospitals—transfer of the larger Hospitals to Hospital Boards.

Education so far as actual running of schools is concerned.

Railways & Electricity

53. We understand that Government has it already in mind to transform the Railway & Harbour Administration and the Electricity Department into Public Authorities. We strongly support this view not only because such a proposal is in line with modern policy in the United Kingdom and elsewhere in the Colonial Empire, but for the reasons adduced by the Committee of Enquiry into the disorders in the Eastern Provinces of Nigeria in November 1949 in recommending the setting up of Statutory Boards with a legal corporate existence to take over certain industries previously run by Government, viz. :

“ . . . This we consider desirable in order to avoid the complications which arise owing to the constitutional position between the Crown and its servant when the Government itself is the manager of industries, such as the colliery, railway, and electricity undertakings.”*

This recommendation was endorsed by the Governor of Nigeria in his despatch of the 18th May, 1950, addressed to the Secretary of State for the Colonies as follows :—

“ Finally I am glad that the Commission has endorsed the view that Statutory Boards should be established to run what may be called commercial and semi-commercial Government owned enterprises. . . . The aim is that the management should be free to carry out its task and to deal with its staff and labour problems, without the centralisation and restrictions which are necessarily imposed on Government Departments. This form of organisation has advantages not only in more efficient administration but in freeing Government from direct responsibility for dealing with industrial disputes. It also has the great advantage of providing opportunities for Nigerians to take a share in the direction of the enterprises as members of the directing Boards.”†

and approved by the Secretary of State in the following terms :—

* Report of the Commission of Enquiry into the Disorders in the Eastern Provinces of Nigeria, November, 1949. (Col. No. 256.)

† Col. 257.

“ . . . I welcome strongly your intention to set up Statutory Boards wherever possible to control the commercial undertakings of Government. It will obviously not be possible for the Government to divest itself entirely of the function of direct employer of labour, but I am convinced that under Nigerian conditions the reasons given in para. 17 of your despatch for setting up these Boards or Corporations are compelling and that the Government must free itself to the greatest extent possible from the complications which, as the Commission has pointed out, arise when the Government itself has the direct management of industrial and commercial undertakings.”*

54. We have given careful consideration to the other suggestions made to us but are not prepared to recommend any further change at the present time ; the setting up of the Railway and Electricity Boards coupled with the proposed changes in the direction of existing Boards so as to ensure a more direct control by Government constitute a sufficiently ambitious programme.

Housing

55. The provision of adequate housing is one of the most urgent problems facing the Gold Coast Government. It has been entrusted to a Department of Housing whose main functions are:—

- (i) Construction of subsidised housing estates for lower paid workers ;
- (ii) Construction of houses for sale (Accra Rehousing Estate) ;
- (iii) The management of subsidised housing estates.

In addition we understand that the Government has at present under consideration a scheme for financing by means of loans to private individuals the construction of middle-class houses. It was represented to us that progress would be quicker if the work were to be entrusted to some body such as a Housing Board free to operate untrammelled by Civil Service rules and regulations ; and that moreover the activities of the Department at present benefit directly only a small section of the community and are therefore not properly a function of the Civil Service. We have, however, had evidence to the effect that the housing programme is proceeding as fast as the availability both of manpower and of materials will permit. We accept this evidence. At Appendix IV we reproduce a progress report and a programme for 1951-52, which we consider to be as ambitious as any form of organisation could undertake in present-day conditions. We do not agree that the activities of this Department affect only a small section of the community. The indirect effect on rents for example of the construction by Government of large numbers of subsidised houses must eventually benefit very large sections of the community. For these reasons we would not at present lend our support to a proposal that the Central Government should withdraw from direct participation in the construction of houses either to rent at subsidised rents or for sale. On the management side, however, we understand that Kumasi Town Council runs, as the agent of Government, a subsidised housing estate. We consider this to be an activity proper to a Municipal Authority and recommend that when the functions of Local Authorities under the new Constitution have been definitely settled, the Government should give serious consideration to transferring the responsibility for the management of subsidised housing estates to these Authorities.

Education

56. It does not appear to us that the employment of teaching staff and the running of schools, etc., is a proper function of the Central Government though the circumstances giving rise to the present position are easy to understand. We do not make any specific recommendations on this subject but we presume that the position will be re-examined when the functions of Local Authorities are being defined.

Hospitals

57. In the time at our disposal it has not been possible to undertake a detailed examination of the internal organisation and administration of the larger Hospitals. We understand, however, that they are run on normal departmental lines with a senior medical officer in a position similar to that of a local Head of Department. In addition there is a lay Visiting Committee which inspects the Hospitals periodically and makes reports. This Committee has no executive powers and can only make recommendations to the

* Col. 257.

Director of Medical Services. We comment later in this Report on the unhappy state of staff relations in the Medical Department and on steps which should be taken to effect an improvement. As regards the larger Hospitals, however, we recommend that an independent investigation be carried out by a Committee, which should include a majority of non-professional members, to ascertain whether it would be in the interests of smoother hospital administration and better staff relations, to grant a greater measure of autonomy to the larger Hospitals in internal administration, and particularly in minor disciplinary matters and personnel matters generally.

In making this recommendation we have not lost sight of the possibility of Local Authorities under the new Constitution assuming a measure of responsibility for the administration of Hospitals within their areas.

Water

58. The construction and distribution of water supplies is at present the responsibility of two Departments. The Public Works Department constructs and maintains supplies for larger urban areas while the Rural Water Development concerns itself with water for smaller towns and villages. No doubt there might be a case on organisation grounds for the amalgamation of these two units but both Departments have full programmes which are being tackled with considerable zest after an initial postwar hold-up owing to shortages of materials and manpower. The degree of dislocation which would be involved in a re-organisation would inevitably result in at least a temporary slackening of the tempo of work, and for this reason we are not prepared to recommend any change at the present time, although some fusion of the two units into one Statutory Board may ultimately become desirable.

Fisheries

59. This Department is mainly concerned with research and experimental work in connection with fisheries development. It also has certain regulatory and supervisory functions under the Fisheries Ordinance and is responsible for a nascent industry which needs the fostering care of a Government Department until it is more fully developed. We recommend no change at the present time.

Co-operation

60. This Department is charged with responsibility for fostering the development of co-operative organisations throughout the Gold Coast. If the various types of co-operative societies could be regarded simply as commercial undertakings we would have no hesitation in recommending a rapid withdrawal of all forms of assistance from public funds. The policy of fostering co-operative organisations has, however, more important objectives than the establishment of successful commercial enterprises. It is closely connected with the education of Africans throughout the country in the responsible management of their own affairs, and the ultimate aim is to build up an African controlled modern trading system on firm democratic foundations. We believe that the success of this policy can and should have an important bearing on the problem of production and distribution which the Gold Coast still has to tackle. The development of co-operative organisations in the Gold Coast is still in its infancy and in view of the potential importance of these organisations to the general economy of the Gold Coast, we consider it vital that the Government should continue for the time being, and should indeed intensify, its direct interest in the development of and control of co-operative societies. Nevertheless it is clear that the co-operative movement in the Gold Coast must eventually be completely independent of any assistance from the Central Government and the policy of the Department and of the Central Government should aim at training staff for direct employment by the co-operative organisations. Large increases in the staff of the Department should be avoided and new staff should be recruited and trained with a view to their ultimate transfer to the co-operative organisations.

Film Unit

61. The Film Unit should also remain the responsibility of Government as it is in the United Kingdom.

Bulk Purchase Scheme

62. The Bulk Purchase Scheme has recently been placed under the direct control of the Ministry of Finance and should in our opinion remain there. The operations of this organisation appear to us to require the closest possible control by Government, and as such it is not in our view an organisation which should at the present stage be transformed into a Public Corporation.

**Town & Country
Planning Board**

63. The Town & Country Planning Board on the other hand is already established as a Public Utility Board. It has been put to us in evidence that this body should be dissolved, that its Secretary and Executive Officer, together with such of his staff as may be necessary, should be attached to the Ministry of Town & Country Planning & Housing in an advisory capacity and the remainder of his staff seconded to Local Authorities as required. We accept this view.

STRUCTURE OF THE CIVIL SERVICE

64. The Structure of the Civil Service is the arrangement of the component parts of the Public Service to make up an organic whole. In this section we shall examine the different parts of the Service and consider whether by re-arrangement of these parts an improved structure can be built up more suited to the operations which the Civil Service is required to undertake.

Africanization

65. The most important single factor in determining the structure of the Civil Service in the Gold Coast is the transition from a Service composed in the upper ranks largely of expatriate staff to one composed mainly of indigenous staff. The complete Africanization of the Public Service in due course is the declared policy of the Gold Coast Government and to this end Government has for some time been taking vigorous measures to encourage and assist Africans to qualify for the higher posts in the Public Service as fast as local candidates with suitable qualifications and experience come forward. Much has been done by way of generous scholarship schemes to local candidates who satisfy the essential educational requirements, to enable them to obtain the qualifications necessary for the discharge of the functions proper to such posts. Some 200 scholarships were awarded in 1949 and some 400 post-secondary students were in training at the end of that year.

66. Further, following upon the recommendations of the Select Committee of the Legislative Council on the Africanization of the Public Service*, the Government has created the post of Commissioner for Africanization, who is himself an African, and whose responsibility it is to effect liaison between the Central Government, the various Heads of Departments, the Local Authorities, and the country at large, with a view to ensuring that the maximum number of suitable qualified Africans become available for appointment to the higher grades of the Public Service.

67. In addition, Government has accepted the following principles which were put forward by the Africanization Committee :—

A. While there shall be no lowering of standards, and in consequence no lowering of the qualifications now prescribed for appointment to the Senior Service, existing vacancies, and vacancies occurring in the immediate future, should be filled by suitably qualified Africans in preference to expatriates, provided that :—

- (i) where a suitably qualified African is in prospect but is not available for an appointment which must be made at once, an expatriate should be appointed on contract if possible, or if that is not practicable, on pensionable terms ;
- (ii) promotions within the Service will continue to be made on merit alone, without regard for race, and the claims of meritorious public officers in the Colonial Service will continue to take precedence over those persons not already in the Service.

B. As regard recruitment in the more remote future, the policy must be to train a sufficient number of Africans so that all vacancies may be filled without recourse to expatriate recruitment, except in so far as vacancies may properly be filled upon the advice of the Public Service Commission, due regard having been paid to the claims of serving officers of the Gold Coast Government, by the promotion, transfer or secondment of expatriate staff.

C. The retrenchment of expatriate officers in favour of Africans is not contemplated,

68. Notwithstanding this policy and the measures adopted for its implementation, the " Africanization Report " (paragraph 25) frankly recognises that the supply of Africans suitable and qualified to fill the higher posts in the Government Service will not in the foreseeable future be equal to the needs of the Gold Coast which must remain largely dependent upon the recruitment of expatriate staff.

69. This situation seems to be due in the main to a combination of four causes :—

- (i) The great increase in Government activities since the war and the even greater extension that is to be expected from the ambitious Gold Coast Development Plan. It has been estimated

* Sessional Paper No. 1 of 1950.

that the Government staff, excluding Railways, increased between 1945 and 1950 by roughly 60 per cent., the Senior Service from 960 to 1555, and the Junior Service from 6770 to 14,100. A further increase of staff in the higher ranks must of course be expected during the next ten years.

- (ii) The heavy wastage in senior Government staff, which is estimated by the Africanization Committee to amount to 1100 for normal vacancies in the ten years 1949-1959, and this figure excludes the prospective vacancies in the Political Administration Service which is regarded by the Committee as a "wasting commitment". The wastage factor may be further accentuated by recent developments in the Gold Coast both political and economic. Even in 1949 a Working Party examining conditions and remuneration of the Civil Service found that partly owing to a lively demand for qualified officers in the United Kingdom and partly owing to recent developments in the Gold Coast, there was a serious diminution in the number of expatriate candidates available for the Colonial Service and that the Gold Coast Government was not getting its proper share of such candidates as were available. At that time there were 451 vacancies in the Senior Service and difficulties were being experienced in filling even a small proportion of those posts. Moreover 58 officers had in that year declined appointment to the Gold Coast and had in preference taken up appointments elsewhere. This difficult staffing position was accentuated by the retirement of officers under the new 45 years rule before reaching the normal age of retirement. These premature retirements reached the number of 41 in 1949 and the position may deteriorate even further with the additional opportunities for retirement conceded in the new Constitution. Relevant paragraphs from the Working Party's Report are shown in Appendix V.
- (iii) The cost of maintaining students at a University in the United Kingdom is high (approximately £500 per head per annum). The Gold Coast has been generous with these scholarships (133 tenable in the United Kingdom in 1949 in addition to scholarships to the University College of the Gold Coast which numbered 182 in 1950). But obviously there must be a limit to the number of students who can be trained in the United Kingdom, both on grounds of expense and the United Kingdom's capacity to absorb Colonial students. The natural alternative of training students in the Gold Coast itself cannot be fully effective until the Regional College at Kumasi is in full working order and the first crop of students from that source cannot apparently be counted upon for several years.
- (iv) A further limitation is that the supply of candidates for post-secondary education is regulated by the output from the secondary schools in the Gold Coast. In 1949 the number of boys taking London Matriculation and continuing in higher studies was 300. The corresponding figure in 1940 was 13*, and judging by the relative increase in School Certificate candidates, the number continuing in higher studies should reach 600 by 1959. This indicates substantial progress but there is clearly a strong case for a much greater increase in the number of Gold Coast candidates for higher education. There are, however, obvious difficulties attending a substantial increase in the supply of qualified secondary teachers and buildings, and in view of this, the immediate outlook is not bright for the supply of Africans with suitable academic qualifications to fill all the prospective vacancies in the higher ranks of the Service, particularly in the professional and technical field.

70. In justification of this pessimistic estimate of the prospective educational output we extract the following passage from evidence given to us by an officer with many years experience and an intimate knowledge of the working of the Educational Service in the Gold Coast:—

"I must emphasize that for 10-15 years to come the output of the educational system will not be sufficient for the needs of the Civil Service. In referring to output I mean graduates and other highly qualified persons who have come up through the educational system to the top of it without a break in their educational careers, such as a sojourn in the Civil Service. In particular, the University and the College of Arts, Science and Technology will not have sufficient output to fill new 'senior' posts envisaged in the Ten Year Plan to replace 'wastage', and to meet the growing disinclination of expatriates and their wives to come to the Gold Coast."

* Authority—Gold Coast File P.L.217.

71. As a corrective to this view it should be remarked however that the Principal of the University College, Achimota, gave it as his opinion to our Commission that the University College alone would be in a position to produce 20 suitable candidates for the Administrative Service, after the 1952 Degree year. This number should, we estimate, be adequate to meet the requirements of the Administrative Service, so far as direct entry is concerned. Indeed, the Gold Coast Government has, we understand, announced its intention to discontinue the recruitment of expatriates by direct entry into the Administrative Service after the present year.

72. Even so there is a vast field of employment outside the Administrative Service—Professional, Technical or semi-technical—Executive (*e.g.* Customs or Postal Services), in which the supply of Africans with suitable qualifications adequately to fill the higher posts in those services is likely, under the present structure of the Service, to be insufficient for many years to come.

Existing Structure

73. In these circumstances it might be expected that the existing structure of the Service would be such as to make the best use of such staff as is available. Unfortunately this is not the case. The existing structure which derives its origin from the old distinction drawn between "European" and "African" appointments, under which all posts of any importance were filled by expatriates, still preserves the division into two distinct services, now styled "Senior" Service and "Junior" Service. Although an increasing number of Africans have been admitted into the Senior Service, the cleavage between the two Services is sufficiently complete to make the transition from the Junior to the Senior Service relatively much more difficult to achieve than a corresponding transfer would be, for instance, in the British Civil Service. In this connection the Africanization Report remarks that the "artificial rigidity" of the present Gold Coast structure "seems to preclude the best use of available manpower. For example, the promising local candidate with the School Certificate "is in general unable to aspire beyond the Junior Service". In effect, the principal weakness of the Gold Coast system lies in the fact that the African entering the Junior Service, being employed for the greater part of his service on duties which are in the main routine, rarely learns by employment on responsible work to develop the qualities essential to an officer filling the higher posts in the Service. In this connection it may be remarked that it is the experience of the British Civil Service that employment from a relatively early age on responsible work, coupled with adequate training and personal study so as to remedy any defects in an officer's early education, can be almost, if not quite, as effective in producing a good civil servant as a course of study at a University—at least for the non-professional and non-technical services. But responsibility is the most effective of all teachers and the essential point, if an officer has the necessary quality, is his employment as early as possible on responsible work.

United Kingdom System

74. It is an essential condition of this system, as it works in the British Civil Service, that a ladder be created by which a suitably qualified civil servant can climb from the bottom of the Service to the highest posts. This is done in the main by a series of annual competitions, under examination conditions, limited to officers already in the Service, and by this means an officer of the requisite quality can pass from his own class to a higher fairly early in his career, 20 per cent. of the vacancies in the administrative class and 33 per cent. of the vacancies in the executive class being filled by a limited competition open to members of the immediately subordinate class. A limited number of vacancies in the Clerical Class are also reserved for members of the sub-clerical classes. The balance of the vacancies in each class is of course filled by some form of direct entry open competition. The upper age limit for these limited competitions varies from competition to competition, but it is 30 years in the case of the Administrative class and 28 years in that of the Executive class, two attempts being allowed in the former case and three in the latter.

75. To make the story complete it should be stated that there is provision for those officers who fail to pass to a higher class by limited competition early in their career, to do so usually at a much later stage—by direct promotion. In addition, as each class is divided into a number of grades there is therefore the normal prospect of advancement from grade to grade within each class.

Proposed Gold Coast Structure

76. It is the opinion of this Commission that the introduction of a system following the main lines of the British Civil Service structure would enable a much better use to be made of the African who has reached his School Certificate standard than is possible under the present Gold Coast system.

Clerical, Executive, Administrative

77. We accordingly recommend :—

- (i) That the present division of the Service into Senior Service and Junior Service be ended.
- (ii) That a new class styled the Executive class be created to take over the less responsible duties now falling to the Administrative Class and the more responsible work now done by the Clerical class—within the definition of the work proper to the Executive class as set out at paragraph 98 of this Report.
- (iii) That in addition to the normal method of direct entry into these three classes, a series of limited competitions be set up offering access from one class to the next highest on the lines set out in paragraphs 74–75 above.

78. We deal with the methods of entry, the duties, remuneration, and conditions of service of the Executive class and its various grades in paragraphs 98–114 of our Report. Details of our recommendations in regard to the limited competitions are also given in the paragraphs dealing with each class.

Sub-Clerical

79. A further weakness in the structure of the Gold Coast Service which is brought out in paragraphs 51–54 of the “Africanization Report” arises from the employment of the Clerical class on typing, stenography and other sub-clerical duties. The School Certificate is the normal requirement of the Clerical class ; the number of such Certificates obtained in the past three years did not exceed 600 per year and the students reaching this educational standard are all that are available for the yearly intake of all Gold Coast activities—Government, Local Authority, Commerce, Industry, as well as the candidates for Higher Education who are estimated to number 300 in 1949. Even in 1959 the maximum possible number of such Certificates is not expected to exceed 1200. In these circumstances the employment of Clerical Officers with School Certificate on work which should properly be done by officers with lower educational qualifications is a misuse of staff. Accordingly we agree with the Africanization Committee in recommending that, apart from such measures as may be necessary to tide over the transition period, special classes be created to take over from the Clerical class typing, stenography, and other sub-clerical work. We return to the method of recruitment, duties, remuneration, and conditions of service of these classes later in this Chapter.

80. The system of classification which we recommend should result in a properly balanced structure adequately suited to the needs of the work to be done and at the same time properly adapted to the different levels of education in the Gold Coast, viz :—

<i>Class</i>	<i>Educational Level for direct entry</i>
(i) Sub-clerical, typing, stenography, etc.	.. Standard VII normally.
(ii) Clerical School Certificate.
(iii) Executive Higher School Certificate or at least School Certificate Class I or II.
(iv) Administrative University Graduate.

There should be a series of ladders leading from the lowest class to the highest either by limited competition in the early years of an officer's service or by direct promotion at a later stage, thus affording an officer of quality the opportunity to do his best work and to achieve his legitimate ambition.

81. This system of classification is devised particularly to cover the administrative field and the cognate field of semi-administrative executive services such as Audit, Income Tax, Customs,

Labour, Social Welfare, Co-operation, Police, Posts (as distinct from the engineering side of telecommunications). We recommend for the Technical and Professional services a system which is in the main similar but necessarily modified to meet the special requirements of those services. We deal with the position of the Technical and Professional services in paragraphs 117-123 of our Report.

82. It is appropriate at this stage that we should define the functions which in our view are proper to the various classes into which we recommend that the non-professional and non-technical field of governmental work be divided, and state our recommendations as regards the method of recruitment for these classes.

ADMINISTRATIVE CLASS

Headquarters of Ministries

83. The Royal Commission on the British Civil Service (1929-31)*, accepting the Report of the Reorganisation Committee of 1920, defined administrative work as that which "is concerned with the formation of policy, with the revision of existing practice or current regulations and decisions," and "with the general administration and control of the departments of the Public Service. For the effective performance of those duties officers of the highest qualifications are needed; and we propose that such officers shall be obtained partly by selection inside the service and partly by recruitment outside the Service".

84. The functions performed by Administrative officers employed in the headquarters of Government in Accra appear to us to be properly covered by this definition, subject always to our proposals in paragraphs 77, 88, 101-103, for reclassification of work now performed by Administrative officers in default of an executive class.

Headquarters of Regions

85. We now turn to the work of the Chief Commissioner and his principal assistants at Regional headquarters. It may be remarked here that both Sir Sydney Phillipson and the "Coussey Committee" envisage the Civil Service in the Regions as part of the Central Government and not as a separate Regional Service. The Chief Commissioner and those members of his staff at Regional headquarters who belong to the "Political Administrative" class will certainly be required to discharge functions which fall clearly within the definition of Administrative work suggested above. The same is also true of the special functions of the Chief Commissioner and his administrative staff in his capacity of "Regional Administrator" or as Sir Sydney Phillipson says "the co-ordinating and constructive executive of the proposed Regional Council"—a capacity in which he will co-ordinate the activities of regional representatives of all Departments on all matters affecting the well-being of the Regions. Sir Sydney Phillipson recommends the strengthening of the administrative hierarchy at Regional headquarters but the decision on that point will vary the functions proper to the regional administrative staff in degree and not in kind. The definition of their functions stands unaffected.

District Commissioners

86. At present the District Commissioner is the representative of Central Government in his district and as such responsible for seeing that the work of Government is adequately carried out and, in unusual cases, if need be, he must himself decide the Government's policy. He is responsible therefore for a wide and multifarious range of governmental activities in his district. Sir Sydney Phillipson considers that "whatever changes of structure the future may bring, a territorially posted service of administrative 'men-of-all-work' (or rather of work not otherwise assigned) carefully selected on the grounds of their educational and personal records as likely to be diligent, resourceful and devoted to the public interest will continue to constitute the 'steel framework' of the Government structure". Dr. Marshall on the other hand† takes the view that in the long run under the new Constitution the functions of the District Commissioner will pass either to Local Authorities or the specialized departments of Government. Both authorities are agreed, however, that in the formative period

* Cmd. 3909, paragraphs 36 and 102.

† Report on Local Government in the Sudan, by Dr. A. H. Marshall, Ph.D., B.Sc., City Treasurer, Coventry, England.

of local government the District Commissioner has an essential part to play. For our part we are clear that in all Districts in the Gold Coast there are, and will continue to be, many duties falling within the definition of administrative work. We do not propose to comment on whether at some future date these duties should be distributed between specialised departments of Government and Local Authorities, but we have no hesitation in deciding that for some time to come the cheapest and most efficient machinery for the performance of these duties is the existing Administrative Service with its system of out-posted administrative "men-of-all-work". We would stress here that we are not in the least concerned with the many political and racial considerations which have been associated with the controversy on the future of the District Commissioner. Our view is simply that there is much administrative work essential to good government in the Gold Coast which must be allocated to smaller units than the Regions, and that this work can best be done by Administrative officers under the direct control of the Chief Commissioners. We would do less than justice to District Commissioners if we passed over in silence the excellent work which we have seen them undertaking in remote districts on construction and maintenance of roads and buildings, the provision and maintenance of simple water supplies, and many other technical jobs. In many districts there is no other agency by which this work can be done and there is certainly no alternative organisation in the country at present which could do the work so cheaply and expeditiously. The people who advocate the withdrawal of District Commissioners would do well to ponder what agency they would substitute for the continuance of these essential services in rural areas.

87. We observe that Sir Sydney Phillipson remarks that under the new Constitution the title "Political Administration" is no longer appropriate and suggests that the generic title Administrative officer (Senior Administrative officer—Administrative officer—Assistant Administrative officer—as the case may be) be applied to all members of this class. We concur in this view.

Administrative Officers in Departments

88. The employment of Administrative officers in Departments has become more widespread in recent years. This practice is partly due to the shortage of professional and technical staff and also to the absence of a general executive class. In many cases the work which Administrative officers have been employed on in Departments is executive work and when a body of competent Executive officers has been built up it should be possible to withdraw Administrative officers. We have allowed for this development in our proposals on departmental staffing. There will remain, however, within some Departments certain work which can best be performed by Administrative officers. This will be found in developing Departments such as the Labour Department, or in large professional and technical Departments where the organisational problems are of a character to justify the employment of experienced Administrative officers. There are also some Executive Departments where the work is divided up into compartments in such a way that the departmental officer gets little opportunity to acquire the broad outlook needed for a Head of Department. In such cases we consider that an Administrative officer of the requisite rank and experience could be seconded to take charge of the Department.

Method of Recruitment

89. We recommend that the Administrative class be recruited partly by selection from inside the Service, partly by limited competition from executive and parallel classes, and partly by recruitment from outside the Service.

90. The last-named method should be the main source of recruitment. We have noted above that administrative work calls for officers of the highest qualifications, and we firmly believe that the mental discipline and intellectual training of a University Course offers the best guarantee that these will be forthcoming. Moreover, the generous scholarship schemes sponsored by the Gold Coast Government should ensure that University education is available to the best material in the country. We have already referred to the decision of the Gold Coast Government to confine direct recruitment to this class of Africans. We would add, with reference to the Africanization Committee's insistence that Africanization should involve no lowering of existing standards, that, although in the case of expatriates recruited to the Administrative class possession of an Honours degree is a normal requirement except in the case of candidates whose careers have been upset by war service, we understand from the Principal of the University College of the Gold

Coast, that acceptance of the new general type of Ordinary degree of that University as a preliminary academic qualification would in no way constitute a lowering of standards.

91. We recommend that direct entry to the Administrative Class should be by means of an open competition for Africans who possess the necessary academic qualifications. The competition should consist of a written examination which should preferably be set by an independent body (such as the proposed West African Examination Council or possibly the United Kingdom Civil Service Commission) in consultation with the Public Service Commission. This should be followed by an interview before a Board, appointed by the Public Service Commission, and marks for personal qualities should be awarded by the Board on a pre-determined basis. The importance of personal qualities in the selection of officers for the Administrative Service cannot be over-emphasised and the interview should be thorough and searching. In the case of marginal candidates more than one interview might with advantage be held. There should be a minimum combined qualifying mark for the two tests, and if sufficient candidates to fill the vacancies reserved for direct entry do not qualify, the remaining posts should be re-allocated to one of the other methods of entry or held in abeyance until the following year. We suggest that appropriate age limits for the open competition should be 22 years to 26 years, and not more than two attempts should be allowed.

92. We recommend that 20 per cent. of the annual vacancies, as in the United Kingdom, be set aside for a limited competition open to officers serving in the Executive class and the parallel classes in the technical or professional Departments. The competition should, we think, take the form of a suitable general non-academic examination arranged by the Public Service Commission. Suitable age limits might be from 25 years to 32 years. Subject to a minimum of 5 years service in the Executive or a parallel class, candidature should, we consider, be by departmental nomination open to all members of the prescribed classes, and Departments should not nominate the same candidate more than three times. The examination should be followed by an interview by a Board as in the case of competitors in the open competition.

93. Direct promotion to the Administrative class of non-graduate officers within the Service should normally be confined to officers of a comparatively senior executive grade at a relatively late stage in their career. Such promotions would not normally be made to the Assistant Administrative Officer grade (see paragraphs 94-95). They should be made strictly on merit and no fixed number of vacancies should be reserved for entry to the Administrative class by this method. Officers appointed to the Administrative class by this method would not normally be so adaptable as other Administrative officers and they would normally perform "specialist" functions in one Ministry or Department. Promotion by this method should definitely be ruled out for officers who are young enough to enter the limited competition. We assume that all such promotions will be made on the advice of the Public Service Commission.

94. As in other classes, promotion from one grade to another in the Administrative class should involve a definite and clearly defined increase in responsibility. The Assistant Administrative Officer should be largely a cadet grade. There should be no duty posts for Assistant Administrative Officers within Ministries when an adequate cadre of experienced officers of executive grades have been built up. (See paragraph 101). Until such officers are available, however, it will probably be necessary to have a number of Assistant Administrative Officers in Ministries to supplement the strength of Administrative Officers. It will also probably be found useful to have a relatively few specially selected Assistant Administrative Officers working within Ministries to gain experience of the machinery at headquarters. In the main, however, Assistant Administrative Officers should be posted to Regions and Districts in the early stages of their careers. In the normal course an Assistant Administrative Officer should on first appointment be posted to a District under an Administrative Officer. After confirmation in his appointment he may, if he has shown special ability, be posted to Regional headquarters to gain wider experience. It is desirable in our view that such officers should have experience in both Regional headquarters and in Ministerial headquarters before promotion to the Administrative Officer grade. A posting to a Ministry need not be of long duration nor should it imply that the officer's future career lies in headquarters' work. It is equally important that the Administrative Officer in the

field should have some over-all knowledge of the working of the machinery of Government. Since Assistant Administrative Officers would not normally be occupying duty posts within Ministries the system we recommend should not interfere with the continuity of staff postings in Ministries, but for obvious reasons it is desirable that the number of Assistant Administrative Officers posted to a Ministry at any time should be strictly limited. When an Assistant Administrative Officer has gained experience in district work, and at Regional and Administrative headquarters, he should be under consideration for promotion to the grade of Administrative Officer. An able Assistant Administrative Officer should be able to attain that grade from within five to seven years from the date of his appointment, and the complements of grades within the Administrative class should be so regulated as to ensure that this can happen.

95. The Administrative Officer is the real basic grade of the Administrative class. On this grade should fall the main burden of the administrative work in the government machine. Assistant Secretaries in Ministries, the main body of the Regional headquarters administrative staff, Administrative Officers in Districts, and Administrative Officers posted to Departments, are in this grade. They should be capable of accepting, and should be made to accept, considerable responsibility for the interpretation of rules and regulations, for taking decisions on minor matters of policy and for giving competent advice to their senior officers on factors affecting major matters of policy. They should not normally be specialist officers (exceptions might occur in the cases of direct promotion of officers from executive grades to Administrative Officers) and should be capable of undertaking administrative duties in any Ministry, Department, or other sphere.

96. The Senior Administrative Officer grade is normally filled by promotion from the Administrative Officer grade. These posts should carry responsibility above that of Administrative Officers, and Senior Administrative Officers should normally be responsible for co-ordinating the work of a number of Administrative Officers operating in a particular sphere or area.

97. We deal in a later section of our Report with the detailed considerations relative to remuneration and the reasons for the changes that we recommend. Meanwhile to make our story complete it may be useful if we append at this point an outline of our recommended scales and the component grades into which the Administrative class should be sub-divided :—

- (i) £550-£30-£850 Assistant Administrative Officer.
- (ii) £900-£40-£1180 Administrative Officer.
- (iii) £1250-£50-£1350 Senior Administrative Officer.
- (iv) Superscale Posts Highest Administrative posts.

We recommend the breaking up of the present Long Scale into the proposed segments only on the understanding that promotions from one segment to the next will be dealt with by the Public Service Commission and that, to quote the Report of the Africanization Committee “promotions within the Service will continue to be made on merit alone, without regard for race, and the claims of meritorious public officers in the Colonial Service will continue to take precedence over those of persons not already in the Service”.

EXECUTIVE CLASS

Definition of Executive Class

98. Executive work has been defined as work in which a code of law or administration is applied in order to obtain results. The Royal Commission on the Civil Service 1930-31 accepts the definition of the

Reorganisation Committee of 1920, viz :—

“To this class we would assign the higher work of supply and accounting departments and of other executive or specialised branches of the Civil Service. This work covers a wide field, and requires in different degrees qualities of judgment, initiative and resource. In the Junior ranks it comprises the critical examination of particular cases of lesser importance not clearly within the scope of approved regulations or general decisions, initial investigations into matters of higher importance, and the immediate direction of small blocks of business. In

its upper ranges it is concerned with matters of internal organisation and control, with the settlement of broad questions arising out of business in hand or in contemplation, and with the responsible conduct of important operations.”*

It will be seen that this definition covers higher accounting and supply work as well as good quality “individual” duties not involving the formulation of policy, in administrative departments. Following this principle we grade as Executive and prescribe Executive scales for the hierarchy of grades above the clerical and sub-clerical levels in Departments such as Audit, Income Tax, Customs, Labour, Social Welfare, and Co-operation. The same grading is followed for the higher grades of Police and the Postal side of the Post Office. We recognise however as a departure from this principle the special responsibility attaching to the Heads of those Departments and we recommend for the Directors of all but the smallest Executive Departments the same salary as that of Heads of comparable administrative and professional Departments.

99. In the Administrative Service (*i.e.*, Ministries and District Administration) which is now staffed partly by administrative and partly by clerical staff, we see considerable scope for the employment of the Executive staff as we have said above on good quality “individual” work which does not involve the formulation of policy. We have formed the impression that junior “schedule” officers in the Chief Secretary’s Office and the Ministry of Finance are doing much work which is really executive in type. Apart from the waste arising from the employment of administrative staff on work proper to a lower grade, considerations of efficiency arise owing to the lack of continuity in the staff doing this work, as these “schedule” officers are usually very junior and are constantly changing. Moreover, the shortage of Administrative Officers in the Gold Coast coupled with the increased load to be expected as the Development Plan progresses appears to us to dictate the utmost economy in the use of the highly qualified Administrative class.

100. At the same time it is important and in the long run more economical to pick out the more responsible duties or parts of duties now falling to Second or First Division Clerical Officers so as to give to promising officers by employment on responsible work at a relatively early stage in their career the opportunity to develop the qualities of initiative, balance and judgment, which are essential to effective performance of the higher duties in the Service.

101. Assuming that our advice is accepted for the creation of an Executive grade intermediate between the Administrative and the Clerical class, we recommend that an early survey be made by the grading teams suggested in the first Chapter of our Report, of the work in the Chief Secretary’s Office and the Ministry of Finance as well as in the other Ministries, with a view to the transfer to the Executive class of all work coming within our definition of Executive work. We mention “other Ministries” with some reserve as, although we interviewed the Secretaries to the new Ministries, we did not actually inspect the work of those Ministries, but we assume that their work will be organised on the same basis as that of the older Ministries and it is important in our view that they should start off on the right lines as quickly as possible.

102. As we point out in paragraph 98, some Departments select themselves for Executive grading as the great bulk of their work is executive in character. In such Departments it will be necessary only to separate the work proper to the Executive class from that which is essentially Clerical or sub-clerical. In the case of the Audit Department and Customs Department we have agreed with the Heads of those Departments on a line of delineation which the grading team can adopt as a basis of grading for application to other Departments. As regards other Departments, which we have graded as Executive although not so obviously Executive in character, we have, after detailed discussion with the Postmaster-General (see paragraphs 604–605) agreed with him on a detailed grading of the work in his Accounting, Stores, and Savings Bank branches, which should be useful in the grading of the work of other Departments. We have also agreed on a grading scheme with the Commissioner of Labour.

103. We regret that the time at our disposal did not permit us to grade the work of all Ministries, Departments, and Regional headquarters, but we hope that the work we have done in this field will enable the grading team to complete the work without undue delay or difficulty.

* Cmd. 3909, paragraph 64.

Recruitment

104. As in the case of the Administrative class we recommend recruitment to the normal entry grade of the Executive class partly by open competition for persons outside the Service and partly by limited competition from Clerical and analogous classes.

105. The open competition for recruitment to this grade should be arranged by the Public Service Commission and should be confined to candidates between the ages of 20 and 22 years with the minimum academic qualifications (viz., School Certificate Classes I and II or higher). We suggest a minimum age limit of 20 for this competition as roughly corresponding to the age at which the Higher School Certificate standard is reached in West Africa and at which candidates can be expected to have made up their minds whether or not to proceed to higher education at a University or elsewhere.

106. The competition should consist of a written examination which should preferably be set by an independent body (such as the proposed West African Examinations Council) in consultation with the Public Service Commission. The aim of the examination should not be to check the academic attainments of the candidates but to assist in assessing their general knowledge, imagination, initiative and aptitudes. The written examination should be followed by an interview before a Board arranged for by the Public Service Commission and marks for personal qualities should be awarded by the Board on a pre-determined basis. There should be a minimum qualifying combined mark for these two tests, and if sufficient candidates to fill the vacancies reserved for direct entry do not qualify, the remaining posts should be re-allocated to the limited competition or held in abeyance until the following year. Not more than two attempts at the open competition should be allowed.

107. The proportion of vacancies in the basic Executive grade filled by open competition in the United Kingdom amounts to two-thirds and we consider this to be the proportion at which the Gold Coast should aim. It is a feature of the structure that we propose for the Gold Coast Civil Service, that the highest departmental posts and a number of the high administrative posts should be within the reach of officers who have passed through the Executive ranks. If this prospect is to be realised it is clear that the basic executive grade should be filled largely by candidates who not only have a comparatively high standard of academic education but have also shown, by successfully qualifying for direct entry, that they are among the best products of their year and have potentialities which should in time fit them for the highest executive posts in the Service.

108. The limited competition should be open to members of Clerical and analogous classes who are between the ages of 23 and 30 years, have had at least five years satisfactory service under Government, and have obtained a departmental nomination to sit the competition. The competition should take the form of a centrally conducted written examination in two parts, (a) general, on the lines of the open competition and compulsory, and (b) a series of optional questions with a bearing on Civil Service work, set with a view to ascertaining the candidate's fitness and aptitude for special departmental work such as accounting. There should be a minimum qualifying percentage. In view of the element of pre-selection by Departments there should be no necessity for an interview and appointments should be made on the results of the written examination. Not more than three attempts at the competition should be allowed.

109. The preceding paragraphs set out the pattern of recruitment to the basic Executive grade, towards which the Gold Coast Government should work. We are, however, only too well aware that it will be some time before the recruiting procedure will fit neatly into this pattern and special arrangements will have to be made for the transitional period. We do not propose to make detailed recommendations on the procedure which should be adopted at every stage during this period since we feel that these decisions must be taken from year to year in the light of prevailing circumstances. We consider however that we have a responsibility for advising on the procedure to be adopted for the immediate reorganisation of the existing Service.

110. As soon as the work of reclassifying and regrading of posts and fixing of complements has been finished, steps will have to be taken to fill the new executive posts (Executive Officer, Higher Executive Officer, and above). Officers already occupying 'D' scale posts should be regarded as occupying executive posts and no promotion procedure is involved. The general effect will however be that a large number of new executive posts will be created and the size of the Clerical Service will be considerably reduced. It is clearly equitable that serving officers in clerical grades should be given first consideration for appointment to the new Executive posts. We recommend that special reports should be submitted by Heads of Departments to the Public Service Commission on all First and Senior Division Clerical Officers on the form at Appendix XIII and that in addition copies of all confidential reports on, and service records of these officers should be attached to the special report. On the basis of this information, supplemented by interview if considered necessary, the Public Service Commission should advise the Governor on the suitability of these officers to fill posts of Higher Clerical Officer (see paragraph 126), Higher Executive Officer, or above. Officers who are not considered suitable for any of these posts may have to be retired from the Service on "abolition of office" terms. Any remaining vacancies in the grades of Higher Executive Officer and Higher Clerical Officer, should be filled by a similar selection from Clerical Officers above the £190 efficiency bar. We strongly recommend that in making selections from within these two groups the Public Service Commission will take account of seniority only as a last resort where two or more officers are in all other respects equally well qualified. We do not recommend at this stage promotion from Clerical Officers below the £190 efficiency bar to the grades of Higher Executive Officer and Higher Clerical Officer. Any remaining vacancies in these grades should be filled by normal promotion procedure from the appropriate grades in the new structure and the Executive grade should be allowed to carry supernumary posts against vacancies in the Higher Executive Officer grade.

111. The posts of Executive Officer should be filled as follows :—

- (i) By appointment from serving officers above the £190 or equivalent efficiency bar recommended by the Public Service Commission on the basis of the information referred to in the preceding paragraph. It should be noted that the Public Service Commission may see fit to recommend that a clerk is suitable for appointment as Executive Officer but not for Higher Executive Officer. A recommendation of this nature would not preclude the officer concerned from consideration in due course for further promotion in the Executive grade, and in fact it would be implicit in such a recommendation that *prima facie* he should, after some experience in the lower executive grade, be able to qualify for further promotion. We anticipate that because of the present lack of opportunities for gaining experience of executive work there will be a number of cases where the Public Service Commission will prefer that officers should be given an opportunity to prove themselves in the lower executive grade before proceeding to the higher executive posts.
- (ii) By limited competition open to members of clerical and analogous grades below the £190 or equivalent efficiency bar who are nominated by Departments as *prima facie* suitable for promotion. The competition should be in the form of a written examination arranged by the Public Service Commission in consultation with Heads of Departments (for optional questions) and on the lines laid down for the limited competition in paragraph 108 above.
- (iii) By an open competition for candidates from outside the Service to be arranged as soon as the claims of all candidates inside the Service have been considered and satisfied. This competition should be open to candidates between the ages of 20 and 32 years who hold a Cambridge School Certificate or its equivalent. As it is desirable to afford an opportunity to enter Government service in this new class to persons with the requisite academic qualifications who have engaged in some other career, we suggest during the reconstruction period an upper age limit of 32 years which should be progressively reduced to 22 after a few years.

112. Seniority between officers appointed to the executive grades under the initial reorganisation should be determined by the date of the letter of appointment for the first two categories and by the date of assumption of duty for the third category. We would emphasise however that we do

not place much importance on the matter of seniority within grades. We consider that too much account has been taken in the past of seniority as a factor in deciding postings and promotions, to the general detriment of the Service.

113. The procedure outlined above will involve a heavy programme of work, particularly for the Public Service Commission, and will inevitably create a degree of dislocation in the Public Service. We do not think it will be possible to complete the process in less than a year. It will be appreciated however that a major reconstruction of the kind we recommend cannot be undertaken without some temporary loss of efficiency in the execution of the normal daily business during the transition period. When the initial translations have taken place the nucleus of the new Service structure will have been formed and the recruiting procedure can follow more normal lines. It will be some time of course before it will be possible or desirable to recruit two-thirds of the basic executive grade vacancies by direct entry through the open competition, but, subject to the availability of suitable candidates, we suggest that not less than 20 per cent. of the vacancies should be reserved in the first instance for direct recruitment. This figure should be increased as circumstances permit until the recommended figure of two-thirds is reached.

114. When the transition stage has been passed, vacancies in the executive grade not filled by direct entry should be filled by limited competition as outlined in paragraph 108 and there should normally be no promotion from the Clerical to the basic Executive grade other than by limited competition, though it may be necessary for a year or two to allow some flexibility in the matter of age limits. A Clerical Officer who fails to obtain promotion to Executive Officer must look for his advancement to the grade of Higher Clerical Officer from which he may be considered strictly on merit for promotion to Higher Executive Officer in competition with officers on the Executive Officer grade.

Recruitment of Expatriates for the Higher Executive Grades

115. Executive work at the lower levels is normally of a general nature and should not require special qualifications and experience. It will be seen however from the gradings set out in detail for each Department in Chapter XIV that most of the posts in the Executive class above Higher Executive Officer level do require special qualifications and experience. It is our hope and belief that the organisation we propose will afford to Africans of the requisite calibre the opportunity to develop their qualities to the full by employment on responsible work from an early stage in their career and, ultimately, to fill these higher posts to the exclusion of expatriate recruitment. Africans will however need to acquire the necessary technical qualifications for the higher work and we assume that they will be given every opportunity, by means of scholarships and any other assistance that may be required, to obtain the technical training either in the United Kingdom or elsewhere. Meanwhile, when the Public Service Commission is unable to find suitably qualified Africans to fill vacancies in the grades above the Higher Executive Officer level, recourse must be had to the recruitment of expatriates subject to the conditions laid down in paragraph 24 of the Report of the Select Committee of the Legislative Council on the Africanization of the Public Service*. We refer later in our Report to the conditions on which contract appointments of expatriates should be made but it is appropriate that we should sound a note of warning here. Contract appointments do not provide that continuity which is essential in many cases and unless there is a reasonable prospect of a suitably qualified African being available at an early date it might be preferable to appoint an expatriate on pensionable terms. There are also many posts to which expatriates cannot be attracted on other than pensionable terms and it seems likely to us that the Gold Coast will continue to find it necessary for some time to make a substantial number of expatriate appointments on pensionable terms.

Remuneration

116. The Executive class covers a much wider range of duties and responsibilities than any other class in the Service and we recommend that there should be six grades on salary scales within the class, in addition to a number of super-scale posts. Starting with the Executive Officer grade and the Higher Executive Officer grade,

* Sessional Paper No. 1 of 1950.

both of which are titles common to all Departments, and rising from these through a number of executive posts carrying departmental titles, we recommend the following salary scales :—

(i) £200—£15—£350	Executive Officer.
(ii) £370—£20—£500	Higher Executive Officer.
(iii) £550—£25—£700	} Senior departmental executive posts.
(iv) £750—£30—£960	
(v) £1000—£40—£1080	
(vi) £1150—£50—£1250	
Superscale posts	Directors and Deputies.

PROFESSIONAL CLASSES

Definition

117. The professional classes for the purpose of our Report include all posts, appointments to which require a recognised professional or scientific qualification. These are Legal, Medical, Engineering (Civil, Electrical, Mechanical, Wireless), Architects, Agriculture, Forestry, Animal Health, Education, and a number of scientific posts such as Geologists, Entomologists and Analytical Chemists. The qualifications are roughly equivalent to the Honours degree normally required for entry to the Administrative class and entry to a Professional class is or should be strictly reserved to applicants holding the requisite academic qualifications or other qualifications recognised by the appropriate professional association. No amount of experience or practical knowledge should normally be accepted as an alternative qualification.

Functions

118. Professional officers are the specialists of the Civil Service. They are highly trained in both theory and practice in a limited sphere. Within that sphere they are the Government experts whose function is to advise on all matters within their specialised fields, as well as to undertake such planning and organising as may arise from declared policy involving action by them. It follows that Professional officers are entitled to demand that they should invariably be consulted before decisions are reached on matters within their sphere. It does not however follow that their advice must be accepted. On this point we are in agreement with the following views expressed in a Paper read to the Institute of Public Administration by Sir Francis Floud on the 11th January, 1923, and accepted by the Royal Commission on the Civil Service 1929-31 :—

“ A specialist may recommend that a particular policy should be adopted by his Department (Ministry in the Gold Coast terminology). In such a case he is not entitled to claim that his advice must be taken. Wider considerations than intrinsic merit have to be weighed, and it may be found that what is desirable is not expedient, and that consequently the advice of the specialist must be rejected ” but “. . . where a policy has been decided on, and a question arises as to the best method of carrying it out, if the question raises technical issues the specialist advisers of the Department must be consulted, and in such a case their advice ought, save in very exceptional circumstances, to be taken.”

Relationship with Administrative Officers

119. In paragraphs 19 and 20 we have indicated that Professional Officers should not normally tender advice directly to their Ministers but that the Permanent Secretary should be the sole officer responsible for advising the Minister. This arrangement does not appear to us to involve any danger that the Ministers will not be fully apprised of the views of departmental officers on any problem. It is the duty of the administrative staff in Ministries to ensure that Professional Departments and officers are fully consulted in advance on any project concerning them and that they should feel assured that their views have been taken fully into consideration. It is equally important that departmental officers should be kept fully informed of decisions taken by the responsible authority. This is a major function of Administrative officers and, judging by evidence we have heard, one which has not always been performed as well as it might have been. We were pleased to note that in a number of Ministries the need for co-operation and personal contact with Departments was keenly appreciated and effective steps were being taken to secure it.

120. We wish to stress that in our view, in spite of the difference in function the Administrative and Professional services are complementary and of equal status. Following this principle we recommend the same salary scales for both services. Professional officers are eligible for consideration for the high administrative posts, and two of the present Secretaries to Ministries began their careers in Professional Departments. While, however, professional officers should be able to compete with administrative officers for the high administrative posts, we consider it likely that in practice most of these posts will be filled by officers who have wider experience than can generally be obtained in the limited sphere of departmental work.

Relationship to Technical Officers

121. The preceding paragraphs deal mainly with the relationship of the Professional classes to the Administrative class. We now turn to consider the relationship of the Professional class to the immediately subordinate technical classes. This relationship is very similar to that between the Administrative class and the Executive class. We have recommended that the new Executive class should take over much work at present being performed by Administrative officers in the absence of an Executive class. Subordinate technical classes do exist but it is none the less important to guard against a tendency to employ fully qualified professional officers on work capable of being performed by trained staff of long experience who have risen from subordinate grades but who may not possess an approved professional qualification. The Professional officers should be employed in a planning, consultative and inspecting capacity, and when the necessary plans have been made and instructions issued the execution of the work should frequently be capable of performance by less highly qualified officers, subject to inspection by Professional officers. This recommendation will not normally apply to professional fields such as Law and Clinical Medicine but it has a particular application to engineering and medical health work. It may also apply to agriculture and forestry. The Gold Coast in common with other countries is suffering from a shortage of professional and scientific staff at a time when the needs of development call for the rapid expansion of those Departments. In these circumstances hard-pressed Heads of Departments have had to give greater responsibility to unqualified staff than they would normally contemplate. We have ourselves inspected a waterworks scheme estimated to cost some £200,000, the construction of which was being supervised by a Chief Inspector of Works. The plans had been prepared by an Engineer in Accra whose other duties permitted him to visit the site only at infrequent intervals. We understand that the work was proceeding satisfactorily and we feel that more use could be made of Inspectors of Works of that calibre to relieve Engineers of responsibility for the execution of works. We have heard much evidence of the mass of non-technical work which professional officers are required to undertake and we make recommendations to improve this situation ; but professional officers are also engaged on much work of a technical or semi-professional character which could, we feel, be delegated to less highly qualified officers. Fully qualified Engineers should not be concerned with the redecoration of bungalows and offices, and, if District Commissioners can be entrusted to construct bungalows with no professional advice at all, we see no reason why Inspectors of Works should not undertake *ab initio* the planning and construction of the many semi-permanent buildings being erected in the larger Government stations. In similar ways we think that Sanitary Superintendents and Inspectors should be able to carry out health measures leaving the Medical Officer of Health to be responsible for planning and inspection over wide areas. These proposals require detailed consideration by the Departments concerned but it should be noted that they are made not as a temporary measure to tide over the present shortage of fully qualified staff, but as a permanent feature of the Civil Service structure. They have the dual merit of economising in expensive professional staff which is difficult to recruit, and of providing reasonable career prospects for unqualified technical staff, by giving this class some of the work previously regarded as professional work.

TECHNICAL CLASSES

122. The Technical classes are equivalent to the Executive class in their respective Departments and in their relationship to the class immediately superior to them. Like the professional class for whom they work, technical officers are specialists and can rarely look for advancement outside

their own Departments. Nor can they normally look for promotion to the Professional class. They include Inspectors of Works, Sanitary Superintendents, Draughtsmen, Technical Assistants, Dispensers, Agricultural Assistants, Forest Rangers, etc. They are the officers who are responsible for giving effect to the technical side of Government policy. Their position in the structure of the Service and their function is clear and we have no special comment on this class.

Recruitment

123. There can be no common method of entry to the various posts coming within this class. At the present moment the difficulty is in attracting sufficient candidates of the requisite minimum qualifications, and until this position is altered, it does not seem necessary to arrange for any entrance examination other than departmental interview. We suggest, however, that it might avoid overlapping if the Agriculture, Forestry and Animal Health Departments arranged a common selection procedure. Similarly the Medical Department might pool its examination of applicants for appointments to the various technical posts in that Department. In certain Departments, however, entry to technical posts is normally by way of promotion from a subordinate position and it is not possible to lay down hard and fast rules for any of these posts.

THE CLERICAL AND SUB-CLERICAL CLASSES

Clerical Assistants— Duties

124. The work of the class of Clerical Assistant may be summarised as routine clerical duties up to and including the preparation, verification and scrutiny of straightforward documents, statistics, records, etc. ; the preparation of other documents, etc., subject to check ; simple arithmetical calculations with or without the aid of office machinery ; the simpler forms of registry work ; simple correspondence of the stock letter and printed form type under well-defined general instructions ; the operation of office machines where convenient. This is a description rather than a rigid definition, and other similar duties may also be assigned to the class. The higher ranges of Clerical Assistant duties overlap with the lower ranges of Clerical Officer duties.

Clerical Officer—Duties

125. The work of the class of Clerical Officer may be defined as comprising all the simpler clerical duties not assigned to Clerical Assistants and in addition the duties of dealing with particular cases in accordance with well-defined regulations, instructions or general practice ; scrutinising, checking and cross-checking straightforward accounts, claims, returns, etc., under well-defined instructions ; preparation of material for returns, accounts and statistics in prescribed forms ; simple drafting and précis work ; collection of material on which judgments can be formed ; supervision of work of Clerical Assistants.

Higher Clerical Officer —Duties

126. Posts of Higher Clerical Officers should be entirely supervisory. They are required where a number of Clerical Officers are employed, usually but not necessarily in the same room, on fairly large blocks of routine work. The Higher Clerical Officer should be the officer in charge of such blocks of work and of the Clerical Officers engaged on it. He should not himself be an " operative ", but he should be responsible for checking the accuracy of work done and for general supervision of the arrangements to get the work done, allocation of duties, discipline and time-keeping. He should normally have, himself, a detailed knowledge of the block of work of which he is in charge. We comment later on the need for increased supervision in all branches of the Service and we wish to stress that this is a supervisory post and must be used as such. The officer must not be employed to do the work himself but he must be held responsible for the speed and efficiency with which it is done by the officers in his charge.

Clerical Assistants— Recruitment

127. This class does not at present exist in the Gold Coast Service except that a certain number of Temporary Clerical Assistants with relatively low educational qualifications have been recruited to make good the shortage in Clerical Officers of the requisite educational standard (School Certificate). As we understand the matter, these temporary officers are employed on clerical duties indiscriminately with Clerical Officers proper, and no general steps have been taken to grade the work to fit in with the educational standard attained by the two classes of officer mentioned. The first

step therefore will be for the grading team to reclassify the clerical work of Departments in accordance with the definitions set out above. When this has been done and the number of Clerical Assistant vacancies has been determined, recruitment for the new grade can begin. First refusal of the new posts should, we suggest, be given to those temporary Clerical Assistants who can be certified by the Head of their Department to have given at least six months thoroughly satisfactory service in a temporary capacity. The balance of the vacancies, if any, should be filled by a competition open to both boys and girls between the ages of 16 and 22. Entry to the competition should be restricted to candidates who had obtained the Primary School Leaving Certificate less than 4 years previously, and not more than three attempts should be allowed. There should be a small entry fee to discourage frivolous entries from what is potentially a very wide field. Ultimately we hope that the West African Examinations Council will conduct the examination upon lines decided upon after consultation with the Public Service Commission. Meanwhile, an *ad hoc* written examination will have to be arranged by some central authority, preferably in the form of a test on knowledge of English, simple arithmetic, and general intelligence. The examination would have to be held in several of the main centres of the Gold Coast, and on the same day.

The scale that we recommend for this class is :—

£90 × £5—£120 × £6—£144.

128. Clerical Assistants should be given a promotion outlet to the Clerical class by means of a limited competition to be arranged after consultation with the Public Service Commission. This competition should be open to officers with a minimum of 5 years satisfactory service who are between the ages of 22 and 30 years. Three attempts at the competition might be allowed.

129. We have considered whether entry to this class should be restricted to girls as in the United Kingdom, but have reluctantly accepted the advice given to us that such a restriction is undesirable at the present time in the special conditions obtaining in the Gold Coast. We have, however, been struck by the fact that apart from nursing and teaching, there are few opportunities of employment open to unmarried African girls, and some 4,000 of them reach the Primary School Leaving Certificate standard each year. Girls normally leave the Service on marriage and are therefore better suited to the work of the sub-clerical class with its necessarily limited promotion prospects. We hope therefore that the question of restricting this class to girls can be reviewed in a few years time.

Clerical Officers— Recruitment

130. When the clerical work has been re-graded as proposed, and a separation effected between the work proper to the Clerical class, according to the definition set out above, and that proper to Executive,

Clerical Assistant and Typist classes, the numbers of the Clerical class should be sensibly reduced. In the case of the Post Office, where we were able to make a detailed study, the diminution amounts to roughly one-third of the class, and in the Audit and similar Departments, the reduction should, we expect, be much greater. We hope in this way to have made some contribution towards diminishing the drain on the output of successful candidates from the School Certificate examination, which has to serve for so many forms of governmental and non-governmental activities in the Gold Coast, and about which the Africanization Committee were so concerned (paragraphs 40-44 of their Report).

131. The School Certificate should, however, remain the educational qualification for the Clerical grade and, this being so, we do not consider that any further examination test need be imposed for the time being. When however, the numbers of successful candidates for the School Certificate examination have markedly increased—and the number may be doubled by the end of the present decade—it will be necessary to prescribe an examination as a basis of selection among the applicants for posts in the Clerical class.

132. The age limits for this class, which should be open to both men and women, should, we think, remain at the present level, viz., 16 to 24 years.

The salary that we recommend is :—

£120 × £10—£270.

133. The promotion outlet, apart from the limited competition for entrance to the Executive class, will be to the grade of Higher Clerical Officer.

Higher Clerical Officer— 134. The duties of the Higher Clerical Officer grade are given in the —**appointment, etc.** definition of the work of this class set out in paragraph 126 above.

135. The pay that we propose for the Higher Clerical Officer is £290 × £15—£350. As stated in paragraph 114, Higher Clerical Officers should be considered strictly on their merits for vacancies in the Higher Executive Officer grade, in competition with officers on the Executive Officer grade. It is desirable that, in view of the difficulty that will obviously be experienced in co-ordinating the promotion of officers of different grades employed on different work, promotions to the grade of Higher Executive Officer should be made only after consultation with the Public Service Commission.

TYPISTS AND CONNECTED CLASSES

Typists

136. Typing and the limited amount of stenography done in the Government service of the Gold Coast is at present one of the functions of the Clerical class—a function to be performed in the intervals of other work. This arrangement, as the Africanization Committee have pointed out in paragraphs 50–54 of their Report, is wasteful in staff. It is also inefficient and uneconomic. It is wasteful because it involves the employment on typing, of clerks with School Certificate qualifications—and as we have already pointed out, there is a desperate shortage in the Gold Coast of officers with such a qualification—whereas typing work can safely be entrusted to officers with lower educational qualifications, e.g., the Primary School Leaving Certificate. It is also wasteful in staff because promising officers tend to be kept on typing because of their proficiency in the art, to the detriment of their career in the Service, as a result of the limitations so imposed upon their opportunities to acquire a wider knowledge of their work. It is inefficient and uneconomic because typing is best done by trained typists who perform no other function and work in pools, large or small as the case may be, under adequate professional supervision. We have seen an experimental pool of typists—in its early stages it is true—operating in the office of the Government Statistician in the manner that we suggest, and we have no doubt of its success. It is also the way in which typing work is organised in the British Civil Service. The organisation of typing work in pools has the additional advantage that it should ensure the fullest possible use of the limited number of typewriters available, about which we heard many complaints.

137. We accordingly recommend that early steps be taken to recruit and train a class of typists, and that this class should ultimately take over all typing work in Government Departments, excluding possibly the smallest offices where special arrangements may be necessary. They should work in pools under adequate supervision—not only in the interests of efficiency, but in order to provide an adequate promotion outlet for the class. The initial training will be a difficulty, but there are many commercial schools in the Gold Coast where the rudiments of typing can be acquired, and, as we said, the Government Statistician has already shown what can be done by building on this foundation. There is, too, a typing school under the control of the Education Department, but its output is limited. Existing training facilities will have to be expanded immediately if the scheme we have in mind is to be carried out within a reasonable period, and we make specific recommendations to this end in Chapter X.

138. It will, of course, be necessary to retain the existing system in its present form until the new system is in working order, but it should progressively disappear. As far as possible, small Departments should be grouped for typing purposes so as to justify a proper typing pool with proper supervision. The same principle might be followed at District Commissioners' stations, or even Regional Commissioners' headquarters, where the size of the offices might not justify a pool, but grouped, such offices might well provide enough work for a pool. Such a system may give rise to some difficulties of organisation but it can be made to work, and in the long run lead to much greater typing efficiency. At offices or stations so small or so remote from other offices that grouping is impracticable, it will be necessary to maintain the present system of clerk-typists.

Pay & Qualifications

139. The pay we propose for a qualified typist is :—

£95 × £5—£120 × £6—£144.

The minimum standard for appointment as a Typist should be 30 words per minute, and a rate of 40 words per minute should be acquired before proceeding beyond the £120 point in the salary scale.

140. As with the Clerical Assistants, we would have preferred, both on sociological grounds and on grounds of greater aptitude for the work, to have reserved typing work for women, but in view of the special conditions obtaining in the Gold Coast, we agree that the exclusion of men from this class is undesirable at the present time, although we hope that consideration may be given to the point at a later date, when conditions may have changed.

Stenography

141. Shorthand, like typing, is at present one of the functions of the Clerical class, and certain standard allowances are granted for proficiency in this art, viz :—

- (i) Lower Standard—£24 per annum for proficiency in shorthand at the rate of 80 words a minute and in typing at the rate of 30 words a minute;
- (ii) Higher Standard—£36 per annum for proficiency in shorthand at the rate of 110 words a minute and in typing at the rate of 40 words a minute.

Proficiency in shorthand, however, is much less common than in typing, and it has been found necessary, subject to certain conditions, to use First Division and Senior Division officers for this work. There is no reason, however, why a start should not be made to build up this shorthand service by the same methods of recruitment and training as we suggest for typists. Stenographers, like typists, should work in the typing pools.

Pay & Qualifications

142. The salary we suggest for this grade is :—

£120 × £6—£144 × £8—£200.

The standards of proficiency might be as follows :—

- (i) On recruitment as trainee shorthand-typist :
Shorthand 60 words a minute ; typing 30 words a minute.
- (ii) On passing out of the school as proficient :
Shorthand 80 words a minute ; typing 30 words a minute.
- (iii) Standard to pass beyond the £144 incremental point :
Shorthand 100 words a minute ; typing 40 words a minute.

In the British Civil Service proficiency allowances of 5s. per week pensionable are granted to typists and shorthand-writers who reach the standard of 120 words a minute shorthand, and typing 50 words a minute, but this is a refinement which possibly may not be necessary to contemplate in the Gold Coast Service at the present time.

The lower age limit for this grade might be 18 years. We do not recommend an upper age limit.

Supervision of typing pools

143. Where the size of the typing group is small, say six or less, a full supervising post would not be warranted. In that event, we recommend a supervising allowance of £1 a month to the typist or stenographer in charge, where the staff supervised is as much as three and does not exceed six.

Allowance holders should continue to perform normal duties as shorthand-typist or typist, as and when required. If there is a shorthand-typist in the group, the person in charge should normally be proficient in shorthand. Where the staff exceeds six, we recommend a full supervising post—Supervisor of Shorthand-typists—on a scale £210 × £10—£270. If the number of the group exceeds fourteen, a Supervisor may be assisted in the supervision by one or more Allowance holders, as required. The Supervisor should normally be proficient in shorthand if the group to be supervised contains shorthand staff, though he or she should not normally be engaged on typing or shorthand. He or she is responsible for maintaining the rate of output and for the accuracy of work. The duties will involve the allocation and checking of work and the maintenance of discipline, time-keeping, etc.

Stenographer/Secretaries 144. We have observed in the Gold Coast that the need for Stenographer/Secretaries for senior officers has manifested itself in many directions. It has been met in the past by the employment of expatriate women (usually the wives of persons resident in the Gold Coast) in a temporary capacity. There have been very few permanent established posts for this category of employee until recently, when we understand twenty non-pensionable posts of Private Secretary were created for allocation to the various Ministries. The original intention was that these posts should be filled in the first instance by the engagement of expatriate women on contract terms. The creation of the posts was approved by the Legislature on the understanding that early steps would be taken to train Africans for appointment to permanent and pensionable posts of Private Secretary. We agree that a number of permanent posts should be created to provide aides for senior officers. The holders of these posts would normally work to specified senior officers. Their duties would be to deal with incoming and outgoing correspondence other than that coming through the normal office channels, to arrange interviews, programmes, itineraries, to deal with minor enquiries, etc., and generally to relieve their chief of the mass of petty detail involved in the machinery of a Government office. They should work in an office adjacent to that of the senior officer, and should be available to work whatever hours the senior officer should require, irrespective of the normal office hours. In addition, they should act as personal stenographer to the senior officer concerned. This is a most important part of the duties, and proficiency in shorthand and typing is therefore an essential qualification. It will be seen from this description of the work that it is partly that of a proficient stenographer, but also partly executive in character, requiring a degree of judgment, initiative, commonsense, personal loyalty and integrity, above that required for straightforward shorthand-typing. We therefore recommend that these posts should be allocated the same salary as Executive Officers (£200-£350). In view of the long hours they will be required to work to adapt themselves to the requirements of their chiefs, and of the personal responsibility involved, it may be desirable to follow the British Civil Service practice and to allocate to them an allowance of say £4 per month. We have given some thought to the title which should be given to these posts. We have rejected the titles Private Secretary, Personal Secretary, Confidential Secretary, and Personal Assistant, in favour of a new title—Stenographer/Secretary—which is more truly descriptive of the duties and qualifications required.

145. In due course we hope that these posts will provide an outlet for the best of the shorthand-typing staff, but for the present, the most promising source of recruitment seems to be from clerks in the Service who are proficient in shorthand and typing, and have also the qualities which would fit them for promotion to the general executive class. We recommend therefore that any serving clerks who, in the course of the reorganisation of the Service, are promoted to Executive Officer, and who are proficient to the present higher standard level in shorthand and typing, should be eligible to apply for appointment as Stenographer/Secretary. There should be no necessity to apply any special selection procedure in such cases unless there are more applications than vacancies. Successful applicants should be given a trial period not exceeding six weeks to three months during which time it is hoped that the expatriate woman secretary at present performing the duties will give him training and advice in his secretarial functions. The trial period will give the officer concerned an opportunity to decide whether he has any real aptitude for it. If he is appointed to the post after the trial period, he should be required to serve in it for a period of not less than two years at the discretion of the Government. At the end of that period he should be allowed at his own discretion to revert to general duties as an Executive Officer. This provision is necessary as the officers concerned may consider that their prospects of advancement are prejudiced if they are engaged too long as Stenographer/Secretaries.

146. The above arrangements apply to the transitional period only, and when, in a few years time, candidates for these appointments may be forthcoming from the ranks of Shorthand-Typists and Supervisors of typing pools, it will be necessary to set up some kind of interview Board to judge the relative merits of applicants. Stenographer/Secretaries appointed in this way would have no option of transferring as Executive Officers. They would not, however, be excluded from consideration for promotion as Higher Executive Officers, though in practice, it seems unlikely that they will be able in many cases to compete successfully for these posts. We hope that in

due course African women of the requisite qualifications will be attracted to these posts, which are normally more suitable for women than for men.

147. We would be failing in our duty if we did not comment on the possibility of it proving impossible to find, at the present time, sufficient African candidates fully qualified to fill all the posts of Stenographer/Secretary which are required. We are firmly convinced that the hard-pressed civil servants must have such assistance, and it must be of the right quality. If candidates cannot be found locally, it is clearly in the interests of economy and efficiency that they should be found elsewhere—by expatriate recruitment. Such recruitment, if it should prove necessary, should be on short term contract, or alternatively by temporary appointment of wives of expatriate residents—this latter expedient would be cheaper since it does not involve the payment of overseas pay or the provision of accommodation. The rates we prescribe for the permanent grade would not, of course, suffice for Europeans recruited on a temporary basis, and it would be necessary to adjust the pay accordingly. Provided appointments are not made to the pensionable staff on salaries which would upset the permanent structure, we do not consider that financial considerations should be given too much weight; the important thing is that fully competent Stenographer/Secretaries, from whatever source, African or European, should be recruited at an early date.

Legislative Assembly Reporters

148. Until the present financial year, there were no special posts to provide for the reporting of the proceedings of the Legislative Assembly. The work was done by clerks in various Departments who were proficient in shorthand and typing, and they were paid an allowance of 12s. a day while engaged on Legislative Assembly work. This arrangement was recognised as unsatisfactory. In the first place the clerks concerned did not have sufficient practice in speed shorthand throughout the year and the standard of reporting suffered accordingly. Secondly, these clerks were carried on the ordinary establishment of Departments, which were deprived of their services for lengthy periods. In the Estimates of Expenditure for 1951–52, eight posts of Reporter have been created on a salary scale of £400×£15–£550. The posts are non-pensionable, the salary scale is provisional, and we have been specially requested to include in our Report recommendations in regard to these posts.

149. It is expected that the Legislative Assembly will sit for about five to six months in the year (statement by Minister for Finance in the Committee of Supply on the 1951–52 Estimates of Expenditure), and, if account is taken of the time needed for transcription of notes, etc., and the requirements of Legislative Assembly Committees and other Committees, there is clearly a need for a number of permanent posts of Reporter. In the United Kingdom and Ceylon, Parliamentary Reporters are not members of the Civil Service and their salaries and other conditions of service are not governed by Civil Service rules. In the Gold Coast, however, the staff of the Assembly are civil servants and we see no objection to this arrangement, particularly at present when the Civil Service provides the only source of recruitment. The work of a Parliamentary Reporter requires a very high degree of proficiency in stenography and it is a specialised job which is technical rather than executive in character. We consider that in order to perform the duties with the degree of efficiency the Legislative Assembly has the right to expect, Reporters should be able to take shorthand at a minimum rate of 160 words per minute and to type at the rate of 60 words a minute. This represents a comparatively high degree of technical skill and we accordingly recommend that the posts should be allocated a pensionable salary scale equal to that of senior technical posts in other branches of the Service, viz., £370–£500. In making this recommendation, we have taken into account the necessarily limited opportunities for further advancement in the Service as well as the fact that stenographers of this calibre could, we presume, command reasonably high salaries outside the Public Service. We have assumed that these Reporters will work under the immediate control of the Recorder of the Assembly (a post to which we would allocate a salary of £550–£700), and that the latter post may provide an outlet for the advancement of an exceptionally well qualified Reporter. If this is not so, we consider that there should be at least one part-supervisory post of Senior Reporter carrying an allowance of £100 per annum over and above the normal salary scale.

150. We are aware that the stenographic qualifications which we have recommended for

Reporters are much higher than have previously been laid down for shorthand-typists in the Gold Coast, but we are of the opinion that the standards we have prescribed represent the minimum necessary to ensure that the proceedings of the Legislative Assembly are accurately recorded. In this connection, we understand that Parliamentary Reporters in the United Kingdom are required to pass an examination in speed shorthand at 200 words per minute and should have a typing standard of 70 words per minute. We appreciate, however, that candidates with the requisite qualifications may not be immediately available and that in the meantime it is necessary that the work of recording the proceedings of the Legislative Assembly should continue to be done. If this should prove to be the position we would see no objection as a temporary expedient to accepting for appointment to these posts candidates who have reached a shorthand speed of 140 words per minute, on the understanding that the appointment is on trial and that a speed of 160 words per minute shorthand and 60 words per minute typing must be attained within a period of two years. If insufficient candidates with the reduced shorthand speed are forthcoming, it will be necessary to deal with the problem by means of secondment with appropriate allowance according to the speed reached.

Machine Operators

151. Certain Accounting Machines such as Powers-Samas and Hollerith, need specially trained staff and special grades are appropriate for this work, including incidental ancillary manual and clerical work. So far as we are aware, these tabulators are used only in one or two Departments at the present time, but we gather that there are schemes under consideration for the extension of their use. The grades of pay that we suggest are as follows :—

Machine Assistant : £90 × £5—£120 × £6—£144

Machine Operators : £120 × £6—£144 × £8—£200

Senior Machine Operators : £210 × £10—£270.

Machine Assistants should perform the simplest work, Machine Operators the more complex, and Senior Machine Operators the best, including supervision and training. A statement is set out at Appendix VI showing the standards laid down for each of these grades.

SEMI-SKILLED AND SKILLED LABOUR, ETC., INCLUDING UNESTABLISHED STAFF

152. We have discussed in the preceding paragraphs the place in the structure of the Public Service of the Administrative, Executive, and Clerical Classes, together with their counterparts in the Professional and Technical spheres. These classes form the corporate body known as the Civil Service, which is the machine established to ensure the uniform application and enforcement of rules made by the representatives of the Public of the Gold Coast for the general conduct of life in a civilised community. These officers have a peculiar position in that, with the exception of some professional and technical officers, the work on which they are engaged has no counterpart outside the Civil Service. In many ways this is a most disadvantageous position, since the civil servant has no legally enforceable contract of employment and holds his appointment at the pleasure of the Crown. Moreover, experience of Civil Service work does not normally qualify him for alternative employment, and, in fact, his employability outside the Service tends to decrease in inverse proportion to his length of service. For these reasons special regulations are laid down governing the conditions of employment of civil servants. These regulations form an elaborate code prescribing the procedure for dealing with individual civil servants in almost every conceivable situation. The adoption of this procedure can only be justified by the peculiar nature of the civil servant's conditions of service.

153. Around this core of the Civil Service, however, there exists a substantial number of employees who are engaged on types of work not peculiar to the Civil Service, but which have counterparts in most other commercial, industrial, etc., enterprises. These are the ancillaries of the Civil Service and they range from the unskilled labourer to the skilled artisan. The importance of these classes is not under-estimated, but they are in a different position from the type of civil servant referred to in the previous paragraph. Their labour, skilled or unskilled, is a commodity

for which the Government is only one of many possible buyers, and they naturally tend to sell to the employer offering the best terms. Open market rates for these classes of employees can thus be fairly readily ascertained.

154. In the Gold Coast large numbers of semi-skilled and skilled employees have been absorbed into the pattern of the Civil Service structure both as regards remuneration and other conditions of service, as the result of the recommendations contained in the Report of the Committee on the Unestablished and Daily Paid Subordinate Staff of the Central Government, 1947*. We have been forced to the conclusion that this was an unfortunate decision and much of the evidence we have heard supports our view.

155. We quote the relevant paragraphs in the above Report :—

“ 19. As regards skilled and semi-skilled labour—from which we exclude Apprentices—we consider that a fixed establishment should be drawn up. This establishment should embrace all posts permanently required. . . . ”

“ 20. We recommend that the establishment for all the categories under consideration should be determined within the framework of the ‘ K ’ and ‘ L ’ scales published in the Harrington Commission’s Report and accepted by this Government in Sessional Paper No. 1 of 1947. In some ways it might have been more convenient to frame new scales without any reference to extraneous factors and based entirely upon the percentage increases which we considered reasonable. As it happened, however, our own estimates, arrived at independently, revealed a remarkable similarity to the scales ‘ K ’ and ‘ L ’ and, since a multiplicity of similar scales is clearly undesirable, we have adopted scales ‘ K ’ and ‘ L ’ for the employees coming within our terms of reference.”

156. The Report does not record the reasons which led to this recommendation, but from evidence deduced from other parts of the Report we conclude that the Committee had in mind a desire for a greater standardisation of terms and conditions of employment in Government service and the need for increased security of employment for certain categories of employees.

157. The “ establishment ” of posts, however, signifies only that the authorised salaries or salary scales, and the cadre, are published in the Estimates of Expenditure, and that financial provision is made under a Personal Emoluments sub-head. It has no inherent significance in regard to either standardisation of conditions of employment or increased security of tenure. These objectives have been achieved in practice by rules issued under administrative direction which could have issued with the same effect irrespective of the “ establishment ” issue.

158. We can see, therefore, no real advantage accruing directly to the employee from the grant of established status, though it is clear to us from the evidence we have received that it is a status which has a considerable prestige value in the estimation of many of the employees concerned. We consider that this is partly due to a widely held view that the increased security of tenure under the new disciplinary rules issued on the recommendation of the same Committee is due to and indistinguishable from “ established ” status. This is, of course, not so. They are two separate and distinct issues and should be treated as such.

159. We should make it clear that we are in full agreement with the motives which we believe to have prompted the “ Korsah Commission ” in this matter. Under the system which that Commission found in existence, large numbers of Government employees of widely differing trades and degrees of skill were paid from open or block votes in the Estimates of Expenditure. These votes did not give any indication of the numbers of the different categories employed or of the rates of remuneration, and as a result the existence of these employees and their conditions of service were not brought prominently to the notice of the Legislature when the Estimates were under consideration by that body. The Government did indeed issue a number of general administrative instructions on rates of remuneration and other conditions of service of this class of employee, but there was practically no machinery to ensure observance of these instructions. Consequently there were wide variances in both rates of remuneration and general conditions of service within the Service. In the United Kingdom the Trade Unions play a responsible part

* Sessional Paper No. V of 1947.

in ensuring observance of uniformity of rates of pay and conditions of service and in protecting the employee from arbitrary dismissal or unnecessarily harsh disciplinary measures, and generally in maintaining favourable conditions of work. In the Gold Coast, however, at the time when the "Korsah Commission" was carrying on its investigations, Trade Unions had not developed to the stage where their organisation could adequately perform this function. The Commission therefore sought to ensure standardisation and at the same time to increase the security of employment of this neglected class by bringing them out of the obscurity of block votes and open votes and placing them prominently in view as established staff under Personal Emoluments sections of the Estimates. We discuss the implications of this decision below, but we stress that we are in accord with the "Korsah Commission" in its desire for a degree of standardisation of conditions of service and for granting a reasonable security of employment to Government employees. Standardisation of conditions of service should be ensured, within broad general definitions which we shall prescribe, by strengthening of establishment and personnel staff in Ministries and Departments, by the advice of the Labour Department on changing conditions, by the introduction of standardised trade tests wherever possible, and above all, by the unremitting watch which should be maintained by the Trade Unions, working in the closest co-operation and in constant negotiation with departmental officers. We attach the greatest importance to this function of Trade Unions and return to it later in our Report. We deal with the question of security of employment and protection from arbitrary disciplinary measures in our Chapter on discipline. We take the opportunity here to point out that the rules governing the payment of gratuities and annual allowances apply equally to daily paid and salaried employees. As regards the objections to paying staff from block votes, the disadvantages to the staff concerned can and should be eliminated by the issue of clear administrative directions on conditions of employment and by the establishment of efficient departmental staff consultative machinery.

160. The main objectionable features we see in the present system are :—

- (i) The number of salary scales available is necessarily restricted and to accommodate within the existing salary framework the vast number of different categories of semi-skilled and skilled employees has called for a Procrustean exercise which has involved in many cases either an injustice to the employee or an unnecessary expenditure of public funds. It is difficult enough to achieve within the Civil Service salary structure the correct relativities between classes whose qualifications, etc., are readily definable; it is practically impossible to do so within a pattern consisting of two main salary scales for the multiplicity of lower grade workers ranging by many degrees from the unskilled to the highly skilled.
- (ii) There is a very real difficulty in defining semi-skilled and skilled labour. In this connection we invite reference to the dispute regarding the classification of Crane Cable Attendants in the Railways and Harbours Administration*. It was ruled in this matter that Crane Cable Attendants are not semi-skilled labourers. We observe, however, that employees such as conservancy labourers are classified as semi-skilled. In our opinion it is in many cases impossible to determine the line between unskilled work and semi-skilled work and between semi-skilled work and skilled work; to this extent the distinctions made in the "Korsah Report" are artificial. We note also that in a number of cases such as Watchmen, the criterion applied has been the degree of responsibility and not the degree of skill. In other cases we understand that literacy has been accepted as the distinguishing line between semi-skilled and skilled labour.
- (iii) Incremental scales are, generally speaking, unsuitable for this type of employee. We quote from a Report by a Commission on the Organisation, Staffing and Operative Methods of Government Departments in †Ceylon :—

"The main peculiarity about wages in Ceylon is the adoption of incremental scales. In progressive countries there is normally no question of increments for industrial workers.

As soon as an operative is of a certain age, if a general labourer, or as soon as he has

* Award of the Arbitrator in the matter of a Trade Dispute between the Employers and Workmen of the Gold Coast Railway".

† Ceylon Sessional Paper No. V of 1948, paragraph 96.

been through his apprenticeship and is rated as semi-skilled or fully skilled, he receives the full adult Trade Union wage, which, subject to wage adjustments in the industry, will remain the same until he ceases to work on account of death, age, or sickness, or until he is promoted. . . .”.

While we do not accept the full implications of this statement, we consider that the value of the work of this category rarely increases with length of service, and that in the circumstances the expenditure of public funds on the grant of annual increments is difficult to justify. We consider however that some arrangement should be made to recognise degrees of efficiency among this class and in Chapter VII on Salary Structure we recommend the introduction of a system of “merit rating” which we understand is being operated successfully by certain industrial concerns in the United Kingdom.

- (iv) Absorption within the Civil Service salary structure renders it difficult to make rapid adjustments in remuneration to meet fluctuations in the cost of living. It is a generally accepted principle* that Civil Service salaries should reflect the long term trend both in wage levels and in the economic condition of the country and that it is undesirable that the conditions of service of civil servants when under review should be related too closely to factors of a temporary or passing character. The result is that levels of remuneration in the Civil Service react less sensitively to external influences such as fluctuations in the cost of living than is the case in outside industry. This has two disadvantages so far as the categories we are now considering are concerned. In the first place these categories have, in the majority of cases, their exact counterparts outside the Service with whom comparisons can be made. Any improvement in the remuneration of these categories in outside industry which is not followed in the Civil Service will lead to discontent. In the second place the remuneration of the lower paid workers leaves a comparatively small margin to meet increases in the cost of living and it follows that unless early action can be taken to meet increases in the cost of living very real hardship may be caused. But however desirable it may be in certain circumstances to make rapid adjustments in the remuneration of certain categories of employee, the Civil Service salary structure is so finely balanced and closely interlocking that it takes some time to review all the implications involved in even the most minor adjustment. In Chapter VI we recommend measures to allow adjustment of daily rates of pay independently of adjustments to remuneration of established Civil Servants.
- (v) Absorption within the Civil Service structure places restrictions on the freedom of negotiation on rates of pay and other conditions of service which is essential to the development of a healthy Trade Unionism in the industrial field. We have noted above the difficulties the present system places in the way of adjustments of remuneration and recognition of relative degrees of skill and responsibility. In countries where industrial Trade Unionism is more advanced than in the Gold Coast these matters are among the most important functions of such Trade Unions and it is this responsible part which Trade Unions play in the process of fixing by negotiation the wages and other conditions of employment that ensures for them a most important position in the economic life of the country. In the Gold Coast, however, the Trade Unions are effectively precluded from assuming this responsibility by the fact that the Government, which is one of the largest employers of the class of worker concerned, ties its rates of remuneration and other conditions of service to a structure primarily designed for employees, many of whom are not members of Trade Unions (members of the present Senior Service are prohibited by law from membership of Trade Unions). In these circumstances, departmental Trade Unions have developed within the Gold Coast Government Service comprising in each Union all classes of civil servants from the daily-paid labourer to the Chief Clerk. We met delegations from most of these Unions and they appeared to us to lack cohesion in organisation and community of interest among their members. We do not intend these remarks to reflect on the ability or sincerity of any of the delegations, most of whom stated their case with eloquence and pertinacity, but they were clearly handicapped by the peculiar organisation and position of their Trade Unions.

* Report of the Royal Commission on the Civil Service 1929-31, Cmd, 3909, paragraph 308.

Moreover, in the Civil Service most of the normal functions of a Trade Union are performed by other means. Remuneration is built into a structure which rises far above and beyond the reach of the Union, other terms of service are safeguarded and clearly defined in rules and regulations of general application, and full provision is made for the redress of grievances. Trade Unions within Government Departments representing a number of heterogeneous grades cannot ever, in our view, play an effective part as negotiators, nor will they ever be more than a constituent element of Civil Service consultative machinery. We do not intend these remarks to apply to the highly developed homogeneous Staff Unions or Associations representing one class or several analogous classes which are such a prominent and essential feature of the organisation of the Civil Service in the United Kingdom. Indeed, Staff Unions of that sort could do much to improve the Civil Service in the Gold Coast. As things are, the arrested development of Trade Unionism in Government Departments has undoubtedly had a depressing effect on the healthy development of the movement in outside industry.

While we do not wish to venture too far into the very specialised field of Trade Union organisation, we feel that there is a need in the Gold Coast for a form of Trade Union in which members are bound together by a common interest based on the nature of the work in which they are engaged. Leaving aside for the moment normal Civil Service Staff Associations, we would like to see develop in the Gold Coast, Trade Unions of tradesmen, artisans, etc., men who work with their hands irrespective of whether they are employed by Government or by private enterprise. Such Unions would have a personal interest in fostering apprenticeship schemes, raising the standard of craftsmanship and technical skill, arranging in co-operation with the authorities part-time training schemes, evening classes, sandwich courses, and the like, negotiating rates of pay for the various trades and for degrees of skill within trades, and generally assuming the full responsibility proper to Trade Unions not only for the maintenance of favourable conditions of employment, but also for jealously guarding and continuously striving to improve the standards of workmanship. For reasons which we have recorded above, we consider that progress towards this ideal is being effectively blocked by the present system of absorbing workers of this class within the structure of the Civil Service.

- (vi) The cost of the system is unnecessarily high. The policy has resulted in the creation of some 12,000 established posts of 'K' and 'L' scales (excluding Railways and Harbour Administration). This has involved a very considerable increase in clerical work within Departments and in the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office. We believe that this additional work is responsible to a considerable degree for the increase in the number of clerical-type posts between 1945-46 and 1950-51 from approximately 1,700 to approximately 3,300*. The capitalised cost of every clerical appointment at a conservative estimate is in the region of £3,000-£4,000. We record these facts to show some of the contingent financial implications of the present policy, but we would not stress this aspect if we were convinced that the policy is in itself in the best interests of the workers and the country in general. We have already given what appear to us to be cogent reasons why we are not so convinced. We trust that these reasons will appear equally cogent to the persons concerned.

161. In the light of the consideration set out in the preceding paragraphs, we recommend a departure from the present policy of establishing all grades of semi-skilled and skilled labour who are permanently required. In our view these grades should not be part of the Civil Service structure and it would be proper for them to be paid fixed daily, weekly, or monthly rates of pay which should be determined separately for each category within a range which we prescribe in paragraph 241, and without attempting to achieve a specific relationship to posts within the structure of the Civil Service. We recommend, however, that employees who are already established shall have the option to remain on their existing terms of service—see also paragraphs 314-317.

162. It should be stressed that the preceding paragraph refers only to labourers, of whatever degree of skill, who are directly employed on the work for which they are trained. They do not

* Figures supplied by the Government Statistician.

apply to workmen who, having shown a capacity for the control and management of men, are appointed to full supervisory posts. In our view all permanently required and full-time supervisory posts should be regarded as "staff posts" within the structure of the Civil Service. There is also a number of employees of varying degrees of skill, the special circumstances of whose employment makes it desirable to include them within the Civil Service structure. It is not easy to find a comprehensive definition for the latter category and each case may have to be considered separately. In general, however, it may be said that any person whose work is mainly within public offices and who may have access to valuable or important documents, or any person whose work involves the collection of revenue, or who has a certain degree of personal responsibility for the private property of individual members of the public, or whose duties place him in a position to obtain information of the private affairs of members of the public, should be included inside the structure of the Civil Service. We deal with these categories in detail in Chapter XIV and particularly in paragraph 485.

163. We have discussed these proposals with a number of responsible officers in Government service, and while all of them were in agreement with the principles, doubts were expressed by some as to their acceptability in the Gold Coast. We therefore summarise here the advantages of our proposals :—

- (i) Actual rates of remuneration for each job can be fixed in consultation with staff representatives and without undue regard for the limitations of the Civil Service salary structure.
- (ii) A range of daily rates of pay representing substantial increases above the existing 'K' scales plus temporary cost of living allowance. We suggest a range between 4s. 6d. a day and 10s. a day (*i.e.* from approximately £70 per annum to approximately £156 per annum) as compared with the present 'K' scale plus allowances which rises from £50 per annum to £144 per annum (see paragraph 241). In addition to basic wage an employee can earn bonus payments (see paragraph 242).
- (iii) Provision for rapid adjustment of rates of pay to meet cost of living changes (see paragraph 200).
- (iv) Introduction of new daily rates of pay in advance of introduction of revised salary scales (see paragraphs 202 and 317).
- (v) Employees who are already established would have the option of remaining on their present conditions of service (see paragraphs 161, 314 and 317).
- (vi) Though rates of pay of daily paid employees would be fixed without reference to the Civil Service structure they would be eligible for retiring allowances on the same basis as established non-pensionable employees.
- (vii) Generally speaking, conditions of service, including leave, sick leave, discipline, etc., of daily paid employees would be similar to those applicable to established non-pensionable staff.

We feel confident that, provided these proposals and their implications are carefully explained to the workers concerned, the shrewdness and perspicacity which we have noted in the Gold Coast workers of all classes will enable them to realise that the proposals are in their own interests and those of the country in general.

164. We would have preferred that artisans at present on 'L' scales should also be placed on fixed rates according to the standard of proficiency reached, but consider that this step should be deferred until such time as full apprenticeship schemes are in general operation and there is a central and standardised system of trade-testing throughout the country. When, however, this state has been reached the Trade Unions and the Labour Department might well consider the introduction of fixed rates for the various grades of artisans, so that artisans throughout the country would be able to demand the rate of pay agreed by their Unions as appropriate to the standard of proficiency which they have reached. In the meantime we have recommended salary scales for this class of employee which bring them within the Civil Service structure.

POSITION OF WOMEN IN THE CIVIL SERVICE

Present Position

165. Apart from teachers, nurses, midwives, telephonists, and a few assistants in the Printing Department, there are very few women in the Civil Service in the Gold Coast. This has been largely due in the past to the generally low standard of education of women, but there are welcome signs of progressive improvement in the provision of facilities for girls' education. We have already noted that some 4,000 girls reach the Primary School Leaving Certificate annually, and the number going on to secondary education is also increasing. While there is no bar to the appointment of women to the Civil Service, they are offered no special encouragement to seek appointments other than those mentioned above. Moreover, we have frequently in conversation with Africans of all classes observed a scepticism, if not actual hostility, to the suggestion that African women might be more widely used in the Civil Service. We would observe that opposition open or concealed, to the employment of women in positions previously occupied exclusively by men, is not peculiar to the Gold Coast. It is perhaps a natural reaction based partly on the fear that women, with fewer financial commitments, will accept lower salaries than men, who will, as a result, be unable to find work. In all progressive countries, however, women are being employed more and more on equal terms with men at all levels in the Public Service, and in commerce and industry. In a country developing as fast as the Gold Coast is there should be no fear of unemployment for many years; on the contrary, the problem may well be how to make the best use of the limited manpower available. A country which does not offer the fullest opportunities and give open encouragement for the employment of women in all spheres of activity, is not making the best use of its resources. The Gold Coast cannot afford to be backward in this matter.

166. We are concerned only with the staffing and efficiency of the Civil Service here, but we wish in passing to draw attention to the urgent need on sociological grounds to provide opportunities for regular employment for girls from the time they leave school until they get married. The social evils resulting from the lack of such opportunities are clearly brought out in Dr. Busia's Report on a Social Survey of Sekondi-Takoradi*.

Need for more opportunities for women

167. There are certain types of jobs in which it has been found elsewhere that women are more efficient and more economic to employ than men. Apart from posts such as teaching in girls' schools, midwifery, etc., it is, generally speaking, more economic to employ women than men on jobs which involve work of a routine or manipulative and repetitive character not involving long and expensive training, and which offer only limited prospects of advancement. Women are probably more efficient than men at work of this kind, but even more important is the high wastage rate among women employed, which is a strong argument in favour of the employment of women rather than men in posts offering limited prospects of advancement. We therefore recommend that the Government should take such steps as are practicable to attract educated women into the Civil Service at all levels, but particularly in posts such as typists, stenographers, machine operators, and clerical assistants. We consider that, other things being equal, preference should be given to women candidates for such posts.

Women in Higher Posts

168. We have so far dealt mainly with the employment of women in minor posts, but we consider that there is, or should be, scope for the employment of educated African women in posts of executive and administrative responsibility in the Public Service, and we trust that the Government will give every encouragement to African women with the requisite qualifications to enter the Public Service in whatever capacity they are most suited. We deal later with the question of conditions of service for women employees. (See paragraphs 271-274.)

UNIFIED COLONIAL SERVICES

169. The policy of the unification of the Colonial Service was adopted in 1930, and in the immediately following years an increasing number of the Services, e.g., Administrative, Agriculture, Forestry, Legal, etc., were "unified". As the Unified Service Scheme has been in the process of

* Report on a Social Survey of Sekondi-Takoradi by K. A. Busia, M.A., D.Phil. (Oxon), 1950. ✓

development during most of that time, and its future and even its continued existence, are, we understand, at present under active consideration, we find difficulty in advising what part it should play in the future of the Gold Coast. Briefly, the present position is that officers appointed by the Secretary of State to the principal professional services, though appointed to serve under a specified Government, are members of one Unified Colonial Service (e.g. the Unified Colonial Medical Service), and are liable to transfer to posts "scheduled" in that Service in other "scheduled" Colonies, provided that such transfers cannot be compulsory in the case of officers appointed to the service before a certain date, or in any case where the new post is, in the opinion of the Secretary of State, of less value than the old. It has not, of course, been possible to maintain uniformity of pay or most other conditions throughout a Unified Service, because these have to be determined in each case by the territorial Government under which an officer is serving, and in the event of an officer's services no longer being required by one "scheduled" Government owing to the abolition of his post or other reason, no guarantee can be given that he will be offered a transfer to a comparable post under another scheduled Government, though in normal circumstances he may expect this to happen if he wishes to remain in the Service, and his record is satisfactory. Attempts have been made from time to time, however, to standardise the principles underlying the main conditions of service on climatic, broad territorial, or other such bases. The Unified Services are fundamentally intended to be expatriate services. We understand that admission to them has not been expressly refused to officers employed in their countries of domicile, but that such officers have never shown much inclination to join a service which, in their case, offers no very tangible benefits.

170. As we see it, the principal arguments against the Gold Coast remaining a scheduled Government under the Unified Colonial Scheme are these :—

- (i) Under the new Ministerial Constitution it may be felt that the Gold Coast Government should have a purely local service, including such expatriate officers whom it recruits to specific posts, in the absence of suitably qualified Africans, and these expatriate officers should be under the direct control of Government and not liable to transfer at any time on instructions from the Secretary of State.
- (ii) Many of the posts in the Gold Coast Service would be "scheduled" and liable to be filled by the transfer of officers from other Colonies on the instructions of the Secretary of State.
- (iii) There is a natural tendency to attempt to standardise in all "scheduled" territories certain terms or conditions applying to Unified Services, which may not be acceptable to the Gold Coast Government for application to local services.

171. Although we can appreciate the natural desire of the Gold Coast Government to exercise complete control over its own staff, we strongly advise against any dissociation from the Colonial Service Unification Scheme. From a recruitment point of view, membership of this scheme has already proved of very great value to the Gold Coast. The professional or administrative man who wants a career in the Colonies is naturally attracted to a service which opens up possibilities of work in territories throughout the world with prospects of promotion from one to another, rather than to service in one territory which may not compare favourably with others as regards climatic conditions, possibilities of leading a family life, educating children, etc. We are convinced that it will not be possible for the Gold Coast Government for some time to come to rely entirely on contract terms for the recruitment of all the expatriate officers still required, and if recruitment is to be confined to those officers prepared to join a purely local service with no prospects outside the Gold Coast, it will be necessary to offer expatriate officers much higher salaries than those which we propose. The Unified Services, on the other hand, offer to territories who are members of the scheme, a wide field of officers, carefully selected by the Colonial Office, whose experience is mostly obtained working in the Colonies, and who are generally prepared to accept transfer, on reasonable terms, to places where their services are most required. Even in the largest Colonies the smaller branches of the Service seldom have enough promotion posts to offer a full and attractive career for every officer appointed. Membership of a Unified Service provides, in such cases, a recruitment appeal which would otherwise be lacking.

172. These recruitment advantages are, in our view, very considerable, and must be made use of

by the Gold Coast Government if it is to have a fair share of the limited numbers of qualified men available for recruitment to serve in the Colonies. We believe that they greatly outweigh the possible disadvantage of having a dual control over a section of the Gold Coast Services. As already explained, rules and practice in the Colonial Unification Scheme are still very fluid, and it should be possible for the Gold Coast Government, by negotiation, to ensure that it was not subjected to unreasonable embarrassment through a too narrow interpretation of the commitments involved in membership. In particular, it might be clearly stated that no post should be filled by recruitment to, or transfer within, a Unified Colonial Service except at the request of the Governor on the advice of the Public Service Commission that no suitable local candidate was available. On the other hand, it would, of course, be necessary for the Gold Coast Government to accept the basic conditions inherent in the Colonial Service Unification Scheme, such as the liability to transfer, mentioned in paragraph 170 (i) and (iii) above.

173. The concept of a Unified Colonial Service as we see it is properly applicable only to expatriate members of that Service. It is rather meaningless when applied to officers employed in their countries of domicile and recruited normally under conditions quite different from those obtaining in the case of expatriate officers. It follows from the policy of complete Africanization of the Public Service that in time the Civil Service will become entirely "local".

We understand that it is the wish of this Government to establish a Local Service as early as possible. Despite the advantages of the Unified Colonial Services which we have pointed out, we consider this to be a natural development, and it is one we would not oppose. We consider that all African civil servants should be appointed to a local Gold Coast Civil Service, whether or not they hold posts scheduled in the Unified Colonial Services. If expatriates can also be recruited to a local Gold Coast Service, we see no objection to their being so appointed, on the assumption that the Secretary of State and the Crown Agents would be willing to lend their services as recruiting agents for the Local Service.

CHAPTER V

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

General

174. Section 67 of the Gold Coast (Constitution) Order in Council 1950, creates a Public Service Commission, the functions of which

are set out in Section 68 as follows :—

“ 68 (i) The Governor, acting in his discretion, may refer to the Commission for their advice any question relating to the appointment (including promotion and transfer) or to the dismissal or other disciplinary control of public officers or of any public officer, or to any matter which, in his opinion, affects the public service.

(ii) It shall be the duty of the Commission to advise the Governor on any question which he shall refer to it in accordance with the provisions of this section, but the Governor shall not be required to act in accordance with the advice given to him by the Commission ”.

175. At the time we left the Gold Coast the Commission had not yet been appointed, and the Chairman designated had not arrived in the Colony, although an “ interim Commission ” had been in operation since December 1948, charged under its terms of reference with “ advising the Governor on appointments and promotions in the Senior and Junior Civil Service, and in matters relating to training generally ”. We understand the new Chairman is an officer with considerable establishment experience who has intimate knowledge of the working of Public Service Commissions elsewhere and we consider that the experience of establishments work will always be necessary in the Chairman in view of the functions allotted to the Commission. We presume that the new Chairman will want as free a hand as possible in shaping the policy, procedure and machinery generally of the new Commission, and we therefore feel reluctant to make any detailed recommendations on this subject. There appeared to us, however, to be a considerable variety of opinion on the precise functions of a Public Service Commission, the part it had to play under the Constitution and its relationship *vis-à-vis* other bodies and officers dealing with staff matters. We make the following observations on the position as we see it, in the hope that they will help to clarify issues and assist the new Chairman without in any way committing him.

176. The adoption of a new Constitution under which Ministers are made responsible for the functioning of Departments has an unsettling effect on the Services who feel that there is a danger that decisions affecting their prospects, movements, and conditions of service generally, may be taken on political grounds rather than on grounds of merit, administrative expediency, etc., as formerly. Nothing can be more damaging to a successful administration than a service whose morale is undermined by political intrigue and interference, or even the suspicion that success or failure depend less on work and ability than on political influence. The evils of political interference do not only affect the public servant ; they can be a source of serious embarrassment to the politician. In a country like the Gold Coast where patronage is still something of a tradition, unless Members of the Legislative Assembly are in a position to state clearly that individuals in the Public Service are none of their concern, and that they are in fact powerless to influence individual prospects, their lives may well be made a burden to them by an ever-increasing flow of applications, interviews, prayers and petitions directed to securing their good offices in the matter of the advancement of quite minor officials.

177. The allocation of the administration of the Public Service to the Chief Secretary, and the establishment of a Public Service Commission are thus fundamental, with the dual object of inspiring confidence in the Services and relieving Legislative Assembly Members of what might easily become an intolerable burden.

Commission Judicial and not Executive body

178. To appreciate properly the part played by the Public Service Commission, Section 66 of the Order-in-Council must be borne clearly in mind :—

“ 66. The appointment, promotion, transfer, dismissal and disciplinary control of public officers is hereby vested in the Governor acting in his discretion.”

This Section read with Section 68 previously quoted clearly indicates in our opinion that the Commission is not intended to be an executive body in any sense of the words, but essentially advisory to the authority ultimately responsible for the Public Services. Its position is judicial

rather than administrative in that it is not involved in the actual day to day machinery of staff administration, and if it is to preserve its judicial authority it is essential that it should not become so involved. We do not visualise it having a staff of experts working under it, but whereas all members should be men of recognised reasonableness and judgment, one at least, preferably the Chairman, should possess considerable establishment experience. It should have access to all papers and records dealing with staff matters. It should have power to require any member of the Public Service to give evidence before it, to consult any member of the public, and to take all necessary steps to ensure that it is in a position to offer to the Governor the best possible advice on any questions referred to it. We presume that the Governor will direct that certain subjects, such as the promotion of specified grades of officers, will be referred to the Commission as a matter of course. In such cases we should expect memoranda dealing with the subject to be prepared in the Ministries concerned or in the Chief Establishment Officer's office and forwarded to the Secretary to the Public Service Commission. The Commission could refer back for any information it still considered necessary to enable it to form an opinion and tender advice. The Governor's final order would be conveyed to the Chairman, and forwarded by him to the Chief Secretary's Office to be given effect.

Scope and functions of the Commission

179. There appears to us a danger that if too much work is placed upon the Commission it may be unable to give more important questions referred to it the time and consideration which they require.

We understand that the "interim Commission" in spite of the scope of its terms of reference, deals almost entirely with matters affecting the Senior Service. We suggest that a lower limit might be placed on the grade of officer whose case for appointment, promotion or discipline was referred to the Commission as a matter of course. It might be possible to confine "essential reference" to matters affecting posts or persons in the Higher Clerical, Executive, or higher grades. This would of course in no way restrict the Governor's power specifically to refer to the Commission any question affecting any grade of the Public Service. Public Service matters below the suggested lower limit should normally go no further than the Head of Department, Secretary to the Ministry, or Chief Establishments Officer.

180. The temptation to "lobby" a body such as the Public Service Commission dealing with matters of very great individual interest is considerable. But if the Commission is to function successfully it must strictly preserve its reputation for impartiality, and avoid even the suspicion that its decisions are in any way subject to undue influence from any quarter. If either the Public Services or the Legislative Assembly lose confidence in the Commission's absolute impartiality, its usefulness will at once be destroyed and it might as well be abolished. We presume that under Section 69(g) of the Order-in-Council severe penalties will be laid down for attempting to influence the decisions of the Commission outside the channels laid down by regulations. But we consider it will assist the Commissioners even more in building up and maintaining a reputation for impartial judgment if their staff is kept as small as practicable.

Relationship to Chief Establishment Officer

181. From the foregoing remarks it should be sufficiently clear that the functions of the Commission and of the Chief Establishments Officer do not overlap. The former is concerned only with the subjects reserved to the Governor by Section 66 of the Order-in-Council quoted in paragraph 178 and with any other matter specially referred to it by the Governor under Section 68 (1) and (2). Within this field the Chief Establishment Officer will be responsible for giving the Commission such technical advice on establishments matters as it may require and for seeing that any general directions which may be issued by the Governor in regard to the procedure to be followed by departments and Ministries in such matters are properly carried into effect. The Chief Executive Officer is the Chief Engineer responsible for the structure and maintenance of establishments machinery throughout Government, and like a good engineer, he should be acquainted with the working of every part of the machine and a familiar and trusted figure to all his subordinates. The Public Service Commissioners hold a position somewhat similar to consultants. Their reputation should be such that their advice is accepted without question on matters of principle, broad issues, and all other matters properly referred to them, but they should occupy a position reasonably remote from the "machine shops" and should not be familiar figures throughout the "works".

CHAPTER VI

COST OF LIVING

Cost of Living Indices 182. We are concerned with the cost of living only in so far as it is a factor to be taken into account when reviewing rates of remuneration of Government officers and employees. There is a popular belief that a Cost of Living Index can be produced which will show accurately and infallibly the effect on the "people" of changes in the cost of living. A Cost of Living Index is no more than a summary of the combined effect of changes in a number of separate indices each of which is in itself a summary of price changes affecting a particular group of goods or services. If an Index covered a group of people whose spending habits and circumstances (*e.g.* size of family) were similar and had been precisely ascertained, and if these spending habits remained unchanged during the period covered, it should provide an accurate gauge of the impact of price changes on the people concerned. Unfortunately this ideal is rarely if ever achieved, and the further away from these ideal circumstances one gets the less reliable a Cost of Living Index becomes as a measurement of the effect on the people of price changes in goods or services. There is no Cost of Living Index in the Gold Coast and the conditions there are such that in our opinion a national cost of living index would be valueless, since there does not exist the basic information concerning the spending habits of the various groups of the population and of the classes within these groups, to enable the selection to be made of the items which should be included in the first set of indices, or to determine the weight which should be given to each separate price index in the compilation of the Cost of Living Index. Moreover, the spending habits of groups and classes within the Gold Coast vary so widely that the average which a National Cost of Living Index would represent would be completely misleading in its application to any particular group. To complicate matters still further there are clear indications that the spending habits of large sections of the people of the Gold Coast have been undergoing a constant process of change during and since the late war. In these circumstances we do not see any advantage to be gained from an attempt to compile a National Cost of Living Index for the Gold Coast. It may be that there is some value to be derived from establishing a Cost of Living Index for each of the major groups or classes of the population but that would involve a long and expensive series of investigations into the spending habits of the community. We leave it to others to decide whether that operation should be undertaken. It is sufficient for our purpose to record that there is in the Gold Coast at the moment no ready guide to the effects on any particular class or grade of civil servant of changes in prices of goods or services; and that there is no prospect in the near future of any such reliable guide being available.

183. This statement in no way reflects adversely on the efforts of the Government Statistician and his small staff to tackle the very difficult problem of measuring changes in the cost of living and their effect on various sections of the community. He has made available to us data which he has compiled showing price trends over the past few years and has given much time and thought to interpreting these trends and helping us to apply the knowledge so acquired to the problems we had to consider. He himself constantly warned us that the figures and other information which he supplied should be regarded as no more than sign posts. They showed the general trend of prices of imported goods, particularly imported clothes and imported food; they did not and could not show how these price trends affected the cost of living of the different groups which go to make up the population of the Gold Coast. Similarly with price trends of local market produce where the position was made even more obscure by the difficulty of collecting reliable figures. We do not intend to publish the statistics supplied by the Government Statistician since they do not provide conclusive evidence on any point with which we are concerned, and they are subject to so many reservations as to their comprehensiveness, reliability and interpretation, that to publish them without lengthy and technical explanatory notes would lead only to confusion in the minds of our lay readers and controversy among the experts.

184. We have outlined above some of the difficulties of accurately assessing the cost of living of the various sections of the community but it is a factor which cannot be ignored when reviewing

the remuneration of civil servants. In addition to studying statistics supplied by the Government Statistician, we have read Reports of our predecessors in this field as well as social and economic surveys such as those of Dr. Busia and Miss Ady ; we have received written and oral evidence from a very large cross-section of the community ; we have given careful consideration to a number of budgets submitted by Associations, Trade Unions, and individuals ; we have had informal discussions with people of all classes, both inside and outside Government service ; we have visited markets, housing schemes, canteens and hospitals, and we have travelled widely throughout the country. In this way we have attempted to acquire a knowledge of the way of life and the daily problems of the people of the Gold Coast such as would enable us to make some assessment of the weight which should be given to the many factors which go to make up the cost of living for the various classes of the community. Having analysed and collated the evidence thus accumulated, we drew our conclusions.

Cost of Living 1945-1950 185. It may assist in presenting a clear picture of the position we reach if we record here a brief history of the measures which the Government has taken to compensate civil servants for the fall in the value of money caused by price increases since the last general revision of salaries. Sir Walter Harragin's recommendations on remuneration, which were largely accepted by the Gold Coast Government, were based on the assumption that the cost of living would remain for some time at the 1945-46 level. By the latter half of 1948, however, it was clear that this had not been proved in the event and representations were made by the Associations of Senior and Junior Civil Servants concerning an increase in salaries having regard to increases in the cost of living and to all other relevant factors. This evidence of a growing disquiet in the Civil Service at the financial pressure caused by the upward trend of prices was confirmed by the increasing difficulty which the Government was experiencing in recruiting, particularly from overseas, and the attenuated staff position at that time was a matter of grave concern. In these circumstances the Colonial Secretary in May 1949 instructed a number of Government officers to form themselves into a "working party" to enquire into the conditions and remuneration of the Civil Service and to make recommendations on the measures required in the light of the then existing circumstances to relieve the disquiet in the Service, and to improve the prospects of filling vacancies. The "working party" was also instructed to draw the attention of the Government to any anomalies in the salary structure of the Civil Service which became apparent in the course of their investigations, and if necessary, to make any recommendations which might lead to the increased efficiency of the Civil Service with special reference to the needs of development. It will be seen that the "Working party's" enquiry covered a much wider field than the effect of changes in the cost of living on the Civil Service, and indeed, this working party was the first to recommend a general review of the salaries and structure of the Civil Service such as we have been commissioned to undertake. We are here concerned only with the working party's recommendations concerning the cost of living, but we have thought it advisable to record that it did not have a single clear-cut issue to consider.

186. On the basis of figures relating to price levels up to the third quarter of 1948 and of other relevant information, the working party came to the conclusion that civil servants, senior and junior and daily-rated, were suffering hardship as a result of price increases since 1945-46. Taking into account other recommendations (such as free passages for children) designed to give additional relief in special circumstances, and the indications at that time that the price of cocoa was more likely to fall than to rise and that as a result prices generally would not rise further, the working party recommended a 15 per cent. allowance on all wages and basic salaries as a measure required to relieve immediate hardship. The other recommendations for improving conditions of service were not governed mainly by considerations of cost of living and we are not concerned with them at this stage. After lengthy consideration by Government and frequent informal consultations with Members of the Legislative Council, approval was given with effect from the 1st September 1949 for the payment of temporary cost of living allowances of 15 per cent. on all wages and on basic salaries up to and including £750 per annum. None of the other recommendations of the working party were approved at that time.

187. In September 1949 a Committee of the Legislature was set up to review the position and to report to the President of the Legislative Council in February 1950. This Committee had avail-

able the Report by Dr. Busia on a cost of living survey made in March-May 1949, and certain other information relevant to the cost of living up to September 1949. This Committee came to the conclusion that the 15 per cent. allowance was inadequate and recommended the payment of temporary allowances as follows :

Daily-rated staff	17½ per cent.
Junior Service	25 per cent.
Senior Service up to and including basic salaries of £750 per annum	20 per cent.
Senior Service above £750 per annum	15 per cent.

The Report was debated in the full Legislative Council and in the event approval was given for the payment with effect from 1st April 1950 of temporary allowances of 20 per cent. on all wages and basic salaries up to and including £750 per annum, and of 15 per cent. on basic salaries above £750 per annum. The position was reviewed by the Legislative Council Committee in September 1950 when it was decided that the allowances should be continued at the existing rates pending consideration of our Report. Other relief measures such as payment of children's passages, and improved travelling and transport allowances, have also been introduced with a view to cushioning the impact of price increases.

188. We have considered it a fair deduction from the above facts that, after full investigation and due consideration of information relating to the cost of living position up to September 1949, the Legislature was of the opinion that the existing rates of temporary increases to wages and salaries together with certain other improvements in conditions of service, constituted the measures necessary and adequate at the 1st April 1950 to relieve civil servants of immediate hardship which they would otherwise have suffered from increases in the cost of living since the last general review of wages and salaries. It can also be assumed that when the Committee of the Legislature reviewed the position in September 1950 no evidence was produced of a deterioration in the position of the civil servant such as to justify any further interim improvements in advance of our Report. The opinion of the Legislature that the rates of remuneration of the Civil Service were generally adequate on the 1st April 1950 confirms our own view formed in the course of our enquiries. We are therefore concerned only with changes in the cost of living which have occurred from the 1st April 1950 in so far as the cost of living is a factor determining remuneration.

189. As already explained there is in the Gold Coast no statistical basis on which to assess the overall increase in the cost of living. We have, however, studied figures of changes in the level of :

- (i) Selling prices of imported foodstuffs (Accra) ;
- (ii) Selling prices of imported clothing (Accra) ;
- (iii) Selling prices of local market produce (Eight towns).

These figures do not give any measure of the impact of price changes on any section of the population but they do show price trends of certain groups of commodities which form important items in most budgets. During 1949 and until about April 1950 the index of retail prices of imported clothing shows a more or less steady downward trend. This occurred during a period when world market prices for textiles were rising. It has been suggested to us that this temporary divergence from world trends may be due to some extent to an increasing selectivity among consumers in the Gold Coast following a period of fairly indiscriminate buying after the shortages of the wartime period. This necessitated the adoption by importers of a policy of "unloading" goods in lessened demand at cut prices, and the inclusion of these goods in the items making up the index would produce an exaggerated downward curve. This is an example of the short-comings of even a retail price index. From about the middle of 1950 however this index showed very sharp rises and there is no indication that prices of imported clothing have yet reached their peak. Indeed, in April 1951, in an official Press release the Minister for Commerce and Industry stated that merchants had up till then been selling existing stocks at below replacement costs, that retail prices in the Gold Coast did not yet reflect the full increases in world prices of basic materials, and in short, that prices had not yet reached their peak. We are in agreement with these views. The retail price index for imported foods in Accra shows a steady upward trend from July 1949 when the Government Statistician's Office started collecting figures. This trend

is in line with the general trend of world food prices and there is no reason to believe that it will not be continued for some time. These two groups comprise commodities which substantially affect the cost of living of most, if not all sections of the community, and their cost is controlled by circumstances entirely outside the Gold Coast. After full consultation with a number of authorities on the subject we have come to the conclusion that the present high price levels of these two groups will be maintained and possibly even increased for some time to come.

190. The retail price index of local produce is a synthesis of similar indices for each of eight towns, Accra, Kumasi, Takoradi, Tamale, Keta, Ho, Kpeve, Kpedze. The interpretation of this index is complicated in the Gold Coast by seasonal fluctuations in supplies and in purchasing power, as well as by doubts as to the reliability of the basic information on which the index is based. The index does however confirm our independently formed view that from a high peak reached in May 1949 prices generally fell gradually until about the end of that year and thereafter remained steady some way above the 1948 level until the fourth quarter of 1950, when a sharp and persistent rise made itself apparent. We do not feel competent to analyse the causes of the changes in the trends of local market prices in the Gold Coast which seem to be affected by a multiplicity of factors, many of them peculiar to the Gold Coast. There is, however, little doubt that the rising price levels of imported goods, the increased aggregate purchasing power resulting from the high price of cocoa and the Government's development expenditure, and the seasonal shortage of supplies during the first half of the year, will combine to maintain the present upward trend. Beyond that we would not care to predict, though a number of authorities have confidently asserted that in the foreseeable future the general level will not fall below that obtaining at the end of the first quarter of 1951. Of the Government's efforts to minimise fluctuations in prices of local foodstuffs and to stabilise prices at a reasonable level we have not much to say. The many problems involved are being urgently but carefully examined and all possible solutions are being investigated by all the resources which the Government can command. We are left, however, with the impression that the complexity of the Gold Coast marketing and distributing system, and the almost total lack of information on production and consumption figures, are formidable obstacles to any early progress towards stabilisation of local market prices under the constant upward pressure exerted by world market prices and by increased purchasing power in the Gold Coast.

191. There are other factors such as housing which affect the cost of living, but, though we have no precise figures of rentals we do not think it will be disputed that the possibility of a general decrease in housing costs in the near future is most improbable. We comment elsewhere on the Government's activities in this sphere but in the short term they can at best provide but a slight amelioration of the position.

**Cost of Living—
present position**

192. We are therefore left with the conclusion that the cost of living is generally above the level it had reached when the present temporary allowances to civil servants were considered adequate, and further, that there is little likelihood of a general fall in prices below the present level in the foreseeable future. *In these circumstances we have decided to recommend the consolidation of salaries or wages with cost of living allowances at a level which we consider adequate as at the 1st April 1951.*

**Cost of Living—
relationship to daily
rates of pay**

193. We have started with the lowest paid labourer as the base to which all other classes and grades in Government employment must be related, however indirectly. The wage rate which we recommend for the unskilled labourer should in our estimation enable him to maintain at least as high a standard of living as that which the Legislature considered adequate in March and September 1950.

194. At this point we digress to remark on the frequent confusion in the minds of witnesses between cost of living and standards of living. It is clear that much of the pressure for increased wages in the country springs not from the increased cost of living but from a natural aspiration towards higher standards of living. Much as we sympathise with this very understandable desire, we feel that general increases in standards of living cannot be achieved on the recommendation

of a Commission on the structure and remuneration of the Civil Service. These will come only with the development of the country's resources and with increased individual rate of production.

195. To return to the rate of remuneration of the unskilled labourer, the standard of living of this class is low and though we believe that the rates which we recommend allow a fair margin above bare subsistence level and insure him against undue hardship from normal and seasonal fluctuations in prices, they are not such as to cushion him against the impact of increases of a permanent or long-term character, or of substantial increases of even a temporary nature in the prices of the main items or groups of items in his cost of living. This class is largely illiterate and, even by Gold Coast standards, inexperienced in modern wage negotiation procedure. It also contains a very large proportion of immigrant labour. For these reasons, in the Gold Coast unskilled labour is not so vocal in proving the need for increased wages or better working conditions generally, as are other classes of workers. The Government has therefore a special responsibility towards this class which is the most vulnerable to price fluctuations yet the least capable of drawing attention to its grievances. We recommend that immediate steps should be taken to establish retail price indices specially related to the needs of manual and related employees, *i.e.*, employees classified as unskilled, semi-skilled, and skilled, for whom we have recommended daily rates of pay. The items making up these indices should be reviewed at least every five years so as to ensure that they are related as closely as possible to the current consuming habits of the group concerned.

196. We have no recommendations to make as to whether retail price indices for this purpose should be compiled from figures collected from a number of towns throughout the country as at present, or whether separate indices should be established for different areas. We would observe however that the marketing and distribution system and other circumstances in the Gold Coast lend themselves to severe and not infrequent price disturbances of a character which can considerably distort a composite index in its application to areas outside that of the local price disturbance.

Cost of Living—relationship to salaries of established civil servants

197. The cost of living must of course remain an important factor in the determination of remuneration for higher classes of the Civil Service as well as for daily rated classes. Rates of remuneration of established civil servants should not, however, be related so closely to price fluctuations as those of daily paid employees. The rates of remuneration we recommend for established civil servants take into account the prevailing price levels as a measure of the value of money in the Gold Coast and, within broad ranges they should provide civil servants with a standard of living reasonably equivalent to that enjoyed by corresponding classes outside the service. At the level of the established civil servant, spending habits within income groups are more varied and variable, and standards of living are susceptible of easier adaptation to changed financial circumstances within certain limits than at lower social levels. These considerations make it difficult to calculate the effect of price fluctuations on the cost of living of the established civil servant; they also lead to the conclusion that adjustments in remuneration should not be made to meet short-term price trends. Moreover, the value of established Civil Service posts cannot be calculated in terms of remuneration only. Account must also be taken of factors such as career prospects which, in the case of daily paid labourers, are of little or no importance. We are therefore led to the conclusion that rates of remuneration of *established* civil servants should as far as possible be so fixed as to endure for a considerable period of time; they should reflect long-term trends in salary levels and in economic conditions in the country; and adjustments should be made only when substantial and continuing changes in real income levels have made themselves apparent. We fully appreciate that this recommendation, if accepted, will mean that salary adjustments in the Civil Service will invariably lag some way behind the changes in economic conditions necessitating the adjustments. This will apply both to upward and downward adjustments and the fact that the present direction of economic changes is unfavourable to salaried groups does not affect the principle we have stated.

198. We do not mean to imply that the cost of living should cease to be an important factor in the determination of remuneration of established civil servants or that the Government is

absolved from keeping a close watch on the effect of the various classes of the Civil Service of fluctuations in price levels. On the contrary, we consider that it is of paramount importance that the Government as the model of a good employer should take every step necessary to ensure that it is kept fully informed of all circumstances affecting the real wages of its servants. Economic conditions in the Gold Coast and in the world generally are at present subject to rapid and possibly permanent changes, and it is important that the Government should be fully informed of these changes and of their overall effect on the position of civil servants. To this end it may be necessary to expand the office of the Government Statistician to provide improved arrangements for the collection and collation of statistics relating to the cost of living.

Cost of Living Committee 199. We also recommend that the cost of living committee which at present exists under the chairmanship of the Secretary to the Ministry of Finance should be established as a permanent feature of the Government machine. This committee should be made responsible for advising the Government through the Minister of Finance of any marked changes in current price levels of goods and services, of the effect of these changes on the various classes within the Civil Service, of the measures if any which the Government should take to meet these changes, particularly in regard to their effect on the Civil Service. The committee appears to be responsible at present for advising on general measures to lower or stabilise the cost of living. It may be convenient to combine both advisory functions in one body, but we are concerned that there should be a Standing Committee the constitution and terms of reference of which are published, which is responsible for advising the Government on measures necessary to maintain the economic position of civil servants *vis-à-vis* other sections of the community.

200. The committee should have a particular responsibility for watching the position of daily paid employees. We have already explained that fluctuations in price levels, even of a temporary nature, may affect this class so severely as to necessitate immediate relief. In such an event wage adjustments should be made independently of adjustments in rates of remuneration of the established and salaried civil servants and with the minimum possible delay after the appearance of the conditions necessitating them. It is this consideration, perhaps more than any other, which has led us to recommend in paragraphs 161-164 that unskilled, semi-skilled and skilled labour should be placed on fixed daily, weekly or monthly rates of pay which can be adjusted to meet short-term trends of substance in the cost of living in a way that is not appropriate for established civil servants whose remuneration as we have remarked in paragraph 197 should reflect long-term trends in salary levels and in economic conditions in the country.

201. We consider that the committee should have a permanent Secretary, preferably an officer in the Government Statistician's office. He should receive monthly reports from District Commissioners and Labour Officers, of price trends and other factors affecting cost of living throughout the country, in addition to the official statistics for which the Government Statistician should be responsible. The Secretary should collate the returns and submit them to the Chairman monthly. The latter will decide whether the information so received necessitates convening a meeting of the committee which should, in any case, meet at least once in three months while the present uncertainty regarding price levels obtains.

Introduction of new rates for daily paid and established staff 202. In this connection we are not unaware that there is a possibility of considerable price changes between the first quarter of 1951 on which we base our conclusions, and the date when effect can be given to our recommendations. This is a problem which the Government must deal with independently of our recommendations, if necessary by way of a further adjustment of the present cost of living allowances. It may even prove necessary to continue to pay modified cost of living allowances in addition to the new salaries which we recommend. Such allowances are now almost a permanent feature in the emoluments of many Colonial Territories and we see no insuperable objection to the principle in the extraordinary circumstances prevailing throughout the world at present. We wish to record our view however that the Civil Service generally, from the unskilled labourer upwards, was adequately and, at certain levels, even

generously remunerated in April 1950 in relation both to its needs and to the prevailing rates of remuneration outside Government service. The changes in price levels towards the end of 1950 exerted increasing financial pressure on wage and salary earning groups, particularly in the Civil Service, which generally speaking, has fewer emoluments in addition to wages or salary than employees in private enterprises. Certain firms and the mining industry recognised the rising price trends by increased cost of living allowances about this time. No adjustment was made to Civil Service cost of living allowances and it seems probable to us that the action by the firms and mines was merely bringing their own rates of remuneration more closely into line with those of the Government. By the end of the first quarter of 1951, the rates of remuneration of the lowest classes of Government labour could fairly be described as barely adequate and tending to become inadequate for its needs, particularly in the larger towns which, in spite of the Government's efforts to organise food distribution, are peculiarly liable to astonishing fluctuations in market prices. Even among this class we saw no conclusive evidence of a general state of hardship, malnutrition and poverty; nor was there the degree of agitation and discontent which we would have expected had their conditions been so intolerable as some of our witnesses would have had us believe. Nevertheless, we consider that it is a matter of some urgency to grant to the daily rated employees the measure of financial relief provided by the rates of pay we suggest. We strongly recommend that that part of our Report should be considered independently of the main body of our recommendations in order that the new daily rates of pay for this class can be put into effect without the considerable delay which must occur before the new salary structure recommended for the Civil Service generally can be introduced.

203. As regards the main body of the Civil Service, we saw little evidence of undue hardship caused by increases in the cost of living. There are admittedly cases where rising prices are causing financial concern and embarrassment to individual officers. This seems to us particularly true of junior expatriate officers with a family to educate and maintain in the United Kingdom, and to a lesser degree of African officers who have to educate their own children or to assist in educating the children of relatives, at schools away from their own stations. But the general conclusion we reached on the evidence before us was that established civil servants were not finding themselves in straitened circumstances at the end of 1950. The case for a review of the remuneration of civil servants rests mainly on other grounds than financial embarrassment, namely, the maintenance of the correct relationship *vis-à-vis* their counterparts outside the Service and in other Colonies, the review of their functions and responsibilities, the needs of recruitment, and the provision of adequate incentives. We see no need therefore to make any further adjustment in the basic remuneration of established civil servants until effect can be given to the full reorganisation proposals we make in Chapter IV of our Report, on the understanding that if substantial rises in price levels occur between April 1951 and the date on which effect can be given to our reorganisation proposals, the Cost of Living Allowance at present paid will have to be adjusted accordingly. In any case we wish to stress that the salary scales we recommend are based on the new structure of the Service and the two must take effect simultaneously.

Summary

204. We sum up the main conclusions reached in this Chapter as follows :—

- (i) Government wages and salaries cannot be adjusted automatically to changes in the cost of living since, apart from other objections in principle, there is no accurate method of assessing changes in the cost of living of the various classes in the Service.
- (ii) The rates of pay we recommend for daily paid staff should be introduced without waiting for consideration of the main body of the recommendations.
- (iii) Special provision should be made for checking the effect on daily rated employees of changes in price levels and if necessary adjustments should be made in rates of remuneration independently of consideration of the position of established civil servants.
- (iv) The rates of remuneration of established civil servants should not be introduced until effect can be given to our proposals for the reorganisation of the Service.
- (v) The salary scales of established civil servants should not in future be altered until substantial

and permanent changes in the ruling income levels and the general economic position of the country has become apparent.

- (vi) Cost of living allowances to established civil servants should only be considered if rises in general price levels recur of such magnitude as clearly to cause undue hardship to serving civil servants or seriously to interfere with the smooth flow of recruits to the Service.
- (vii) A Standing Cost of Living Committee under the Chairmanship of the Secretary to the Ministry of Finance should be established as a permanent feature of the Government machine to advise on changes in the cost of living and the steps which should be taken to meet these changes.

CHAPTER VII
SALARY STRUCTURE

General Considerations 205. In the Paper on the Organisation of the Colonial Service published by the Colonial Office*, the following general principles are set out for the guidance of Colonial Governments in framing salary schemes :—

- “(i) The salaries of all posts in the Public Service of a Colony should be determined according to the nature of the work and the relative responsibilities irrespective of the race or domicile of the individuals occupying the posts.
- (ii) The salaries should be fixed at rates applicable to locally recruited staff, even though there may for the time being be grades in which few or no locally recruited officers are in fact serving.
- (iii) In fixing these basic salaries regard should be paid to the relevant local circumstances, such as the ruling income levels in those classes of the community from which the Public Service is or will be recruited.
- (iv) Where the salaries so fixed are insufficient to attract and retain officers from overseas, expatriation pay should be provided for such officers. In determining the rates of expatriation pay it will be relevant to consider such factors as the additional expenses to which an officer may be put by reason of the fact that he is serving away from his own home, especially when his service is in a non-temperate climate ; the remuneration and amenities available in alternative careers in the officer's home country ; and the general standard of remuneration and conditions in the Colonial Service.
- (v) The practice of providing free quarters for certain classes of officers should be discontinued where it exists. It is reasonable that where suitable houses are not readily procurable the Government should relieve its officers of the anxiety of finding accommodation for themselves and should provide quarters ; but officers may properly be expected to pay rent for such quarters, and their salaries should be fixed on this assumption.”

We agree with these principles and in our recommendations have attempted to follow them as far as practicable in the circumstances of the Gold Coast.

Existing Structure 206. The present salary structure in the Gold Coast is based on the recommendations contained in the Report of the Harragin Commission on the Civil Service of British West Africa 1945-46. This Report deals with staff which, at that time, was established. The Public Service is divided for salary and other purposes into two main classes, the Senior and the Junior Service. A basic salary is laid down for each grade in these Services, and an officer recruited from outside West Africa draws a pensionable addition to his basic salary called expatriation or overseas pay on a platform basis, approximating to one-third of his salary. Salaries in both Services are generally on scales, but Heads of Departments and officers holding the higher posts in the Senior Service are on fixed salaries which fall into one of thirteen groups, generally known as superscale. The various scales are distinguished by letters of the alphabet. They almost invariably overlap considerably with the next higher scale, and in some cases are of nearly equal value. Except in the case of “A”, “B”† and “M” (the three highest scales), they are divided into sections, and a post may be graded in one or more of these sections.

207. Salaries of staff not dealt with by the Harragin Report are based on recommendations contained in the Report of the Committee on the Unestablished and Daily Paid Subordinate Staff of the Central Government of the Gold Coast, popularly known as the “Korsah Report”. Some of these employees are on fixed daily rates of pay which, in the case of unskilled labour, increase in amount according to whether employment is in the Northern Territories, the Colony and Ashanti (exclusive of the three main towns), or in Accra, Kumasi, Sekondi/Takoradi. The remainder are on one or more segments of scales designated “K” and “L”. In addition to

* Colonial 197.

† In some cases the upper segment of Scale “B” is used as a separate section.

basic wages or salaries, all grades are paid a temporary or cost of living allowance calculated at 20 per cent. on pay up to and including £750, and at 15 per cent. on higher salaries.

Territorial Limitation of Recommendations 208. As the Harragin Report dealt with West African salaries, salary scales and the grading of posts are at present similar in the four British West African Colonies, with certain divergences and variations required by local conditions. In view of present day conditions in the Gold Coast it is no longer practicable to tie salaries in that Colony closely to those obtaining elsewhere in West Africa, and we have made our recommendations accordingly, without reference to salaries elsewhere except in so far as they are liable to affect recruitment to the Gold Coast.

Salaries on an Indigenous Basis 209. The basic salaries which we recommend are those which we think should offer to an African living in his own country an adequate reward for his work, and a reasonable livelihood. In framing them we have not been unduly influenced by salaries paid to men doing the same work in other countries where circumstances and conditions of life are entirely different. We have, however, made frequent reference to salaries in countries where Civil Services are more complex and of longer standing, to assist us in determining the relative value of work performed by different grades. We have not lost sight of the need to keep constantly in view the rates of pay of persons doing similar work outside the Public Service, and we are grateful to the managers of banks, commercial firms and corporations, who have greatly assisted us by supplying confidential information on the remuneration of their employees. We found, however, that Government as the largest employer, was apt to set the pattern of salaries and wages. Another difficulty which we encountered, was the shortage of fully qualified professional Africans such as lawyers and doctors, in private practice in the Gold Coast. The potential earning capacity of these few is consequently considerable, and we were told that rates of pay for professional officers would have to be increased considerably if Government Service was to be made attractive to the professional African. In making our recommendations we have borne this point in mind, but at the same time, we assume that this is a passing phase and that private earnings in the professions will assume less extravagant proportions as the numbers of qualified men in practice increase. It would, in our opinion, be quite unwarranted and highly uneconomical to compete with private practice by increasing the salaries of the few services concerned out of all proportion to the general pattern, and perpetuating unnecessarily high standards of remuneration.

Consolidation and Cost of Living Allowance 210. Early in our investigations there appeared to be three courses open to us:—

- (i) The existing temporary cost of living allowance might be consolidated and salaries adjusted as far as possible to present price levels.
- (ii) The existing salaries based on the Harragin Report might be retained with a special temporary allowance easily adjustable to meet fluctuations in the cost of living.
- (iii) A combination of the first two courses resulting in consolidation of part of the existing temporary allowance in higher basic salaries, plus a smaller but variable temporary allowance.

In view of the conditions described in the last paragraph, we were strongly attracted by the last two courses, but on further investigation decided to reject them mainly for two reasons. We received convincing evidence that it was not yet possible in the Gold Coast to produce regular and reliable cost of living statistics for every class of civil servant, on which a variable cost of living allowance could safely be based. We deal with this more fully in Chapter VI. We came to the conclusion that the existing basic salaries were generally too low and there was no reasonable possibility of living costs falling to a level which would justify these basic salaries being maintained. Pensions are, of course, calculated on basic salary (plus overseas pay in the case of expatriate officers) and the principle of awarding pensions on only a portion of an officer's remuneration, which no longer represents or is likely to represent the value of his services, is unfair. We decided after frequent consultation with the Government's financial advisers, that the first course alone was appropriate in present circumstances, and the salaries we recommend

are consolidated, and adjusted to meet normal standards of living in the Gold Coast as far as we are in a position to judge them.

Salary Ladders

211. The changes in the structure of the Services which we recommend in Chapter IV will require a corresponding change in the salary structure. In our recommendations we have endeavoured to adhere to the fundamental principle that promotion should invariably be accompanied by an increase in pay. Where there is a promotion ladder there should also be a salary ladder, and to this end we have abolished overlaps in scales as far as practicable. The scales we recommend for the various grades in the Administrative, Executive and Clerical classes follow successively from one to the other, so that in each class there is a single salary ladder, each rung representing an increase in pay. It is true and indeed essential that the ladders for the three classes overlap. An experienced Executive Officer is worth more than a recruit to the Administrative class, and a Higher Clerical Officer should earn more pay than a junior Executive Officer. Promotion from one class to the other, however, should be a simple matter of transference from a rung of one ladder to an appropriately higher rung in the ladder of another class.

Short and Long Scales

212. In the present salary structure, scales are generally long with promotion bars in the Senior Service, and promotion and efficiency bars in the Junior Service. Establishments, though fixed for the grade to which a scale is applicable, are fluid as between bars, which are introduced with the object of ensuring that no officer proceeds by the normal course of earning increments to a salary higher than the quality and/or the quantity of his work justify. To pass an *efficiency bar* an officer (a) must have reached the salary step immediately below the bar and (b) must receive a certificate in approved terms that his work and conduct are up to standard. To pass a *promotion bar* an officer must show both that he is thoroughly competent in his office, and that he has developed his capabilities and is fitted for further responsibilities.

213. The evidence we have received led us to believe that the object of these bars has not been achieved, and that in fact, few officers are held up at bars unless their work or conduct is such as to make it doubtful whether their retention in the Service is justified. It is difficult to differentiate between the yearly certificate that an officer has earned his increment, and the certificate of eligibility to pass an efficiency bar. Unless there is a clear distinction, the latter is superfluous. The greater stringency of a Promotion Bar is apt to be lost sight of, and in practice Heads of Departments find it difficult to determine the degree of unfitness for higher responsibilities which would justify what has come to be considered simply the withholding of further increments. We are convinced that only by abolishing the system of promotion by passing bars is it possible to ensure that the more responsible work is given to the more capable officers, that these officers have a continuing incentive to do their best work, and that the higher rungs of the Service are not filled with "dead wood". We therefore recommend that each grade should be assigned a reasonably short scale; that there should be a definite establishment for each grade, and that promotion from a grade to vacancies in a higher grade should be based solely on official qualifications, experience and merit, as stipulated in Colonial Regulations 32. When recommending promotion to fill a vacancy in a higher grade only two decisions should be necessary; who are the officers in the lower grade who possess all these qualifications, and which of them is the best?

214. It may be objected that the breaking up of long scales and the increased possibility of stagnation will have a bad effect on recruitment. It is true that a certain number of officers of low calibre who might under the present system climb the full length of the scale without hindrance will be halted at the top of one or other of the new short scales, but the establishments can be so adjusted that no officer of reasonable ability should be held up in any of the new grades merely for lack of a vacancy in the next grade. We have already indicated that the "administrative officer" grade (£900-£1180) is the basic grade of the Administrative class, and it is this grade which should carry on its establishments reliefs to cover leave and sickness for its own grade and for higher grades. Similar establishment adjustments will have to be made in each class, the basic grade in each case carrying leave and sickness reliefs. It will probably be found among Executive grades that there are two "basic grades", namely:—

- (i) The Executive Officer grade (£200-£350) which should carry leave and sickness reliefs for its own duty posts and those of the Higher Executive Officer grade and possibly in certain cases the grade immediately above the Higher Executive Officer grade.
- (ii) The grade carrying a salary of £750-£960 which is normally a more specialised executive grade and which should carry leave and sickness reliefs for its own duty posts and for higher grades.

The decision as to which grade should carry reliefs should be made on the advice of the proposed grading team. We are emboldened to make this suggestion that leave reserves for the higher Administrative and Executive posts should be carried on the Administrative officer grade and the corresponding Executive (£750-£960) grade respectively because we were struck by the number of higher officers, both in Regions and Departments, who were required to do "double duty" owing to the absence of colleagues on overseas leave. No doubt recruitment difficulties would account for a great deal of the present trouble, but we believe the arrangement suggested by us would, in the long run, lead to greater efficiency and speedier despatch of the work.

Incremental Credit

215. On first recruitment an officer should normally be placed on the first step of the scale appropriate to his grade. We found, however, that for some years the following exceptions had been made to this rule. In the professional scales designated "A" and "M" incremental credit is given to members of certain services to compensate for long periods of training required to obtain minimum qualifications. Credit is also given for approved professional experience gained after full qualifications have been obtained, and for years spent on war service. We examined the rules governing the grant of these additional credits, and though it was not always easy to see how two or three years additional to the time required to take a degree could justify a "bonus" of five or six increments, we were given to understand that in some cases it had been found in practice that a special entry point was required for recruitment purposes. As most of these rules are of general application throughout the Colonies, and have been carefully framed after consultation between the Secretary of State and Colonial Governments, we do not think it advisable to suggest any major changes. We suggest in Appendix VII the initial entry points for certain professional classes in the new salary scale. At the same time, we do not think a system based largely on temporary recruitment difficulties is sound, and we recommend that entry points should be reviewed periodically with a view to lowering them to a level which can be defended purely on grounds of additional training years.

The rules governing incremental credit for approved professional experience require the most careful application. Credit should be strictly limited to actual and fully qualified experience, and before an offer is made, the relative salary position of officers already in the Service must be considered. If one or more serving officers find that men with equal or less experience elsewhere are being recruited to their Service on higher salaries than they themselves enjoy, demands for salary increases will naturally result. Such demands are difficult to resist and if granted will give rise to strong dissatisfaction in other Services. Meanwhile, we assume that existing rules will continue to be applied as regards incremental credits for approved professional experience.

216. Exceptions will have to be made to the system of short scales and separate establishments for each grade within a class, in the case of certain professional classes whose initial entry point in the salary scale is so close to the top of the lower grade that they might cease to earn increments while waiting for a vacancy in the higher grade shortly after joining the Service. Among classes such as Doctors there is also difficulty in the degree of responsibility etc., attaching to different grades within the class. We have dealt with these departures from the general rule under the appropriate departmental heading in Chapter XIV.

Increments during Probation

217. It is the present practice in the West African Colonies for an officer on first appointment to be placed on three years probationary service, during which time he receives no increase in salary. Probation is, of course, a normal feature of any Civil Service, and the practice of withholding increments during probation is defended mainly on the grounds that while on probation a man is learning his

job and the payment of yearly increments would not be appropriate. We were surprised to find that the principle had been carried a step further, and that established pensionable members of the Junior Service on promotion to the Senior Service posts were treated as if on first appointment, and kept on trial for a period up to three years, and in any event given no increase in pay for three years. It was argued that the officer had to show himself fit for the higher post to which he had been appointed before he could be confirmed in it, and that as the three first steps in the new scale, all on the initial salary, were an intrinsic part of that scale, he could not be allowed to gain an advantage over officers already in the Senior Service, by jumping steps. These arguments appeared to us artificial. We understand that in the British Civil Service, an officer on probation does earn increments, while in the East African Colonies, although no increment is paid after completion of the first year's service, a double increment is paid at the end of the second year, so that no continuing loss is suffered. On the balance of evidence, and having regard to the dissatisfaction and complications frequently created by the West African system, we favour the British practice, and recommend that increments should be paid during probation. Although the normal period of probation in the West African Government Services is three years, the corresponding period in the United Kingdom and most Colonies is two years. We understand that the three-year practice was adopted to ensure that an expatriate officer had served for at least two tours of eighteen months before he was considered for confirmation. If increments are paid during probation, officers will suffer no financial loss while waiting an extra year for confirmation. We see no reason to recommend a departure from the present three years system, which appears to be suitable for conditions in the Gold Coast.

Salaries of Women Officers

218. In the Gold Coast it is at present the practice to pay the same salaries to male and female officers doing the same work. In the United Kingdom and in the East African Colonies women are paid less than men. We understand, however, that the British Government has accepted the principle of equal pay for men and women employed on the same work, and that it proposes to put it into practice when the financial position of the United Kingdom permits. We consider that it would be a retrograde step for the Gold Coast Government at this stage to abandon the practice of paying equal salaries, and from a purely financial point of view we consider that the employment of women, even on the same salaries as men, can still effect economy. There are certain kinds of work, mostly sub-clerical, typing, and manipulative, in which an employee quickly attains the maximum degree of efficiency required for the job. In such cases it is uneconomic to employ men for considerable numbers of years, adding to Government's pension liability, and possibly dissatisfied with their salaries, as the work does not, of course, justify a long incremental scale. A very high proportion of women recruited to a service leave it within a comparatively few years of joining, either on marriage or for other reasons. Apart from their pay they add little to Government's financial liabilities and can generally be quickly replaced.

Revision of present rates

219. It is now necessary to consider the actual salaries which should be fixed for the various grades and posts, and in Chapter XIV we set out our detailed recommendations. We found this one of the more difficult parts of our task. A revision of salaries which necessarily aims at providing a basis of remuneration which can safely be applied in the foreseeable future, should, if possible, be undertaken at a time when local and world markets and other factors governing prices and cost of living are stable and likely to remain so for a reasonable time. Conditions during the time we were making our investigation were just the reverse. The period of comparative, though uneasy, stability immediately following the Armistices of 1945-46, had been disturbed, first by the devaluation of the pound sterling, and then by the decision of the British and American Governments to begin an extensive rearmament programme. Prices of raw materials and wages in countries from which the Gold Coast derived its imports were increasing. The position in the Gold Coast was further complicated by the circumstances to which we refer at greater length in Chapter VI—Cost of Living. The rapid increase in the price of cocoa resulted in a large increase in the currency in circulation, with inevitable inflationary tendencies accentuated by short supplies of consumer goods. It is difficult to decide how much a man should be paid for his work if the value of the medium in which he is paid is uncertain.

“Overseas” Pay

220. We recommend the retention of the principle of “overseas” pay on basic salary to officers recruited from overseas with no domiciliary connections in West Africa, and in Appendix VIII we give what we consider to be the minimum rates likely to attract to the Service the diminishing numbers of expatriate officers required to enable Government to perform its functions. We received and have carefully and sympathetically considered an appreciable body of evidence for and against the principle of “overseas” pay, and on the proportion it should bear to basic salary. In the light of this evidence we have made some adjustments, in the interests of recruitment, to the rates payable at the lower salary ranges while leaving the highest ranges unaltered. Certain adjustments have also been made at intermediate ranges as a consequence of our proposed new basic scales.

221. The argument, which in our view is irresistible, can be briefly stated as follows. It is generally accepted that a certain number of expatriate officers are still required for the Gold Coast Services. The Gold Coast Government naturally wants these men to be fully qualified and of the highest calibre, capable not only of doing a job, but of passing on their skill and knowledge to others. It is obvious that such men at the present time can always obtain employment on satisfactory terms in their country of domicile. It is therefore quite unreasonable to presume that they will consent to serve in West Africa unless they are offered terms which are sufficiently attractive to induce them to do so. This, under present conditions, means a higher rate of pay than it is economically sound to pay for the job in the Gold Coast. If, employing the argument equal pay for equal work, African and expatriate officers are offered the same terms of remuneration, one of two unfortunate situations will arise. Either the quality and numbers of expatriate officers urgently required will not be forthcoming, or Government will be faced with a salary bill out of all proportion to the value of the services rendered, and will eventually be in danger of bankruptcy. The conclusion is inescapable that expatriate officers, for as long as their employment is necessary, must be offered higher inducement than Africans doing the same work, and in our opinion this can best be done by continuing the present practice of offering overseas or inducement pay in addition to basic salary.

222. We have already shown in paragraph 69(ii) of this Report that

- (i) There is a heavy wastage of expatriate staff in the Gold Coast Service which is increasing and is likely to be accentuated owing to postwar conditions in the United Kingdom.
- (ii) That there has been a serious diminution in the number of expatriate candidates for the Colonial Service and that the Gold Coast is not getting its share of such candidates as are available.

This state of affairs reinforces our conclusion that there is no alternative to the retention of overseas or inducement pay.

223. We do not attempt to define an expatriate for this purpose. The definition contained in Sessional Paper No. 1 of 1947 appears to us to be as comprehensive as possible, but we have received complaints that certain Gold Coast Africans have under that definition been allowed to draw Overseas Pay. We have not investigated the circumstances of these cases but it seems to us that in general Gold Coast Africans should not be eligible for Overseas Pay. We do not, however, wish to imply that Overseas Pay is based on racial discrimination. An officer of African descent recruited from the West Indies or America might be adjudged eligible equally with a European. It will be found that the majority of cases present no difficulty and we suggest that in the few doubtful cases the Governor should decide whether the person concerned is eligible for overseas pay before an offer of appointment is made.

Contract Appointments

224. In order to facilitate the Africanisation of the Service, the Government has in recent years resorted to a considerable extent to the recruitment of expatriate staff on contract terms. We consider that it is proper in the present circumstances in the Gold Coast to recruit expatriates on contract terms to the Public Service, but it should be noted that every grade and class within the Service must contain a hard core of pensionable officers who are making their careers in the Gold Coast; if this hard core cannot be provided from local sources, it must be provided by recruitment from overseas.

225. There are three main reasons for contract appointments :—

- (i) Where a local candidate is expected to be qualified and available shortly for the post and an expatriate is required to fill the post for a short and specified time.
- (ii) Where the post is in itself of a temporary nature, e.g. for a capital works programme.
- (iii) Where no African is available locally and expatriates will only accept appointment on contract terms.

226. Each of these circumstances requires a different kind of treatment but as we understand them, the present rules governing contract appointments do not allow for much variation to meet different circumstances. In fixing contract terms without prospects of ultimate establishment, the normal practice is to add 10 per cent. to the approved salary for the post and at the conclusion of the contract pay a gratuity calculated at the rate of £25 per three months of service on salaries up to £1000 and at £37. 10s. 0d. per three months of service on salaries above £1000. It generally requires more inducement to obtain the services of a qualified officer on contract than if he is offered a permanent pensionable post. Professional men are apt to lose touch with the latest developments in their profession if they spend some years in Africa. When their contract has been completed, they may find they have lost contact at home, and it is not easy to set themselves up again in their profession. Good men, well qualified in their profession or trades who are prepared to go abroad on contract work are not easy to find, and in present world conditions there is considerable competition for their services. In the circumstances, it appears to us a little unrealistic to fix terms for contract appointments by hard and fast rules. We recommend that to enable the Gold Coast Government to compete in what is virtually a “seller’s market” the Chief Establishments Officer of the Chief Secretary’s Office should be given wide discretion in fixing terms for contract appointments.

227. We suggest the following general rules :—

- (i) That before advertising a post abroad it should be decided whether the post is to be filled on contract or on pensionable terms. The procedure of advertising overseas appointments on a contract basis in the first instance and later on pensionable terms, delays and hinders recruitment.
- (ii) The Chief Establishments Officer should be authorised, according to the state of the market, to offer rates of remuneration up to 25 per cent. higher than the gross salary which would be offered for a pensionable appointment. The employment of staff on contract at rates of pay substantially higher than those applicable to the permanent staff should not provide the latter with any reasonable grounds for dissatisfaction.
- (iii) Contracts should be offered for a definite period of up to 10 or 15 years, if necessary, with adequate provision for earlier release by both sides.
- (iv) Provision should be made for contributory superannuation schemes to be attached to long term contracts at the discretion of the officer, and with the alternative of lump sum gratuities.
- (v) Rates of remuneration should be advertised showing consolidated rates inclusive of overseas pay, as well as the “break up” of those rates.

Superscale Posts

228. As stated in paragraphs 97 and 120, we recommend for the Administrative and Professional classes three relatively short scales rising to £1350, while for the Executive and allied classes, which cover a more varied and wider field, we advise six reasonably short scales rising to £1250. We experienced some difficulty in assigning salaries appropriate to qualifications and responsibilities to superscale posts above those levels. We have had in the first place to bear in mind the salary levels of posts of equivalent status in commerce and industry in the Gold Coast, which normally carry special emoluments and privileges that are foreign to Government Service. We have also had to have regard to the pay attaching to similar posts in other Colonies and in the United Kingdom. It was also necessary to consider the economic situation of the Gold Coast and the level of professional incomes prevailing in that country so as to ensure that the higher salaries recommended by us would not be out of keeping with a completely Africanised service. Striking a balance between these considerations, we have been led to the conclusion that the highest salary in the Civil Service of the Gold

Coast should be maintained approximately at its present level, *i.e.*, £3000 per annum consolidated and pensionable, for the Chief Secretary.

229. Within these limits we have had to grade a large number of posts of varying responsibilities. In our approach to the problem we have followed two main principles:—

- (i) As far as practicable, it is wiser, owing to the difficulty of assessing accurately the difference in responsibilities between such high level posts, to disregard minor divergencies and to adopt a “broad band” of salary for posts of nearly equivalent value. With this end in view we assign a salary of £1600 to Directors of practically all Departments. We have made exceptions in the case of the Director of Medical Services whose salary must be in proportion to the high salaries it is necessary at present to pay qualified doctors in any country; the Directors of Agriculture, Public Works, Education, and the Commissioners of Police and Lands, who have responsibilities recognisably greater than those of other Heads of Departments; and the Heads of three of the smaller Executive Departments whose posts have always been graded at a lower level than those of other Heads of Departments for whom the qualifications required are higher and the responsibilities greater.
- (ii) We take the view that the proportionate difference as regards weight of responsibility is much greater when comparison is made between the Head of a Department and his Deputy than it is when the Deputy is compared with the new grade. We have therefore left a proportionately greater gap between the salary of a Director and that of his Deputy than between the salary of a Deputy and that of Assistant Directors. We have also followed our first principle and assigned broadly the same level of salary (£1400) to Deputy Directors of the main administrative and professional Departments, while fixing at £1350 the general salary level for Deputy Directors of Executive Departments.

**Special Executive and
Technical Posts and
Expatriate Recruitment**

230. We are aware that the salary scales we recommend for the lower grades of the Executive and Technical classes in certain cases may not be attractive to expatriate recruits. They are, however, appropriate to the posts in the local pattern we are trying to create, and if it should not prove possible for the time being to fill the posts locally, special arrangements may have to be made to attract expatriates, preferably on contract terms.

231. The grade which is least likely to attract expatriate recruits is the one carrying a salary scale £550–£700. In so far as this scale applies to posts of a general executive type and to certain other posts of a semi-specialised nature such as accounting posts, we do not consider that there should be much difficulty in finding suitable recruits by local promotions and appointments. After the initial reorganisation these posts should normally be filled by promotion within the Service. In the next grades £750–£960 and £1000–£1080, which include the more specialised executive and accounting posts, it is unlikely that sufficient Africans with the requisite qualifications and experience will be immediately forthcoming. Few Africans for example have yet acquired sufficient experience or qualifications to fill the more responsible posts in the Income Tax Department. Until such time as Africans are available to fill these higher posts by promotion from the lower grades, it will be necessary to recruit expatriates on contract terms, but it seems unlikely to us that these terms will attract sufficient recruits to fill the gap until local candidates are forthcoming. In these circumstances for specialised executive work in certain Departments it will be necessary to recruit expatriates into the Service on pensionable terms, either direct on first appointment or on transfer from another Colony on the grade starting at £750 per annum. In making such appointments care should be taken that candidates have in fact the qualifications and experience in the work which local candidates have not yet acquired. We stress, however, that in due course these posts and higher posts should normally be filled by promotion from within the Service.

232. As regards technical posts, there is a severe shortage of Africans who have had the training and experience necessary to undertake the type of work we have suggested in paragraph 121 should be assigned to officers such as Inspectors of Works. The Gold Coast, in common with most countries in the world, will require this type of officer in increasing numbers for many years to come, and, in view of the heavy demand for officers with this particular experience it may be

found necessary to make special *ad hoc* arrangements to ensure a steady flow of expatriate recruits until such time as qualified Africans begin to come up the ladder we have tried to provide in the new structure. We deal in more detail with this class of officer under the appropriate departmental headings in Chapter XIV.

233. There are also a number of posts at present on Scale C1,2, which we have regraded on the executive scale from £550 to £700. In our view the present gradings of these posts were influenced by the need to recruit expatriates. In the majority of cases qualified Africans should shortly be available to fill these posts, and we cannot recommend a general departure from the rule that posts should be regraded as for an indigenous Civil Service. Serving expatriate officers will, of course, have the option to retain their existing salaries and in very special circumstances we would see no objection to an expatriate being allowed to convert to the next higher executive scale (£750-£960) personal to himself. We stress, however, that this should be approved only in very special cases and we would hope that where such approval was given the officer concerned would be due to retire within the period which it would take him to train his successor. The personal salary scale could thus be justified by the additional training duties placed on the officer.

Teachers

234. We have experienced some difficulty in assigning a salary scale to junior teaching staff in Government schools. Teachers do not fall clearly within any of the usual Civil Service categories and we have allocated to the Junior teaching staff salary scales overlapping the Clerical and Executive classes. These scales provide a relative improvement in the position of Government teaching staff which we consider justified by the importance of this class in ensuring a steady flow of educated Africans which are required for the public administration and for private, commercial and industrial enterprises. We have, however, noted earlier our view that the running and maintenance of schools is not a normal function of civil servants, and it may be that in the not too distant future the Central Government will withdraw from *direct* participation in the teaching and management of schools and colleges. In that event the salaries of teachers in all schools could be decided without the complication of having to determine relationships with Civil Service classes.

Junior Technical Grades

235. We met criticism of the present salary structure on the grounds that African youths were attracted by the higher pay which could be earned by "white collar" workers and were not prepared to enter technical grades doing equally essential work. Credit must of course be allowed for superior education and compensation for extra years spent profitably at school, but subject to this, we have tried to redress the balance by framing scales which should provide technically-minded schoolboys with attractive careers in Departments such as Agriculture, Animal Health, Forestry, and the Post Office. We have also endeavoured to ensure that artisans, technicians and others who work with their hands should have fair and reasonable remuneration and prospects of advancement (provided they are prepared to improve themselves) in no way inferior to those of Clerical and other non-technical staff.

Clerical Service

236. Witnesses whom we consulted were almost unanimously of the opinion that the clerk with full secondary education who joined the Service on £84 per annum (approximately £100 per annum with temporary allowance) and remained on that salary for three years, was underpaid. We accept the view that a secondary schoolboy is worth more than £84 per annum on appointment provided he is employed on work corresponding to his educational attainments. In our recommended structure and subject to the regrading that we propose, the initial salary point for Clerical and analogous classes is £120 per annum. Sub-clerical workers with inferior educational qualifications start of course on lower salaries. Under our recommendations the clerical worker will not be able to proceed by annual increments on the new consolidated scale beyond £270 although at present he can reach £300 including temporary allowance. This is inevitable as he will not, while in that grade, be expected to undertake the more responsible of the duties at present assigned to Second Division clerks. He will, however, be eligible to draw increments from the end of his first year's service; he will be pensionable on a maximum of £270 instead of £250 as at present, and if he is capable of doing more responsible work, he should have full opportunity of obtaining early promotion to a more highly paid grade.

Unskilled Labour

237. It was suggested to us that daily-paid staff did not come strictly within our terms of reference, and any adjustments required in the pay of this class of employee should be settled by negotiation with their Unions and on the advice of the Commissioner of Labour. We are required, however, to report on "changes in remuneration" and we do not think we can disclaim responsibility for this numerous and important class of Government worker. Indeed, we have come to regard the daily paid labourer as the base of our salary pyramid. As the lowest paid employee he is more susceptible to changes in the cost of living and has the smallest safety margin to meet a sudden rise. He can aspire to be rated as a skilled worker, or "established" in the lower grades of the permanent service, and in fixing the salaries of these grades, it is necessary to keep in sight the normal yearly earnings of daily paid staff.

238. As briefly explained earlier in this Chapter, daily paid employees are at present paid rates which vary according to locality. These are as follows:—

Northern Territories 2s. plus 5d. temporary allowance—2s. 5d.

Ashanti and the Colony, exclusive of the three main towns 2s. 6d. plus 6d. temporary allowance—3s. 0d.

Accra, Kumasi, Sekondi/Takoradi 2s. 9d. plus 7d. temporary allowance—3s. 4d. (first year)

and Railway Employees 3s. plus 7d. temporary allowance—3s. 7d. (after one year)

The practice of paying wages by location is not entirely satisfactory and is liable to create difficulties of administration and dissatisfaction among the workers. On the whole, however, it appears to work tolerably well in the Gold Coast, and there are serious objections to insisting on a uniform rate of wages in the present stage of development of the country, when costs and standards of living vary greatly in different localities, particularly for the unskilled labour force. Government is only one of many employees of labour and it would be a mistake in our opinion to make it necessary to private employers all over the Northern Territories to raise wages to Accra levels because Government wished to preserve uniformity in official rates. Daily paid labour is not transferable so that the arguments which make it necessary to pay uniform rates to officers liable to transfer, wherever they are serving, do not apply. We recommend no change in the present practice, but have included Tamale in the group comprising Ashanti and the Colony, as we understand living costs of labourers in that town are related more to those obtaining in the South than in the rest of the Northern Territories. Semi-skilled daily paid workmen who have in effect a commodity of accepted value to sell to employers, should, as at present, enjoy uniform rates throughout the Gold Coast.

239. An unusual feature of the present rates is the practice of paying labour in the principal towns at 2s. 9d. for the first year and at 3s. for subsequent years. We understand that it was introduced to induce labourers to remain in Government employment after their value had been enhanced both through their familiarity with working conditions, and Government supervisors' familiarity with them. We were also informed that the practice was now well understood and popular with labour. From a financial point of view there is obvious economy in paying a man a lower wage until he has shown himself to be a useful worker worth keeping, and in our recommendations we have retained this practice and extended it to all three groups.

240. We recommend the following rates of pay for unskilled labourers:—

- (i) *Accra, Kumasi, Sekondi/Takoradi*—3s. 9d. per diem rising to 4s. per diem after one year's continuous service.
- (ii) *Other parts of the Colony and Ashanti and Tamale*—3s. 3d. per diem rising to 3s. 6d. after one year's continuous service.
- (iii) *Northern Territories other than Tamale*—2s. 6d. per diem rising to 2s. 9d. per diem after one year's continuous service.

Regrading of subordinate staff

241. Above the level of the unskilled labourer, and below that of the formally trained technician or artisan, exists a large number of workmen employed on jobs requiring various degrees of acquired skill and involving differing degrees of responsibility. These workmen form the categories referred to in the

Korsah Report as semi-skilled and skilled labourers, which we have, in paragraphs 160-161, recommended should be removed from the main structure of the Civil Service. At the lower levels they emerge indistinctly from the ranks of the unskilled labourer by the acquisition of a degree of dexterity in a particular operation. At the upper levels they tend to merge into the class of technician or artisan though generally speaking, the latter should have had a certain amount of theoretical training enabling them to assume a greater measure of discretion and initiative in deciding the job requiring to be done and the best methods of doing it. We have indicated in paragraph 164 that we consider that ideally the technician or artisan class should be remunerated on fixed rates and that all grades of semi-skilled and skilled labour which are in any case more closely related to the unskilled class, should definitely be paid on fixed daily, weekly or monthly rates of pay. We would not presume to assess in terms of rates of pay the relative value of, for example, a crossing-keeper and a conservancy labourer. This should be done in negotiation between the authorities who want the work done and the representatives of the men who do it, with, possibly, the assistance of the Labour Department. Certain limits must of course be imposed but within these limits there should be freedom to decide by departmental negotiation the wages which should be attached to each job. We consider that on the values obtaining in April 1951, it should be possible to fix fair and reasonable wages for all jobs in these categories, at different rates between 4s. 6d. a day, and 10s. a day, which seems to us a reasonable payment on the present-day values for the highest grade of labour below the skilled Artisan or Technician. In order to assist in determining rates of pay we include at Appendix IX some notes on factors to be taken into account in assessing the value of different types of work, and we state here that in our view there is no objection to an employee on daily rates of pay receiving larger gross emoluments than he would receive as a civil servant on a salary scale.

Merit Bonus

242. We have recommended in paragraph 161 that skilled and semi-skilled labour should not be placed on annual incremental scales.

There is, however, a psychological need to provide some positive incentives which, as we have explained, were not provided for skilled and semi-skilled classes by annual incremental scales. Among classes where full apprenticeship schemes and trade tests can be operated, the provision of incentives by way of additional remuneration for recognised standards of skill is comparatively simple. Moreover, as we have suggested earlier, one of the functions of Trade Unions is the maintenance of standards of workmanship and productivity. With the classes with which we are now dealing, however, for the same reason that it is difficult to draw the dividing line between skilled and semi-skilled and between semi-skilled and unskilled, it is difficult to tie incentives to recognised standards such as trade tests. In the United Kingdom we understand that a system of "merit rating" has been introduced to overcome this difficulty and we recommend it for adoption in the Gold Coast. Under this system an employee can earn a "merit bonus" in addition to his basic wage rate on the recommendation of the Foreman under whose immediate charge he works. An employee should not normally be eligible for a "merit bonus" until he has been employed for one year. The recommendation should be submitted by the Foreman or equivalent officer in charge of the employee concerned, to the Engineer or equivalent officer in charge of the particular Division, who should be authorised to approve or reject. If approved, the "merit bonus" should be payable, subject to good conduct, for a period of six months, when it should lapse unless continued meritorious service justifies a recommendation for its continuance or an increase. The question of decreasing the bonus in place of complete withdrawal may also arise. The important point about this system is that individual and specific recommendations have to be submitted, and in the absence of any recommendation, no bonus is payable. The bonus should be in units of one penny per day, and an employee should be able to earn any number of bonus units up to a stated maximum. The details of this system should be worked out in consultation with the employees' representatives.

CHAPTER VIII

MISCELLANEOUS CONDITIONS OF SERVICE

Provision of houses for civil servants

243. As we understand the present position, Government has a virtual obligation to provide accommodation for all expatriate officers, but has refused to accept a similar obligation as regards African members of the Junior Service, with certain exceptions such as Policemen, Prison Warders, etc. No firm policy, however, has been declared as regards provision of accommodation for African members of the Senior Service, though bungalows, if available, are normally allotted to African Judges, Magistrates, Heads and Deputy Heads of Departments, if they so desire.

244. The need to provide accommodation to expatriate staff is obvious, and this obligation should be specifically accepted. It is difficult, however, to justify the acceptance of any such obligation towards officers living in their own country merely because they happen to work for Government, and we understand that it has already been made clear that when Government or Local Authorities have started building schemes to relieve housing shortage, no preference will be given to Government servants in the allocation of houses. It does not, of course, follow that no African officer should be provided with a house. The progress of Africanisation and the consequent reduction in the number of expatriate officers will naturally result in an increasing number of houses being available for allocation by Government to African civil servants. We recommend that Government, while disclaiming a definite obligation to provide quarters for African Civil Servants should in practice provide accommodation for Africans posted to stations outside the main towns if no other suitable accommodation is available. We favour the present practice of providing houses wherever possible to certain African officials such as judicial officers, doctors, and Heads of Departments, who should be readily accessible outside office hours. The Commission has received evidence that African officials, in the Senior Service particularly, find the greatest difficulty in obtaining suitable accommodation in the large towns at rentals bearing a reasonable relation to their salaries. Government officers are at a greater disadvantage than persons in commerce and industry by reason of the liability to transfer from one station to another at short notice. Moreover, while the Housing Department is making progress with the provision of housing estates for labourers and for the class of society in which the Junior Civil Service falls, no similar measures have yet been taken to provide housing for the class of society to which the senior African official belongs. We believe that the proper solution to this problem is the provision of facilities for loans on the lines of a building society in order to relieve hardship caused to African officers of the Senior Service, stationed in the urban areas, who are unable to find suitable accommodation at reasonable rentals. But we consider it even more important that in the present stage of the country's development Government should concentrate on ensuring that officers in out-stations have somewhere to live, rather than that officers in towns like Accra and Kumasi should have houses considered appropriate to their status. The question of the appropriate rent to be charged in each case has next to be considered.

Rent

245. Prior to the adoption of the Harragin Commission Report with effect from 1946, expatriate officers enjoyed free quarters as a condition of their service. The Report recommended the retention of this condition, but it was decided to introduce the rent principle in the form of a reduction from basic salary worked on a platform basis, *i.e.*, the amount of the reduction was successively increased above certain salary points or platforms. A proportionate increase was made in the salaries recommended by the Commission, the intention being that officers would be no worse off when required to pay rent than they had been when they enjoyed free quarters. In fact, they should be better off as the increase was pensionable and accrued to the officer when on leave and not occupying a Government house. In the event, payment of rent has possibly caused more complaints and dissatisfaction, with consequent work for Establishment staffs, than any other of the 1946 adjustments. Officers do not readily appreciate (especially in view of the rise in the cost of living since 1946) that a part of their salary as shown in the estimates merely represents a rent element to be repaid to Government, and the longer the lapse of time since the system was introduced, the more difficult it will become for Government to meet complaints with this argument. Perhaps the most fruitful

cause of dissatisfaction is the wide difference in the standards of accommodation often enjoyed by officers paying the same rent, or even by the same officer who may be required to live in quarters inferior to those which he occupied at a previous station when he was on a lower salary platform and paid less rent. We hope that some of these difficulties are temporary and will diminish with an improvement in the existing difficult housing situation when Government is in a position to offer officers and their families accommodation of a standard which they can reasonably expect. But in the meantime we consider that some relief should be given, more particularly as in the revised salaries which we recommend we have not included a special rent element, and we make the following suggestions for consideration.

246. All houses normally allocated to expatriate officers should be graded into three broad classes, viz., Classes I, II and III, to provide a distinction from the A, B and C classes at present occupied by members of the Junior Service. Class III should normally be assigned to officers on basic salaries up to £960; Class II to those on the rental salary platform £961-£1350, and Class I to those on higher platforms. If an officer was assigned a house in a lower class than that to which his salary would normally entitle him, and provided he had not applied for a house in a lower class, he would be required to pay only the maximum rent appropriate to the house he occupied.

247. As we did not have an opportunity to make a comprehensive review of the various types of houses available for allocation, we leave the details of classification to the Director of Public Works and the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office, who possess the detailed knowledge of houses we lack, and are also aware of the grounds which most frequently give rise to complaints from tenants. It might help, however, if we state briefly the main principles we have in mind. Most Government houses in the principal towns would fall into Class II. Class I would be reserved for the larger houses such as the T.2 type; houses which have been reconditioned, and those which provide reasonable accommodation for the more senior officers. Class III would include very small houses, and houses particularly in outstations, where reasonable modern standards had either never been provided or not been maintained. Bad state of repair should normally be attended to by the Public Works Department and not form grounds for low classification, but an exception should be made in cases where, owing to pressure of more urgent work, or lack of materials, there was no near prospect of repairs being carried out, or in cases where the house had been condemned, so that major repairs would not be economical, but shortage of accommodation made continued occupation necessary.

248. The concessions regarding quarters shared, sub-standard houses, etc., provided in General Orders 653 and 654, should be retained, but the provision contained in General Order 654(i) that officers occupying a single room in a resthouse should pay full rent for the first seven days, and half rent thereafter, appears to us ungenerous in view of the discomfort frequently involved. We spent several nights in resthouses in the Northern Territories which seemed to us to provide adequate accommodation for officers on short duty visits, but inadequate for semi-permanent occupation. It is difficult to draw a fair comparison between such accommodation and a room with bathroom attached in the Accra resthouse, and yet under the present regulations the rent charged in each case is the same. We recommend that the authority responsible for a resthouse (e.g. Chief Commissioner or Chief Transport Officer) should fix a rent for occupation of a room, which we suggest should not be less than 1s. 0d. or more than 2s. 0d. a night, and officers occupying resthouses, provided they had not been allocated houses for which they were paying rent based on their salaries, should pay the fixed rent.

249. African officers who are assigned Government quarters and who are not entitled to free quarters, at present pay rent on the platform basis if they are in the Senior Service, and on a percentage of salary basis, varying according to the standard of accommodation, if they are in the Junior Service. We encountered a considerable divergence of views, both in the Senior and in the Junior Service, on the question whether rent should be paid on the platform or on the percentage basis. On the balance of evidence we are satisfied that there are insufficient grounds at present for abandoning the existing system, though we appreciate that at a later stage when the services are mainly or wholly African it may be necessary to review the whole question and either

have a fixed rent for every house (which we do not think immediately practicable) or work on the uniform percentage of salary basis, adopted by the Governments in East African Colonies. We therefore recommend (see also Appendix X) that rent should be paid on a platform basis for the houses we have classified I, II and III, and that rent for houses classified A, B, C in General Orders, should be paid on a percentage basis as follows :—

<i>Class of House</i>	<i>Unfurnished</i>	<i>Partly Furnished</i>
A	6% of salary	7% of salary
B	5% of salary	6% of salary
C	4% of salary	5% of salary

At present the classes of house for which we suggest grading I to III are normally partly furnished ; Classes A to C are not. We received frequent complaints from members of the Junior Service that they suffered substantial losses from breakage of furniture in transport when on transfer to new stations. Much of the furniture owned by this class of officer is of flimsy construction and when it is carried for long distances by lorry over bad road surfaces, breakages are unavoidable. We recommend that wherever practicable basic heavy furniture such as beds, tables, cupboards, and chairs, should be provided in the lower class houses, and we have suggested that an additional 1 per cent. of salary shall be paid for housing so furnished. It could probably be supplied at reasonable rates by local carpenters working on contract, if the Public Works Department was unable to undertake the work owing to other commitments. The cost would be recovered over a period of years from the additional rent charged.

Allocation of Government Houses 250. It is the duty of the Chief Secretary in Accra and the Chief and District Commissioners in the outstations to allocate quarters to individual officers. While the supply of houses is inadequate, the task of ensuring that every expatriate officer is suitably housed, that full and continuous use is made of all the houses available, and that as far as practicable officers returning from leave to the same station may be allowed to occupy their former houses should they so desire, is both difficult and invidious. We recommend that in all the larger stations housing committees should be formed under the chairmanship of a senior officer, preferably one who had been resident in the station for some time. These committees will be responsible, under the Chief Secretary or Commissioner, for the allocation of houses in the station. The appointment of members representing different grades and departments would inspire confidence that the circumstances of each case were fully appreciated, and at the same time the invidiousness of the task would be shared and would not have to be borne by a single officer as at present.

Police Quarters and rent allowances 251. Owing to the rapid expansion of the Police Force, who are entitled to free quarters in the non-commissioned ranks, it has not been possible for the Government building programme to keep pace with requirements. As a result, it is often necessary for constables and inspectors either to live out in privately rented quarters, or share quarters intended for individual officers. When a policeman has to rent private quarters he is paid a monthly or daily allowance at a fixed rate according to whether he is a member of the inspectorate or a constable. We understand this has caused dissatisfaction in the past because the allowance was insufficient to meet the high rental charges levied by private landlords, but the matter is being re-examined by the Chief Secretary's Office. This practice, however, must always be unsatisfactory as an increase in Government allowances almost invariably tends to increase the rent demanded by the landlord. The only true solution is the provision of sufficient houses, which should be given high priority, but until this is achieved we suggest that as far as practicable Government should itself rent such extra accommodation as is required rather than pay standard allowances to the men themselves. We understand a somewhat similar position obtains in the Prison Department where members of the staff are entitled to free accommodation.

252. When two members of the Police Force (below commissioned rank) have to share quarters intended for one, they are paid a compensatory allowance equal to half the allowance paid when no official quarters are provided. We consider this practice indefensible and should be abolished. Allowances should be paid for extra work or skill or to meet expenses necessarily incurred in the

course of duty. Inconvenience caused by housing shortages is universal at present in the Gold Coast, and policemen, like other members of the public, should be prepared to accept that inconvenience until the position can be improved, and not expect to be compensated in cash.

Transit Camps for Junior Staff

253. Transfer from one station to another in the Gold Coast frequently involves a journey of more than one day, and nights have to be spent at stations en route. We received numerous complaints

from members of the Junior Civil Service that owing to the absence of suitable accommodation at their night stops, they frequently suffered considerable hardship. We were told of nights spent by families on street verandahs and in transport yards. We understand that Government has already accepted in principle the provision of transit quarters at nominal rates for junior African staff in certain key stations, and although a house has been provided for this purpose in Accra, the building of transit quarters in other stations awaits priority sanction. We consider this a matter of considerable importance for the maintenance of a contented staff and recommend that the highest possible priority shall be accorded. If delays in building are inevitable consideration should be given to renting accommodation as has been done in Accra. Transit quarters should be suitably furnished and should have adequate cooking facilities. The furnishings required is a matter to be determined in consultation with the staff representatives. There is the further connected question of the provision of temporary accommodation for junior officers who have reached their destination on transfer, but have either not been assigned permanent quarters, or are not yet in a position to occupy them. We do not consider this of such urgency, as arrangements can generally be made for the new arrival to lodge temporarily with a fellow officer in the station, but serious consideration should also be given to the use of transit quarters for this purpose as well, with any precautionary measures thought necessary to avoid temporary lodgers obtaining "squatters' rights" and proving difficult to move into more permanent accommodation.

Transit Quarters Senior Staff

254. We were favourably impressed by the Transit Quarters for Senior Staff at Takoradi which are a catering establishment run on hotel lines.

The absence of similar establishments in Kumasi and Tamale imposes a considerable strain on the hospitality of officers stationed in these towns, and reduces the usefulness of the internal air services. We hope that the success of the experiment at Takoradi will encourage the Government to make similar arrangements for the other main towns as early as may be. These establishments differ from resthouses and the transit camps mentioned in the preceding paragraph in that as nearly as possible charges levied should be at economic rates.

General Housing Shortage

255. Shortage of houses, such as is general throughout the Gold Coast, induces high rents which immediately affect cost of living and create demands for increased wages which are difficult to resist.

Government is alive to the position and a separate department has been created which is mainly concerned with the building of housing estates in approved localities. This should, of course, be the responsibility of Local Authorities, but in the meantime and until local authorities have reached a more advanced stage of development, we consider that this should be one of the more important functions of the Central Government. We further recommend that private enterprise in building should be encouraged by some form of Government sponsored building society which would advance money to building contractors on behalf of private individuals who submitted approved plans. We understand some such proposal is already under contemplation; it should be adopted and actively pursued.

LEAVE AND PASSAGES

General Observations

256. The leave conditions (including vacation leave and travelling time, sick leave and casual leave) for all classes of civil servant are generous, both by standards existing in the United Kingdom and in comparison with the practice prevailing in any other employment in the Gold Coast, about which we have received evidence. Nevertheless, we received many representations from junior African civil servants for considerable improvements in leave conditions, accompanied by reduced hours of work and increased pay. Representations of this nature revealed a lack of a sense of proportion and responsibility and we are glad to be able to record that a number of more discerning witnesses recognised the generosity

of the existing leave terms by passing them by in a discreet silence. Our attention has, however, been drawn to leave terms which form an important part of conditions of service and a far from negligible factor in considerations of efficiency.

African Leave Rates 257. The existing leave rates for African civil servants as laid down in General Orders Nos. 669, 727, 736 and 737, are as follows:—

Daily paid employees—14 days for each year of service plus two Public Holidays with pay.

**Junior Service* :

Salaries up to £120 per annum—15 days for each year of service.

Salaries over £121 per annum and up to £250 per annum—30 days for each year of service.

Salaries over £250 per annum—45 days for each year of service.

**Senior Service*—60 days for each year of service.

258. Leave rates in the United Kingdom Civil Service vary from 14 days a year to a maximum of 36 days a year. Leave rates in private employment in the Gold Coast vary from two weeks in a year to one month in a year. We consider that the existing leave rates in the Gold Coast Civil Service are unnecessarily extravagant and recommend that they be amended as follows to bring them more into line with rates prevailing outside the service:—

Daily paid employees—14 days for each year of service plus two Public Holidays as at present.

Established Staff :

Salaries below £200 per annum—14 days for each year of service.

Salaries of £200 and up to £350 per annum—21 days for each year of service.

Salaries above £350 and below £550 per annum—30 days for each year of service.

Salaries above £550 per annum—45 days for each year of service.

These rates are comparable at the lower ranges with those prevailing in commerce and industry in the Gold Coast, and at the higher ranges are slightly more favourable. We see no reason why civil servants should continue to enjoy leave terms bearing no relation to those enjoyed by other members of the community.

Expatriate Leave Rates 259. Expatriate officers are at present eligible for seven days' leave for each month of residential service in the Gold Coast. This again is very generous in comparison with practice in private employment in the Gold Coast, and we have no reason to believe that the general standard of health among overseas employees of private firms is lower than that of overseas civil servants. Moreover, we understand that in recent years many overseas civil servants have been unable, due to staff shortages and pressure of work, to enjoy their full earned leave. Cases have been brought to our notice of officers with considerable amounts of accumulated leave to their credit. In our opinion, the present generous leave rate for overseas officers is unnecessary on health grounds and unjustified on financial and staff considerations. We are not unaware of the advantages from the point of view of recruitment of generous leave terms for overseas officers, but we consider that the other improvements which we recommend in remuneration and in free passages for children should offset the reduced leave terms. We recommend that overseas officers should be eligible for six days' leave, exclusive of travelling time, for each month of residential service in the Gold Coast.

Transport on Leave 260. As with other leave conditions, we consider the provision for free transport of civil servants proceeding on or returning from leave is generous. We have the following recommendations to make:—

(i) <i>Class of Accommodation</i> †	<i>Sea</i>	<i>Rail</i>
Salary of £550 and above	1st	1st
Salary of £200 up to £550	3rd	2nd
Pensionable below £200	3rd	3rd
Non-pensionable below £200	Deck	3rd

* Established staff are of course entitled to Public Holidays as they occur. There are eight Public Holidays per annum in the Gold Coast.

† General Orders 807 and 847.

(ii) *Coastwise passages—African Officers**

The provision for free leave passages for the wives and families of African officers to their homes outside the Gold Coast is a generous concession where the officers concerned have been recruited in the Gold Coast. It does not, however, place a very great burden on the country's finances, and it should be recognised as an *ex gratia* award for satisfactory service. Under the existing regulations the concession may be granted every two years to officers of the Senior Service and every four years to officers of the Junior Service. Since we recommend the abolition of the distinction between the Senior and Junior Service, it will be necessary to amend this rule. It may be assumed that persons from other Colonies coming to the Gold Coast in search of permanent employment intend to make the Gold Coast their normal place of residence and we consider that it would be sufficiently generous to allow the concession of free travel to their native country once in four years for all pensionable officers. We recommend no change in the provision for non-pensionable officers.

- (iii) *Porterage.* We have received many representations that the Government should refund porterage expenses incurred by African officers proceeding on leave. There is clearly much feeling on this matter among the officers concerned, and since the expense involved is negligible to the Government, we recommend that their request should be granted insofar as concerns pensionable officers travelling in circumstances where Government accepts responsibility for transport of baggage by road or rail.
- (iv) *Rail travel in the United Kingdom.* A proposal to pay rail fares in the United Kingdom of officers and their families proceeding on and returning from leave was rejected by the Standing Finance Committee of the Legislature in 1950. We understand that a number of other Colonies have agreed to pay these expenses and we consider that in the present competitive market for trained European staff it is essential that the Gold Coast should not be in the position of appearing mean about minor conditions of service. As with porterage for African officers, the expense is negligible so far as the Government is concerned and the satisfaction the concession would give to the officers concerned should more than justify it. We recommend that rail fares should be paid for officers and families of officers proceeding on or returning from leave in the United Kingdom between port and home.
- (v) *Passages to United Kingdom for African Officers.* General Order 751 makes provision in certain circumstances for the grant of free passages to African officers of the Senior Service and their wives, to enable them to spend leave in the United Kingdom once in every five years. This generous concession is in the discretion of the Governor and is subject to the condition that the Head of Department is satisfied that the officer's work would benefit from such a visit. We recommend the retention of this provision but suggest that it should normally be restricted to officers in receipt of salaries in excess of £850 per annum. If it is considered that officers in receipt of salaries below £850 per annum would benefit from a visit to the United Kingdom, arrangements should normally be made as for a course of instruction.
- (vi) *Free transport on leave for non-pensionable employees.* We received many representations that non-pensionable employees (other than those provided for in General Order 810) should be entitled to free leave transport to their homes on the same conditions as pensionable staff. We regret we are unable to recommend this request. These employees normally work in the place where they are recruited and if they are transferred elsewhere they are, under General Order 811, entitled to free transport to and from the place at which they were engaged. We suggest that this General Order might be extended to cover free transport to and from any other towns in which he desires to spend his leave, up to the cost of transport to the town in which he was recruited.

Length of Tour

261. The normal length of duty tours for African officers is two years to fit in with the provision for free leave transport. We see no objection to this practice in general but consider that the more senior officers should wherever possible take leave annually. We consider that short and frequent leaves should be of advantage to them on health grounds, and it makes for more continuity in work since the officers are away from duty for shorter periods than under the present system. In many posts the volume of work is subject

* General Orders 750, 804 and 805.

to seasonal fluctuations and if an officer is to be absent for only six weeks, it may be possible, if he chooses the time well, to arrange for his duties to be carried out temporarily on a part-time basis, thus reducing the number of leave reliefs carried on the establishment.

262. Expatriate officers' duty tours at present vary from 18 months to one year according to age and length of service. Again we advise annual leaves as beneficial both from the point of view of the officer's health (particularly if local leave is abolished), and from the point of view of economy.

Local Leave

263. Overseas officers are at present eligible, subject to the exigencies of the Service, for three weeks' local leave plus six days' travelling time, in each tour of duty. We understand, however, that in practice the officers on whom the heaviest burden of work falls are *ipso facto* seldom able to take advantage of this concession. With the improved health conditions in the country and the facilities for shorter tours of duty, we consider it difficult to justify the retention of this privilege and recommend its abolition without any right of option.

Casual Leave

264. We have had many representations from members of the Junior Service to the effect that the privilege of casual leave had been abolished and "special leave" introduced in its place. We were unable to discern a clear distinction between the two terms. The new edition of General Orders which was being printed when we left the Gold Coast provides as an act of grace at the discretion of Heads of Departments for the grant of short spells of casual leave not exceeding *seven* days. This General Order (General Order 668) is, however, applicable only to pensionable staff, though we consider it would be reasonable to extend similar facilities to all classes. Urgent personal affairs occur from time to time which necessitate an employee being absent from work for a few days, and a good employer should, if he is convinced of the *bona fides* of the case, be prepared to release the employee to enable him to attend to these affairs without incurring undue financial penalties. We recommend that full pay leave of this kind should be allowed to all classes of staff (including daily paid with more than one year's continuous service) on compassionate grounds up to a maximum of *ten* days in any one tour of duty provided the authorising officer is satisfied that there are genuine and justifiable grounds for the application. We do not recommend that any travelling expenses should be paid on such occasions. If a period in excess of ten days is required, additional leave without pay may be granted, or alternatively, additional leave may be granted to be offset against earned leave if the officer so desired. We wish to make it clear that leave of this kind is not a right, nor should it be granted as a matter of course. It is provision to cover cases where genuine hardship would be caused if an officer could not absent himself from his official duties for a few days to attend to personal affairs in the course of a tour of duty. On each occasion the onus is on the applicant to prove the need for the grant of this privilege.

Sick Leave

265. The existing provision for sick leave for pensionable staff is in our opinion adequate, and we recommend no change. We have, however, received a number of representations as to the inadequacy of sick leave provisions for non-pensionable African staff. Established non-pensionable employees are at present entitled to sick leave on full pay for 30 days and thereafter sick leave on half pay for a period not exceeding two months. Daily paid employees, with 12 months' service, are entitled to sick leave on full pay for 30 days only. There are two considerations to be taken into account when dealing with sick leave provisions :—

- (i) The desire of the Government to retain the services of trained employees who might be difficult to replace and
- (ii) The social obligation on the Government to set an example to other employers in a country which has no form of National Health Insurance or other general provision for persons who are temporarily incapacitated.

It is the first consideration which justifies the more generous sick leave provisions for pensionable staff. We are doubtful, however, whether the existing provisions fully meet these considerations in the case of non-pensionable staff, and recommend that this class including daily-paid employees should be entitled to sick leave as follows :—

After 12 months' service—Up to 30 days on full pay followed by 2 months on half pay in any period of 12 months.

After 5 years' continuous service—Up to 3 months on full pay followed by 3 months on half pay in any period of 12 months.

The grant of sick leave pay should be subject to the usual requirements of medical certificates of incapacity and to the over-riding condition that sick leave is granted only if a Government Medical Officer certifies that the employee should be able to resume duty after treatment.

Children's Passages

266. Among the most disadvantageous features of employment in the Gold Coast from the point of view of the overseas officer have been the enforced separation from his children during the formative years of their childhood and adolescence, and the heavy expense associated with their education at a boarding school in the officer's home country. Up till about the period of the late war, children of officers serving abroad could usually be looked after in the United Kingdom by grandparents or other relations, but social conditions in that country now are such that overseas officers can rarely make arrangements for their children to attend a "day" school and be looked after out of school time by friends or relations. There is normally therefore no alternative under present conditions to education at a boarding school for the children of an officer serving abroad. The overseas officer is thus faced with a situation in which his children are deprived of the care and attention only obtainable in family life and where at the same time the cost of maintaining and educating them is heavily increased. This position undoubtedly aggravated the difficulties of recruiting overseas officers and in 1950 the Legislature went some way to meet the difficulty by approving the grant of free passages to and from the Gold Coast for overseas officers' children subject to certain conditions. This concession is now embodied in General Order 755 which provides for the grant to overseas officers of free passages to and from the United Kingdom for a maximum of three children under the age of nine years in respect of each tour of duty.

267. This concession, while providing a measure of financial relief to officers with young children left untouched the problem of children requiring full-time education at a boarding school in the United Kingdom, and for this reason the existing concessions in regard to children's passages must be regarded as inadequate. In any event the West African Colonies are at a serious disadvantage both in comparison with employment in the United Kingdom and in East Africa and other Colonies where educational facilities exist for European children and where it is possible for those children to enjoy some of the benefits of normal family life while they are being educated. The comparatively long leave periods of overseas officers in West Africa have to a very limited extent offset the disadvantages of enforced separation from their children, but this is a highly expensive way of dealing with the problem, and as we have remarked, leaves untouched the problem of children needing full-time boarding school education in the United Kingdom. We have recommended on other grounds that leave rates should be reduced and it will be necessary to offer some compensatory contribution towards the cost of educating adolescent children while the father is on duty in West Africa.

268. In this connection it is relevant to quote the corresponding concession approved by the Legislature in Nigeria :—

"If an officer brings his children to Nigeria, he will be entitled to assistance from Government towards their passages up to a maximum of £75 per child, up to a maximum of two children, in each tour of residential service. As an alternative to this, an officer who leaves his children in his 'home' country may be paid, during a tour of residential service in Nigeria, an allowance at the rate of £75 a year in respect of up to two children for the actual period of separation."

A similar concession is, we understand, made available in respect of the children of overseas officers in the mining industry and in certain commercial firms in the Gold Coast. We also observe that the University College of the Gold Coast makes even more generous provision for the children of its overseas staff and pays from the date of birth to the cessation of full-time education a family allowance of £100 per child up to a maximum of three children, when the child is normally resident elsewhere than in the Gold Coast.

269. A corresponding concession is in our view essential in respect of children of overseas officers in the Public Service of the Gold Coast if the Gold Coast is to compete on equal terms in the market for the services of the skilled European technicians and professional officers who are so badly needed. In this connection we have already pointed out in paragraph 69(ii) that the Gold Coast is unable to obtain its share of such candidates for the Colonial Service as available—see also paragraphs 318–321. The reduction in leave rates which we have recommended should in fact offset the cost of the increased concessions, which, in any case, apply only to a section of the Public Service due gradually to diminish as the Africanisation programme proceeds.

270. We recommend therefore the granting of assistance, on the lines of the Nigerian concession, to the children of overseas officers serving in the Gold Coast. If the officer brings his children to the Gold Coast he should receive assistance towards their passage up to a maximum of £75 per child up to *three* children, in each tour of residential service. As an alternative to this an officer who does not take advantage of the assistance towards the cost of his children's passages during any tour of residential service in the Gold Coast should be paid an allowance at the rate of £75 a year in respect of up to three children for the actual period of separation. This concession should apply to such children for the whole of their schooling, that is, until the child leaves school to start work or to proceed to a University, or until the age of 18 years, whichever is the earlier.

Leave and other provisions for Maternity

271. Section 75 of the Labour Ordinance 1948 (No. 16 of 1948) provides that a female in any industrial, commercial or agricultural undertaking may in her discretion leave her work six weeks before confinement and shall not be permitted to be employed for six weeks following her confinement. During that period she must be paid not less than 25 per cent. of her wages. In addition a female employee who is nursing her child is entitled to be absent from work for this purpose for half-an-hour twice a day. The provisions of this section are applied to female Government officers and employees by General Order 745. This General Order provides that in addition to vacation leave earned, a female officer or employee on becoming pregnant may be granted three months' maternity leave on half pay. Maternity leave is in addition to normal sick leave entitlement.

272. We have had evidence from some departments employing a number of women that full use is made of these concessions, to the embarrassment of the Department, which has constantly on its establishment a number of non-effectives due to maternity leave. We understand that the objection is not so much to the provision of paid leave on pregnancy but to the need to re-engage such employees, thus preventing the engagement of permanent replacements during the period of maternity leave. It is circumstances such as this which strengthen the hostility to the employment of women which we have mentioned earlier. As the law stands at present the entitlement to three months' maternity leave is absolute and we would not in any case wish to curtail this very humane measure. We consider, however, that the present position should be reviewed in the light of considerations of the efficiency of the Public Service and in the general interests of the tax-payer.

273. This subject is bound up with the general position of women in the Public Service and it is convenient to deal here with all conditions of service for women. We have recommended that women should have equal pay with men and this implies that they should be expected to undertake the same duties and responsibilities, and be subject as far as possible to the same general rules of employment. It is necessary, however, to make certain special regulations for marriage or pregnancy of female employees. Schedule 1 to the Pensions Ordinance 1950 (No. 42 of 1950) provides for the payment of gratuities to female officers confirmed in a pensionable office and with not less than five years' service who retire from the Service on marriage. General Order 244 provides that in the event of marriage or pregnancy a woman officer or employee may be called upon to resign. It is clearly the Government's intention that female officers should in normal circumstances resign from the Service on marriage, and we consider this the proper course since in our view, under Gold Coast conditions, the responsibilities of married life are normally incompatible with the devotion of a woman's whole time and unimpaired energy to the Public Service.

274. We have the following recommendations to make :—

- (i) Married women should not be appointed to an established post without the prior approval of the Chief Establishments Officer first having been obtained. Approval should not be given unless it is clear that any disadvantage which may arise from the employment of a married woman is outweighed by her special qualifications or experience.
- (ii) Female pensionable officers should normally be required to resign from the Service on marriage and on such resignation should be entitled to a gratuity at the rate and on the conditions laid down in the Schedule to the Pensions Ordinance. The retention after marriage of a woman pensionable officer in the Service should be subject to the approval of the Chief Establishments Officer, and if she is retained she should not be eligible to receive a marriage gratuity on subsequent retirement.
- (iii) Non-pensionable female employees should normally be required to resign on marriage and should be eligible for a gratuity at the rate of one month's pay for each completed year of service provided they have had not less than five years' continuous service and subject to a maximum gratuity of one year's pay.
- (iv) Female officers and employees who are permitted to remain in the Service, on becoming pregnant should be entitled to maternity leave at the prescribed rates. If a serving officer or employee becomes pregnant on a second occasion she should be removed from the Service with vacation leave and the usual maternity leave due, but without any retiring benefits.
- (v) Maternity leave should count against the normal sick leave entitlement and sick leave in addition to maternity leave should not normally be granted. Any period of absence above the approved maternity leave should be regarded as special leave without pay, and should not count towards retiring benefits.
- (vi) The existing provision for nursing mothers should be retained.

RETIRING BENEFITS

Ordinance No. 42 of 1950 275. A new Pensions Ordinance (No. 42 of 1950) was enacted in 1950 and in the course of passing the Bill the Legislative Council scrutinised carefully the provision for superannuation of Public Servants. We have, nevertheless, received a number of representations relating to retiring benefits for civil servants. We do not propose to make any recommendations on points which have so recently been fully considered, even where we have received specific representations.

276. The main points of evidence we have received on pensions, etc., are as follows :—

- (i) *Pension constant—African Officers.* That the pension constant for African officers for service before the 1st January 1946 should be 1/600. This was fully considered by the Select Committee on the Pensions Bill and in view of the difficulties attending retrospective modification of the existing rule after an interval of more than five years, we have no recommendations to make.
- (ii) *Pension constant—European Officers.* That the pension constant for Europeans should be improved to 1/480. We do not support this request.
- (iii) *Minimum Age.* That service below the age of 20 years should count for pension. This is provided in Regulation 21 of the Pensions Regulations.
- (iv) *Maximum Retiring Age.* That the maximum retiring age should be increased to 60 or 65 years instead of the present 55 years. We did not get the impression that there is a wide-spread demand for this change, but the suggestion was put to us by a number of Africans and some expatriate professional officers. Sir Walter Harragin in recommending optional retirement at 45 years stated :—

“ It is undeniable that in West Africa officers of all races after 45 years of age tend to deteriorate rapidly unless they are living under ideal circumstances. This is particularly noticeable amongst African officers though it is hoped that with an improved standard of living this premature ageing will tend to disappear.”*

* Report of the Commission on the Civil Services of British West Africa 1945–46. Paragraph 105.

We have, however, noted some outstanding examples of Europeans and Africans rendering valuable public services some years after reaching the maximum age of retirement. The proposal was made on the African's part mainly on the ground that owing to the practice of late marriages many Africans were still educating their children when they reached the age of compulsory retirement ; and on the expatriate's part on the ground that the late age of entry to the Public Service for certain professional officers combined with the early retiring age, precluded them from earning a very high rate of pension. We concede both of these arguments. It is also economical from the Government's point of view to raise the maximum retiring age provided that it retains the existing discretion to call upon any officer to retire after he reaches the age of 45 years. We therefore recommend that the Government should ascertain the views of the Service on this point and if the general opinion is in favour of the change, the necessary amendment should be made to Section 9(i) of the Pensions Ordinance.

- (v) *Retirement after 10 years' service.* That the provisions of Section 71, sub-section (3) of the Gold Coast (Constitution) Order-in-Council 1950 regarding retirement after 10 years' service should be applied to the Junior Service. We understand that this proposal is already under consideration in consultation with the Association of Junior Civil Servants and we have no recommendation to make.
- (vi) *Non-pensionable service followed by pensionable service.* That service in a non-pensionable post immediately preceding service in a pensionable post should count in full towards pension. It was argued in favour of this proposal that appointment to a number of pensionable posts, particularly in the Railway Administration, could only be obtained after service in a non-pensionable capacity. We do not feel justified, however, on this evidence in recommending a departure from the well-established rule, which appears in every Pensions Law we have consulted, that service in a non-pensionable capacity cannot normally count in full on retirement in pensionable circumstances.
- (vii) *Training Schools.* That periods as pupils in departmental schools such as Cadbury Hall and the Survey Department School should count as pensionable service. It was argued in favour of this proposal that the present system placed technical officers at a disadvantage as compared with clerical officers. We cannot however draw a distinction for this purpose between training received in a departmental school and that received in any other Technical College or University. We have taken the additional training period into account in fixing salary scales.

Pensions related to Cost of Living

277. We have heard much evidence to the effect that Government pensions are not geared to the cost of living. In so far as these representations referred to existing pensioners they do not fall clearly within our terms of reference. As regards the general principle we regret we are unable to support the claim that Government pensions should be geared to the cost of living.

Delays in Payment of Retiring Awards

278. We have heard many complaints about delays in the payment of retiring awards, particularly those made under the Rules for Annual Allowances and gratuities to non-pensionable employees. This complaint was dealt with in the Chief Secretary's Office Circular No. 44/48 of 25th June, 1948, and there should no longer be any reason why the payment of award should not be authorised on the effective date of retirement. In any case, this complaint should more properly have been dealt with through the departmental negotiating machinery. We mention it here as an instance of the apparent failure on both the staff and official sides to make full use of the consultative and negotiating machinery which should exist in all Departments.

Retiring age, etc., applicable to non-pensionable employees

279. We wish to make it clear that we have assumed that the conditions regarding retiring age, etc., mentioned above in regard to pensionable officers should, in our opinion, apply equally to *ex gratia* awards to non-pensionable employees.

Distribution of pensionable and non-pensionable posts

280. Paragraph 13 of Chapter IV of Gold Coast Sessional Paper No. 1 of 1947 provides that " all posts which are permanently required and which carry a salary in excess of £130 per annum will be regarded as pensionable. All posts which carry a salary or maximum salary

of £130 per annum or less will be non-pensionable". We do not wish to disturb this arrangement merely because of upward adjustment of salaries and therefore recommend that the present rule should stand subject to the substitution of £160 per annum for £130 per annum.

Widows' and Orphans' Pensions 281. Sir Walter Harragin recommended that an African Widows' and Orphans' Pension Scheme on the lines of the existing European Widows' and Orphans' Pensions Scheme should be started as soon as the necessary investigations have been made and the necessary legislation passed. Detailed consideration of this recommendation has been unavoidably delayed but we understand that it is now proposed to introduce a scheme on a funded basis. The introduction of such a scheme should give the Civil Service an added attraction for Africans, particularly for African professional men, and we hope that the necessary preparatory work will be completed as expeditiously as possible.

ALLOWANCES

General Observations 282. Generally speaking, we have found civil servants in the Gold Coast to be very "allowance conscious", and as a result there is a large number of different allowances, many of them insignificant in amount, covering a variety of different circumstances. Hidden emoluments of this kind are normal features of any Civil Service structure but they should be restricted to cover circumstances not common throughout the Service and which cannot be covered by the general provision for the remuneration of civil servants. A large increase in the rates and numbers of allowances is an unhealthy development and usually reflects inadequacies in the general rates of remuneration. We expect that with the improvements in wages and salaries which we recommend it should be possible to restrict allowances to their proper sphere of special cases.

283. We propose in the following paragraphs to deal only with general principles which should govern the grant of allowances, with anomalies which have come to our notice, and with certain allowances on which specific representations have been made or which are of particular importance. The two main categories of allowances with which we are concerned here are :—

- (i) Allowances in recognition of additional work or responsibility.
- (ii) Allowances to cover abnormal expenses necessarily incurred in the performance of duty.

Allowances for additional work etc.—principles 284. In the United Kingdom Treasury Code of general directions on staff matters the following dicta appear :—

"Allowances to individuals should not be contemplated

- (a) for a junior officer doing work usually done by senior officers in the same grade ;
- (b) for an officer who is doing his work with exceptional zeal or efficiency ;
- (c) as compensation for misfortune, including the misfortune of deserving promotion but being unable to secure it ;
- (d) for an officer who deputises from time to time for an officer in a grade above or takes some other responsibility, possibly new to him but not beyond what can reasonably be expected from his grade or scale of pay ;
- (e) for additional responsibilities which take the form of enhanced effort due to postwar conditions.

"In short, allowances should only be given where an officer is regularly required to carry responsibilities conspicuously superior to those of the most senior officers of his grade. The clearest case arises where an officer is required regularly to supervise other officers of the same grade."

We recommend that these principles should be accepted for general application in the Gold Coast.

Acting Allowances 285. General Orders 420–428 provide for the payment of acting allowances. These rules appear to us to be adequate, but we have been struck by the large numbers of officers, particularly in the Senior Service, who are acting in posts above their basic grades. This is partly due to shortage of staff and the comparatively long leave

periods. We hope that the latter cause will be at least partially removed if our recommendations for shorter leaves at more frequent intervals are accepted. We have, however, seen evidence suggesting that there is a tendency for an acting appointment to be made and acting allowances to be paid whenever the substantive holder of a senior post is absent from the country for any period in excess of the minimum period of 14 days laid down in General Order 422. An example occurred while we were in the Gold Coast. A senior superscale officer had to leave the country for a period of three weeks, and during that period we interviewed the officer deputising for him. It was clear that the latter officer, himself the holder of a superscale post, was not in a position to enter into the discussions with the authority of the post in which he was acting. We noted, however, that he was officially gazetted as acting in the post and we presume he was paid the usual allowance. In cases such as this we consider that it should not be necessary to make an official acting appointment or to pay any allowance. In order to justify the payment of an acting allowance an officer should normally undertake the full duties and responsibilities attached to the substantive post over a period of **not less than six weeks**; otherwise he should be regarded merely as deputising for the substantive holder and no allowance should be payable. On this principle approval of an acting appointment necessarily implies that the officer concerned is regarded as capable of filling the post substantively and it follows that the selection of an officer for an acting appointment should be made not on the grounds of seniority mainly but with the same regard for merit as in making recommendations for promotion. We are by no means convinced that this has been the practice in the Gold Coast.

Reimbursement Allowances—Principles

286. The principle to be aimed at in the payment of reimbursement allowances is that they should cover the cost of goods or services required by officers for the proper performance of Government business. On this principle allowances are paid in certain circumstances for the maintenance of artisans' tools, for official entertaining, and for the maintenance of means of transport. It is, however, not always easy to distinguish between expenditure incurred necessarily and entirely on Government business and expenditure which an officer might normally be expected to incur in his private capacity. On this point it must be assumed that the salary attached to a post is designed to cover the normal expenses (from entertaining to the purchase of clothing for protection against the weather) of an officer of the particular class or grade. Allowances should be made to cover abnormal expenses not common to all officers of the particular grade or class concerned. We recommend that all existing allowances should be reviewed by Government on this basis.

Transport Allowances

287. The system of transport allowances appears to be causing more discontent in the Service (particularly car allowances) than almost any other matter on which we received evidence. The complaints we have heard came mainly from officers in outstations who allege that the recent revision of the system favours officers in headquarters stations who do comparatively little travelling on duty, at the expense of the officers in remote stations. We do not propose to enter into this controversy, but it is indisputable that the recent revision enabled large numbers of headquarters officers to receive transport allowances to which they were not previously entitled. We do not pretend to have the necessary expert knowledge to enable us to comment on the adequacy or otherwise of the present system but the general prevalence of the complaints we have heard strongly suggests that the existing allowances are inadequate in certain cases. The details of revised rates must be worked out by experts in running costs, etc., and we recommend that this task be undertaken without delay in consultation with the Associations of Civil Servants.

288. There are, however, certain general matters on which we wish to make recommendations. We have spent some time visiting by road a number of remote stations in the country and have acquired some knowledge of the conditions which give rise to complaints regarding the inadequacy of transport allowances. Even the main roads over which outstation officers have to travel are bad by standards prevailing in and around the main towns, and facilities for servicing and repairs are in most cases non-existent. In these circumstances officers' cars frequently have to be sent to the nearest large town at considerable expense for servicing or repair. During the period that the car is unserviceable the officer ceases to be eligible for transport allowance. Moreover,

the economic life of vehicles in these conditions is short and replacements are increasingly expensive. Most of the officers we met were repaying by heavy instalments advances for the purchase of cars which would scarcely last longer than was necessary to repay the advance. We consider that these facts constitute ample ground for complaint and that immediate ameliorative measures should be taken.

289. We therefore recommend :—

- (i) That the present system of transport allowances should be reviewed with particular reference to the position of officers in outstations, and the payment of additional mileage rates to officers who are required to travel regularly over sub-standard roads.
- (ii) That transport allowances should be payable during leave, sick leave, or absence from duty for any other approved reason, up to a maximum period of three months.
- (iii) That the cost of major repairs necessitated through travelling on abnormally bad roads on duty should be refunded by Government. The cost of such repairs should include the cost of sending the car to the nearest garage and the cost of labour as well as the cost of the necessary spare parts.
- (iv) That the Transport Department should provide an inspection and maintenance service for officers in remote stations where no alternative facilities exist. This service could be provided by means of a fitter with the necessary tools and equipment who could visit outstations once a month on the regular transport department lorry. A charge should be made to cover the cost of materials such as oil and grease used.

Use of Government Transport by Officers in receipt of Allowance

290. It has been alleged that certain Senior officers in headquarters who are entitled to receive transport allowances at the maximum rates, in fact either do not travel on duty outside the main towns, or if they do, use Government transport for the purpose. Apart from the moral aspect, the psychological effect on Junior Officers in outstations of Senior Officers refusing to use their own cars on bad roads cannot be good. We recommend that any officer who is in receipt of an allowance for a car suitable for trekking should not be permitted to use Government transport without prior approval first having been obtained from the Ministry of Finance.

Drivers' Allowances

291. General Order 453 authorises the payment of Drivers' Allowances to the Chief Secretary, the Chief Justice, Chief Commissioners, the Secretary for Development, and the Senior District Commissioner, Sekondi. We consider that there is a case for the payment of Drivers' Allowances to ex-officio Ministers, the Chief Justice and Chief Commissioners. In view of our remarks in paragraph 22 we make no recommendation as regards the Secretary for Development, but we are not clear what justification there is for the payment of Drivers' Allowance to the Senior District Commissioner, Sekondi. We recommend that the need for this allowance be reconsidered.

Travelling Allowances

292. Travelling allowances are paid to meet *extra* expenses necessarily incurred by officers travelling on duty. The approved rates laid down in General Order 454 vary according to salary or wages and the schedule will require revision in the light of the new rates of wages and salaries. The existing schedule includes nine different rates of allowances. While we agree that rates of travelling allowances should be related to the status of the officer concerned, we consider that the actual additional expenditure which the allowance is designed to cover does not differ much within broad ranges. We have ourselves travelled extensively in the Gold Coast, living on some occasions as guests of Government officers, on others in primitive and sparsely furnished resthouses, and on two occasions in the Government Transit quarters in Takoradi. We have therefore some experience of the innumerable petty expenses incurred in travelling in the Gold Coast, and in the light of this experience we have no hesitation in saying that the existing rates of allowances are, generally speaking, inadequate. We recommend the following rates of allowances :—

Salaries of £1600 and above	£1 per night
Salaries of £1200 and less than £1600 ..	15s. per night
Salaries of £550 and less than £1200 ..	10s. per night
Salaries of £200 and below £550	5s. per night
Salaries of £150 and below £200	4s. per night
Salaries of £100 and below £150	2s. 6d. per night
Salaries below £100	1s. 6d. per night

In all cases salaries referred to are basic salaries and the term should be read to include basic wages of employees on daily rates of pay.

Commuted Field Allowances 293. If the above recommendations are accepted it will be necessary to revise the rates of commuted field allowances.

General Order 457 294. General Order 457 states that carriers, labourers, and other employees on a daily rate of pay whose emoluments contain a disturbance element are not eligible for travelling allowance. A number of representations have been made to us in favour of granting travelling allowance to all employees. Where however travelling is an essential part of the work as for example in the case of a carrier, we consider it proper that the basic wage should take account of the element of disturbance involved in the work and that no additional travelling allowance should be paid. We would stress, however, that when fixing the wages in such cases true account should be taken of this factor.

Allowances on transfer 295. We have heard much evidence of the difficulties incurred particularly by Junior officers such as clerks, on transfer to a new station. The housing situation in the Gold Coast is such that Junior (and Senior) officers undoubtedly incur in many cases considerable hardship and expense before obtaining suitable accommodation on transfer to a new station. In order to provide a measure of financial relief while the officer is disposing of his accommodation in the station from which he was transferred and searching for suitable accommodation in the new station, we recommend that all officers should be eligible to draw travelling allowances at the full rate for 14 days from the date of arrival at the new station and thereafter at half rate for a period not exceeding 30 days. These allowances should cease to be payable at any time when it is possible to offer the officer accommodation either in a Government house or in a recognised Housing Estate, or when he acquires other permanent accommodation which is judged to be suitable by the District Commissioner.

Allowance on Temporary Transfer 296. We consider that the provision in General Order 485 for an officer to draw an allowance at one half of the appropriate rate of travelling allowance while on temporary transfer does not take full account of the fact that in the majority of cases the officer concerned is obliged to retain his accommodation in his permanent station as well as to hire accommodation in the new station. We recommend that in such cases the officer should be eligible for the full rate of travelling allowance for a period up to one month and at half rate for the two months thereafter.

Table of Entertainment Allowance 297. Table allowances are at present payable as follows :—

Chief Commissioner, Ashanti	£360 per annum.
Chief Commissioner of the Colony	£330 per annum.
Chief Commissioner, Northern Territories	£240 per annum.
Senior District Commissioner, Sekondi	£300 per annum.
General Manager, Railways	£240 per annum.

The question of allowances for official entertainment undertaken by Government officers is a difficult one. We have heard much evidence of the expenditure on entertainment in an official capacity by a wide range of officials, and various suggestions have been made to us that this should be recognised by the grant of entertainment allowances. We recognise the social obligations of officers such as Heads of Departments and District Commissioners in their official capacities, but the expense involved varies so much according to circumstances and personalities that we do not consider it practicable to allocate allowances to cover this expenditure. We are

not even sure that it would be justifiable to do so. Officers of the standing of District Commissioners and Heads of Departments must expect to maintain a certain status in the community in which they live. It appears to be the custom in the Gold Coast for social status to be determined and maintained by a system of entertainment and this does not appear to us to constitute sufficient reason for the Government reimbursing the officers concerned. Chief Commissioners are, however, in a different category. They have a special function as the chief representative of the Crown in a wide administrative area—a function which differs from that of District Commissioners in kind as well as in degree. They are required to hold official receptions on State occasions and to act as official hosts to a degree which almost brings their residences into the category of public buildings. It would be most undignified to require officers in their position to submit monthly lists of claims for reimbursement of expenditure on the entertainment of official guests or on other official functions, and in any case detailed claims would in all probability exceed the amount of their existing table allowances. We recommend that the present allowances to Chief Commissioners be continued and that the rates should be subject to review from time to time. As regards the General Manager of the Railway, this officer is in charge of a vast industrial concern, in close and constant touch with the representatives of other industrial and commercial concerns, and in accordance with the practice prevailing in those circles we consider it proper that he should be granted an entertainment allowance. We do not consider his present allowance excessive. The allowance granted to the Senior District Commissioner, Sekondi, is more difficult to justify. We understand that it was originally approved during the late war when the Commissioner of the Western Province stationed there was obliged to provide hospitality to the large numbers of senior naval, military and other officers, arriving at Takoradi. At that time also, the present excellent catering resthouse at Takoradi was not in existence, and the Senior Administrative officer in Sekondi was frequently called on to provide hospitality for senior Government officers waiting to embark. It seems to us that circumstances justifying the grant of this allowance have disappeared and we doubt whether the Senior District Commissioner, Sekondi, is now in a different case from any other District Commissioner in a large town in so far as calls for official hospitality are concerned. We recommend that the need for the continuance of this allowance be reviewed.

Outfit Allowance

298. Outfit allowances are at present paid to all officers on first appointment to the Senior Service below a certain salary. These

allowances were originally paid to expatriate officers only and were intended to cover the cost of purchasing items of equipment such as mosquito nets, mosquito boots, clothing, and other items of equipment required for work in a tropical climate. We do not understand the reasons which led to the grant of outfit allowances to Africans on appointment to the Senior Service, and we see no justification for their retention. The allowance can be justified in the case of overseas officers only on the ground that they are required to purchase special equipment for work in conditions climatically and otherwise different from those in their native country. It is the practice in most other countries recruiting from overseas to pay outfit allowances in first appointment, and we recommend that this practice should be continued in the Gold Coast for expatriate officers only.

Uniform Allowances

299. We recommend the continuance of the payment of ceremonial outfit allowances to officers required to provide themselves with a

ceremonial uniform. We also recommend the continuance of payment of outfit allowances to Nursing Sisters and other officers in the Nursing Service required to provide their own uniforms. The rates of these allowances should be reviewed by the Government from time to time in the light of changes in costs.

Tools Allowances

300. We have received evidence to the effect that the existing rates of tools allowances payable to carpenters are inadequate, and also that

these allowances should be extended to other artisans. We consider, however, that this is properly a subject for negotiation between the Trade Unions concerned and the Government as an employer. The general principle should be that an Artisan who is required to use his own tools when employed by the Government should be paid an allowance sufficient to cover the cost of maintaining them in good condition, replacing worn parts, etc. The allowance is not intended to cover the purchase cost of the tools.

Northern Territories Allowance

301. While travelling in the Northern Territories we received many representations from members of the Junior Service for the payment of a special allowance to non-natives of the Northern Territories serving there. In these representations there occurred frequent reference to a "N.T.s consolidated allowance" which was "abolished by Harragin". In view of the impression which these witnesses gave that Sir Walter Harragin deprived them of an emolument to which they were entitled prior to 1946, we have ascertained that the relevant instruction* authorised the payment to "African officers of the Junior Service for whom no Government quarters free of rent are available . . . while serving in Ashanti and the Northern Territories a special consolidated allowance in lieu of travelling and quarters allowance". Payment was restricted to (a) in Ashanti officers who at some time prior to the 1st August 1926 had already drawn the allowance as confirmed officers and (b) in the Northern Territories natives of the Northern Territories or officers recruited there who at some time prior to the 1st April 1926 had already drawn the allowance, and natives of the Gold Coast Colony and Ashanti who at some time prior to the 1st January 1931 had already drawn the allowance as confirmed officers. It will be seen that long before Sir Walter Harragin's Report it had been recognised that the allowance was an anachronism.

302. The advocates of the restoration of this allowance based their case on two main factors, namely, the general conditions of life in the Northern Territories, and the high cost of living for non-natives of the Northern Territories. As regards the first factor many witnesses stressed the discomfort caused by water shortages, lack of medical facilities, bad roads, weather extremities, distance from friends and relations at home, lack of educational facilities for families, and the difficulty of obtaining accustomed foodstuffs. The following is a typical extract from evidence submitted to us on this point.

"The officers posted to the North are cut off from any real social life. They lack adequate medical facilities. They are treated as aliens and their children cannot enjoy the bare minimum educational facilities up to the Primary School Certificate standard let alone secondary education which is completely non-existent."

We are not impressed by the spirit actuating representations of this nature and feel sure that they are not really typical of the attitude of mind of the great body of African civil servants working in the Northern Territories. It is true that comparatively speaking the Northern Territories suffer from bad communications, extremes of weather conditions, and shortage of social, medical and educational facilities. These conditions are to be found in many other parts of the Gold Coast, and the fact that they are more widespread in the Protectorate of the Northern Territories does not justify a claim by civil servants coming from more fortunate parts of the country for what amounts to a foreign service allowance. The emphasis in recent constitutional development in the Gold Coast has been on the unity of the Colony, Ashanti and the Northern Territories as one political entity and it ill becomes civil servants to ask for special allowances for service in certain areas where they have to suffer, in common with the general public there, a shortage of amenities compared with more highly developed parts of the country.

303. As regards the claim that the cost of living in the Northern Territories is higher than in the Colony and Ashanti for non-natives of the Northern Territories, we cannot approve of allowances to meet minor cost of living variations in different parts of the country. We have heard much evidence of the difficulty of getting suitable foodstuffs in the Northern Territories but there are certain foods such as groundnut oil, eggs, chickens and mutton, which should be acceptable to "Southerners" and which must be obtainable as readily and at least as cheaply in the North as in the South. Moreover, General Order 853 authorises free transport of stores amounting to 6 cwt. a year to pensionable officers posted to the Northern Territories or to outstations in Ashanti, not served by the railway. It has been suggested to us that this concession does not operate very well owing to the difficulty in getting supplies from stores in Kumasi and Tamale. We are satisfied that there is little substance in this complaint. The main difficulty appears to be that the officers concerned wish to buy on credit or to buy only articles in temporary short supply.

* Old General Orders. General Order No. 557 Amendment Slip No. 49, File No. 12/31/S.19, in force 1st January 1932.

304. As regards educational facilities we have ascertained that though there is a general shortage of Infant and Senior schools throughout the Northern Territories, it is only in Tamale that applications for entry of children to Infant Junior schools by Government servants have had to be rejected because classes were already full. We understand that a new Infant Junior school will shortly be opened in Tamale and it is hoped that this will ease the position. As regards facilities for education beyond the level of the Infant Junior stage, it is not only in the Northern Territories that children have to leave homes to get education and we cannot concede that special allowances should be paid on this account to civil servants in the Northern Territories.

305. We have spent some time on this subject because service in the Northern Territories seems to be widely, and in some cases strongly, unpopular among Africans from Ashanti and the Colony. Yet, for some years to come, it is from the Colony and Ashanti that the Government must find the increasing number of civil servants who will be required in the Northern Territories as the Government's plans for the development of that part of the country are put into operation. We do not wish to give the impression that we are unsympathetic to the natural reaction of a people so conservative in their habits and taste as the Gold Coast African, to the great difference in general living conditions between the Northern Territories and the South, but we feel strongly that it is wrong in principle to take any action by way of granting allowances for service in the Northern Territories which would strengthen the tendency to regard that area as something less than an integral part of the Gold Coast. We recommend elsewhere that Government quarters should be partially furnished and this will remove at least one grievance. Officially sponsored social centres exist at most stations but social amenities are not created by Government action ; they are created by members of the community themselves. A very fine Community Centre has been built at Government expense at Tamale but on the two or three occasions we visited it we saw no evidence that it was greatly appreciated.

306. We fear therefore that we have nothing to offer to the advocates of a Northern Territories allowance save the advice that as public officers in the service of a country which is making such rapid constitutional and economic advances they should be proud to serve in whatever part of the country they are required. We deprecate, however, the present uncertainty which seems to surround the duration of the postings to the Northern Territories of African officers. It should normally be possible to let an officer know when he is posted how long he will remain in his new station. We recommend that a posting to the Northern Territories should normally be for a minimum period of two years and a maximum period of four years.

Miscellaneous Allowances 307. We have dealt elsewhere with a number of miscellaneous allowances such as overtime, shorthand allowances and rent allowances.

There remain many allowances, some of which may not even have come to our notice. We recommend that a full investigation be made of all forms of cash emoluments received by civil servants of all classes and grades from whatsoever source, and the justification for each case be reviewed in the light of general principles. We suggest that these principles should include those prescribed in paragraph 284 and that in addition it should be accepted as a general rule :—

- (i) That the wages or salary of a Civil Service post should normally constitute the full remuneration payable to a civil servant from any source in return for the performance of the duties attached to the post. If the normal duties of a post involve the provision of services for which payment is made by members of the public, such payment should, as a general rule, be made to the Treasury.
- (ii) That no remuneration additional to wages or salary should normally be paid for work involving discomfort or unpopularity. These factors should be taken into account in the basic wage or salary.
- (iii) That the salary or salary scale of pensionable civil servants is based on the understanding that the full time of civil servants is at the disposal of Government. If pensionable civil servants are required to work overtime in the performance of their normal duties they should not, as a general rule, be eligible to receive overtime payment, though wherever possible "time off" should be given to compensate for overtime worked. Where overtime is worked in the performance of services for which individual members of the public are required to pay

(e.g. Customs work) it is reasonable to charge the public additional rates and to pay the civil servants concerned some part at least of the additional charges.

- (iv) That where civil servants are permitted to perform work either for Government or for an outside agency, which is not within their normal duties and which is performed outside normal working hours, they should be allowed to accept remuneration for the work. We have in mind, for instance, instructional work by civil servants taking classes out of official hours at technical schools or institutions.
- (v) That rates of allowances such as overtime and night duty should be determined in consultation with the Trade Unions concerned.

MINOR CONDITIONS OF SERVICE

General Observations

308. In addition to the major conditions of service which we have dealt with in the preceding paragraphs, there is a multitude of minor details affecting working conditions and general living conditions of civil servants. These details are not in themselves sufficiently important to come prominently to the public view nor do they individually attract or discourage recruits to the Service ; but in the aggregate they constitute an important factor in the maintenance of a contented and efficient Public Service. They are not matters which should normally require the attention of a Commission such as ours ; they should be susceptible of satisfactory adjustment through good staff management including smooth-working consultative and negotiating machinery. Nevertheless, we have seen much evidence that lack of attention to minor details of conditions of service has given rise to petty and needless irritations. We trust that these matters will be speedily dealt with by strengthened staff management sections in Departments and Ministries.

Canteens and Restrooms

309. A number of Departments in Accra have canteens and restrooms for staff. We consider that it is the duty of the Government to provide adequately equipped restrooms for staff in all Departments (or groups of Departments in the same area) employing such numbers of staff as in an establishment of similar size in the United Kingdom would necessitate the provision of restrooms. This is a matter to be taken up in the departmental Whitley Councils. We have also inspected catering canteens at the Railway Workshops at Sekondi and at the Government Printing Department, Accra. The Railway canteen had not achieved the popularity which the subsidised meals might have been expected to attract. We have found considerable difficulty in ascertaining the true reasons for this lack of popularity. The staff side claim that the food provided is unsuitable and inadequate for the price. The official side states that the food compares very favourably with that provided by market women and that the real reason for the lack of popularity is the fact that no credit sales are made, and the opposition of market women, many of whom are related to influential employees. We do not pretend to know the true facts but we consider that the system of catering canteens in Government Departments has not been fully exploited either by the staff side or by the official side. This system can provide the lower paid officials with good meals in the middle of the day at prices which are protected from the vagaries of open market conditions. If the Gold Coast custom insists on credit sales it should not, in our opinion, be beyond the wit of the staff and official sides to devise a system enabling payments for meals to be deducted from wages or salary at the end of the month. We see no objection to a reasonable amount of subsidy being allowed in the running of the canteens or of the staff required for operating them being paid by the Government. We recommend that the question should be referred to a special committee composed of representatives of both the staff and official sides for investigation and report to the Central Whitley Council.

Storage Accommodation

310. We understand that though adequate arrangements exist for the storage of baggage of senior officers on leave, no similar arrangements exist for junior officers. We see no justification for this discrimination and recommend that all officers proceeding on leave from an outstation to which they are due to return on completion of leave should be allowed to store their loads in Government stores free of charge.

Uniform

311. We have had many representations from members of the Junior Service in favour of the issue of free official uniforms and other clothing to various grades of public servant. This is another matter which should properly be decided in the departmental Whitley Council and we do not propose to consider in detail the various requests which have been made to us. We consider, however, that uniforms should only be issued where the work subjects ordinary clothes to abnormal wear and tear, and that issues of clothing such as boots, gloves, etc., should be made for protective purposes only. Where some form of identification is necessary for officers dealing with the public this should as far as possible be done by means of an armband and/or cap supplemented, where necessary, by an official warrant card. It may also be considered desirable to issue uniforms to officers at airports and other public places where the smart appearance of public servants is considered important. In general, however, we view with suspicion the development of a uniformed Civil Service in a free country as being conducive to petty officialdom and tyranny incompatible with the conception of a Public Service in a democracy. We trust that these considerations will be borne in mind by both officials and staff when dealing with the question of uniforms.

CHAPTER IX

CONVERSION TO REVISED CONDITIONS

Conversion Tables

312. It is customary for Commissions concerned only with the revision of salaries to set out conversion tables applicable to all officers in the Service at the time. We do not propose to do so, and indeed such a course would hardly be practicable in our case, as the salary adjustments we recommend are frequently associated with a change in grading and classification of posts. We have suggested elsewhere the appointment of a team to advise Government on the regrading of work in Departments. When their work is finished it will probably be found necessary to appoint a small Committee or Working Party to undertake the conversion of salaries, which will be complicated by the considerable variations we recommend in existing salary structures.

Conversion Principles

313. We recommend, however, the adoption of the following general principles :—

- (a) Where as a result of our recommendations an officer receives promotion to a higher class or grade, the provisions of Colonial Regulation 44 should apply, "existing salary" being interpreted to include temporary allowance if he has not already converted to the new scale of his present grade.
- (b) Where an officer remains in the same class or grade for which a revised scale has been accepted, he may either continue on his present scale with existing overseas and/or temporary allowance, or he may convert to the new scale by the method known as "notching". By this is meant that the officer is placed on that step in the new scale which is the same number of steps above the minimum of the new scale as the step in the old scale, on which he is at present, is above the starting point of the old scale. If, as we recommend, stagnation of initial salary during probation is abolished, the officer will of course gain on increment in the new scale for each year he stagnated while on probation on the old scale. Stagnation imposed in the old scale as a disciplinary measure should not earn increments in the new scale. Incremental dates will normally remain unchanged.
- (c) In some cases an officer on a fixed salary under the old terms, will convert to a scale under the new terms. Provided there is no element of upgrading in the new salary, he should enter the scale at the point he would have reached if he had been placed on the scale on the date of his appointment to the post, which should be his future incremental date.
- (d) Where the operation of the previous principles results in an officer receiving less gross remuneration, after overseas and/or temporary allowance is taken into consideration, he should be paid a non-pensionable allowance equal to the difference between his gross emoluments on the old terms and on the new terms. This allowance should continue to be paid until it is absorbed by increments earned in the new scale, or by increased emoluments on promotion.
- (e) An officer should not be permitted to draw salary at a higher rate than the maximum assigned to his post purely through the accident of conversion.
- (f) Election to convert or not to convert should be final. An officer should not be allowed to convert to a new scale to gain a temporary advantage, and later revert to an old scale with allowances; nor should he be permitted to remain on his old scale till a certain step is reached and then convert. On the other hand, promotion to a higher grade or class should invariably be to the new scale assigned to that grade or class.

Option of Serving Officers

314. Unless it is otherwise stated in the relevant paragraphs of this Report, officers should not be permitted to elect in favour of any particular part or parts of the new conditions for which an option is allowed, but should be required to accept such conditions in full or retain the existing terms. The option as an alternative to existing terms should embrace salaries and overseas pay, rental rates, leave and passages (including children's passages). The recommendations in paragraphs 282-311 should be considered independently of other conditions of service and when decisions have been reached they should be applied without option.

Operative date of new conditions

315. We have received many representations in favour of giving retroactive effect to the new salaries and wages. These representations were made on the assumption that we would recommend general increases in salaries and wages, and that this was the main purpose of our Commission. We have, however, shown in previous Chapters that the major part of our recommendations concerns a radical change in the structure of the Civil Service involving a re-allocation of duties and responsibilities between various grades and classes of civil servant. The salaries we recommend are mainly applicable not to existing posts, but to posts in the revised structure of the Service, and for this reason alone there could be no justification for retrospective payments at the new salary rates. For example, a clerk could not claim to be entitled to the salary scale we assign to an Executive Officer until he actually assumes the duties and responsibilities of an Executive Officer. We have, however, given serious consideration to the question whether the existing rates of remuneration for the work being performed under the present organisation of the Civil Service, are generally inadequate to meet the current cost of living. We have dealt in more detail with this question in Chapter VI and have come to the conclusion that the cost of living position at the end of the first quarter of 1951 was not such as to justify a general and retrospective increase in the prevailing rates of remuneration of the Civil Service prior to the introduction of the new system of organisation as a whole. In these circumstances we are unable to recommend that retroactive effect should be given to our proposed revision of conditions of service.

316. While the introduction of the revised conditions of service must await the implementation of our reorganisation proposals, there are certain other factors to be taken into account :—

- (i) Undue delay in introducing the new conditions after the publication of our Report will give rise to increasing dissatisfaction within the Service, and may lead to a deterioration in the staffing situation.
- (ii) The reorganisation of all Departments of the Service cannot be completed simultaneously.
- (iii) The introduction of the new conditions with different dates for different Departments would be manifestly unjust.

In these circumstances we consider that the Government should set a target date for the official change-over to the new structure and organisation of the Service. We consider that, with the assistance of the grading teams referred to in our first Chapter, the plans for the initial reorganisation should be well advanced by the end of the first quarter of 1952, and we accordingly suggest that the target should be fixed at **the 1st April, 1952**. We do not suggest that the Civil Service will be working smoothly to the new pattern by that date. In fact, it will probably be a long time before full effect can be given to all our proposals, and some time even before an appreciable increase in efficiency will be observed. By the 1st April 1952, however, it should be possible to create the establishments of posts required under the new structure and to start working on the new system. Straightforward conversions not involving regrading, reclassification, or promotion procedure should take effect from that date. By that time also the Public Service Commission should be well advanced with its review of candidates for promotion to the new executive posts, particularly those referred to in paragraph 111(i) and it should be possible to announce a number of promotions to these posts on that date. For the executive posts which cannot be filled by that date Heads of Departments must allocate officers from their existing establishments to act. No acting allowance should be payable in such circumstances but officers who are subsequently promoted to the substantive posts under the procedure for initial reorganisation prescribed in paragraph 111(i) and (ii) should have their promotion back-dated to the 1st April 1952 or to the date on which they started to perform executive duties, whichever is the later date.

Daily-rated employees

317. The above provisions apply only to established civil servants. At paragraph 204 in Chapter VI we have given reasons why we consider that the new rates for daily-paid employees should be introduced without regard to the date of the introduction of our full reorganisation proposals for the Civil Service generally. We recommend that the new conditions of service applicable to daily-rated employees should be applied without delay to all serving daily-rated employees, to all future daily-rated appointments, and to all employees at present on salary scales who elect under the proposals in paragraphs 161 and 241 to convert to daily rates of pay.

CHAPTER X

RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING

Expatriate Recruitment— present position 318. The Gold Coast Government has for some considerable time been concerned at the shortage of senior staff, particularly in technical and professional grades. We have outlined (paragraph 69 and

Appendix V) the situation as it stood in the Gold Coast in 1949. Broadly, the position then was that owing to world-wide competition for officers with technical and professional qualifications, the demand greatly outstripped the supply, and the Gold Coast for various reasons was not getting its fair share of such candidates as were available. Unfortunately the situation, which was grave in 1949, has deteriorated still further, at least so far as the Gold Coast is concerned. The Secretary of State in the enclosure to his Circular Despatch dated 19th February 1951 gives the following reasons for the deterioration, as compared with pre-war days, of the general recruitment position in the Colonial Service as a whole :—

- (i) By the beginning of 1950 the supply of wartime service men had for all practical purposes been exhausted and as in the pre-war days reliance had once again to be placed mainly on the products of the schools, universities, and other training institutions. There were however several important differences.
- (ii) The first of these was that the scale of recruitment required by Colonial Governments was some seven or eight times as large as just before the war. In 1938, for example, 344 appointments were made to the Colonial Service. In 1950 1587 appointments were made, and yet at the end of the year 908 vacancies remained. 575 of these were in four classes of appointments, viz., education, engineering, medical, and agricultural ; unfortunately none of these types of appointment offers any immediate prospect of a sudden inrush of candidates. The recruitment figures given for 1938 and 1950 include a small proportion who were recruited in the Colonies, but for the most part refer to expatriate staff.
- (iii) The second difference is, of course, the vastly changed " market " in 1950 as compared with 1938. In the latter year the United Kingdom was recovering from a period of unemployment ; today there is full employment and a universal shortage of qualified scientists and technical experts. In 1938 about a quarter of the recruits for the Colonial Service were required for the medical, agricultural, educational and engineering services ; in 1950 almost half of the new entrants went into those four branches of the Service. Nevertheless, in 5½ years since the war there have been recruited 770 doctors and dentists compared with 243 in the five years preceding the war. Over similar periods the figures for teachers have been 1116 compared with 62, and for agricultural appointments 370 compared with 99. The recruitment of engineers has been a major post-war development, and in 5½ years the number appointed, including architects and town planners, has risen to 1024.
- (iv) Another difference is that owing to National Service obligations it now takes two years longer than in 1938 before a candidate becomes available for appointment to the Colonial Service, although in this respect the Ministry of Labour and National Service has for 1951 agreed to grant the same degree of exemption from military service as in 1950 to candidates entering the following branches of the Service—agricultural, veterinary, survey, and geological survey.
- (v) There must also be mentioned a growing concern on the part of potential candidates whether the political progress of the Colonies will result in the Colonial Service becoming no longer a lifetime's career for the expatriate officer.

The Secretary of State, in analysing the recruitment position for the Colonies generally during 1950, points out that recruitment was quite satisfactory for the field as a whole as regards the administrative, geological survey, and legal branches ; that there was real improvement in two of the larger branches of the Service—medical and engineering ; but that there had been no improvement as regards candidates for the other largest and most important services—education and agriculture.

319. Examination of the figures for the West African group of Colonies gives a less satisfactory picture, while those of the Gold Coast itself are even more disturbing. Recruitment of Adminis-

trative officers is no longer of concern to the Gold Coast Government since it has been decided to cease expatriate recruitment for this Service. Of the other major services only in agriculture is the recruiting position relatively satisfactory. A comparison as between the Gold Coast and all the Colonies is given in the following table, but it has to be remembered that the vacancies shown for the Gold Coast are those that the Public Service Commission has declared must be filled by expatriates. They do not therefore present a complete picture of the staffing situation in the Gold Coast.

PROFESSIONAL & TECHNICAL SERVICES (excluding Administrative and Administrative Auxiliaries)*
 Vacancies filled from 1.1.50 to 31.12.50 and vacancies unfilled at 31.12.50

	All Colonies			Gold Coast		
	Number Filled	Number Unfilled	Percentage Unfilled	Number Filled	Number Unfilled	Percentage Unfilled
Agriculture	83	84	50%	14	8	36%
Education	233	170	42%	14	15	52%
Engineering (all types)	239	161	40%	21	24	53%
Medicine	131	160	55%	2	8	80%
Other Services	1320	869	37%	—	—	—

320. The percentage of vacancies unfilled clearly indicates that the recruitment situation is still difficult and that it is more difficult to recruit for the Gold Coast than for other Colonies. It has also to be borne in mind that, as shown in paragraph 69 of this Report :—

- (i) The Development plan will necessitate a large increase of expatriate Technical and Professional staff.
- (ii) The heavy wastage of such staff has been for some time a serious factor and is likely to be accentuated during the present decade.

321. Our recommendations as regards pay and conditions both for pensionable and contract appointments will, we hope, help to reverse the adverse trend. Much, too, will depend on a settled political climate in the Gold Coast. Obviously these two factors will in the main determine the success of the Gold Coast Government's effort to recruit the technical and professional expatriate staff which it will certainly need for a number of years to come.

322. The difficulties attending recruitment at the present time should not in our view lead to the adoption of a policy of lowering of qualifying standards. The recruiting position should become easier in a few years' time and it would be unwise to sacrifice long-term interests for short-term advantages. The principle that "there shall be no lowering of standards and in consequence no lowering of prescribed qualifications" which was adopted by the Africanization Committee (paragraph 24 of their Report) in regard to the recruitment of Africans to the Senior Service should apply equally to the recruitment of "expatriates".

Steps to Facilitate Expatriate Recruitment

323. Nevertheless, certain steps might be taken to facilitate recruitment without derogating from the principle set out above. Strong representations were made to us by almost all Heads of Professional Departments as regards the delays involved in the present Colonial Office system of recruitment. We observe also that the conference of Directors of Public Works, held at Bathurst in February 1950, while expressing their appreciation of the services rendered to recruitment for West Africa by Sir Hubert Walker, C.B.E., Advisor to the Secretary of State on Engineer recruitment for West Africa, "reiterated their dissatisfaction at the delay between the offer of an appointment to an applicant and his final acceptance into the Service". These complaints of delay in appointment seemed to be made as much in regard to appointments made through the Crown Agents for the Colonies as those made through the Colonial Office itself, and it was stated to us in evidence that such delays normally amounted to nine months. We appreciate the need for the closest examination of the credential of candidates both by the Colonial Office and by the Crown Agents if standards are not to be lowered, but certain suggestions were made to us in this connection which might speed up appointment without involving any lowering of standards. We append an extract from the evidence of one Head of Department which seems to us worth examination :—

* Source : Colonial Service Department, Colonial Office.

“ He observed that recruitment for contract appointments did not take so long as for pensionable appointments, and suggested that everybody should be recruited in the first instance on contract terms ; they could then be vetted as to their suitability for pensionable appointments during their first tour. This would also enable us to offer more attractive salaries than we can offer for permanent appointments. Another way of speeding up recruitment would be to take up references, have medical examinations, and do all the preliminary vetting, etc., during the final year at the University, so that if and when a candidate qualified he could be appointed without further delay.”

324. As regards the first suggestion, without subscribing to its universal application, we do consider that in several Services a short period of contract service to be followed after a satisfactory probation by retrospective appointment to a pensionable post would both cut down delays and bring in candidates who would not otherwise enter the Colonial Service. In the first place the ordinary graduate is rarely able under present economic conditions to wait nine months or more for an appointment after his graduation ; secondly, in certain Services where a period of practical experience is prescribed to follow after graduation or after becoming qualified, we should imagine that a number of candidates might be willing to go out to get their practical experience in the Gold Coast, and later, if both parties are satisfied with the bargain, to take up a pensionable post, whereas after practical experience in the United Kingdom, the successful professional man would probably not wish to embark on a new career in West Africa and the tendency would be for the relative failures to look for such appointments. This suggestion seems to us particularly apposite in the case of barristers and engineers, but it may apply equally to other Services where it is not essential that the practical experience should be gained in the United Kingdom. Incidentally it might be as well worth consideration for African graduates as for Europeans. It certainly seems to us to apply to African barristers. Some Directors make a point while on leave or on visits to the United Kingdom of keeping in touch with their Professional Institutions or Universities in order to bring the attractions of a Colonial career under the notice of possible applicants and generally to facilitate recruitment. This procedure in certain cases appears to have had marked success. In this connection we append an extract from the proceedings of the Bathurst Conference :—

(vi) In order to spread knowledge of the openings available in the Colonial Engineering Service, Directors should on leave maintain contact with the Institution of Civil Engineers and in particular attend the Colonial Engineers Conference. The meeting also welcomed the establishment of the Engineers' Guild as a means of contact between the Colonial Engineering Service and the profession in the United Kingdom.

We recommend this as a step that might with advantage be adopted generally by Directors of all Departments. We have no information as to the methods adopted by the Director of Recruitment in the Colonial Office, but some such procedure might also be well worth consideration by his Department. The Chief Establishments Officer in the Gold Coast will also have some responsibility in this matter, and if there is foundation for the alleged delay of nine months in appointment, we suggest that he and the junior members of his staff might well spend some portion of their leave in establishing contacts with the staff of the Director of Recruitment by working in or for that Department, and studying methods by which the delay can be reduced.

325. Secondly, although this is not strictly germane to the question of recruitment, it is perhaps relevant to recall that, in order to cut down the number of professional officers to be recruited and so to ease the present difficulties in recruiting such officers, we have suggested in paragraph 121 (see also paragraphs 230 to 233) that fully qualified professional officers be relieved of some work that might well be performed by less highly qualified officers, subject to inspection by professional officers. This applies particularly in the Medical, Engineering, Agricultural and Veterinary Services. We also accept the recommendations made to us that similar relief might be afforded to Professional officers by the appointment of what are now called Administrative Assistants—under our structure one or other of the grades of the Executive class according to the weight of the job to undertake certain personnel and semi-administrative duties proper to the Executive grade, in order to set professional officers free to perform their proper professional functions.

326. Lastly we observe that at the Bathurst Conference the Chief Engineer West Africa Command suggested that regular Royal Engineer Officers might be seconded to West African Public Works Departments to enable them to get Civil Engineering experience, and that discussions on the point are proceeding between the War Office and the Colonial Office. Obviously any such proposal can only be of limited application, but, if feasible, it might be of benefit to both Services and would ease the current recruiting difficulties. It need not, of course, necessarily be restricted to the engineering field.

Recruitment of Africans 327. In Chapter IV of our Report we have dealt in some detail with the recruitment of Africans to the Gold Coast Public Service. We desire here to emphasise the three general considerations set out in the following paragraphs :—

“ No lowering of standards ” 328. Complete Africanisation of the Public Service in due course is the declared policy of the Gold Coast Government and, in accordance with this policy, all vacancies in the Service are properly filled by suitably qualified Africans in preference to expatriates. It is, however, essential if an efficient, duly qualified, and contented Public Service is to be maintained, and if the developing needs of the Gold Coast are to be met, that the following principles which were put forward by the “ Africanization ” Committee and accepted by the Government shall be strictly observed :—

- (a) “ There shall be no lowering of standards and in consequence no lowering of the qualifications now prescribed for appointment.”
- (b) “ Promotions within the Service will continue to be made on merit alone without regard for colour, and the claims of meritorious public officers in the Colonial Service will continue to take precedence over those of persons not already in the Service.”
- (c) “ The retrenchment of expatriate officers in favour of Africans is not contemplated.”

Scientific and Technical Education in the Gold Coast 329. We remark in paragraph 235 of our Report that, in order to meet criticism of the present salary structure on the grounds that young Africans are attracted by higher pay to “ white collar ” jobs to the neglect of technical posts which involve equally essential work,

we have framed scales which should provide technically-minded candidates with attractive careers in Departments such as Agriculture, Forestry, Animal Health, and the Post Office. The difficulty, however, is fundamental in the Gold Coast economy and cannot be cured by higher pay alone, nor solely by the prospect of more attractive careers. Part of the difficulty lies in the fact that Africans who have had the advantages of a secondary school education are not generally interested in Agriculture, Forestry or Animal Health. We understand from our interview with the Commissioner for Africanisation that (i) such students as have attained the inter-science standard prefer to study medicine with its more lucrative prospects either inside or outside Government service and (ii) that the African has yet to be convinced that “ farming pays ”. The main difficulty, however, seems to us to lie in the inadequate facilities available for the scientific and/or technical student in the Gold Coast. There are, we understand, only five schools with science teaching facilities in the Gold Coast, and full staffs for even these five schools (Achimota excepted) were not expected to be available until later this year. The opening of the College of Arts, Science and Technology at Kumasi should certainly improve greatly the position as regards scientific and technical education in the Gold Coast, provided that there are enough secondary schools and similar institutions with adequate facilities to act as feeders to the College on the scientific and technical side, but, so far as this side is concerned, some time must pass before the new College can be in full operation. We have it in evidence that plans for technical and technological education below the level of the Kumasi Regional College exist very largely on paper. Certainly the evidence given us on the point at the beginning of our enquiry, and that tendered at the end of our stay in the Gold Coast, disclose considerable variations, and it would not be unfair to infer that the Education Department’s plans are still in a state of flux. For instance, we were told on arrival that the Takoradi Technical School was to be “ developed into a prototype secondary (technical) school and a prime feeder of the projected Regional College at Kumasi ”. Later we learned that “ the output from this school would not necessarily be absorbed in technical work. It would in fact provide a secondary education which would still be liberal but

with a bias towards mathematical and scientific subjects. Its output might be used for feeding the Kumasi Regional College but many of the pupils would undoubtedly be absorbed into Junior Technical grades in Government Departments". We are not in a position to criticise this change in outlook which apparently springs from a similar change in policy in the United Kingdom, but the output from this and the science sides of the ordinary secondary schools seems to us to constitute a slender basis on which to build the higher scientific education which is the great need of the Gold Coast today.

330. This prospect is even more gloomy at the level of the Technical Institutes which are intended to provide part-time training for apprentices on the lines of the Polytechnics in the United Kingdom. Four of these are proposed at Accra, Tarkwa, Takoradi, and Kumasi ; but they remain projects at the moment.

331. Below these institutes there do exist two Trade Training Centres at Mampong (Ashanti) and Assuansi, and a third is expected to be opened at Tamale in the near future, but " each Centre will only turn out 40 trained artisans per year, and at best, these Trade Training Centres are *faute de mieux* substitutes for the apprenticeship system which has still to be properly developed in the Gold Coast".

332. So far as we understand them, the difficulties are the usual ones of staffing and buildings. Wartime and postwar conditions largely account for these difficulties and we trust that this Report may be of some indirect assistance. The Gold Coast has made great progress in the field of primary education and we gather that vigorous efforts are being made to achieve a like success as regards secondary education. This policy is no doubt well-suited to the long-term interests of the country, but the Gold Coast Government's short-term development policy which will necessarily create an urgent demand for African scientists and technicians at all levels of industry demands equal progress in the field of technical and scientific education. We feel that an intensive and concerted effort is needed in this field if the Gold Coast is to produce the artisans, the technicians and the professional men that the country will need to carry out its extensive Development Plans. So far as we can judge only the fringe of the problem has as yet been touched.

333. We note that in November 1949 the Africanization Committee reviewed the position as regards technical education in the Gold Coast and expressed the opinion that " the flow of recruits " to technical education " must be stimulated and that this can be achieved only by an all-round improvement in the general standard of technicians throughout the country ". To this end the Committee recommended :—

- (i) The early organisation of trade-testing and apprenticeship systems with the co-operation of Government Departments, Town Councils and private undertakings.
- (ii) The recruitment of additional staff including staff for technical instruction by contract or on pensionable terms.
- (iii) Consideration of the feasibility of separating the secondary-technical schools from the organisation of the Education Department in the same way that Achimota has become a body corporate.

So far as we can judge, the situation today is exactly the same as it was in November 1949 except that the urgency today is even greater than it was then. It may be that the real solution lies along the lines of the third of the Committee's recommendations.

Organisation of Recruitment

334. It may be assumed that African secondary schoolboys and graduates are well acquainted with the openings available to them in the clerical and administrative classes, but we have reason to doubt whether even the existing openings available in the rest of the Government Service are equally well-known, and whether the present policy of advertisement in the official Gazette and in the Gold Coast newspapers with their limited circulation is a really effective way of notifying vacancies to the African public. We have no doubt at all that some better way will have to be devised of bringing under general notice—to take one example—the attractive executive appointments and corresponding technical posts that are recommended in our Report. The same point arises in regard to the outlets now proposed for craftsmen and artisans.

335. We have had our attention directed to the proposals made in this connection by the Commissioner for Africanisation to the Public Service Commission and to the comments made on those proposals by the Commission. We find ourselves in general agreement with Mr. Adu's suggestion on this matter, which may be summarised as follows :—

- (i) Regular visits to all post-primary institutions in order to acquaint students with the opportunities for employment in the Civil Service and the training facilities available.
- (ii) Similar liaison with African students in the United Kingdom or other overseas countries.
- (iii) Close liaison with all Headmasters and Heads of Educational Institutions, and with the staff of the Department of Education.
- (iv) Preparation of pamphlets written in *simple* language explaining to the public the various careers open to candidates for employment in the Public Service, outlining the qualifications required for various appointments, how those qualifications may be obtained, and the scholarship schemes in operation.

Director of Recruitment and Training

336. This programme is reasonably comprehensive, and if properly carried out should do all that is required, but it is difficult to see how the Commissioner for Africanisation can singlehandedly carry out such a programme over and above his normal administrative function of planning ahead the recruiting requirements of the Service and estimating how far those requirements can be met from Gold Coast sources. In this connection it seems to us worth consideration whether the somewhat restrictive title of Commissioner for Africanisation need be preserved under the new Constitution, the salient features of which are an African Legislative Assembly with wide powers and an Executive Council, the majority of whose members are Africans. We feel that, bearing in mind all the difficulties that will have to be overcome as regards recruitment, both inside and outside the Gold Coast, and the further difficulties in regard to training, with which we shall be dealing in the second half of this Chapter, the Gold Coast Government would be well advised to create in the Chief Establishment Officer's Department a post—on the Principal Assistant Secretary level—for a Director of Recruitment and Training, in which the Commissionership for Africanisation might be merged. Such an organisation would be much more effective from the standpoint of Africanisation than the present single-handed Commissionership ; it would give him a staff through which he could work to discharge the responsible functions entrusted to him, and it would give him "teeth" which he could use to ensure that the policy which he is appointed to discharge is effectively carried into execution.

TRAINING

Need for Training Facilities

337. We regard this question as one of the most important, if not the most important, with which we have to deal. Without adequate training facilities our proposals for reorganising the structure of the Service and for the creation of the Executive class and the corresponding class in the Technical Services will be of little avail ; they must be supplemented by proper training, both initial training and post-entry training, if the Africanisation policy of the Gold Coast Government is to be effective in a reasonable period of time—effective, that is to say, in producing throughout the whole structure of the Service a competent and well-balanced African staff who will not only be efficient in doing the work allotted to them, but will also manifest, to quote the "Assheton Committee" on the training of Civil Servants, that "less tangible efficiency of the organisation as a corporate body derived from the collective spirit and outlook of the individuals of which the body is composed".

338. Following upon the Report of the Assheton Committee, the British Government was so impressed by the need for training in the postwar British Civil Service that it set up in the Treasury a special division responsible for general control and guidance in the field of training. Similarly, branches with responsibility for "control and guidance" in the departmental field were established in all Departments, in the larger Departments under the control of an "Assistant

* Cmd. 6525.

Secretary”, while in sub-Departments and in the Regional organisations corresponding but suitably modified branches were created.

339. It is perhaps hardly necessary to demonstrate that the Gold Coast Service with its much shorter experience of Civil Service technique and its relative, if not absolute, lack of technical skills has even greater need of the policy followed in the British Service. It is for these reasons that we propose in paragraph 336 the creation of a post for a Director of Recruitment and Training in the Chief Establishments Officer's Office. Parallel but suitably modified organisations should be set up in Departments, but, as co-ordination and general control will be exercised from the Office of the Chief Establishments Officer, and actual training is a specialised departmental affair, we do not recommend the establishment of a Training Division in headquarters of Ministries.

340. We are fortified in our recommendation on this point by the knowledge that no subject ventilated before this Commission aroused more interest than that of Training. Heads of Departments unanimously deplored the lack of training of the recent recruits to the clerical class. Undoubtedly rapid expansion since the war has strained the resources of educated manpower in the Gold Coast, but it may be doubted whether efficiency, let alone economy, is served by a policy of swamping the job with untrained clerks, who in their ignorance of departmental procedures detract from the total of work done by their Department rather than contribute to it. Nor was the interest confined to Heads of Departments. We had more evidence from representatives of African staff on this single question than on any other. This evidence covered a number of points and a wide variety of subjects. We do not propose to deal with them here but our indexed files will be available to the proposed Director of Recruitment and Training when he is appointed. We would also commend to his attention Command Paper 6525—the Report of the Assheton Committee on the training of Civil Servants, and Estacode, the code of general directions issued by the British Treasury to Departments on Civil Service Establishment matters, which sets out for the British Civil Service the present-day procedure on training; based on the Assheton Report. These two documents will well repay study.

341. Apart from these general considerations therefore we will confine ourselves to certain special points on which we think our advice may be of value to the Gold Coast Government.

Initial Training

342. As with all educational institutions in the Gold Coast, the limiting factors in the greater part of the field of departmental training are shortages in teaching staff and accommodation. Progress in this field of training is reasonably good but even here it may fairly be described as “ patchy ”. We have seen or have heard evidence about a number of successful initial training schemes such as the Agricultural School at Cadbury Hall, the Forestry School at Sunyani, the Telecommunications School near Accra, the Cocoa Rehabilitation School at Bunsu, the Survey School and the Nurses' Training School, both at Accra, not to mention other smaller institutions. We have not much to say about these except that they need expansion and development, and that this can only come as more teaching staff and accommodation is made available. We have also been told—the Survey School is one case in point but we have seen or heard of others—that when operational staff runs short it is usual policy to shut down the training school. We hope that the new salaries proposed by us will improve recruitment and so remove the need for such drastic action as the closing down of a training school, but, if something has to be cut, it should, in our view, be the “ field ” staff and not the teaching staff at the training school. In other words, the long-term interests of the Service should not be sacrificed to short-term considerations.

Clerical and Sub-Clerical

343. Although we are happy to pay tribute to the good work done by Gold Coast departmental training schools in the technical field, we found certain obvious gaps in the sphere of initial training where little or nothing has been done. The most glaring gap is of course in the clerical field to which we have already alluded. Our evidence is that a small course which lasts about three months and caters for 30 pupils per course is conducted by the Department of Education for serving clerks and for clerks of commercial firms. There is no initial training for clerks. This, of course, is quite inadequate for the needs of the situation, but it is doubtless all that the Department of Education can undertake without interference with the essential professional duties and responsibilities of that Department. We

are unable to comment in detail on this school as it was closed during the absence of the officer in charge on leave in the United Kingdom, when our programme gave us time for a visit. We cannot in any case agree that the idea of centralised training for clerks is basically sound. The "Assheton Committee" reached the conclusion that as it would be impracticable to devise a syllabus for a central training school covering all kinds of clerical processes, and as in any event the numbers involved would be unmanageable, the matter must be dealt with departmentally. In our view the same principle holds good for the Gold Coast although possibly there should be some combination in the case of smaller Departments. As regards the details of such departmental training schemes, which should of course, embrace all clerks on their entry to the Service, we can but refer for general outline to Command Paper 6525 and Estacode, but even more valuable would be a period of secondment of a specially selected officer to the British Treasury Training Division and one or more of the departmental Training Divisions to study the methods by which the theory of the "Assheton Committee's" Report on Training has actually been worked out in practice. The arrangements for the training of the sub-clerical class should *mutatis mutandis* follow the general lines of those for the clerical class.

Typists 344. We have outlined in paragraphs 136-139 some of the difficulties that will attend our recommendations for the introduction of a new class of Typist, particularly those in regard to training, and we remark there that existing training facilities will have to be expanded *immediately* if the scheme proposed is to be carried out in reasonable time. At present there are two relatively small schools for typists within the Government structure, both at Accra, one run by the Department of Education and the other by the Government Statistician for his own Department. Typing unlike clerical processes is a subject that lends itself to centralised instruction in one or more centres according to geographical needs. We accordingly propose that the two Accra schools mentioned above be combined in one school which should obviously be placed under the control of the Director of Recruitment and Training. It will be necessary too to set up training schools, also under his control, in each of the other main centres of the Gold Coast, viz., Takoradi/Sekondi, Kumasi, and Tamale. Additional staff will be required and we recommend the recruitment of qualified expatriates on contract terms in so far as Africans of suitable experience and skill are not available. These schools should be responsible not only for training but also for the conduct of proficiency tests at the various stages of a typist or shorthand-typist career. We suggest that a Training School should not accept a candidate for training unless the candidate has a reasonable acquaintance with typing and adequate knowledge of the English language.

Graduates (African) and expatriate recruits 345. We have no comments to make on the training of members of the Administrative and Professional classes other than to express the hope that African graduates accepted for these classes will continue to be passed through the Devonshire courses (and equivalent courses on the professional side) by which their expatriate colleagues have hitherto received their initial training. If this is not done, we foresee a grave risk of inbreeding and a failure to attain the wider horizon and knowledge of policies, techniques and skills obtaining in the outside world that must be got outside the Gold Coast.

Technical and Sub-technical 346. As we have already pointed out, departmental training schools on the technical side are generally satisfactory; we would urge that it is incumbent on all Departments to follow the example of those singled out by us for mention in paragraph 342. In this connection one obvious lacuna is the absence of any proper training school in the Public Works Department. The following extract is typical of the evidence presented to us:—

"One of the greatest shortages in the Gold Coast was of competent sub-technical staff. There were no facilities anywhere in the Gold Coast that he knew of for organised and systematic training of people for these posts. In Lagos, the Public Works Department have had a Technical School producing this type of workman for a number of years and the result is that the standard of the Junior Technical officers in Nigeria is very much higher than in the Gold Coast."

347. We know that it has been recently decided to transfer the control of the Public Works Civil Engineering School in Nigeria from the Public Works Department to the Technical Branch of the Education Department. We are not, of course, aware of the reasons that led to this change of policy in Nigeria, but we would say from our knowledge of Gold Coast conditions :—

- (a) That such a School is badly needed in the Gold Coast.
- (b) That other Departments have shown that such schools can successfully be run by Gold Coast Departments.
- (c) That the energies of staff of the Department of Education are more than fully occupied, as they themselves state, “ by the essential professional duties and responsibilities of the Department ”.
- (d) That despite the pressure of work on the higher staff of the Public Works Department resulting from their heavy development programme, the institution of such a school will in the long run be an important contribution to the economic progress of the Gold Coast, even if the teaching staff has to be imported specially—on generous contract terms if necessary.

348. Our only other comment in this field is to point out that the early organisation of trade-testing and apprenticeship systems, which was recommended by the Africanization Committee in their Report dated November 1949, has still to be carried into effect. We understand that the initial difficulties attending the introduction of these schemes are in process of being overcome. We can only say speaking from our knowledge of the Gold Coast industrial conditions that the need for their introduction is more urgent than ever.

Pay during initial training

349. Where an officer who has been duly appointed to the Service in the normal course is required to undertake initial training before assuming the full duties of his post, he should draw the full salary of his appointment during training. This will apply mainly to the non-technical classes such as clerical and executive where the officer is regarded on appointment as fully qualified for the post but where it is considered advisable to give him some introductory instruction on departmental procedure, etc., before he assumes full-time duty. For example, a clerk on appointment by direct entry might be given full-time instruction on all departmental clerical routines and procedure for one month during which time he should be expected to acquire a working knowledge of the functions and aims of the Department and of his own particular duties. After one month he should be required to assume duty at least on a part-time basis. Some Departments might find that one month's full-time instruction is sufficient, while others might with advantage continue regular part-time instruction on departmental procedures for another month or two. The part-time instruction can probably be combined with refresher courses for serving officers.

350. Where a candidate has been selected departmentally for entry to departmental training schools such as those of the Agricultural Department and Post Office, he should be paid an allowance in keeping with the pay of the permanent post for which he is endeavouring to qualify. It should be noticed that in this case the candidate is not qualified for appointment to the post he seeks until he has successfully completed his training. The departmental training school is, in this respect, analogous with the Teacher Training College. We give in Chapter XIV under the appropriate departmental headings the rates of allowance we recommend for certain cases. Other rates can be worked out in proportion. Special arrangements may of course have to be made in cases where an employee already serving in a Department in a subordinate capacity is selected for training at the departmental training school with a view to qualifying for a higher appointment. Cases of this nature will have to be dealt with on an *ad hoc* basis but we suggest that in no case should the remuneration payable while at the school be less than that received in the substantive post.

351. Pupils in the typing schools are in a different category from either of the above two. They are under no obligation to enter Government Service and the training they are receiving would qualify them for appointments outside the Service. In view, however, of the great need to produce a class of fully trained typists and shorthand-typists, we consider that at the outset a subsistence

allowance of £5 a month should be paid to trainees while at the typists' schools. This allowance and the prospects open to trained typists and stenographers both inside and outside the Service should encourage elementary schoolboys—and even more so, schoolgirls—to shorthand typing as a career. The allowance should be payable for so long only as the officer in charge of the school is satisfied that the trainee's progress is such as to justify continuance of the allowance—and not for longer than six months in any case. The question of such an allowance and its amount should however be reviewed in the light of experience.

Probation and initial training

352. In paragraph 384 of this Report we follow the "Assheton Committee" in recommending that the probation served by every new recruit should be a real probation. Every effort should of course be

made by training to fit every recruit for the career which he is seeking, but even so, there may be some misfits who during their probation and early training show no aptitude for Civil Service work. We mention this point here to emphasise that in such cases it is in his own interests as well as in the national interest that such a misfit should leave the Service at the earliest stage consistent with giving him a fair trial.

Post-entry training

353. Apart from the Railway School at Takoradi, we received no evidence of the existence of any post-entry training in the Gold Coast

itself, although there do exist facilities for sending promising officers to the United Kingdom either on training courses or with scholarships, or in special cases, to Ibadan and other centres in Nigeria. These latter methods are extremely expensive and can in the nature of things be applied only in exceptional cases. They have apparently been carried as far as is practicable at the present time, and we have no comment to make on them. What is greatly needed is the development of post-entry training inside the Gold Coast. Initial training is of course extremely valuable but United Kingdom experience would tend to show that in most fields even more valuable results may be got from special training at later stages in an officer's career, so as to equip him with special skills needed in his work and to enable him to qualify for advancement in the Service. In addition to training in special skills and techniques, training in the use of English and in clarity of expression has, for instance, been found necessary in the British Civil Service. It can probably be copied with advantage in the Gold Coast. Training of supervising staff and potential supervisors in the responsibilities and functions of a supervisor could also be of special value to the Gold Coast at the present time. The detailed arrangements for such courses and such questions as whether they should be on a part-time or a "sandwich" basis, must depend upon local conditions, but the Director of Recruitment and Training will find full information as regards United Kingdom practice in the Report of the Assheton Committee on Training and Estacode. We would merely add here that as with initial training, post-entry training should normally be arranged departmentally. An economical way of finding instructing staff might be to enlist the aid of suitable members of the departmental staff to give instruction, either on a part-time basis or outside official hours—with payment on an overtime basis in the case of members of the lower salaried grades.

External training

354. External training at Polytechnics and similar Institutes is a regular and valuable feature of training in the British Civil Service which has no counterpart in the Gold Coast. By arrangement with the staff side of the National Whitley Council, the State encourages serving officers to improve themselves and aids them by allowing "time off", assisting with fees and contributions to the cost of books. Nothing could contribute more to the economic progress of the Gold Coast than the early opening of the projected new Technical Institutes at Accra, Tarkwa, Takoradi and Kumasi, which are to be on the lines of the Polytechnics in the United Kingdom. We trust that all possible steps will be taken to expedite their establishment.

Post-entry training as a step to promotion

355. We have come across indications that Africans selected for training or scholarship courses tend to regard such selection as a guarantee of promotion immediately on return to the Gold Coast.

Successful negotiation of such a course will naturally tell heavily in a candidate's favour when his claims for promotion fall to be considered, but it cannot of itself be regarded as conveying a

prescriptive right to promotion. That must depend on the existence of vacancies, the claims of rival candidates, the nature and value of the course which the candidate has passed. In short, such a candidate must content himself with the satisfaction of having passed his course successfully and thereby establishing his claims to be considered with those of his colleagues for promotion in due course.

Urgent need for improved training facilities 356. In this Chapter we have outlined certain general considerations which should govern the policy of recruitment and training. Many of the suggestions we make, particularly in regard to training, are of a long-term nature, and will require additional staff buildings and equipment before they can be adopted in full. There is in this situation a danger that the immediate and urgent needs of the Gold Coast will be obscured by considerations of long-term policy. We hope that with the appointment of a Director of Recruitment and Training the immediate problems will be tackled with a sense of urgency and a drive and enthusiasm which has so far been lacking in the present unco-ordinated attempts to provide adequate training and to organise local recruitment.

357. We would stress the need for improvising until the long-term plans begin to bear fruit. Typists' schools need not await the arrival of expatriate staff from, for example, Pitman's School of Shorthand, or be held up for lack of typewriters and buildings. Some progress can be made by using Government offices and departmental typewriters out of office hours and temporary teaching staff can be found either from inside the Service on an overtime basis or outside the Service. The temporary staff should be sought by way of advertisement and the rates of remuneration offered should be sufficient to induce serving officers to give up some of their leisure time. We believe that there are a number of married expatriate women in the country who have had a full secretarial training in the United Kingdom. These women should be able to offer a useful contribution to the development of the Gold Coast in giving typing, shorthand and clerical training and no consideration of racial bias should be allowed to prevent the Director of Recruitment and Training from offering them temporary employment at rates of pay which will attract them.

358. Similar improvisations can be made for technical and trades training at the lower levels. The Director of Recruitment and Training must be allowed to pay adequate rates to teaching staff whether inside or outside the Service, and Departments must be prepared to allow the use of their workshops and equipment. It has been suggested to us that more use for training purposes should be made of the many highly skilled but illiterate craftsmen and artisans in the country. We commend this suggestion to the Director of Recruitment and Training.

CHAPTER XI

EFFICIENCY

General 359. In Chapter IV we have recommended a Service structure which we hope will in due course be built up and prove sufficient to meet the complexities of administering a modern state. We are well aware, however, that for many years to come the greatest difficulty will be experienced in recruiting men of adequate qualifications, or even education, to man the machinery of Government. This does not refer only to the higher administrative and professional officers in the Service, but perhaps even more to the large body of clerks, junior technicians, etc., who form the foundations and lower storeys on which the administrative edifice is built. In these circumstances it is obvious that every man must be suitably and fully employed and every unnecessary activity or practice of Government must be eliminated. There must be no waste of manpower, material or money. This is what we understand by efficiency in public administration.

The incentives to hard and efficient work which we have already recommended in the shortening of scales and the opportunities open to the more conscientious and intelligent officers to obtain early promotion to higher grades, should do much towards fostering the will to work to full capacity. In the following paragraphs we deal with other more specific ways in which efficiency may be increased.

Co-ordination of planning 360. Strong representations were made to us by Heads of Departments and others as to the "lack of co-ordinated planning in the reconciliation of departmental programmes against the need for accommodation, and working facilities for the staff indented for and awaiting passages". Representations on similar lines were received as to the need for co-ordinating demands on the strained resources of the Government Printer. We ourselves saw a glaring example of lack of co-ordination in the new hospital at Bolgatanga, where the main structure was completed by the end of 1949 but the hospital cannot, it is anticipated, be ready for opening until 1952 because the quarters for medical and ancillary staff and the provision of water and electricity have not kept pace with the construction of the main building. This instance illustrates the case for devolution of authority to Regions, to which we refer in paragraphs 38-40, as well as the need for more co-ordinated planning of new accommodation. It is unthinkable that the lack of co-ordination which characterised the handling of the Bolgatanga hospital by the distant headquarters of Departments at Accra, would have been allowed to exist if the Chief Commissioner had been responsible for co-ordinating the activities of various Departments concerned. We have devoted a good deal of our attention to the manner in which the efficiency of the individual can be increased by suitable incentives to encourage him to give of his best, and we have tried to suggest ways in which methods of working can be improved so as to enable the individual worker to discharge his responsibilities in the simplest and quickest way. Much, if not all, of the time and energy devoted to these points however may be wasted through the lack of co-ordinated planning at the top.

361. One way of achieving this, as we point out above, is to make the Chief Commissioner responsible for co-ordinating the activities of all Departments concerned in his Region when the size and scope of the scheme is not such as to demand co-ordination at headquarters. When co-ordination at headquarters is called for in order to allocate building priorities we would advise some such system as that used by Government Departments in the United Kingdom. Briefly this problem is solved by the constitution of a standing committee, under the chairmanship of the Permanent Secretary to the Ministry of Works, all the main Government Departments being regularly represented on the committee and the others as required. All questions of priorities are thrashed out by this body, generally by consent between all concerned, but in the last resort questions in dispute can be referred through the Ministers concerned for settlement at Cabinet level or that of a Cabinet sub-committee of Ministers. This method of procedure should easily be applied to similar problems in the Gold Coast with the same success as in the United Kingdom. The operation of such an organisation, which appears to us the only practical method of co-ordinating the conflicting claims of a number of Departments or Ministries, can of course be extended from the sphere of accommodation to any field where it is necessary to allocate priorities

as regards materials or resources in short supply. Settlement of such priorities early in each financial year would also enable Departments to reconcile their departmental programmes with their share of accommodation or other scarce resources as allocated to them by the co-ordinating committee.

362. While it is obviously necessary to maintain a certain amount of flexibility in forward planning, the order of priorities allocated to programmes under review should not be varied except for the gravest and most compelling reasons. As the Director of Public Works points out, in the extract from his evidence annexed at Appendix XI, deviation from a programme, when once it has been fixed and the preliminary work upon it has been done, may completely disorganise the machine and lead to chaos. The extract from the evidence of the Director of Agriculture contained in the same Appendix illustrates a similar point—the need for a carefully determined departmental policy based on the essential requirements of the country and for its undeviating pursuance, without intervention from outside except in case of compelling necessity. In this connection we invite reference to paragraphs 119 and 120 on Professional officers and their relationship with Administrative officers.

Planning of Supplies x 363. We have also heard much evidence of the shortcomings of the system of placing indents with the Crown Agents for the Colonies for all Government stores and materials, and of the resulting delays and inefficiency in the execution of departmental programmes of work. The general tenor of evidence has been that the Crown Agents' organisation is inadequate for present-day conditions of heavy demands and short supplies, and that Heads of Departments should have more discretion to buy direct either through importing firms or from manufacturers in the United Kingdom. While there can be no doubt that the Crown Agents in common with most other businesses have experienced some difficulty in adapting their organisation to postwar conditions, with the inevitable shortages in materials and resources, and in finding the necessary additional staff, we are far from convinced that better overall results would have been obtained by any other system. The Crown Agents have an organisation which arranges for the supply of an enormously wide range of stores and materials and this organisation ensures that standards of quality, etc., are maintained in a way which Government Departments acting independently would find difficult to emulate. It may be that the mechanics of placing indents could be improved both at the Colony end and in London; that arrangements could be made to speed up inspection of goods ready for delivery by the use of qualified officers on leave in the United Kingdom; that some system could be devised to give the Crown Agents greater discretion in the supply of substitutes where stores or materials indented for are not immediately available; but these are questions which we feel can be settled largely in discussions between the Heads of Departments concerned and the Crown Agents. We do not propose to make specific recommendations but we record our view that it would be unwise to sanction any extensive departure from the Crown Agents indenting system.

364. In this sphere also the importance of forward planning cannot be over-emphasised. We have heard much evidence of the restrictions placed on forward indenting by the necessity to obtain the approval of the Legislature for the annual budget. We do not think however that this should provide an insuperable obstacle to the placing of forward indents for stores and materials or approved projects, or for stores and materials annually required for the normal running of a department. In view of the present supply situation we consider that the Legislature would be wise to give a standing authority for the placing of routine annual indents for consumable stores and materials in common use, in anticipation of the provision of funds in the annual budget, and for placing advance indents for materials required for approved capital works projects where it is known that there is a time lag between the date of ordering and the date of delivery. It is possible also that in some cases the maximum authorised holding of departmental unallocated stores is too low.

+ 365. There will, however, always arise cases from time to time where for some reason or another a Department requires stores which are not immediately available through the normal supply channels and which can be obtained locally. We have suggested in paragraph 35 that the powers of "Local Purchase" delegated to Departments may be inadequate and we recommend that consideration be given to a further degree of devolution to Heads of Departments of authority to

purchase essential stores and materials locally. We would stress, however, that "Local Purchase" is generally more expensive than purchase through the Crown Agents and the devolved authority should be used sparingly. It should not be taken advantage of to cover up failures to indent at the proper time for stores, the need for which could have been foreseen. Heads of Departments should be required to notify the Ministry of Finance of local purchases above a certain value.

Organisation and Methods

✓ 366. The increasing strain thrown upon Governments of recent years by their constantly developing activities—a phenomenon common to almost all Governments—has led to the emergence of a new technique, called Organisation and Methods, which is designed to ensure that the machine used by Government for the execution of its policy is as efficient as it ought to be.

Mr. R. G. Casey describes the Organisation and Method technique in his book "Double or Quit" as follows:—

"There is no mystery or hocus pocus about the O & M specialists. They are men who have made organisation their job. They have studied it in countless enterprises. Their first question when they tackle a new enterprise, whether it is an industry or a Government Department, is: 'What is this show required to do?'. They quite properly insist on getting this down precisely in black and white. . . . When they have gone right through an organisation in this way, they have a pretty good idea as to what it is all about. They then sit down with all the evidence they have carefully collected and see what improvements they can work out. The flow-sheet of responsibility and authority is the main framework. When that is settled to their satisfaction, they deal with the location of typists' pools, registry, telephones, messenger and despatch services, returns, accounting, and all the rest. They examine all returns and reports, and endeavour to ensure that only the facts and figures that are really needed are made the subject of returns. They investigate the mechanical aids in use and whether more office mechanisation is justified and, if so, what sort. They investigate and report on the lighting, ventilation, sanitation, rest facilities and all else that has to do with the comfort and convenience of the employees."

We include in Appendix XII a more detailed description of Organisation and Methods in the form of a paper by Mr. J. R. Simpson, C.B., Director of Organisation and Methods in the United Kingdom Treasury.

367. According to a recent authority* the Organisation and Methods technique was first devised in the United Kingdom for achieving efficiency in the public administration by ensuring:—

"(i) That the objectives of Government are clearly stated and understood, and that the machine is designed to achieve those objectives (and not bygone ones) and to move at the pace at which it has to travel today.

(ii) That each part of the machine is in itself well designed and arranged in proper relation to all the other parts (instead of providing a spectacle of the overlapping and duplications, of gaps, weak links and delays, which are discernible in every Government machine today)."

368. In the Gold Coast where the machinery of Government has now to be reconstructed and adapted to a modern Constitution and a faster tempo of administration, there is immediate and continuing work for Organisation and Methods staff. It is not merely a question of adjusting the machine and ensuring that it is adequate for its task, but a constant watch has to be kept to see that its efficiency is maintained or improved and to eliminate waste.

369. In 1949 an Organisation and Methods section in embryo was set up in the office of the Government Statistician as an experiment. Its two main objectives were:—

(i) Improvements of methods of collection and compilation of statistics and increasing the coverage of those statistics.

(ii) Improving departmental recording procedures.

The bias was almost entirely on increasing efficiency through the proper collection and use of statistics, and the main field of Organisation and Methods work was hardly entered. This fact,

* Mr. N. Baliol Scott, Ceylon Sessional Paper No. III of 1951 "Report on the Introduction of an Organisation and Methods Division into the Ceylon Public Service".

of course, was fully realised by the officer in charge of the section and appreciated by Government. In the 1951 Estimates the section has been removed from the Statistics Office and placed directly under the Ministry of Finance where, we agree, it rightly belongs. It still has to be developed into a powerful instrument for ensuring efficiency in public administration.

370. In the time at our disposal in the Gold Coast we were not able to examine in detail the procedural methods used in Government departments and Ministries, but in the course of our visits and inspections we were able to see enough of the methods in use to convince us that there is an ample field for an extensive Organisation and Methods campaign in the Government service of the Gold Coast. The unanimous evidence, both oral and written, received from Heads of Departments supports this view. We were particularly struck by the obsolete procedures used for the following services :—

- (i) *Departmental Registries*. There was general agreement in regard to all Departments as to the variety and inefficiency of the registration systems used, the inordinate delay in tracing files of papers when required, and the consequent slowing down of public business. The following extract from our evidence is typical of the representations that we have received on this subject :—

“ Filing methods, handling of correspondence, office lay-out, all require reviewing and the introduction of organised methods.

“ The time wasted by certain clerks in ‘ chasing up files ’ is excessive ; the slipshod manner in which incoming correspondence is dealt with can only mean loss of letters themselves, loss of time in returning loose letters for placing on files and then returning for action. All these points require immediate attention.”

- (ii) *Accounting Records and Staff Records*, of all kinds. These records all seem to be kept in large leather-bound volumes which disappeared from use in the British Civil Service early in this century. Loose leaf or card records, despite their much greater convenience and efficiency, do not appear to be in use at all, still less the more recent refinements on the loose leaf or card system. In one or two cases modern methods have been introduced such as the Power-Samas system in the Customs Department or machine posting in the Savings Bank. Even here, however, the introduction was not preceded by that careful preliminary study of the ancillary processes, which is common form in Organisation and Methods technique, and, as a result, serious difficulties have manifested themselves in the subsequent operations of the new processes.

371. All this goes to show the urgent need for the development of an Organisation and Methods section in the Gold Coast. We recommend that this object be achieved in two ways :—

- (i) Arrangements should be made for one or more officers trained in the Organisation and Methods technique in the United Kingdom, to visit the Gold Coast and advise on the setting up of the section, and the lines along which it should operate. This may not be easy as Organisation and Methods officers of the necessary experience are few and in considerable demand, but in 1950 a team, under Mr. N. Baliol Scott of the British Treasury, was able to pay such a visit to Ceylon and publish a most helpful report. We understand from Mr. J. R. Simpson, C.B., Director of Organisation and Methods in the United Kingdom Treasury, that O & M missions have been sent to a number of British Colonies and that, subject to the limitations imposed by the exigencies of his own Department's work, similar help would be available to the Gold Coast Government if desired.
- (ii) Suitable officers in the Gold Coast Service should be sent to the United Kingdom to take O & M courses, if possible in the Treasury, or if this could not be arranged, in some other large Department of Government where an O & M branch was in successful operation.

372. At the risk of trespassing on expert territory we would suggest that the Organisation and Methods staff in the Gold Coast need not be large, though it must be efficient. An O & M section cannot be operated by amateurs. If it is to be successful it must earn and hold the confidence of officers in charge of Departments whom it purports to advise. One or two obvious mistakes will destroy confidence, just as tactlessness through lack of experience will destroy popularity, which it should also be the aim of the section to build up. It is therefore of the greatest importance

that this section should be properly organised and trained. In this connection two main points have to be borne in mind.

- (i) The good Organisation and Methods officer is *not* an Inspector or Auditor. He is essentially a consultant to help the Department which he is called in to assist, to find ways of doing a better job.
- (ii) On the procedural side, the essence of Organisation and Methods is to make any changes necessary to ensure efficiency and simplification—simplification of forms and procedure to enable each individual worker to discharge his responsibilities in the simplest and quickest way.

373. Frequent visits would have to be made to Departments to advise on “setting houses in order”, if not on cleansing Augean stables, but the operation of Organisation and Methods has also a more subtle side. It aims at cultivating in Heads of Departments and supervisory staff an attitude of mind which has been called the “O & M approach”. This attitude can be developed and promulgated by talks, formal and informal, the example of results achieved in offices where O & M advice has been accepted, and the issue of O & M bulletins. Thus the spread of what might be termed the O & M doctrine largely depends on obtaining departmental disciples or converts, tactfully directed by a small “professional” group of experts whose duty it would be to maintain purity of doctrine and eliminate heresy.

Discipline

374. In the course of our enquiry we heard numerous complaints from Heads of Departments and other officers in charge of staff that one of the main causes of inefficiency in the Service was the difficulty of dealing promptly and effectively with inefficient staff. We were told that rather than consume many working hours of the senior staff (which might be more usefully employed), in carrying out the detailed procedure necessary to discharge an inefficient employee, with the possibility that the proceedings would in any case be quashed by higher authority, staff officers were inclined to turn a blind eye to all but major misdemeanours, and put up with low standards of efficiency. As a result there had accumulated a considerable quantity of “dead wood” throughout the Service.

375. The main features of the disciplinary procedure in the Gold Coast Service are as follows :—

Regulations governing disciplinary proceedings affecting all members of the Service are contained in General Orders 214–229. These are based on Colonial Regulations 63–76 and Part VI of the Gold Coast (Constitution) Order-in-Council 1950.

Under Colonial Regulations public servants are divided into two main categories for disciplinary purposes. Pensionable officers in one or other of the Unified Services or on salaries exceeding £600; pensionable officers on salaries not exceeding £600. In both these categories disciplinary procedure is varied according to whether misconduct which may involve dismissal, less serious misconduct, or inefficiency is alleged. Non-pensionable officers are not specifically mentioned; their cases normally fall to be dealt with under local regulations. Under the Gold Coast General Orders additional categories are added for officers serving on contract, for established non-pensionable employees of the Junior Service, and for unestablished employees with less than three years' service. Unestablished employees with three or more years' service are grouped with established non-pensionable employees of the Junior Service.

376. Colonial Regulations add steps to what might be called basic procedure, and increase its thoroughness according to the status of the officer concerned and the seriousness of the alleged misconduct. But there are two clearly defined basic principles underlying both Colonial Regulations and General Orders. Briefly these are :—

- (i) An officer must be made fully aware of the charge against him. This may include access to documents and confronting witnesses supplying evidence against him.
- (ii) An officer must be given every opportunity to defend himself against the charge. This may include time to produce witnesses or documents on his own behalf, and an opportunity to refute witnesses supporting the charge.

377. It would obviously be improper to attempt to increase efficiency by curtailing any of the steps required to ensure that both these basic principles are fully maintained. The problem then,

as we see it, is to eliminate from existing procedure any steps which are not essential to maintain basic principles, and when that has been done to ensure that delays do not occur through procedure not being properly understood or being wrongly applied.

378. As regards existing practice in the Gold Coast, we think more use might be made of the Colonial Regulations distinction, noted above, in the procedure adopted in dealing with (a) more senior as opposed to junior grades of officers and (b) major as opposed to minor misconduct. The procedure laid down in Colonial Regulations which applies to officers on salaries in excess of £600, though somewhat lengthy, has been devised by the Secretary of State's legal advisers for application to senior officers in all Colonies to ensure that when disciplinary cases come up before the Secretary of State for a decision, he is aware of all the facts and is satisfied that the fullest enquiry has been made. We understand that these cases are not of very frequent occurrence in the Gold Coast and we were not given the impression that any substantial change was thought desirable. We note, however, that in Gold Coast General Orders a single section of the disciplinary regulations (General Orders 214-220), in amplification of Colonial Regulations, applies to all pensionable officers. General Order 215 provides an example of the consequent and in our opinion unnecessary complications. Under this Order, before taking disciplinary proceedings against a qualified doctor the Director of Medical Services is required to submit a report to the Chief Secretary. If there is any question of dismissal this is understandable (though it should not be necessary if there is a competent Personnel officer in the Department), as the doctor has been appointed by the Secretary of State, who must be satisfied that the case has been proved before he orders dismissal. But if dismissal is not contemplated reference to the Chief Secretary at this stage should be unnecessary. A similar report must be sent to the Chief Secretary before the Director of Medical Services can begin proceedings against a pensionable dispenser. In such a case it is not clear why proceedings could not be begun and completed at a lower level even if it is still considered necessary to forward them to the Chief Secretary for a final order.

379. As under the new Constitution emphasis will necessarily be on a local Civil Service we recommend that the more complicated disciplinary procedure set out in Colonial Regulation 68 should be employed in the Gold Coast only in the case of officers of the Colonial Unified Services and officers holding posts appointment to which is subject to the approval of the Secretary of State. Other pensionable officers should be dealt with under Gold Coast Regulations framed on the basis of Colonial Regulations 66 and 67 and embodying the general principles that the officer empowered to make an appointment should have authority to terminate it; that the enquiry should be carried out by the "staff officer" of sufficient authority (*i.e.* an officer of the Administrative class or of equivalent status) best acquainted with the circumstances and conditions in which the alleged misconduct occurred; that proceedings should move as far as practicable by continuous stages to the officer empowered to make the final order, without reference back or interim reports. We further recommend that wherever practicable an authority beneath the appointing authority should be empowered to deal with cases in which dismissal is not contemplated, and proceedings should be conducted on the simplest lines.

380. We understand that it has become the practice in the Establishments branch of the Secretariat to seek the advice of the Crown Law Officers in framing all disciplinary charges. This is frequently the cause of considerable delay as the officers whose advice is required are generally fully engaged with other important legal matters. We recommend that only in cases which have to go to the Secretary of State, or which present special difficulties of a legal nature, should the advice of the Crown Law Officers be sought.

381. Most of the complaints we received of delays and difficulties in disciplinary procedure, concerned the treatment of subordinate staff. This class of employee cannot be expected to have the same sense of responsibility and duty as officers in higher ranks of the Service, and it is only natural that advantage is immediately taken of any weakness in disciplinary procedure, with a consequent falling off in efficiency. The employee knows when he is at fault. He also knows when he has been "caught out" by the officer immediately in charge of his work. But if he finds in practice that his superiors can do "nothing about it" until there has been a considerable amount of delay and correspondence, and that one or more other officers (who have not "caught him out") have to be convinced that he is at fault, he feels that "the cards are

stacked in his favour " and that it is worth his while to slack or misconduct himself when it suits his purpose to do so. Apart from the immediate loss of efficiency, such conduct has a most undesirable effect on other more conscientious workers who see an inferior or lazy workman " getting away with it ".

382. We recommend that in disciplinary matters no distinction should be made as at present between employees who are established, unestablished with three years' service, or unestablished with less than three years' service. We would, however, retain a distinction between pensionable and non-pensionable employees. There is provision in the Pensions Ordinance for awarding a reduced pension to public servants who have been removed from their offices on grounds of inefficiency, but such pensions can only be granted by the Governor in Council. Cases involving the discharge or dismissal of pensionable officers should, we consider, go up to the Permanent Secretary level at least, though not necessarily cases in which some lesser penalty is contemplated. Disciplinary cases concerning non-pensionable employees should in no case go higher than the Head of Department who should in most cases be able to devolve his authority to a lower level. The officer who recruits this class of employee and who is in a position quickly to appreciate the full circumstances of any misconduct or shortcomings, should also be in a position to deal summarily with all questions of discipline. An appeal would, of course, lie to the Head of Department, and we agree with the time limit of seven days laid down in General Order 228. We doubt, however, if the full procedure contained in General Order 226 and 227 is in all cases necessary. It should be the task of the Chief Establishments Officer to promulgate disciplinary regulations applicable to the main classes of employee on the principles indicated above, but as regards the treatment of non-pensionable subordinate staff we commend for attention the comparatively wide terms of the following extract from Colonial Regulation 65:—

" . . . he may cause an investigation to be made into the matter in such manner as he shall think proper, and the officer shall be entitled to know the whole case made against him, and shall have an adequate opportunity throughout of making his defence."

A responsible officer immediately in charge of non-pensionable staff should have little difficulty in acting strictly in accordance with this extract and certifying that he has done so in recording his decision.

383. The procedure to be adopted in discharging pensionable staff on grounds of general inefficiency is clearly laid down in Colonial Regulations 67 and 76. If this procedure is to be effective, however, it is essential that full and regular reports should be maintained on all pensionable staff. We deal with this in a later paragraph. In the case of non-pensionable staff other than " casual staff " individual records should be kept in simple card form where practicable, but it is even more important that a clear warning should be given and recorded by the officer immediately in charge whenever he has reason to find fault with one of his subordinates. Difficulty frequently arises in cases where the subordinate does his best but for temperamental or other reasons is " not up to the job ". In the case of pensionable staff the position should of course be clearly stated in annual confidential reports, but at the risk of depressing a willing but ineffective worker, we strongly advise that superior officers should in the case of both pensionable and non-pensionable staff, tactfully convey to their juniors the view which they have formed, and record that they have done so. There is always the chance that a tactful warning may have the effect of reducing even temperamental shortcomings, and even if improvement is impossible there are few things more demoralising to a hard though only moderately efficient worker than a totally unexpected failure to gain what seems to him reasonable promotion.

384. The importance of the correct use of probation periods cannot be over-emphasised. It should be made clear to all Heads of Departments that this is the time to get rid of " unsuitables " who will become a constant problem if confirmed. General Orders make it easy to discharge a probationer. Formalities are reduced to a minimum ; there is no question of charges and answer, but merely a considered report from the superior officer which should go to the authority responsible for the appointment. But the procedure is only simplified on the strict under-

standing that the probationer is given suitable instruction and training, that he is continuously supervised and given warnings and advice where necessary so that he "knows where he stands". In these circumstances a decision not to confirm him, which should be taken at the earliest stage consistent with giving him a fair trial, should not unduly surprise him. Here again it is important that a record should be made immediately a warning is given, and warning should, preferably, though not necessarily, be reduced to writing.

385. One of the principal causes of delay and dissatisfaction in disciplinary matters is the failure of reporting officers—particularly in the more junior ranks—to understand just what procedure is required in each case that comes to their notice, to conduct enquiries along approved lines, to ensure that they have taken all steps necessary to make their reports immediately acceptable to higher authority and avoid frequent reference back for further action or information, or even a fresh enquiry. We strongly recommend that when the procedure to be adopted in all disciplinary cases has been finalised a brief pamphlet should be published in readable form explaining in simple language just what procedure should be adopted in each case. Examples of actual incidents likely to arise might be given, and also specimen charges as in Sir Alison Russell's excellent work on *Official Proceedings**. It might contain brief lists of the various essential steps to be taken, in proper order, in each class of disciplinary investigation, which the enquiring officer should keep before him to ensure that his proceedings contain no serious omissions. It should be made clear that such a publication supplements or amplifies, but in no way supplants General Orders, which should be the final authority. Distribution of the pamphlet should be as wide as possible.

386. Discipline is one of the subjects on which the Public Service Commission is required to advise the Governor under the Constitution. Permanent Secretaries should, however, be executive responsible for the disciplinary control of all Civil Servants under their Ministries. The Permanent Secretaries should deal themselves with all disciplinary matters which do not require to go to the Governor but which cannot be settled on a Head of Department or lower level. In cases requiring the order of the Governor or Secretary of State, or appeals in disciplinary matters, the Permanent Secretary should be responsible for seeing that action is complete and the papers in order before transmitting them to the Secretary to the Public Service Commission. The Commission could then if it thought fit request further information or initiate further proceedings before tendering its advice. If the Commission considered that some aspect of disciplinary procedure, though covered by regulations, was not properly understood or was wrong in principle, it could so advise, and if such advice was accepted by the Governor, the drafting of the necessary amendments or other action would then be undertaken. It may be that the drafting and issue of regulations on disciplinary procedure, amendments to regulations, etc., affecting the Service generally can most conveniently be undertaken by the Chief Establishments Officer at present. We conceive it as the primary duty of the P.S.C. in disciplinary matters to see that substantial justice is done and to advise along broad lines how it should be done. If, however, the Commission considers that in order to achieve its purpose it should issue directions on its own authority as to the procedure to be adopted to ensure that disciplinary cases are dealt with in a manner which they would approve, we can see no objection.

387. It may appear that our recommendations in so far as they seek to shorten and simplify existing procedure and to devolve authority to lower levels in disciplinary cases, detract from the security at present enjoyed by junior civil servants. There is, however, nothing in our proposals which should adversely affect any junior civil servant or daily paid employee who does his work conscientiously. The security of appointment of employees of this type remains unaltered and their prospects should be considerably enhanced by the recommendations made in other parts of our Report. The main object of disciplinary procedure is to provide machinery to discourage, by the imposition of penalties, negligence, official misconduct, and general bad workmanship. In achieving this object a premium is placed on good service. No organisation, Government or non-Government, can operate efficiently without such provisions, and they should be so designed that the procedure can be applied without undue delay or interference with the work of the

* "Notes and Forms on Official Proceedings under the Colonial Regulations against an Officer for Offences." Sir Alison Russell, K.C.M.G., K.C. (H.M.S.O. 1948.)

department. We are convinced that delays and suspense in obtaining decisions in comparatively simple disciplinary cases are as galling to the better type of junior employee as they are to senior officers, and prompt though summary justice, if properly administered, will be welcomed by the junior ranks of the Service. We consider that our proposals will go some way towards achieving these objects.

Supervision

388. We have heard much evidence of the low rate of production of certain classes of workers in the Gold Coast. To some extent this is due to faulty organisation and inadequate training, but in most cases lack of supervision is largely responsible for low production rates. There should be a supervisory officer personally responsible for the output of work of each group of subordinate staff from road labourers to clerks. This officer should not engage himself in the operations of the group he supervises but should be held personally responsible for the quality and quantity of the work done, and he should be remunerated on that basis. He should be fully trained in all aspects of the work he is supervising and should be capable of performing that work as well as any member of the staff under his control. He may have certain checking or training duties in addition to purely supervisory work but the latter should be his main function. It is this officer who should be responsible for maintaining discipline and for reporting good or bad workmanship. If he fails to maintain discipline or to report on bad workmen under his control, he should be held personally responsible for any deterioration in work. We received the impression that there were not a sufficient number of posts of this nature and that in many cases supervisory officers were so busy handling other work that they had little time to devote to purely supervisory work. We recommend that a supervisory post of the character we have described should be created as justified for each group of subordinate posts and that the cadre of such supervisory posts should be such that each officer is responsible for a group small enough to permit personal supervision. The numerical size of such groups will vary according to the nature of the operations on which the group is engaged, and the cadre of such supervising posts should be subject to constant review by the Chief Establishments Officer with the assistance of an O & M report when possible, to ensure that there is no extravagance. From our observations we would say that the introduction of direct and responsible supervision, as proposed by us, is particularly necessary in the clerical and typing services and in the industrial field.

389. Under the heading of supervision we would like to stress the need for regular and frequent inspections of outstations by officers from Regional Headquarters. The absence of routine inspections in many departmental outstations seemed due as much to the system of departmental organisation as to staff shortages. Infrequent short visits by Heads of Departments while a desirable feature, can be no substitute for a regular routine of inspections by senior officers who can discuss administrative, executive and technical details of the work with the officers in the field. The object of these inspections is not to "catch out" the field officer but to assist him by help and advice, to acquaint him with the headquarters point of view and of policy developments, while at the same time keeping the headquarters officers in touch with practical difficulties being experienced in the field. In some Departments such as Prisons and Post Office, it might be necessary to create a special inspectorate post or posts of adequate seniority purely for this purpose, Inspectors of Prisons for the Prisons Department and Assistant Controllers of Posts in the case of the Post Office, but in all Departments provision should be made for more regular visits of inspection by officers below the rank of the Head of Department, and the officer responsible should be specifically nominated. His inspection reports should be submitted monthly to the Regional Head of Department and to headquarters.

Confidential Reports

390. One of the essentials of sound Establishments administration is the maintenance of a complete and accurate record of staff, in a form which ensures quick and easy reference. This implies a regular system of reports on all established staff from recruitment to retirement. When an officer is being considered for disciplinary action or for promotion in competition with others, it should be possible for the authority dealing with his case to have before it the full story of his career in Government, and not merely an *ad hoc* report by a superior whose acquaintance with him may be limited, and whose judgment may be unwittingly affected by consciousness of the immediate effect the report is likely to have.

From the point of view of the Services, the knowledge that an officer's work and conduct are the subject of regular reports, is likely to keep him " up to the mark " and is conducive of efficiency ; the knowledge that no such regular system of reports is maintained renders suspect all selections for promotion based on merit, and breeds discontent and inefficiency.

391. In the Gold Coast, regulations governing the submission of confidential reports on officers are contained in Chapter 7 of General Orders. The principal features can be summed up as follows. A clear distinction is made between the Senior Service and Junior Service staff. In the case of the former, regulations conform strictly to the requirements laid down by the Secretary of State for officers whose records are kept in the Colonial Office. Apart from the more frequent reports called for on officers serving probation periods, reports are not normally required on an officer until he has reached the sixth point in his incremental scale, and then only biannually except in the case of officers on superscale salaries, or whose performance varies markedly for better or for worse within the two-year period. In the Junior Service annual reports are required only on members of the Senior Division ; on the six senior officers in Departments holding technical appointments in the Second Division ; on clerical officers of the Second Division who are sufficiently outstanding to merit consideration for accelerated promotion to the Senior Division.

392. We have no comments to make on the regulations laid down by the Secretary of State for providing reports on officers for whom he is directly responsible. These are common to all Colonies and specially designed to meet Colonial Office requirements. But while the various forms approved for this purpose might be retained, we see no reason why the frequency of reporting might not be increased for local purposes. Reports in every instance should be furnished not less frequently than annually ; in cases where a report is also due to the Secretary of State extra copies would be required.

393. If our recommendations are accepted there will be no separate Junior Service, and reports on all pensionable officers should be submitted annually, though a distinction should be made in the form required for reporting on administrative and professional and higher grades of executive officers, and that required for the lower executive, clerical, sub-clerical, and technical grades. While the standard Colonial Office forms might be used for the former classes, we consider that something more detailed is required for the latter. We understand that there is a tendency for reporting officers to do so briefly and in terms of fairly wide general interpretation, which make it difficult for a senior officer or board to determine the relative merits and suitability of candidates for promotion to a specified post. At the same time, when reports have to be furnished on considerable numbers of officers, it is often difficult for the reporting officer to compose a comprehensive and fully informative note on each individual. For classes for whom the standard Colonial Office form is not used we recommend a suitable adaptation of what might be termed the " standard classification " form used in the Colonial Office for reporting on officers on salaries not exceeding £965. This form contains sixteen headings indicative of character and personality, such as reliability, output, judgment, initiative, alertness, vigour, zeal, ability to organise, address and tact, grading for promotion. Reports under each heading are confined to one of six classifications—Outstanding, Very Good, Satisfactory, Indifferent, Poor, or no opportunity for assessment. There is also space for general remarks and explanatory comments. The purpose of these various classifications and the significance of terms are explained in notes on the form, and once a reporting officer has mastered them, it should not be difficult for him to produce a report capable of providing to senior officers a very fair picture of a subordinate's work, character and capabilities. A copy of the Confidential Report Form is annexed in Appendix XIII. The Confidential Report should be accompanied by a form indicating the amount of sick leave taken by the officer concerned during the period under review.

394. The filing and custody of confidential reports are of the greatest importance. There should be a personal record file for each pensionable officer, which should contain a complete record of his work, character, education, qualifications, etc., and nothing else. A separate file or files should be kept for all correspondence about an officer, confidential or otherwise, though, if following an exchange of correspondence, an officer receives a commendation or reprimand, this should be noted in his personal record file. Officers appointed by the Secretary of State are

normally required to complete Personal Record Form P2, giving the facts of their parentage, education, academic and other qualifications, previous experience, war service, etc. This would normally be the first folio in the Personal Record files of such officers, followed by probation reports and annual confidential reports in the order in which they were received. We recommend that something similar to Form P2 should be required from all officers on the pensionable staff. If considered suitable it might take the form of a printed questionnaire on the inside cover of personal record file covers, which an officer would be required to complete on first appointment to the Service. The same procedure should not be necessary in the case of officers in non-pensionable grades, but Heads of Departments may find it convenient to devise their own system of reports and records for this class of employee.

395. The Chief Establishments Officer should, in our opinion, have the custody of personal record files. We gave careful consideration to the advisability of these files being retained by the Public Service Commission. We appreciate that it would probably inspire confidence in the Service if officers knew that their personal records and reports were kept in the custody of this important and detached body, but there are also serious disadvantages. We do not visualise the Public Service Commission having the staff and accommodation necessary to ensure that the office work in connection with personal records is properly carried out. This can be considerable, as a check has to be made to ensure that all reports, etc., required, are regularly received when due, entered in the correct files, and submitted to higher authority when necessary. In these circumstances we have come to the conclusion that the Chief Establishments Officer is the most appropriate officer to have custody of personal record files as defined in paragraph 394 above. These files would be made available by him to the Public Service Commission on request. On the question of which files should be retained by the Chief Establishments Officer and which by Heads of Departments, we would advise that the Chief Establishments Officer should have the custody of the files of all officers down to the lowest level he finds practicable. Only thus will he have under his control the fullest possible record of all members of the Establishments for which he is responsible, and ensure that reports are being regularly and correctly furnished.

Promotion

396. A Chapter on efficiency would be incomplete without reference to the need for a sound promotion policy. At various points throughout this Report we have touched on the need to select the best available candidates for posts irrespective of considerations other than merit. We have emphasised the need for careful and unbiased reports on officers and outlined the functions of the Public Service Commission in this matter. We stress again however that a sound promotion policy is essential to the successful operation of the Civil Service under any system. We cannot do better than quote the following passage from the Report of the Commission on the Civil Services of Kenya, Tanganyika, Uganda and Zanzibar, 1947-1948* :—

“ It is unnecessary to elaborate that the efficiency of any Civil Service depends in large measure on the more responsible posts being filled by the ablest officers available, and that the higher the level in the official hierarchy the more should merit outweigh seniority in the filling of vacancies. . . . Undue emphasis on seniority is bad for the Service in more ways than one. From the point of view of the efficient conduct of any Department of the Service, it is obviously bad that a less meritorious officer should be preferred to a more meritorious one. But the mischief goes deeper than that. After a few years of service the junior officer forms a pretty shrewd idea of the merits of his seniors, and if he sees them climbing the promotion ladder in order of seniority, with little or no regard to their respective merits, the edge of the keenness with which he entered the service is likely to be blunted, and he will be more concerned to avoid ‘ blotting his copybook ’ than to make his maximum contribution to the work of his Department.”

397. It may be useful if we complete this picture by attaching the following extract from the Report of the Royal Commission on the Civil Service 1929-31 whose recommendations still govern promotion policy in the British Civil Service :—

“ The methods by which normal departmental promotions are carried out in the Service were

* Col. No. 223.

the subject of an agreement reached in 1921 on a Committee of the National Council known as the Promotions Committee.

“ The Promotions Committee, in their report, under the heading ‘ the principles of promotion ’ stated as follows :— ‘ We are agreed that the consideration ruling all promotions should be the advancement of the efficiency of the Public Service, and that this can only be secured by determining promotions on the ground of fitness. . . . For different posts, however, the relative importance of the qualities varies, and the fitness of an officer is indicated not by a mere enumeration of the qualities he has displayed in the past, but by the extent to which he possesses that combination of qualities which is requisite for the work to be performed in the immediate or more distant future. In promotions to posts in which the work is of a routine character seniority should be allowed more weight than in the case of promotions where greater responsibilities and initiative are involved : ’

“ In dealing with the weight attached to merit and seniority in promotion, a distinction must be drawn between the various ranges of the Service. In filling the higher posts in the Service it is clear that merit should be the only consideration. We are glad to note that, when appointments to the highest posts in the Service are under consideration, no account is taken of seniority.

“ In filling posts in the middle ranges of the Service merit should be the determining factor.

“ In the lower ranges seniority and length of service will necessarily carry weight.

“ Some of the evidence which we heard from associations representing clerical staff was in favour of promoting the senior officer on the list, provided only he was fitted for advancement. We do not accept this view. Even in the lower ranges, steps should be taken to ensure that exceptional merit is rewarded by accelerated promotion.

“ In regard to the Service generally, the factor of seniority is unlikely to be undervalued and we deprecate the exercise of any pressure designed to stress the claims of seniority as against exceptional merit.”

398. The system recommended both by the Royal Commission and by the Joint Committee of the National Whitley Council, a system which is sponsored equally by the Staff side and the Official side and by the Royal Commission, has worked well for many years in the British Service. We can commend it therefore with confidence to the Gold Coast Government. Its basis is the Annual Report form (see Appendix XIII) which brings out the qualities that normally are the factors determining fitness for promotion. It also assures a common standard of promotion. We deal with the Annual Report form in paragraphs 390–395 and emphasise here that a sound promotion system is not feasible without some such system which records systematically over the years the progress and qualifications of officers under consideration for promotion and ensures that those qualifications are estimated in accordance with a common standard.

Transfers and Closed Services

399. In the course of our enquiry we received frequent complaints from Heads of Departments that efficient members of their staff, particularly in the Clerical grades, were transferred to other Departments where they were not familiar with the work and presumably less useful. Conversely, when they had a vacancy in a promotion post in their own Department it was frequently filled by the transfer of an officer from another Department, who knew little about the duties of the post, even when an eligible officer already in the Department and acquainted with the work had been recommended for promotion. One Head of Department referred to the constant “ leapfrogging from Department to Department ” and the waste of time and money on fruitless interviews of the inevitable “ transfer seeker ”. On the other hand, another Head of Department expressed the view that as “ change and variety were essential for Africans ”, transfers should be encouraged, and members of the Junior Service are jealous of their right of transfer. Though opinion on the subject is by no means unanimous, it can be said that Heads of Departments are generally in favour of closed services, while members of the staff are not.

400. The Clerical Service is at present a “ Unified Service ”. Members are liable to transfer at any time to any Department, with the exception of the Railway, Customs, Audit, Police, Prisons, and Posts and Telegraphs Departments. For promotion purposes, *i.e.*, promotion from Second to

First and First to Senior Divisions, Departments are divided into groups in which the work is roughly similar, but there does not appear to be any strictly enforced bar against inter-group promotions.

401. Our recommendations on the structure of the Service if accepted, will, of course, largely alter the picture. Promotion from the Clerical service will generally be to Executive class posts on the advice of the Public Service Commission who will presumably want as large a field as possible from which to select. We recommend that once an officer has been appointed to an Executive class post he should have no inherent right to a transfer on promotion or otherwise outside his Department, but Government should of course retain the right to transfer him to a post of equal or higher value elsewhere in the interests of the administration.

402. As regards the Clerical Service in the new structure we recommend, it should eventually be possible, and advisable, to break it up into closed sections by Ministries. Transfers as between Departments within Ministries could thus be arranged by Permanent Secretaries, with a consequent reduction in the burden of work devolving on the Chief Establishments' Officer's staff. But as long as there is still a shortage of boys with full secondary education, and consequent understaffing of the Clerical Service, it will be necessary to keep the Service as fluid as possible, and use the limited number of recruits to fill vacancies wherever they occur, on the basis of the most urgent requirements of the Public Service as a whole. The operation of this principle is of course bound to cause a certain amount of dissatisfaction, but in the present state of understaffing, Heads of Departments must accept the position which can be made more tolerable by an exercise of consideration and forethought on the part of the authority responsible for transfers. As regards technical posts we think the same basic principles should apply, but as technical officers are frequently given a considerable amount of training in their trades at the expense of Departments, in time if not in money, we do not think that technical officers should be considered for transfer to non-technical posts. We see no reason for instance why a machine operator trained in the Government Press should be allowed to transfer to the Clerical Service because he considered he would thereby increase his prospects of ultimate promotion.

403. To recapitulate, we recommend that the Clerical Service should for the present continue to be unified and transferable with defined groups; that all clerks with the necessary qualifications should be eligible for promotion to executive posts in any Departments; that officers in the Executive class should have no right of transfer to other Departments, but would have to accept such transfer if ordered by Government; that technical officers should be eligible for transfer to technical but not to non-technical posts in other Departments. Sub-clerical employees who pass the limited competition for appointment to the Clerical class would normally but not necessarily be posted to their own Departments.

Hours of work

404. The minimum hours for attendance laid down for public officers in the Gold Coast are $6\frac{1}{2}$ on weekdays (exclusive of luncheon interval) and four on Saturdays. On administrative instructions daily hours may be arranged by Heads of Departments on a "single session" or a "double session" basis. Under the former system an officer comes on duty at 7 a.m. and works straight through to 2 p.m. with half-an-hour's break for refreshment or relaxation. Under the latter, he comes on at 7.30 a.m., works till 12 noon, when he has two hours off for lunch, and resumes work from 2 till 4. In practice it often happens that the clerical staff adopt the single session system (which saves them transport expenses to their homes and back at midday) while their supervising officers adopt the double session. It is difficult to imagine a practice which lends itself more to inefficiency. There is little or no supervision over the Junior staff during the half-hour before the senior officers arrive, and the two hours during which they are absent for lunch. This results in bad time-keeping, and slacking off at midday. In any case, we do not think an effective day's work can be rendered in the tropics in one continuous stretch with only half-an-hour's break.

405. The ideal to be aimed at is that Government offices should at no time close down within stated hours. This means that lunch hours, which need not exceed an hour to an hour-and-a-half for the junior staff, should be staggered. "Staff officers", who are paid on the assumption that they will perform the work assigned to them irrespective of the time it takes, are not bound

down by set hours in the same way as clerks, but may be expected to adjust their attendance to see that the junior staff is properly supervised and the Public receives adequate service. To achieve this ideal and yet act fairly by the junior staff, canteens or other suitable messing arrangements should be provided in the larger Departments and in towns where officers live some distance away from their offices. We can see no reason why a canteen in the vicinity of the Chief Secretary's Office, Accra, should not be able to cater for the needs of the junior staff of the Chief Secretary's Office and many other neighbouring offices. We understand that in many Government offices in India and Ceylon it is not even thought necessary to provide a canteen where food can be bought. Messing or "tiffin" rooms are set aside for junior and subordinate staff, where officers can eat their lunch, brought in suitable containers, smoke, read, play games, and generally relax. We recommend that the Gold Coast Government should give serious consideration to the adoption of suitable messing arrangements for junior staff along the lines we have suggested, with a view to the introduction of a more economical system of office hours.

406. Under the present regulations the weekly working hours of a Government office worker in the Gold Coast total $36\frac{1}{2}$; subordinate and manual workers are required to work a total of 45 hours per week. Though we see no reason to recommend a change in the weekly total for subordinate workers we consider that hours for office workers should be increased from $6\frac{1}{2}$ to 7 per weekday, and from 4 to $4\frac{1}{2}$ on Saturdays, making a weekly total of $39\frac{1}{2}$ hours exclusive of meal times. We received evidence of considerable arrears in clerical work in most Departments, and in view of the need to operate the complicated administrative machinery of the new Constitution with a clerical staff limited in numbers by the shortage of qualified recruits, we do not think the present comparatively short working hours can be justified. The increase of three hours per week which we recommend will reduce the gap between the total weekly hours of clerical and of manual workers, which formed the subject of frequent representations we received from members of the latter class.

407. We do not suggest the actual times during which Government offices should be open and staff should attend work, apart from expressing our dislike of the single session system. Actual hours can best be fixed by Government in consultation with Staff Associations, but in determining hours of attendance we recommend that particular weight should be given to the following two factors in the order in which we mention them :—

- (i) The convenience of the general public whom it is the duty of officers to serve ;
- (ii) The convenience of clerks and officers of similar status, on whom these hours are strictly obligatory, and who are normally faced with greater difficulties of transport and feeding arrangements than staff officers.

Overtime

408. Overtime is a thing to be avoided in sound administration, as inconsistent with efficiency. It is an expensive way of getting work done, as it must be paid for at higher rates, and tends to reduce the day to day efficiency of the employees who have to do it. The accepted alternatives are the employment of more staff, or, when that is impracticable, the grant of additional time off in lieu of the extra time worked. We may say at once neither of these alternatives is practicable on most occasions in the Gold Coast under present circumstances, when a great deal of urgent work has to be done by a limited number of qualified people. In the foreseeable future it will still be necessary to pay large sums in overtime each year.

409. The appropriate rates and regulations governing the payment of overtime are fully set out in General Orders 499-512. We are in general agreement and have no recommendations on details to offer. We should like, however, to stress the principle that the payment of overtime to *pensionable* staff should be considered abnormal practice and confined to the lower salaried grades. No pensionable officer should earn overtime for doing his normal work. Overtime should only be paid to a member of the pensionable staff with the direct or delegated approval of the Chief Establishments Officer, when either it has become necessary to allocate to him in addition to his proper work special duties which he would not normally be expected to perform and which cannot be attended to during official hours, or (more rarely) when, for a limited period of time, special circumstances so increase the normal load of work in his office that it is quite

unreasonable for him to be expected to complete his share within a normal day's official hours, and he cannot be given assistance. In such cases we would recommend that rather than ordering payment of overtime on an hourly basis the additional work should be reviewed after it has been completed, and the officer or officers responsible rewarded by the grant of a cash bonus, the amount of which would be calculated on the quality as well as the quantity of work.

410. We encountered among junior and subordinate staff in the Gold Coast a tendency to associate claims for "overtime" solely with hours on duty. While this must obviously remain the principal criterion in assessing these claims, we think that emphasis must also rest on the nature of the work. An officer's substantive pay is calculated on the value of his post. With some jobs such as night watchman, the work is comparatively easy though the hours are long; easy work accompanied by long hours have to be considered conditions of the job on which the pay is assessed, and claims for overtime should not be considered merely on the grounds that hours on duty compare unfavourably with those of officers in more strenuous posts. Similarly a post may involve long hours on duty, much of which is "stand by" as opposed to "active". Station-masters in charge of small stations handling only one or two trains a day are cases in point. Here again "broken time" is a condition of the job on which the remuneration is fixed and overtime payments cannot be justified.

411. We frequently received complaints about hours of duty from officers working in shifts or on night duty, such as members of the Prisons and Meteorological Departments. Hours of duty in such cases are largely a matter for adjustment through staff negotiating machinery, and we do not propose to comment apart from the general principles, mainly concerning remuneration, we have indicated in the above paragraphs.

Checking of Stores

412. We received complaints from Heads of Departments that a disproportionate amount of their time and the time of their senior officers was spent on membership of Boards, particularly Boards of Survey on stores. Frequent service on Boards is a duty which must be accepted as unavoidable in a Colony where a relatively small body of senior officers, many of whom are on leave out of the country at any one time, share the main responsibility of advising Government. But in spite of the time spent by highly paid officers in checking stores, the report of the Director of Audit contains every year an alarming list of detected losses incurred by Government from stores of public material or money. The prolonged employment of highly paid officers on store survey work can be justified if it effectively prevents or reduces fraud; if it fails to achieve this object it cannot be justified. In our view the present system is faulty because although the integrity of the officers appointed to Boards of Survey can be accepted without question, their capability of taking the necessary pains and time to perform an adequate check can not. High-powered Boards to survey specified stores can only be appointed at long intervals and the persons in charge of stores have ample warning of the precise date of the proposed survey. The heavier losses experienced by Government are generally due to failure to detect leakage at an early stage and consequent wastage over relatively long periods.

413. A post of Stock Verifier already exists in the Medical Department, and we consider that if similar posts were created in some of the larger Departments responsible for internal stores audit, the expense would be more than justified by the consequent saving in losses. It would be the duty of the Stock Verifier to keep a constant watch on stores and the methods of operating them, so that if leakages did arise they could at once be detected and stopped. The presence of a Stock Verifier in a Department should enable the Director of Audit substantially to modify Board of Survey requirements. We also consider that if the revised structure we recommend is accepted, more use might be made of senior executive in place of professional or administrative officers as members of Boards of Survey.

General Orders and Manuals of Procedure

414. If a Department is to be efficiently run and the staff are to avoid wasting their own time and that of other Departments by adopting wrong procedures, codes of regulations governing the day to day working of the Government machine must not only be accessible even to junior clerks, but must be presented in an orderly and readable form, well indexed and providing easy reference. When

we first arrived in the Gold Coast we found that General Orders, the principal Government Code of Regulations was so pasted over with correction slips (in cases where the staff responsible had remembered to insert them) that it was extremely difficult to discover what were the regulations on any particular subject, and which of them was still in force and had not been amended. Government was fully aware of this unsatisfactory position, and a complete revision was already being carried out and has now been completed. Unfortunately we were only able to see the preliminary cyclostyled copy before we left the Gold Coast, but we understand that the final printed copy is to be in loose-leaf form, and we note that an ample supply of Order numbers has been left spare at the end of each Chapter. We would like to congratulate those responsible. If corrections and additions are made in the form of substitute or extra pages (bearing of course in every case the date of the correction) and promptly despatched to all copy holders, we feel sure that much tiresome correspondence between headquarters and branch offices will be eliminated, with a consequent increase in efficiency. We hope that correction procedure will be systematised. An officer in the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office should be responsible for the Code. It should be his duty to see that all approved amendments are promptly printed in suitable form and distributed. In every office there should be one clerk responsible for inserting correction pages in all copies in his office, and this should be done immediately correction pages are received. We do not advise any restriction of the number of copies issued in the interests of economy. A wide distribution of copies should pay for itself in increased efficiency.

415. We understand that it is also proposed to carry out a long overdue revision of Financial Orders and Stores Regulations. We strongly recommend in the interests of efficiency that this work should be given the highest priority; that the loose-leaf form of publication should be adopted, and that the Ministry of Finance should make arrangements to ensure that a satisfactory supply of copies is distributed to Departments, and the process of keeping them up to date is made as simple as possible.

416. In paragraph 385 we have already recommended the issue of a pamphlet on disciplinary procedure for use in all Departments. We do not think that the issue of such instructive publications need be a monopoly of the central headquarters of Government, and at least one Head of Department has had the initiative to compose a manual of departmental methods and procedure for the instruction of his staff. We recommend that this excellent example should be followed in other Departments wherever practicable. The responsibilities of a Government Department might be said to be twofold; the carrying out of the main functions for which it is created and the training of staff to become useful servants of the State. This latter responsibility is particularly important in the present state of development of the Gold Coast and Heads of Departments should do all in their power to see that recruits to their staff are given every opportunity to learn how things are done in the Department, and why they are done in a particular way. It is here that a departmental manual is most useful, but care should be taken to see that it is written in a clear and readable form providing easy reference.

Correspondence

417. In 1939 on the suggestion of the Secretary of State the "saving telegram" was introduced to save time and paper in correspondence between the Colonial Office and Colonial Governments. Previously, though there was a system of brief communication by "third personal notes", practically all written correspondence had been conducted through the medium of the formal despatch, or slightly less formal letter addressed by or to the Under Secretary of State. As its name suggests the saving telegram is a postal communication written in the minimum of words generally associated with telegrams, and containing nothing which is not essential to the information it is intended to convey. The subject matter and the senders' and addressees' reference numbers are clearly stated at the beginning. The text follows in the simple and precise language of an official telephone message, bereft of all the strictly unnecessary clichés and formal phrases commonly referred to as "officialese". The success of this departure from the traditional practice is evidenced by the fact that in most Colonies formal despatches are now the exception rather than the rule in corresponding with the Secretary of State. In many Colonies we understand that this simplified form of communication has been taken a step further and is used frequently in correspondence between the Secretariat

and Departments, and between departmental headquarters and branch offices. We understand, however, that this is not generally the practice in the Gold Coast and we strongly recommend it should be adopted. When the writer merely has to note references and subject, and then to state in simple language what he has in mind, without formal introductory or valedictory phrases or unnecessary words such as "on the above subject", the time taken in drafting or dictating an official communication is sensibly reduced. It also avoids the exasperation which we learned was frequently suffered by Heads of Departments who received a letter formally couched "on the direction of the Governor" when they were well aware that the subject matter had been dealt with on a much lower level. It not infrequently happens that a Head of Department in replying to a letter from the Secretariat commits the irregularity of referring to it as the letter of the (possibly) quite junior officer who happens to have signed it. Any official communication from the Secretariat, or any other Department, issues of course on the authority of the officer in charge of the Department, but there is a natural though unfortunate tendency for the addressee to attribute responsibility for its contents to the signatory. Saving telegrams are not signed, though generally initialled by the issuing officer. They thus serve to preserve the anonymity of the writer, and correctly focus attention on the authority-responsible.

418. Another common cause of delay and waste of time and energy is the habit of writing long minutes to officers frequently working in the same building or easily accessible by telephone. We appreciate that there are many occasions when it is necessary to have on the file a full record of the arguments which were considered before a decision was reached, but it frequently happens that a brief conversation followed by a short note on the file enable a decision to be made with the minimum expenditure of time, energy and paper. Personal or "demi-official" notes between senior officers, in place of formal departmental communications, is another effective time-saver much practised in Government Departments in the United Kingdom. We cannot attempt to specify on which particular occasions these various "short cuts" should be used; this is a matter for the discretion of individual officers, but if the attitude of mind is developed which favours the direct approach wherever possible, well recognised and generally adopted time-saving practices will automatically follow. We are also aware that the question of correspondence between one Ministry and another as well as between one Department and another, is being actively examined in the Gold Coast and is being pursued on what appears to us on the right lines. Apart from the suggestions mentioned above we have no other comment to make.

MACHINERY FOR STAFF CONSULTATIONS

Whitley Council functions 419. In pursuance of the recommendations of the Harragin Commission, two Gold Coast Councils have been established, "one to deal with matters concerning the Junior Service and the other with matters concerning the Senior Service". The Harragin Commission recommended that the functions of both Councils should be advisory to the Governor. The Holmes Commission for East Africa made the same recommendation. These recommendations deliberately adopted a different system from that obtaining as regards the National Whitley Council in the United Kingdom where the agreed decision of the Council becomes operative on being reported, subject to the over-riding responsibility of Parliament and the responsibility to Parliament of the Minister concerned. The Holmes Commission considered that the United Kingdom system would not be suitable in Colonial Territories "since though decisions could only become agreed if the Official side of the Council had previously ascertained that they would be acceptable to the Governor, it might well be that they would not be acceptable to the Secretary of State, whose control over the conditions of service of officers in posts the filling of which requires his approval cannot properly be fettered, and who must also be safeguarded against repercussions on those conditions arising from decisions affecting conditions of service applicable to holders of other posts".

420. In the event the constitution of the Gold Coast Whitley Councils in theory at least follows that of the British Council. The operative paragraph of the Constitution is as follows :—

"*Decisions.* The decisions of the Council shall be arrived at by agreement between the two sides, shall be signed by the Chairman and Vice-Chairman, shall be reported to the Government, and thereupon shall become operative subject to the over-riding authority of His Excellency the Governor, and subject to the approval of the Legislature where such approval is necessary."

In practice, however, the positions is different. Possibly thinking on the point is influenced by the "advisory" basis recommended by the Harragin and Holmes Commissions but however that may be we know of at least three agreed decisions of the Council where the over-riding powers have had to be invoked, whereas we understand that, apart from one debatable incident in 1921, no such case has arisen during the 30 years history of the British National Whitley Council. Probably the main reason for the difference in practice arises from the fact that in the United Kingdom the official side are careful to make sure that any agreement into which they enter will be acceptable to superior authority, whether Ministerial or Parliamentary, whereas the same technique has not yet been developed in the Gold Coast. It should perhaps be added that it is an essential factor in the British system that both sides are aware of the limitations imposed by the system in force and are therefore the readier to arrive at a compromise which will be acceptable to the final authority on both sides.

421. The recent changes in the Constitution of the Gold Coast and the recommendations of this Commission for abolishing the right of appeal beyond the Governor in the case of officers whose appointment is wholly within the competence of the Gold Coast Government (paragraph 50) will, if our recommendation is approved, bring the Gold Coast position much nearer that of the United Kingdom. We have much evidence of discontent with the present working of the Whitley Councils and many officers are asking whether it is worth while to maintain the machinery of Whitleyism when agreements reached in the Council are so liable to be overturned by higher authority, whether by the Legislative Council or by the Secretary of State. We do not recommend any modification of the formal constitution of the Council but within this framework it should be possible to devise an arrangement under which, as in the United Kingdom, agreed decisions become operative on all matters within the competence of the Gold Coast Government. In order that the system should work satisfactorily in this way it is essential that both sides are fully briefed by their Principals on the extent to which they can compromise without the need for reference back. Repudiation by either side of an agreement reached in Council tends to undermine confidence in the system. On matters within the competence of the Gold Coast

Government—and their scope will naturally expand over the years as the Constitution develops—the Gold Coast Council seems to us in the same position as the National Whitley Council in the United Kingdom. We annex at Appendix XIV a note on the constitutional position of the National Whitley Council in the United Kingdom.

Composition of the Civil Service Council of the Gold Coast

422. Our recommendations for the abolition of the present division of the Service into Senior and Junior Service (paragraph 77) will, if accepted, entail a corresponding change as regards the two Gold Coast Councils. The Holmes Commission for East Africa differed from the Harragin Commission in recommending that as “the Civil Service should be open to all irrespective of race, there should be in each territory a single Whitley Council covering the whole body of Civil Servants”. The time has now come, in our view, when the same principle should be followed in the Gold Coast. The Council should include representatives of each class of civil servant who will presumably be elected by the appropriate staff association or Union. The Council, we remark, has power to appoint Standing Committees or special committees.

Departmental Councils

423. The penetration of the Whitley system down to the departmental level has begun in the Gold Coast but it has not gone very far. While hearing evidence from the Staff Associations we came across many cases of what seemed to us honest and genuine indignation at the failure of departments to deal with minor grievances on which representations had been made to them over a long period of time. These grievances seemed matters which might readily have been cleared at a single meeting of a departmental Council on Whitley lines. We were particularly struck by the need for such a Council in the Medical Department, which has a large and heterogeneous staff, but possesses no central consultative body at which it can express its point of view to its Chief and his principal Assistants. It seems to us that there is a barrier at present dividing the Senior from the Junior Service—this barrier is psychological and based on a fundamental difference in outlook as well as representing a division in status and pay. It is essential to break down this barrier and we know of no better way to do it than by the “cut and thrust” of negotiations and discussions across the table at a meeting of a Whitley Council. As a first step to the Unified Civil Service which we trust will eventually emerge in the Gold Coast, we hope that Whitley Councils will be set up for *all* departments as soon as possible. Similar steps should also be taken for each department at the Regional level. Judging by the masses of evidence of local, as distinct from national interest, that were presented to this Commission as we toured through the Regions, we are satisfied that there is ample scope for such Regional departmental Councils.

Regional General Councils

424. The case for General Councils at the Regional level is perhaps more debatable. “The Chief Commissioner of the Northern Territories was opposed to a suggestion that there should be a regional Whitley Council for the Northern Territories. He expressed the view that the present consultative machinery was adequate though a few minor adjustments should be made. The introduction of another Council was unnecessary. He explained that all departments had—or should have—local departmental consultative committees. Discussions began there at a fairly low level and many points of differences could be resolved at that level. If the differences could not be resolved in the local departmental committee’s half-yearly meeting, they would be referred to the central departmental consultative council in Accra. From there the next appeal was to the Central Whitley Council in Accra. He was of the view that there should be regional departmental consultative committees in all three Administrations, and that the Central Whitley Council should be strengthened by having at least two representatives of the staff side and one from the official side from each regional departmental consultative committee. He explained further that matters of general application to the Northern Territories were referred to the Northern Territories branch of the Association of Junior Civil Servants which could either negotiate direct with the Chief Commissioner or refer to the Central Whitley Council. Many matters under discussion had financial implications and this was an additional argument against the usefulness of a Regional Whitley Council.”*

We admit that there is some force in these arguments which no doubt are sound in principle,

* Extract from notes of evidence.

but during our tour of the Northern Territories we gained the impression that there is in that Region almost a complete absence of any local consultative machinery. We devote five paragraphs of this Report to the special conditions obtaining in the Northern Territories and are of the opinion that practically the whole of the representations made to us by the subordinate staffs could have been cleared by a properly working Regional Whitley Council. They could not have been met by the departmental Councils suggested by the Chief Commissioner because the grievances in question were common to the Northern Territories as a whole and not confined to particular departments. They would not, however, be appropriately dealt with by the National Whitley Council, as they referred particularly to conditions peculiar to the Northern Territories. We are of opinion therefore that the best way of ensuring that departmental consultative machinery is not only set up but also made to work properly, is for the Chief Commissioner personally to take on this special responsibility by means of yearly or half-yearly Regional Councils under his Chairmanship.

425. We have less evidence of the case for similar Regional Councils in Ashanti and the Colony, but in view of the position assigned to the Chief Commissioner in the administrative hierarchy (see paragraphs 39 to 42 and paragraph 85) as Regional Administrator, it follows in our opinion that Regional Whitley Councils should be established also in both those Regions. It is most desirable that the Chief Commissioner, who is the principal representative of Government in his Region should meet representatives of his staff regularly in formal Council where he can ascertain their point of view at first-hand and at the same time explain to them the policy which he is pursuing.

426. These Regional Councils would of course deal only with matters within the competence of the Chief Commissioner.

Arbitration

427. It has been suggested to us that Whitleyism cannot work satisfactorily unless an Arbitration Tribunal is established in parallel to settle disputed wage claims. It would be a pre-requisite of such a system that the Government should accept the decision of the Tribunal and support it in the Legislative Assembly when, as usually happens, the Tribunal's award involves financial provision requiring the approval of the Legislature. We agree that compulsory arbitration is a natural concomitant of the fully developed Whitley system but we do not consider such an Arbitration Tribunal to be either an essential or a desirable development in the present stage of "Whitleyism" in the Gold Coast.

Trade Unions and Staff Associations

428. We have already expressed our views (*vide* paragraph 160(v)) on the form taken by Civil Service Trade Unions and Staff Associations in the Gold Coast as they exist today. To us the present departmental or vertical structure of Trade Unions in the Gold Coast appears singularly ineffective, not least from the standpoint of the members of those Unions. A heterogeneous committee, few of whose members may be concerned or acquainted with the point at issue, is not a good negotiating body.

429. Some changes must be made in the organisation of Service Trades Unions and Staff Associations, if only as a result of the abolition of the division into Senior and Junior Service, and the creation of the new classes proposed by us. The Senior Service, for instance, will no longer exist as such, and it will be necessary to modify the present Trades Union Ordinance which specifically excludes from membership of a Trades Union any member of the Senior Service.

430. We suggest therefore that opportunity might be taken of the proposed complete reorganisation of the Service to persuade the civil servants of the Gold Coast of the need for taking advantage of the change that must be made in any event and to convince them that it would be to their own interests to regroup themselves according to the classes that we propose, or in an association of groups of allied classes if they so prefer—that is to say, grouping on a horizontal or class basis rather than on the present vertical or departmental basis. Experience in the United Kingdom indicates that departmental interests can safely be left to the "class" Unions or Associations grouped together in a particular department in the departmental Whitley Council.

431. It is difficult to suggest precise groupings without knowing the views of the staff concerned and this will not be possible until the new structure of the Service has come into being, but it

would be in the interests of the staff that such groupings should conform as closely as possible to the main classes into which we propose to divide the new Service. There would, however, be no objection to a grouping of allied classes which have substantial interests in common. Thus in the United Kingdom the Civil Service Clerical Association represents Higher Clerical Officers, Clerical Officers and the sub-clerical class including typing and shorthand-typing grades. The "Society of Civil Servants" represents all the grades in the Executive class and also analogous managerial grades. Of recent years for instance the Association of Head Postmasters and the Association of Telephone Managers, which were formerly "recognised" as separate associations, have decided that negotiations on their behalf would be more effectually handled by the Society of Civil Servants and have been absorbed in that body.

432. We recognise that the composition of Staff Unions or Associations is a matter for the Unions or Associations themselves, but we make the above suggestion because we are convinced that only in this way can they convert themselves into a strong and effective negotiating force. The method that we suggest is that followed by Service Unions in the United Kingdom. These Unions have organised themselves in that way not because such a grouping suits Government convenience—indeed they would brook no interference by Government with their right to organise themselves as they please—but because it suits them and their members, and because they have found it to be the most effective and efficient organisation for carrying out their primary purpose—negotiations with the official side in the interests of their members. Convincing evidence on this point is found in the fact that in the United Kingdom no Service Union is willing in practice to entrust to the National Whitley Council negotiations for increased pay which concern only the class or classes which it represents. It prefers to handle that job itself rather than hand it over to the National Whitley Council which for this purpose would be no more than a heterogeneous committee few of whose members will be concerned or acquainted with the questions at issue.

Recognition of Government Staff Associations

433. Apart from the Senior and Junior Civil Service Associations—which, as we understand it are "Whitley" bodies—the only other Staff Associations are the departmental Trade Unions which are required to register under the Trades Unions Ordinance. Registration is subject only to the discretion of the Registrar of the Supreme Court and, once registered the relationship between the Trade Union and the State is governed by the formal code of law laid down in the Ordinance for the control of Trade Unions. Even so it does not follow that a registered Trade Union is automatically "recognised" by the department in which its members work. At least one such case was brought to our notice. We have indicated in paragraph 160 that we would like to see develop in the Gold Coast real Unions of Tradesmen irrespective of employer, but this is not incompatible with the existence within Government Service and even within such Trade Unions, of Government Staff Associations recognised by the Government as the proper body to negotiate on conditions of work, etc., for a particular class of employee.

434. We consider that registration under the Ordinance as a Trade Union is appropriate only to the form of Trade Union envisaged in paragraph 160, and should not apply to Government Staff Associations or Unions though, if the members wished to impose upon themselves the obligations of formal registration and satisfied the conditions laid down in the Ordinance, we would see no objection. In the main, however, we consider that "recognition" of a Government Staff Association should not be in any way dependent on registration under the Trades Union Ordinance.

435. The relationship between the State and a Staff Association in the United Kingdom is much less formal than in the Gold Coast. A Staff Association may or may not be registered as a Trades Union; that is a matter which does not concern the British Treasury or other Civil Service authority which grants the right of "official recognition" to a Civil Service Union; nor normally would such authority have any knowledge whether a Union is so registered or not. We understand that most Staff Associations are not in fact registered as Trades Unions. The vital link between the State and the Staff Association is the grant of "official recognition" to the Association or the organ entitled to negotiate or make representations on behalf of a given grade or class. This "recognition" is accorded by the Treasury acting on behalf of the Chancellor of the Exchequer in the case of an Association which covers the whole Service or more than one

Ministry ; where the Association covers a grade or grades confined to one Ministry " recognition " in respect of that Ministry is granted by the Minister concerned. The essential prerequisite to " recognition " is that the Association seeking " recognition " must establish to the satisfaction of the authority authorising " recognition " its right to speak for a majority of the members of the grade or class concerned. Apart from the obligation to produce evidence of the strength of its membership, the British Government in its capacity as employer does not attempt to exercise any control over the working of the organisation of a British Staff Association. In theory of course the Government has the right to withdraw recognition from an Association which persistently acts in such a way that negotiation or relationship with it becomes impossible, but that right has never so far as we are aware, been exercised, thanks to the good sense and cordial co-operation which characterises the relations both of Official and Staff sides.

436. We believe that the looser relationship based solely on " recognition " would help to build up stronger and more healthy Staff Unions in the Gold Coast than the present formal relationship based on the Trades Union Ordinance. We would advise therefore that Staff Unions should not be required to register as Trades Unions—unless of course they themselves wish to do so—as a pre-requisite of recognition.

Summary

437. We append a summary of our suggestions for the improvement of the machinery for staff consultations.

(i) CIVIL SERVICE STAFF UNIONS :

Staff Associations or Unions composed of and representing the interests of civil servants in a particular class or group of allied classes irrespective of the Department in which the members are employed. These Associations or Unions may seek " recognition " from the Chief Secretary as the competent body to represent the interests of the particular class or classes of civil servant concerned. As a condition of " recognition " they should be required to produce proof that they represent the majority of civil servants in that class or those classes.

(ii) " WHITLEY " MACHINERY :

Departmental Councils or Committees at departmental headquarters and Regions (and districts wherever practicable) composed of representatives of all classes of civil servant in the Department and meeting regularly under the Chairmanship of the Head of Department, or the departmental officer in charge of the Region or District as the case may be. These bodies should be competent to discuss purely departmental matters. They will not normally discuss individual questions, e.g. of discipline or promotions, although they may discuss general principles underlying such issues. They will normally discuss matters of general concern and not those peculiar to one class or Association, which should be left for the Association concerned to pursue through other channels. In the case of Regional and District Councils or Committees departmental discussion should be confined to purely departmental matters peculiar to the Region or District.

Regional General Councils composed of representatives of each class of civil servant in the Region nominated by the appropriate Staff Associations and meeting regularly under the Chairmanship of the Chief Commissioner. These bodies should be competent to discuss all general issues affecting the Region concerned. Agreements reached on matters within the competence of the Chief Commissioner should become operative.

The Central Civil Service Council for the Gold Coast composed of representatives of all classes and from all regions meeting at least once a year under the Chairmanship of the Chief Secretary. This body should be competent to discuss and negotiate on all matters affecting the Civil Service in general and agreements reached on matters within the competence of the Gold Coast Government should become operative.

438. Staff Associations should not be required to register as Trades Unions though, provided they satisfy the requirements of the Trades Unions Ordinance, there should be no obstacle to their doing so. In practice, however, we envisage Trades Unions embracing a wider field of workers than those in Government employment, and it seems to us likely that, while a number of civil servants may be members of both a Trade Union and a Government Staff Association, there will be little advantage in a Staff Association registering as a Trade Union.

PRIVATE PRACTICE

Definition

439. By "private practice" as used throughout this Chapter, we mean the acceptance, by Medical Officers, of fees or other remuneration in respect of professional services rendered to members of the public, in addition to their official salaries and allowances.

440. It was suggested to us that private practice in the Medical Department was not a matter which came strictly within our terms of reference, but an enquiry from Government at the highest levels confirmed our own opinion that this was not a matter on which our Report could be silent.

History of Private Practice

441. The history of private practice in the Medical Service on the West Coast of Africa is given at some length by Sir Sydney Phillipson in his Report of the Commission on the Private Practice of Medicine and Surgery by Officers of the Department of Medical Services, Nigeria. Briefly the facts are these. Prior to 1934 private practice was an accepted feature of medical service in West Africa, though it was not enjoyed by certain officers holding senior administrative posts, or by officers of the Medical Health Service who drew a special compensatory allowance of £150 per year known as "staff pay". The Governor had the right to withdraw or suspend the privilege particularly in cases where the needs of a district were adequately met through private practitioners. Abolition was proposed and discussed in 1928, but it was decided that the time was not yet ripe, mainly owing to the scarcity of private practitioners.

442. In the mid-thirties the Unified Colonial Medical Service was created, and the position was again reviewed when it became necessary to frame regulations for the new Service. The final decision was incorporated in Regulation 7 which was worded as follows :—

"No officer shall be entitled as of right to practise on his own account. The conditions, if any, under which officers may be permitted to engage in private consulting practice, and to receive fees from members of the public, shall be determined by local regulations framed in accordance with the circumstances of the various dependencies and approved by the Secretary of State."

"Provided that nothing in this Regulation shall affect any right acquired by any officer prior to the 1st of January 1934."

In interpreting this Regulation for the West African Service, it was decided that private practice should normally be allowed in the case of officers not holding senior administrative posts provided it did not interfere with the faithful and efficient performance of official duties, and on the distinct understanding that the privilege might be withdrawn or restricted in terms of Regulation 7.

443. On the 17th January 1946, after consideration of views expressed by the West African Governors Advisory Committee, the Secretary of State issued a Despatch in which he accepted the abolition of private practice in principle, and in letters of appointment to members of the Medical Service thereafter, it is clearly stated that they are precluded from engaging in private practice for remuneration. The application of this principle to serving officers was left for consideration by Colonial Governments, with the suggestion that sufficient compensation should be offered to induce officers to forego their acquired rights or privileges. On this the West African Governors in Conference reached the following agreement in April 1946 :—

- (i) Officers appointed before 1934 should be offered a pensionable allowance if they surrendered their right to private practice.
- (ii) Officers appointed after 1934 should be compelled to accept such allowance in lieu of private practice.
- (iii) The Harragin Commission should be asked to recommend a scale of pensionable allowances.

Sir Walter Harragin's Recommendation

444. Sir Walter Harragin in his Report, while condemning private practice in principle, left it to individual Governments to "make suitable arrangements to meet the new conditions", but recommended

that officers at present in service (without the post-1934 distinction) and entitled to private practice, should be offered the choice between being allowed to continue to possess this right, and of receiving by way of compensation in lieu an annual pensionable allowance of £100. Medical Officers of Health in receipt of Staff Pay at the rate of £150 non-pensionable, should be given the opportunity to convert to a pensionable allowance of £100 per annum.

Sir Sydney Phillipson's Enquiry and Report

445. Numerous practical difficulties were encountered in giving force to these recommendations and in 1948 Sir Sydney Phillipson was commissioned by the Governor of Nigeria to review the whole question and make recommendations regarding future policy and the most suitable means of giving effect thereto. His very full and admirable Report was published in 1949 and the relevant portions of his recommendations are reproduced in Appendix XV. In brief he recommended the abolition of all private practice for personal gain in Government Institutions in the case of officers appointed on or after 1st January 1934. Officers appointed before that date might retain their rights, or accept in lieu a compensatory non-pensionable allowance of £120 a year. Officers appointed after that date but before 17th January 1946, and not entitled to Staff Pay, should draw a compensatory non-pensionable allowance of £90 a year. Fees levied for professional services in Government Institutions should be on a prescribed scale, and credited to an official Medical Fund reserved solely for medical purposes; but fifty per cent. of fees prescribed for certain non-routine operations performed within Government Institutions should be paid to the officer who performed them. Officers should also be allowed to accept certain prescribed fees for consultations in cases referred to them by private practitioners. Private practice should, however, continue to be allowed outside public institutions, not as a right or privilege, but as a means of helping to meet a public need caused by the shortage of private practitioners. Staff Pay in the case of officers appointed before 17th January 1946 should be increased from £150 to £180 per year; but officers appointed on or after 17th January 1946 and employed on work (e.g. Health work) from which private practice was totally barred, should draw staff pay at £90 only. Non-pensionable compensatory allowances should only be drawn for the period of an officer's clinical service and cease when he was promoted to an administrative post or retired from active practice.

Nigerian Government's Conclusions on the Phillipson Report

446. The "Phillipson Report" was considered by the Nigerian Government and found to be generally acceptable with one important change. It was felt that if the abolition of private practice in public institutions was to be absolute and effective, the fifty per cent. fee for certain non-routine operations, and the consultation fees paid through private practitioners should not be allowed. To compensate for the rejection of these recommendations, and because Staff Pay rates had been fixed before 1914 and never amended, the following increases were suggested to the amounts recommended by Sir Sydney Phillipson:—

- (i) Non-pensionable compensatory allowance payable to officers appointed at *any time* before 17th January 1946 to be £200. (In the Report £120 was recommended for officers appointed before 1st January 1934 and £90 for those appointed thereafter but before 17th January 1946.)
- (ii) Staff Pay for officers appointed before 17th January 1946 at present £150 and recommended in the Report to be increased to £180, should be £300.
- (iii) Staff Pay for officers appointed on or after 17th January 1946 should be £100 and not £90 as recommended in the Report.

447. When these "conclusions" on the Report were submitted to the Nigerian Legislature for approval, they were first referred to a Select Committee of the Legislative Council which recommended that they be accepted, with the amendment that fees collected in Government Institutions should not be credited to a special Medical Fund, but to general Revenue.

Present Position in Nigeria

448. The recommendations contained in the "Phillipson Report", as amended by the Government Statement of Conclusions and by the Report of the Select Committee, were eventually accepted by the Nigerian Legislative Council for implementation with effect from 1st April 1951. As far as we are aware they now represent present practice in Nigeria.

**“ Injection ” Practice
and Dentists**

449. The “ Phillipson Report ” also contained recommendations relating to Injection Practice and to private practice by Dental Officers. As we received no evidence that irregular Injection practice was prevalent in the Gold Coast, and as the main principles accepted for governing private medical practice can be applied with suitable modifications to dentists, we have confined our observations to private medical practice.

**Position in the
Gold Coast**

450. As conditions under which Medical Officers serve in all the West African territories are for all practical purposes uniform, the Gold Coast Government was content to await the publication of the “ Phillipson Report ” before taking action in accordance with the suggestions contained in the Secretary of State’s despatch of 17th January 1946. In May 1950 the Executive Council of the Gold Coast Government considered the Phillipson Report and the Statement of Conclusions of the Nigerian Government (the Nigerian Select Committee had not yet been appointed) and advised that private practice should be abolished in terms of the Nigerian Government’s Conclusions, with a few important differences. Private practice should be abolished *outside* as well as inside public institutions, officers appointed before 1st January 1934 having the choice of retaining their rights of private practice or receiving a £300 non-pensionable compensatory allowance, the same allowance being paid to officers appointed on or after 1st January 1934 and before 17th January 1946 who were not eligible for Staff Pay. Medical Officers appointed on or after 17th January 1946 and before the 1st June 1950, and employed in posts carrying Staff Pay, should continue to draw Staff Pay at the existing rate of £150 a year during such employment. (The words in italics indicate departures from the practice adopted in Nigeria.) The Governor concurred in the views of the Executive Council and made Order accordingly.

451. In August 1950 the Standing Committee on Finance of the Legislative Council approved the expenditure of funds to implement the Governor’s Order but expressed the view that it was undesirable to credit professional fees to a Medical Fund instead of to general revenue. This accorded with the recommendation which was to be made some months later by the Select Committee and accepted by the Legislative Council in Nigeria.

452. The Governor’s Order was not in fact implemented. Difficulties of administrative detail were encountered ; the Report of the Select Committee in Nigeria was awaited ; a new Legislative Council under a new Constitution was elected, and it was agreed to await our recommendations on the subject which would be considered by the new Council.

**Abolition accepted in
principle**

453. We have thought it necessary to trace the history of this thorny question at some length to indicate the complications and difficulties inseparable from it, and the differences in major and minor details of treatment which have been suggested from time to time. We do not propose to set out in full the arguments for and against private practice. These have been extensively discussed in conferences and despatches over the last thirty years, and are clearly stated by Sir Sydney Phillipson in his Report. All authorities, including previous Commissions on the subject, the British Medical Association, who conveyed their views to us, and most of the practising Medical Officers in the Gold Coast, agree that private practice is wrong in principle and should be abolished. We accept this conclusion. The problem as we see it can therefore be stated in the following terms :—

(i) Is the present time ripe for the abolition of private practice in the Gold Coast?

(ii) If the time is ripe :

(a) Should the methods adopted in Nigeria mainly on the advice of Sir Sydney Phillipson be followed in the Gold Coast ;

or (b) Should these methods be modified in any details to suit Gold Coast conditions, e.g. as advised by Executive Council in May 1950 ;

or (c) Should entirely new methods be devised?

**Difficulties and
dangers of abolition**

454. As regards the suitability of the present time, it was pointed out to us that the Medical Service in the Gold Coast was at present understaffed and recruitment was difficult. Private practice was one

of the attractions of the Service and if it was abolished, not only would it be difficult to recruit more doctors, but many doctors already in the Service would retire and set up practice on their own. We considered that too much weight should not be given to these arguments, as, taking the long view, a doctor is a doctor whether in Government Service or not. A reduction in the number of official doctors would thus be compensated to a certain extent by an increase in the number of private doctors though such an increase would tend to be concentrated in the richer to the neglect of the poorer areas where the need for doctors might be more urgent. We understand, however, that the facilities placed by Government at the disposal of official doctors, and the prestige they enjoy, are no mean factors in attracting men to the Service and keeping them there. The question of the recruitment of such expatriate doctors who are still required presents a more serious though not insuperable difficulty. All doctors cannot rely on substantial private practice; but the new salaries and conditions of service which we recommend will apply to all doctors recruited in future, and should, we hope, prove sufficiently attractive.

454. A more serious objection to immediate abolition is the possible reduction in actual services rendered by the few Medical Officers stationed in districts to the large populations in their charge. We discussed this problem with an officer in charge of an area with a population of 80,000. We understand that his case was in no way exceptional in a country of over 4,000,000 inhabitants with only 138 registered medical practitioners, 21 of whom work for Mining companies and seven are not engaged in clinical medicine. He told us that apart from the public hospitals and dispensaries in his charge, he had set up dispensaries of his own at various centres, where patients might come to consult him on a fee-paying basis. If all incentives to building up a lucrative private practice were removed, we do not suggest that Medical Officers would neglect their duty to the people in their charge, but it would not be natural to expect them in every case to show quite the same enthusiasm in going outside fixed Government stations and at considerable personal inconvenience, bringing their medical skill to the assistance of large numbers of the population who could not easily find their way to public institutions. We think it only fair to state that in certain remote and extensive districts in the Northern Territories where, owing to the poverty of the inhabitants, there is little or no private practice, we met Medical Officers who showed the greatest keenness in their work, and arranged long and tiring "trek" programmes which they regularly carried out. We consider that in any scheme for the abolition of private practice at the present time, it will be necessary to take cognisance of this objection and devise means to meet it.

Recommendations

456. While we realise that the present is not the happiest time to introduce a radical change in the conditions of service for Medical Officers in the Gold Coast, we think that on balance of arguments it would be difficult to justify further postponement of the adoption of a principle which has generally been accepted not only by Government but by the British Medical Association and the general consensus of opinion among Government Medical Officers in the Gold Coast. Major changes in conditions of service are most easily made in conjunction with improvements in the salaries of those affected; if our recommendations on salaries are accepted, it would be unfortunate if the opportunity to adjust the private practice position was not seized, especially as the neighbouring Colony of Nigeria has already taken the initiative in the matter without the advantages offered by the coincidence of a salary revision. But though in these circumstances we consider the time is not entirely unsuitable for the abolition of private practice, we do not feel that it is ripe for a complete and drastic changeover, even to the extent to which it has been carried in Nigeria. We therefore recommend that a start be made in giving effect to the accepted principles, and that a partial abolition of private practice should be undertaken on the lines suggested in the following paragraphs.

457. Although general conditions in the Gold Coast are by no means identical with those in Nigeria, it is generally admitted that a considerable degree of uniformity has always existed in the terms of medical service in the two Colonies. It is for this reason that the Gold Coast Government before taking action decided to await the results of the Phillipson Commission. This is mentioned in paragraph 7(b) of the Phillipson Report. The thoroughness and extent of Sir Sydney Phillipson's investigation before he felt in a position to make his recommendations, and

the care with which these recommendations were subsequently sifted by all concerned, have convinced us that it would be presumption for us in the limited time which we can devote to this single item under our terms of reference, to attempt to devise an entirely new method of tackling the problem. We therefore suggest that a start should be made in abolishing private practice in the Gold Coast on the lines recommended by Sir Sydney Phillipson, but modified to the extent we indicate to meet the peculiar conditions of the Gold Coast :—

- (i) *Subject to certain provisos and exceptions set out below, private practice should be abolished in all public institutions.*

(NOTE.—We consider it one of the more objectionable features of the present system that Medical Officers generally should be allowed to use for their private gain official places of business and equipment provided by Government. The mere fact that it is condoned in the case of senior staff makes it difficult to prevent junior unqualified officers and employees levying toll.)

- (ii) Surgical Specialists should be allowed to retain half the fees charged for all surgical operations they perform inside Government Institutions, the other half being paid to Government.

(NOTE.—This concession is essential to our proposal that private practice should be abolished by degrees. As long as there are practically no private operating theatres, the surgeon can have no private practice outside Government Institutions. A fee in such cases seems a more appropriate reward than a compensating allowance, but it is only fair that the surgeon should recognise the fact that his salary comes from Public Funds and he is using public buildings and material, by contributing half the fee to public revenue.)

We consider that the question of what fees should be charged on each occasion and how they should be credited is not strictly within our terms of reference.

- (iii) Government Medical Officers should be allowed to retain in full fees for consultations referred to them by private practitioners.

(NOTE.—There is no element here of competition with private practitioners. Such consultations are essentially personal, and a tribute to an individual's special skill and experience. We think it reasonable that when a Medical Officer is so consulted he should be allowed to accept a fee.)

- (iv) Government Medical Officers should continue to be allowed to charge fees for domiciliary visits.

(NOTE.—In paragraph 455 we have already dealt with the need for some such concession as long as Medical Officers are placed in charge of districts where there are more people than they can possibly be expected to attend to in the time at their disposal. We were at first inclined to recommend that "domiciliary" should be interpreted in its strictest sense, but we were impressed by two contrary arguments, (a) in many districts individual houses are quite unfit places in which to form a proper diagnosis or treat patients, and (b) as it is often quite impracticable for a Medical Officer to visit regularly every village in his district, the obvious solution is for him to have various centres to which patients can be brought. Treatment at such centres should be regarded as domiciliary visits. It is strictly the duty of Government, either Central or Local, to provide these centres, but until this can be done, it is in the general interest that some incentive should be given to Medical Officers to provide their own visiting centres. As the number of Public dispensaries increase, so will the incidence of this form of private practice diminish.)

- (v) Government Medical Officers appointed before 1st January 1934 should be given the choice to retain their existing conditions of service in regard to private practice, or to surrender them and accept the new rates of pay and conditions, including the non-pensionable compensatory allowance recommended at (vi) below.

(NOTE.—These officers joined the Service before Regulation 7 of the Regulations governing the new Unified Colonial Medical Service made it clear that no officer was entitled as of right to practise on his own account, and this concession has been generally accepted by the various authorities concerned. We suggest, however, that it should be made clear that officers cannot both elect to go on to the new rates of pay we recommend, and also retain their existing rights of private practice. It seems to us a fair assumption that if an officer is

earning sufficient total emoluments (and reckons he will continue to do so) to make him decide not to accept the new conditions including improved pay and the reasonably generous compensation we recommend, there should be no need to increase his official salary.)

- (vi) A compensatory non-pensionable allowance of £300 per annum should be paid to all Government Medical Officers holding clinical but not staff posts and who were appointed to the Service prior to the date when the Legislature takes a decision on our Commission's proposals, provided, in the case of officers appointed before the 1st January 1934, they have not elected to retain their existing conditions of service.

(NOTE.—We were unable to obtain any authoritative statement on the monetary value of private practice to individual doctors but on what evidence we could collect we consider that £300 is fairer compensation for the partial loss of private practice in the Gold Coast than the £200 figure accepted in Nigeria.)

We have abandoned the distinction made between officers appointed before and after 17th January 1946, the date of the Secretary of State's Despatch announcing his decision to inform future recruits to the Service that they would not enjoy private practice. As we have shown, no practical steps were taken to give effect to this decision, and the distinction is particularly invidious in view of the fact that in several cases, war service prevented doctors from joining the Colonial Service till after the 17th January 1946, though they would otherwise have done so.

We have chosen as the operative date, the date of the acceptance of our recommendations both because we have seen how unreal more specific dates tend to become as a result of delays and postponements, and because this date should ensure that officers recruited on terms forbidding private practice should also be recruited on the improved salary terms we suggest.

We agree with Sir Sydney Phillipson and the Nigerian Government that officers holding administrative posts and not engaged in active health or clinical practice should not be eligible for compensation. It may be observed that an officer on the maximum of the new scale who was appointed Assistant Director of Medical Services and thereby forfeited his compensatory allowance, would actually lose in gross remuneration. His pensionable emoluments would, however, be substantially increased and we consider that the post of Assistant Director of Medical Services, as a post in which officers are tried for higher administrative promotion, should not necessarily be filled by a doctor on the top of his scale, and should normally be looked upon as a stepping stone to higher appointment.)

- (vii) Staff Pay to Medical Officers of Health appointed to the Service prior to the date on which the Legislature takes a decision on our Commission's proposals, should be increased from the present £150 to £300 per annum. Officers appointed to Health Service and analogous posts after that date and who are unable to enjoy any of the concessions we recommend should, during such employment, be paid Staff Pay at the rate of £150 per annum for such time as these concessions continue to be in force.

(NOTE.—We understand it is medical policy to place as much emphasis on the Health as on the Curative side of medical work. In the circumstances it is reasonable that Staff Pay and the compensating allowance we recommend should be equal, and that officers who are appointed in future to the Health Services and cannot share in the limited private practice concession still allowed should also receive some compensation.)

- (viii) Such limited private practice as is still allowed should be regarded as a concession and not a right. It should be clearly understood that it is eventually intended to abolish all private practice for Government Medical Officers when the medical services in the country, both private and public, have so developed in extent and availability as to make this practicable.

458. We wish to point out that the last paragraph contains merely a synopsis of the principles which we recommend should be adopted in framing regulations governing private practice in future. Sir Sydney Phillipson, who was commissioned to report on this one subject, has stated his recommendations much more comprehensively. We have reproduced them in Appendix XV and we suggest that our recommendations should be used in modification and amplification of his

in framing the Gold Coast scheme. We note the following extract from paragraph 49 of the Phillipson Report :—

“ These recommendations have not been worked out in their last detail because it is clearly desirable that decisions should be taken on issues of principle before time and energy are spent in working out their detailed application.”

459. We suggest that a senior officer of the Medical Department and an officer of the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office should be given the task of working out the scheme in detail before it is published and put into practice. We advise that one or more representatives of the doctors affected should be associated with this working party.

**Supplies of Drugs
and Equipment**

460. A factor in the discontinuance of private practice to which we feel obliged to draw special attention is the need to augment the supplies of drugs and equipment to Government Hospitals. We

understand that Medical Officers make substantial purchases of supplies of drugs and equipment for their private practice. If private practice is discontinued these supplies must be provided by the Government. We have, however, heard at various stations convincing evidence of the inadequacy of the Medical Department stores organisation. At present many Medical Officers are prepared to make good deficiencies in official supplies from their own pockets, but it is unlikely that they will continue to do so if they are denied the privilege of charging private fees. If therefore the public is to continue to have medical services on the same scale as at present—and any reduction in the present scale is, of course, not to be contemplated—it is essential that steps should be taken well in advance of the abolition of private practice to ensure that all Government Hospitals are adequately stocked with drugs and equipment and that supplies can be maintained through official channels.

MISCELLANEOUS DEPARTMENTS

Explanations

461. In earlier Chapters we have dealt mainly with matters of broad principle and have touched on the detailed application of principles only by way of example. We have, however, specific recommendations to make on matters of detail, such as the grading of individual posts, affecting certain Departments. These recommendations will be found in this Chapter under the appropriate departmental heading. We emphasise that we do not propose to undertake a comprehensive review of the functions of, or the posts in all Departments, but merely to deal with points of peculiar difficulty or on which we received special evidence. We also take the opportunity to give some examples of the application of the general structure we recommend to specific departments.

462. We append at this point for convenience, a schedule of salaries, of posts (Administrative, Executive, Clerical and sub-clerical) common to a number of Departments. Following that schedule, we attach notes on three subjects of common concern to a number of Departments :—

- (i) Professional qualifications of Engineers.
 - (ii) Grading of Draughtsmen and Surveyors.
 - (iii) Grading of tradesmen, artisans, apprentices, industrial workers and unestablished staff.
- We then proceed to deal with individual Departments *seriatim*. We have graded in some detail the Posts and Telegraphs Department and the Railway and Harbour Administration. The other Departments have been dealt with less thoroughly but we trust sufficiently so to enable the grading team to apply the principles that we have in mind.

POSTS COMMON TO A NUMBER OF DEPARTMENTS

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
<i>Administrative Class :</i>	
Principal Assistant Secretary ..	£1600
Assistant Chief Commissioner ..	Ditto
Senior Assistant Secretary ..	£1250 × £50—£1350
Senior Administrative Officer ..	Ditto
Administrative Officer	£900 × £40—£1180
Assistant Secretary	Ditto
Assistant Administrative Officer ..	£550 × £30—£850
<i>Executive Class :</i>	
Higher Executive Officer	£370 × £20—£450 × £25—£500
Executive Officer	£200 × £15—£350
<i>Clerical Class :</i>	
Higher Clerical Officer	£290 × £15—£350
Clerical Officer	£120 × £10—£270
<i>Sub-Clerical Class, Typists, etc. :</i>	
Clerical Assistant	£90 × £5—£120 × £6—£144
*Typist	£95 × £5—£120 ; £126 × £6—£144
*Shorthand Typist	£120 × £6—£144 ; £152 × £8—£200
Supervisor of Shorthand Typists ..	£210 × £10—£270
†Stenographer/Secretary	£200 × £15—£350
Machine Assistant	£90 × £5—£120 × £6—£144
Machine Operator	£120 × £6—£144 × £8—£200
Senior Machine Operator	£210 × £10—£270

* Allowance of £1 a month payable when undertaking supervisory duties.

† Plus allowance of £4 a month.

Engineering Services

463. We regard the following as full professional qualifications for Engineering Services :—

- Associate Membership of the Institution of Civil Engineers ;
- Associate Membership of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers ;
- Associate Membership of the Institution of Electrical Engineers.

464. We are aware that there is some controversy in the Gold Coast as to whether membership of other bodies such as the British Institute of Radio Engineers and the Institute of Road Transport Engineers, should be regarded as full professional qualifications. At present they are not and we do not propose to enter into the controversy. If at some future date other qualifications are recognised as constituting full professional engineering qualifications the professional scales will apply to the posts requiring these qualifications. In the meantime we accept the present position.

465. The posts for which full professional engineering qualifications are normally required are as follows :—

- Railways* : Civil Engineer—A.M.I.C.E.
Mechanical Engineer—A.M.I.Mech.E.
Electrical Engineer—A.M.I.E.E.
- P.W.D.* : Executive Engineer—A.M.I.C.E.
Mechanical Engineer—A.M.I.Mech.E.
- Electricity* : Electrical Engineer—A.M.I.E.E.
- Post Office* : Engineer—A.M.I.E.E.
Wireless Engineer—A.M.I.E.E.
- Public Relations* : Broadcast Engineer—A.M.I.E.E.
- Mines* : Inspector of Machinery—A.M.I.Mech.E., A.M.I.E.E.
- Labour* : Factory Inspector—A.M.I.Mech.E.
- Rural Water Development* : Engineer—A.M.I.C.E.
Workshop Superintendent—A.M.I.Mech.E.
- Housing* : Executive Engineer—A.M.I.C.E.

Special knowledge or experience of certain aspects of the Department's work is also a normal requirement. For certain posts alternative qualifications are accepted. For example, the Housing Department will accept Architects (A.R.I.B.A.) in place of Engineers, and the Director of Rural Water Development is prepared to accept a candidate with no professional qualifications as a Workshop Superintendent if he cannot recruit a fully qualified Engineer. We welcome these signs of flexibility in recruiting policy but we can only prescribe salary classifications and gradings for the normal qualifications. Any variations from the normal will have to be dealt with on an *ad hoc* basis.

466. We understand that it has been the practice for candidates to be accepted for appointment to certain engineering posts without the full A.M.I.C.E., A.M.I.E.E., or A.M.I.Mech.E. qualifications if they possess a degree or diploma which gives exemption from Sections A and B of the Institutions' examination, together with a period of practical experience. This subject is dealt with in the Secretary of State's Circular Despatch of the 7th April 1950, on the Colonial Engineering Service. Since Section C of these examinations is based almost entirely on practical experience we see no objection to this system, but, in order to ensure that the professional standards of the Technical Institutions are maintained in the Gold Coast engineering posts, we recommend that officers promoted to the grade starting on £900 should normally be required to hold full professional qualifications.

467. The recently approved arrangement for the appointment of Pupil Engineers is an extension of the above system and one which we approve. Under this arrangement candidates can be appointed as Pupils or Cadets as soon as they have passed Sections A and B of the relevant Institutions' examination or have obtained an Engineering degree giving exemption from these sections.

468. We recommend that candidates with exemption from Sections A and B of the relevant Institutions' examination should be eligible for appointment as Assistant Engineer on the initial salary in the scale £550 × £30–£850, and in addition, should be eligible for incremental credit for each year of practical experience after obtaining the minimum qualifications. Promotion to the post of Engineer (£900 × £40–£1180) should normally be dependent on possession of Associate Membership of the relevant Institution and Assistant Engineers who have been confirmed in their appointments should be eligible at any time for promotion to that post. The Engineer grade is true basic duty grade of this class and should carry normal leave, etc., reliefs.

Draughtsmen and Surveyors

469. These titles are extensively used throughout the Service with wide variations in meaning. A Draughtsman may be a mere tracer or drawing office assistant or a highly skilled technical officer. This lack of precise definition of titles is confusing and not infrequently leads to grading injustices. We have recommended salary scales for Draughtsmen and Surveyors in the Survey Department and we recommend that standard qualifications be prescribed for each grade. Departments should then employ the grade equivalent to their needs. Employees in drawing offices or engaged in survey type work who do not possess the qualifications of the lowest grade we recommend, should be paid on daily rates and should not be designated Draughtsmen or Surveyors.

Tradesmen, Artisans, Apprentices, Industrial Workers, and Unestablished Staff

470. We have commented earlier in this Report on the need for establishing apprenticeship schemes in all Departments employing what we describe as industrial workers. These apprenticeship schemes should be designed to produce Artisans trained both in the practice and theory of their trades who can look forward to a career of progress through various grades of responsibility until they reach the post of Inspector or Chief Inspector of Works. One of the most discouraging features of the present staffing situation in Government Departments is the relatively small number of technical posts such as Inspectors of Works or Works Foremen which are filled by Africans. This position has, in our opinion, two major causes :—

- (i) The almost complete absence of formal apprenticeship schemes for the basic training of Artisans.
- (ii) The low basic educational qualifications of African Artisan type employees.

The removal of the first cause should be one of the first tasks of the Director of Recruitment and Training, and the increased educational facilities in the country should automatically remove the second cause. It only remains for us to prescribe rates of remuneration which will attract suitable candidates and provide an adequate career for them.

471. We recommend that the normal period of apprenticeship to qualify as a trained Artisan should be five years*, and that during apprenticeship the following rates of pay should apply :—

1st year ..	4s. 6d. a day	3rd year ..	6s. 0d. a day	5th year ..	7s. 0d. a day
2nd year ..	5s. 0d. a day	4th year ..	6s. 6d. a day		

On the successful completion of apprenticeship the apprentice should graduate as an Artisan Grade II. We recommend the following salary scales for fully qualified Artisans :—

Artisan Grade II	£120 × £8–£200
Artisan Grade I	£210 × £10–£250
Leading Artisan	£260 × £10–£290
Chargeman Grade II	£300 × £15–£350
Chargemen Grade I	£370 × £20–£450 × £25–£500
Inspector of Works and above ..	£550 × £25–£700 etc.

472. After five years service from completion of apprenticeship an Artisan Grade II should be eligible to sit a trade test to qualify for appointment as an Artisan Grade I. Under the present system appointment to Artisan Grade I will depend on the occurrence of a vacancy but the establishments should be so adjusted that an Artisan who has qualified for a Grade I appointment

* The apprenticeship scheme may have to be modified during the next few years to accommodate pupils following the present curriculum in the Government Technical School, Takoradi, which is to be discontinued.

should not normally have to climb to the top of Grade II before being promoted into Grade I. Trade tests may have to be conducted departmentally in the first instance but special measures should be taken to ensure uniformity of standards as between Departments and between different trades. The tests should not be formalities but should be designed to ascertain whether the candidate is fully trained in all branches of his trade and has improved his skill by the experience acquired since completing his apprenticeship. An Artisan Grade I should be an experienced tradesman able to undertake intricate and specialised work in his trade.

473. Artisan Grades I and II should be engaged full time in the exercise of their trade and should not normally have any supervisory or training responsibilities. The Leading Artisan should normally have some supervisory responsibility and may be required to direct and train apprentices. A Leading Artisan should have qualified as an Artisan Grade I, and, although he may be the leader of a gang of Artisans and Labourers engaged on a particular task, he is himself a working Artisan. In certain circumstances it may be desirable to create posts of Leading Artisan for work requiring a degree of skill, precision and responsibility above that normally undertaken by Artisans Grade I.

474. The Chargeman grade exists mainly in the Railway Administration. It is particularly suited to the Railway Workshops where differing degrees of supervisory responsibility can be defined without undue difficulty. We consider however that such a grade can with advantage be created in most "industrial" Departments. The Chargeman should be in charge of a particular section of work and should have under him a team which may include Leading Artisans, Artisans, sub-clerical staff, and Labourers. The majority of Artisans under the control of a Chargeman would normally be of the same trade. The creation of posts of Chargeman (or Junior Foreman) in Departments such as the Public Works, Electricity, Transport, Housing and Rural Water Development, would give African Artisans training and experience in the assumption of responsibility, and give them an opportunity to prove their fitness for eventual promotion to the post of Inspector. At the same time, as we have remarked in paragraph 388, the creation of additional supervisory posts is justified in the interests of efficiency.

475. We have recommended two grades of Chargeman, the distinction being the size of the organisation or the operation for which the Chargeman is responsible. A Chargeman Grade I may or may not, according to the nature of the operation or organisation, have Chargeman Grade II under his control. The question of the cadre of Chagemen posts is one for consideration by Heads of Departments in the light of the needs of the Department.

476. The arrangements which we have outlined above clearly cannot apply to all trades. Some trades may not justify such a hierarchy of posts, but these arrangements can and should apply to all trades for which there are at present "senior service" posts such as Inspectors of Works and Foremen of Works. They should also apply *mutatis mutandis* to the Printing Department. The details of their application should be worked out by the Heads of Departments concerned, with the assistance and advice of the grading team. The trades in the Railway Administration to which we apply this organisation of Artisans based on a formal apprenticeship, are Carpenters, Masons, Boilermakers, Moulders, Coppermiths, Fitters (Mechanical, Electrical and Marine), Turners, Machinists and Blacksmiths, and in this connection we invite attention to the details of the Railway apprenticeship scheme set out in paragraph 18(c) of Chapter II of the Railway Staff Manual. There are four trades classed by the Railways in their evidence to us as Artisans but for which no apprenticeship scheme as yet exists, viz., Patternmakers, Welders, Wiremen and Upholsterers. If these trades are properly classed in the Artisan group no doubt consideration will be given to the matter. Meanwhile we allocate the Artisan rates of pay to these groups. There are three other Railway Trades included by the Railways in the Artisan group, which while not up to the full Artisan classification, rank distinctly before the skilled labour group in view of the special skill required by their work, viz., Signwriters, Sawyers and Steam Crane Drivers. To them we allocate a special scale, viz., £120 × £6-£144 × £8-£200.

477. We are aware that many Artisans, Leading Artisans, and a number of Chagemen at present in the Service have not served a formal apprenticeship and that some of them are not sufficiently literate to write reports or to read intricate charts, plans and blueprints. These officers must be

allowed to retain their existing privileges but we cannot emphasise too strongly that the scales we recommend are intended for Artisans who have a basic education at least to Standard VII level, have served a formal apprenticeship in both theory and practice of their trades, and are able to write reports and read intricate charts.

478. We judge from the differences in salary scales applied to the same trades in different Departments that designations such as "Blacksmith", "Carpenter" and "Mason" are at present used without precise definition. In the Agricultural Department for example, Blacksmiths are on scale K2 as compared with scale L1,2 in the Public Works Department. We assume that the Agricultural Department's needs are met by a semi-skilled labourer but the present system of naming every employee who uses a hammer a Blacksmith, is liable to lead to confusion and should be discontinued. The titles Blacksmith, Carpenter, etc., should be reserved for Artisans who have passed through a formal apprenticeship and satisfied prescribed trade tests. Employees who are at present on 'K' scales should in general be classified as semi-skilled or skilled labour irrespective of their present designations.

479. We have recommended in paragraphs 241-242 that, with certain exceptions (see paragraphs 162 and 485) and subject to bonus additions (see paragraph 242) semi-skilled and skilled labour should be paid fixed daily rates within a range from 4s. 6d. a day to 10s. a day—subject to the right of serving officers to opt to retain their existing terms (see paragraphs 161 and 315-317). In "semi-skilled and skilled labour" we include employees at present on 'K' scales and in Departments other than the Railways, a number of employees on scales L1 and L2 who do not fall within the class of Artisan described above. A number of the L1,2 grades appear to us to be more properly classified as sub-clerical rather than industrial, and, in so far as this is the case, their grading will be a matter for consideration by the grading team. These 'K' and 'L' groups are listed in Appendix V of the Annual Estimates of Expenditure for the Colony 1951-52, and in the Schedule to the Railway Administration Estimates 1951-52. This class will mainly consist of employees who have started work as unskilled labourers but who have acquired a degree of skill or dexterity at a particular operation demanding intelligence or responsibility above that required of an ordinary labourer. A Chainman in a Survey gang is a good example of this type of "semi-skilled" work. Use should also be made of this range of rates of pay to recognise work which while of an unskilled nature is either unpleasant or unusually heavy, e.g., conservancy labourers and coalmen. It is within this range too that rates should be fixed for work which involves constant travelling (*vide* paragraph 294).

480. We do not propose to set out in full detail all the posts which we consider to fall into this category. With the assistance of the grading team and in consultation with the employees' representatives, Heads of Departments should not find it too difficult to classify posts in their own Departments. We have, however, made a particular study of the Railway Administration and by way of example we show the conclusions we reach below:—

Post	Present salary scale plus temporary allowance	Daily rate to be fixed between
Crossing Keepers	£50-£58	
Carriage Cleaners	£62-£77	
Launch Deckhand	do.	
Lighter Deckhand	do.	4s. 6d.
Engine Cleaners	do.	(approx. £71 per annum)
Boatmen	do.	and 5s. 6d.
Pointsmen	do.	(approx. £86 per annum)
Porters	do.	plus merit bonuses up to
Trolleyman	do.	a maximum of say 20%
Coalmen	do.	of the rate for the job.
Call Boys	£50-£77	
Resthouse Cleaners	do.	
Watchmen	do.	

<i>Post</i>	<i>Present salary scale plus temporary allowance</i>	<i>Daily rate to be fixed between</i>
Chainmen	£50-£101	
Messengers	do.	
Storemen	do.	
Coach Attendants	£62-£101	4s. 6d.
Concreters	do.	(approx. £71 per annum)
Crane Firemen	do.	and 7s.
Head Trolley-men	do.	(approx. £110 per annum)
Riggers	do.	plus merit bonuses up to
Blacksmith Strikers	do.	a maximum of say 20%
Trackmen	do.	of the rate for the job.
Tug Deckhands	do.	
Boat Boatswain	£86-£101	
Divers Linesmen	do.	
Quartermasters	do.	
Shunters Class II	do.	

<i>Post</i>	<i>Present salary scale plus temporary allowance</i>	<i>Daily rate to be fixed between</i>
Boiler Washers	£62-£130	
Stationary Engine Drivers and Pumpmen	do.	
Quartermasters	£86-£130	5s. 6d.
Crane Drivers	do.	(approx. £86 per annum)
Firemen (Fire Service)	do.	and 9s.
Headmen	do.	(approx. £142 per annum)
Launch Boatswain	do.	plus merit bonuses up to
Locomotive Firemen	do.	say a maximum of 20%
Marine Firemen	do.	of the rate for the job.
Painters	do.	
Sub-gangers (Permanent way)	do.	
Head Porters	do.	
Sun Printer	£106-£130	

<i>Post</i>	<i>Present salary scale plus temporary allowance</i>	<i>Daily rate to be fixed between</i>
Tug Boatswain	£86-£144	
Resthouse Attendants	do.	
Storekeepers	do.	6s.
Signwriters	do.	(approx. £94 per annum)
Timekeepers	do.	and 10s.
Tracers	do.	(approx. £156 per annum)
Trimmers	do.	plus merit bonuses of say
Village Overseers	do.	a maximum of 20% of
Watermen	do.	the rate for the job.
Lorry Drivers	do.	
Leading Firemen (Fire Service)	£106-£144	(Note : This group would
Head Crane Drivers	do.	include industrial staff
Launch Drivers	do.	paid on L1,2 scales in
Loco Shedmen	do.	Departments other than
Gangers (Permanent way)	do.	the Railways.)
Rail Car Drivers	do.	
Shunters Class I	do.	

Post	Present salary scale plus temporary allowance	Daily rate to be fixed between
Checkers	£62-£144	4s. 6d.
Log Keepers	do.	(approx. £71 per annum and 10s.
Number Takers	do.	
Signalmen	do.	(approx. £156 per annum)

It should be possible to create two or more grades for these posts with different basic rates of pay plus an appropriate merit bonus.

481. Among this category the rates of remuneration should be fixed always on the basis of the value of the work in relation to that of the unskilled labourer. It should also be borne in mind that for a number of employees in this category the period spent on daily rates of pay is a period of training not entirely dissimilar to an apprenticeship, and wherever possible separate grades should be established to enable full advantage to be taken of increased knowledge and experience and to recognise increased responsibility.

482. Subject to this suggestion that wherever possible separate grades should be established within a range of daily pay laid down by us for the job, we envisage that within such range a definite daily rate shall be fixed for each occupation. This *basic* rate should not be increased except where it is possible to allocate such increased responsibility, e.g., training or supervisory responsibility, as will justify a higher rating. Over and above the basic rate we envisage, as recommended in paragraph 242, a system of merit bonuses in recognition of increased efficiency on the job.

483. We discuss in Appendix IX the factors to be taken into consideration in fixing the rate for each occupation within the range of daily pay laid down by us. We assume that after consideration of these factors Departments will initiate consultations with the Trades Unions concerned in order to arrive at an agreed rate for each occupation.

484. We have noted in the Railway Administration a number of "promotion" posts such as Head Crane Driver, Head Driver, and Senior Rail Car Driver. These posts do not carry any additional responsibility or heavier duties and in accordance with our principle that promotion should involve both increased pay and increased responsibility, we recommend the abolition of these posts.

485. We have indicated at paragraph 162 that there may be categories at present on 'K' scales who should properly remain within the Civil Service salary structure. One such post is that of Telephone Operator for which we have prescribed a salary scale of £70×£4-£90×£5-£115 within the Post Office framework. There are other such posts for which we have prescribed appropriate scales under the Departments concerned. Apart from these posts there should, however, be very few of such posts and it is with some diffidence that we prescribe a salary scale since it is not possible within the framework we recommend to produce scales which give benefits equivalent to those we recommend for daily rated staff. In view of this we suggest that the final decision regarding the classification of such posts as between "daily paid" or "salaried" should be left for negotiation with the Staff Association concerned. We recommend two general salary scales for this category of employee should they be required:—

- (i) £66×£4-£94 ;
- (ii) £100×£5-£120×£6-£144.

486. Within the categories we refer to as semi-skilled there are a number of posts such as Messenger, Caretaker, Crossing-keeper, etc., which require no particular attributes other than loyalty and integrity. These posts should, we consider, be filled as far as possible by the appointment of older men who are no longer capable of sustained physical effort.

PERMANENT STAFF OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

487. The question of the permanent staff required for the Executive Council and the Governor's Office was fully discussed by the Committee of Supply on the Annual Estimates of Expenditure

for 1951-52. The present arrangements including staffing and functions are clearly subject to alteration in the light of experience and we do not feel that we are in a position to make any helpful recommendations. We are convinced, however, that whatever the final shape of this office may be, the post of Secretary to the Executive Council and official Secretary to the Governor is one involving the highest responsibilities and calling for the highest administrative qualities. We regard it as the most senior Civil Service post of the Gold Coast and have graded it accordingly.

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
Secretary to the Executive Council	£2000
Administrative posts	As required
Executive posts	Ditto
Clerical posts	Ditto
Sub-clerical posts.. .. .	Ditto
Ancillary staff	Ditto

PERMANENT STAFF OF THE SPEAKER'S OFFICE

488. The Speaker of the Assembly who is, of course, not a civil servant, has under him a permanent staff of civil servants, led by the Clerk to the Assembly. We see no objection to this arrangement in present circumstances in the Gold Coast but it seems likely to us that at some future date the staff of the Speaker's Office will be provided for by a special Ordinance which will remove them from the Civil Service proper. In the meantime the Clerk to the Assembly seems to us to be in the peculiar position of being a civil servant in control of a team of civil servants and answerable neither to a Minister nor to a senior civil servant. This is clearly a delicate situation but in the present formative stage of the Government machine we do not consider that any useful purpose would be served by our making recommendations on the organisation of the Speaker's Office.

489. We consider that the Clerk to the Assembly is properly graded as an Administrative officer of the same grade as a Senior Assistant Secretary, *i.e.*, £1250-£1350. The Deputy Clerk, Assistant Clerk and the Recorder are, in our opinion, executive posts and should be graded within that class according to their duties and responsibilities. We have dealt earlier with the position of Legislative Assembly Reporters.

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
Clerk to the Assembly	£1250 × £50-£1350
Deputy Clerk	£550 × £25-£700
Recorder	£550 × £25-£700
Assistant Clerk	£370 × £20-£500
Reporter	£370 × £20-£500
Clerical posts	As required
Sub-clerical posts	Ditto
Ancillary staff	Ditto

AUDIT DEPARTMENT

490. The Audit Department does not come under the control of any Minister and the Director of Audit is responsible directly to the Governor for the audit of the Colony's accounts and for certifying the Annual Abstract Account and the Balance Sheet. The Director of Audit has also a direct responsibility to the Director-General of Colonial Audit in London. In these matters the Audit Department is in a different position from that of any other Department. This position does not, however, affect the nature of the duties of the Department which are, in our opinion, clearly executive. We do not in any way underestimate the importance of an efficient Audit Service or of attracting to that Service officers of high calibre and qualifications, but we cannot agree that audit work as a whole should be graded above executive work. The nature of audit work, however, which involves a greater degree of *individual* responsibility and initiative than in normal accounting work, justifies a greater proportion of senior posts than in general accounting.

491. We recommend the following gradings for the Audit Department :—

Director of Audit	£1600
Deputy	£1350
Principal Auditor	£1150 × £50—£1250
Senior Auditor	£1000 × £40—£1080
Auditor	£750 × £30—£960
Assistant Auditor	£550 × £25—£700
Higher Executive Officer (Audit)	£370 × £20—£500
Executive Officer (Audit)	£200 × £15—£350

492. We have outlined in paragraphs 104 to 108 the procedure for entry to the basic executive grade. The Director of Audit has, however, represented that there are special considerations in the Audit Department necessitating some modification of the normal procedure for the general executive class. The main work of the Department is essentially individual executive work and, though a number of sub-clerical posts will be required, there is not much scope for clerical officers. Moreover, because even at the lowest levels audit work is more than usually specialised, the system of direct entry to the basic executive grade is said to be unsuitable for this Department. We are prepared to accept these arguments and suggest that there should be an overall establishment in this Department for Executive Officers and Clerical Officers. All entrants will be classed as Clerical Officers on first appointment, and after confirmation in that appointment will be eligible to sit the limited competition for the Executive class, which will have a special section on audit work (see paragraph 108). On passing that examination they will be eligible for immediate appointment to the Executive class in the Audit Department. If they fail to qualify for appointment to the Executive class by the end of their fifth year in the Department, they should be transferred to another Department as Clerical officers and replaced by a new appointment.

493. The Director of Audit has stressed to us the need for officers in the higher ranks of the Department to have a University education. While we do not consider a University degree to be an essential qualification for appointment to the higher posts of the Audit Department, the qualifications accepted by the "Africanization Committee" for appointment to the Colonial Audit Service are as follows :—

"Candidates should have acquired a University Degree, preferably Honours, or should have qualified as an Accountant at the Institute of Chartered Accountants (England, Scotland and Ireland) or at the Society of Incorporated Accountants and Auditors, or at the Association of Certified and Corporate Accountants."*

There are obvious advantages in having a proportion of senior officers in the Audit Department with the above qualifications particularly at the present time when the Department is undertaking, to quote the Director of Audit, "educational work in the realms of finance and accounting connected with Local Authorities". Also, the rapid expansion of governmental activities will place a considerable strain on the accounting staffs of departments and necessitate the maintenance of an Audit Service of the highest calibre. For these reasons, and also to facilitate a more rapid Africanisation of the Department than would otherwise be possible, we consider that provision should be made for direct entry to the Audit Department of African University graduates at the Assistant Auditor level. To this end we recommend that candidates who fail to obtain an appointment in the Administrative Service through the open competition, should, if they are considered suitable by the Public Service Commission, be offered appointments as Assistant Auditors on the scale £550—£700. These appointments would be analogous to Assistant Administrative Officer and would be in the nature of cadet appointments. Appointments to the Audit Service by this method should not however be made in such numbers as to exclude the promotion to the higher ranks of the Service from the grade of Higher Executive Officer.

* Gold Coast Sessional Paper No. IV of 1950 Chapter VII, para. 7.

494. The Auditor grade (£750-£960) should be the basic grade in the higher ranks of the Department and should carry on its establishment leave and sickness reliefs for its own duty posts and those of higher grade posts.

495. Posts of Senior Auditor will be required for each Audit region and possibly for certain branches of audit work such as the Railway Administration. The Senior Auditors should be in direct executive charge of teams of Auditors, Assistant Auditors, and lower executive grades, and should be responsible under general control from headquarters (but with due regard to the principles of devolution of responsibility which we have outlined elsewhere) for the organisation and executive of Audit work within their Regions.

496. The posts of Principal Auditor, Deputy Auditor, and Director of Audit are headquarters posts.

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
Director of Audit	£1600
Deputy	£1350
Principal Auditor	£1150 × £50-£1250
Senior Auditor	£1000 × £40-£1080
Auditor	£750 × £30-£960
Assistant Auditor	£550 × £25-£700
Senior Examiner of Accounts	Ditto
Other Executive posts	As required
Clerical posts	Ditto
Sub-clerical posts	Ditto
Ancillary staff	Ditto

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

497. We have dealt with the Public Service Commission in Chapter V of our Report. We had some doubts whether the second rather than the third segment of the Administrative scale was not more appropriate for the post of Secretary, but have finally come to the conclusion that, in the formative stages at any rate, the need for an experienced officer on this work would justify the higher grading. We suggest that the question might be reviewed when the work of the Commission has settled down.

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
Chairman	£2000
Secretary	£1250 × £50-£1350
Executive posts	As required
Clerical posts	Ditto
Sub-clerical posts	Ditto
Ancillary staff	Ditto

SUPREME COURT

498. As mentioned in paragraph 3 we do not propose to deal in our Report with members of the Judiciary other than Magistrates whom we consider later in this Chapter together with other Legal Officers (see paragraphs 520-529). We deal here with the clerical and executive staff of the Supreme Court.

499. We explained in discussions with the Chief Registrar the distinction between Clerical and Executive work and he informed us that there is no work of an Executive character below the grade of Registrar to the District Magistrate's Court (Senior Assistant Registrar). He states "I must point out that the Department is not a large one and that the staff is split up into small

groups, *i.e.*, the Chief Registrar's Office, the Land Court Registry, and the various Divisional and District Magistrate's Court Registries. The average size of these groups is five or six persons. I do not consider it would be a satisfactory arrangement (even if it were practicable) for duties within these groups to be sub-divided in such a way as to make certain members non-interchangeable. The present arrangement is a flexible one whereby each member of the staff can be trained in all the duties which have to be performed and he must, in my view, be so trained in order to be of real value to the Department. Furthermore, a clerk will obviously be better qualified for promotion to the higher posts of Registrar or Assistant Registrar if he has a practical knowledge of the duties of those whose work he will be expected to supervise." In an interview, however, the Chief Registrar informed us that the present system of slow progression through the clerical grades does not provide the best training for appointments to posts of Court Registrar. We consider that provision to select promising candidates at an early stage in their career for duties of special responsibility with a view to training them for promotion to Registrar posts would result in a general improvement in the standard of Court Registrars, and we feel sure that such duties can be found in the Supreme Court below the grade of Registrar. As we can see no way in which the "slow progression through the clerical grades" of which the Chief Registrar complains can be remedied other than by the introduction of the Executive class into the Department, we recommend that the grading team referred to in our first Chapter should give special attention to this problem.

500. In the meantime, on the assumption that there is in fact executive work in the Supreme Court below the Registrar level, we recommend the following gradings :—

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
Assistant to the Chief Registrar	£550 × £25—£700
(Plus non-pensionable allowance of £100 per annum as personal secretary to the Chief Justice.)	
Court Registrars Grade I (Divisional Courts)	£550 × £25—£700
Court Registrars Grade II (District Magistrate's Courts)	£370 × £20—£500
Assistant Court Registrars	£200 × £15—£350

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE AND EXTERNAL AFFAIRS

501. We have stated the case for the creation of the new post of Chief Establishments Officer in paragraphs 23–29. The case for the creation of the new post of Director of Recruitment and Training which will absorb the duties of the existing post of Commissioner for Africanisation is stated in paragraph 336. Otherwise we have no comment to make on this Ministry.

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
Chief Secretary	£3000 (consolidated)
Secretary to Ministry of Defence and External Affairs	£1800
Special Commissioner (Industries)	£2000 or equivalent contract appointment
Chief Establishments Officer	£1800
Director of Recruitment and Training	£1600
Other Administrative posts	As required
Executive posts	Ditto
Clerical posts	Ditto
Sub-clerical posts	Ditto
Ancillary staff	Ditto

POLITICAL ADMINISTRATION

502. We dealt with the duties and functions of these officers in paragraphs 39–42 and 85–87 of our Report. In paragraph 87 we support Sir Sydney Phillipson's suggestion that the title "Political Administration" is no longer appropriate and should be replaced by the generic title

“Administrative Officer”. As a general title for this Division we suggest “Regional Administration”.

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
Chief Commissioner	£1900
Assistant Chief Commissioner	£1600
Senior District Commissioner	£1250 × £50–£1350
District Commissioner	£900 × £40–£1180
Assistant District Commissioner	£550 × £30–£850
Executive posts	As required
Clerical posts	Ditto
Sub-clerical posts	Ditto
Technical posts	Ditto
Sub-technical posts	Ditto
Ancillary staff	Ditto

POLICE DEPARTMENT

503. The duties of and qualifications required for the Police Force which are admirably set out in Chapter XXIV of the Supplement to the “Africanization Report”^{*} are clearly more closely allied to those of the executive and technical classes than to Administrative and Professional classes. We have graded the Department accordingly.

504. Considerable improvements were made to the salary scales of non-commissioned ranks of the Police (*i.e.*, up to and including Chief Inspector) in a revision which took effect from the 1st April 1949. The existing salary scales for these ranks are regarded by the Commissioner of Police as satisfactory and indeed, he told us in evidence that there have been cases of schoolmasters applying for entry to the Police Service. When considering the salary scales we recommend it should be borne in mind that the entry grade for Standard VII candidates is Constable Grade III with a starting salary of £110 per annum plus quarters and uniform. This compares favourably with the starting salary in any other career open to Standard VII schoolboys. The multiplicity of grades in the non-commissioned ranks should ensure that a career of rapid promotion on merit is open to keen and efficient recruits.

505. We had some doubts about the salary grading of the post of Chief Inspector. As mentioned in Chapter VII we have tried wherever possible to avoid overlapping salary scales within the same class. Since promotions from the ranks of the Inspectorate to Assistant Superintendent of Police can be expected to become the normal rather than the exception, it might appear that our grading of the post of Chief Inspector is at variance with the principles expressed in Chapter VII. We understand, however, that it is not uncommon in Police Forces and the Army for the rates of remuneration of the highest non-commissioned rank to overlap those of the lowest commissioned rank. We also consider that there is justification for a post of Chief Inspector on the salary we recommend. The post should normally be filled by promotion of Inspectors who either because of age or lack of basic educational qualifications are unlikely to be promoted to commissioned rank but who have acquired a full and detailed knowledge of all the processes of Police work at the Inspectorate level and whose knowledge and experience will be of value not only in the day-to-day execution of Police duties but also in giving training and advice to younger Inspectors and other non-commissioned ranks.

506. As more Africans of secondary school education become available, the commissioned ranks of the Police will tend to be filled more and more by promotion from the Inspectorate grade, but it would be a mistake to attempt to fill these posts by promotion from within the Force until candidates qualified in all respects are available. Police work is no longer a simple matter of maintaining law and order by beat patrols and directing traffic. It requires specialists in a wide variety of branches from motor traffic control to the use of scientific aids for the detection of crime. The Gold Coast has made some progress, particularly in recent years in the introduction of modern Police techniques, but it is still a long way behind in the struggle to provide the public of the Gold Coast with protection against wrongdoers. It would be a pity if at this stage the higher ranks of the Force were to be diluted by the appointment of officers who had not had the

^{*} Gold Coast Sessional Paper No. IV of 1950.

benefit of full training and experience in modern Police methods. To some extent this training can be obtained by sending promising Inspectors and lower ranks for courses in the United Kingdom, but until sufficient numbers of African non-commissioned officers with the basic secondary school education necessary to enable them to take full advantage of those courses are available we consider that it will still be necessary to make appointments to the Gold Coast Police of expatriates with suitable training and experience at the rank of Assistant Superintendent and above. Only by so doing can the Gold Coast Police be kept in touch with developments in organisation and technique in more modern and better equipped Police Forces.

507. It will be observed that we have introduced a new post of Senior Superintendent of Police. This grade already exists in Nigeria and we consider that there is a good case for its introduction in the Gold Coast on the abolition of the present long scale. There are at present 15 Superintendent posts as follows :—

Staff Officer.	Northern Territories.
C.I.D.	Motor Traffic (Colony).
Mobile Force.	Wireless (Headquarters).
Accra.	Special Branch.
o/c Western Province.	Sekondi.
o/c Eastern Province.	Kumasi.
o/c Central Province.	Transvolta.
Ashanti.	

We consider that the Police Officers in charge of the three Colony provinces, Ashanti and the Northern Territories and Accra, should be of the rank of Senior Superintendent. The special responsibilities of the officers in charge of the C.I.D. and the Special Branch, would also seem to warrant the new rank. We have no recommendation to make on the other posts, the grading of which should be settled by the Commissioner of Police and the Establishments branch of the Chief Secretary's Office.

508. We have graded the Commissioner of Police above the generality of Heads of Departments because we consider that as the officer executive responsible for the maintenance of law and order throughout the territory he has a degree of responsibility in present circumstances above that of most Heads of Departments. This grading is reflected in that of the Deputy, but below that level we have graded posts on the usual executive scales.

<i>Post</i>	<i>Salary</i>
Commissioner of Police	£1650
Deputy Commissioner	£1400
Assistant Commissioner	£1150 × £50—£1250
Senior Superintendent	£1000 × £40—£1080
Superintendent	£750 × £30—£960
Assistant Superintendent	£550 × £25—£700
Bandmaster	£550 × £25—£700
Paymaster	£550 × £25—£700
Quartermaster	£550 × £25—£700
Chief Inspector	£525 × £25—£600
Inspector Grade I	£425 × £25—£500
Inspector Grade II	£310 × £15—£370 × £20—£410
Sub-Inspector	£270 × £10—£300
Sergeant-Major	£280
Sergeant	£225 × £10—£265
Corporal	£185 × £10—£215
Constable Class I	£160 × £8—£176
Constable Class II	£136 × £6—£154
Constable Class III	£110 × £5—£130
Constable IV	£90 × £4—£106
Recruits	£80
Telephonists	Scales as fixed for General Post Office.