

**AN ASSESSMENT OF LIBERAL DEMOCRACY IN THE
SOCIO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF AFRICAN
STATES: CASE STUDY OF GHANA AND BOTSWANA**

BY
FRANCISCA OFOLIWAH SABBAH
(10377066)

**THIS DISSERTATION IS SUBMITTED TO THE
UNIVERSITY OF GHANA, LEGON, IN PARTIAL
FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
AWARD OF THE MASTER OF ARTS DEGREE IN
INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS**

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this dissertation is the result of an original research conducted by me under the supervision of Dr. Afua Boatema Yakohene. All sources referred to in the study have been acknowledged and that no part has been submitted anywhere else for any other purpose. `

.....
FRANCISCA O. SABBAH
(STUDENT)

.....
DR. AFUA B. YAKOHENE
(SUPERVISOR)

DATE.....

DATE.....

DEDICATION

I dedicate this work to my parents, Mr. David N. Sabbah and Mrs. Augustina A. Sabbah (late) and my sister Eugenia K. Sabbah for their patience, love, and words of encouragement, prayers and support.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my profound thanks and gratitude to God Almighty for His abundant grace and provision throughout this course of study.

This work has been an immense success with the help of so many people without whom I could not have come this far.

I first thank my able supervisor, Dr. Afua Boatemaa Yakohene, who was not only my supervisor but also my mother and confidante throughout this work and even my entire stay at LECIAD.

I would also like to thank Dr. Philip Attuquayefio, Dr. Ken Ahorsu, Dr. Yao Boni Gebe and Mr. Osei Baffour Frimpong for the guidance and instruction that has guided me throughout this dissertation and course of study

I am also grateful for the lives of all my family members for their sound words of encouragement, prayer and support in all forms during this period of my life.

I am indebted to Mr. Daniel Odoi and Ms. Juliana Abokuma Edzii who encouraged me to stay confident and believed in me through to the end.

To all my friends, classmates, experts and interviewees who helped me in different ways to accomplish this work, I appreciate all your support and assistance and I am eternally grateful to you all.

GOD BLESS YOU ALL!!!

ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS	-	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
BDP	-	Botswana Democratic Party
CHPS	-	Community-based Health Planning and Services
CPP	-	Convention People's Party
EFA	-	Education for All
ETSSP	-	Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan
GNP	-	Gross National Product
HIV	-	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
MoH	-	Ministry of Health
NHP	-	National Health Policy
NLC	-	National Liberation Council
NYEP	-	National Youth Employment Program
PNDC	-	Provisional National Defense Council
PNP	-	People's National Party
WHO	-	World Health Organization

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	i
DEDICATION	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	iii
ABBREVIATIONS	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	vi
LIST OF TABLES	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	ix
ABSTRACT	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	x

CHAPTER ONE:

INTRODUCTION

1.1	Background to the Research Problem -	-	-	-	-	-	-	1
1.2	Statement of the Research Problem -	-	-	-	-	-	-	2
1.3	Research Questions -	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
1.4	Objectives of the Study-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
1.5	Scope of the Study-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
1.6	Rationale of the Study-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
1.7	Hypothesis-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
1.8	Conceptual Framework-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
1.9	Literature Review -	-	-	-	-	-	-	9
1.10	Operational Definitions-	-	-	-	-	-	-	15
1.11	Sources of Data-	-	-	-	-	-	-	17
1.12	Research Methodology-	-	-	-	-	-	-	17
1.13	Limitations of the study	-	-	-	-	-	-	21
1.14	Arrangement of Chapters	-	-	-	-	-	-	21
	Endnotes							

CHAPTER TWO:

OVERVIEW OF THE PRACTICE OF LIBERAL DEMOCRACY IN GHANA AND BOTSWANA SINCE INDEPENDENCE AND THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC PATTERNS OF GHANA AND BOTSWANA.

2.0	Introduction								
2.1	General History of Liberal Democracy	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	25
	2.2.1 Types of Liberal Democracy	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	26
	2.2.2 Some Tenets of Liberal Democracy	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	28
2.2	Post-Independence Political History of Botswana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	34
2.3	Post-Independence Political History of Ghana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	35
2.4	Liberal Democracy in Botswana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	39
2.5	Liberal Democracy in Ghana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	40
2.6	The Main Features of the 1992 Constitution of Ghana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	41
2.7	The Main Features of the 1966 Constitution of Botswana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	41
2.8	Development	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	42
2.9	Social Development in Ghana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	43
2.10	Social Development in Botswana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	44
2.11	Economic Development in Ghana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	46
2.12	Economic Development in Botswana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	48
2.13	Conclusion	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	50
	Endnotes								

CHAPTER THREE:

ASSESSING THE INFLUENCE OF LIBERAL DEMOCRACY ON SOCIO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF GHANA AND BOTSWANA BETWEEN 2008 AND 2018.

3.0	Introduction	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	52
3.1	Socio-Economic Development Achieved from 2008 to 2018 in Ghana and Botswana								
	3.1.1 Youth Employment Rates in Ghana	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	56

3.1.1a	Initiatives of Various Governments	-	-	-	58
3.1.1b	Place of Liberal Democracy in Employment Promotion				62
3.1.2	Youth Employment Rates in Botswana	-	-	-	66
3.1.2a	Initiatives of Various Governments	-	-	-	68
3.1.2b	Place of Liberal Democracy in Employment Promotion				69
3.1.3	Public Basic Education in Ghana	-	-	-	70
3.1.3a	Initiatives of Various Governments	-	-	-	72
3.1.3b	Place of Liberal Democracy in Public Basic Education				74
3.1.4	Public Basic Education in Botswana	-	-	-	76
3.1.4a	Initiatives of Various Governments	-	-	-	77
3.1.4b	Place of Liberal Democracy in Public Basic Education				78
3.1.5	Quality Healthcare in Ghana	-	-	-	80
3.1.5a	Initiatives of Various Governments	-	-	-	82
3.1.5b	Place of Liberal Democracy in Quality Healthcare	-			84
3.1.6	Quality Healthcare in Botswana	-	-	-	85
3.1.6a	Initiatives of Various Governments	-	-	-	88
3.1.6b	Place of Liberal Democracy in Quality Healthcare	-			89
3.2	How Liberal Democracy Can Promote Socio-economic Development in Ghana and Botswana	-	-	-	89
3.3	Conclusion	-	-	-	91
	Endnotes				

CHAPTER FOUR:

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

4.0	Introduction	-	-	-	96
4.1	Summary of Findings	-	-	-	96
4.2	Conclusion	-	-	-	98
4.3	Recommendations	-	-	-	99
	Bibliography	-	-	-	102

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1.....	57
Table 3.2.....	65
Table 3.3.....	73-74

ABSTRACT

This study particularly focuses on the existing relationship between the practice of liberal democracy and socio-economic development in Africa. The concept and practice of liberal democracy is one that is widely popular in the international system and states continually strive to adhere to and uphold the values of liberal democracy. In as much as it is largely believed that Liberal Democracy goes a long way to affect the socio-economic development of states, this assertion is contradictory among some African states. Ghana and Botswana are countries hailed in their various sub-regions as models and beacons in the practice of liberal democracy and this assertion has been given the nod by the international community. However, some socio-economic challenges particularly in the areas of youth employment rates, public basic primary education and the quality of healthcare still persist in both countries and this puts a dent on the full consolidation of liberal democracy for Ghana and Botswana. The theory underpinning this work is Liberal Democracy because the tenets of Liberal Democracy sets certain parameters to ensure that at the end of the day, all governance initiatives are geared towards the development of the citizen in its entirety is made paramount. It spells out the various characteristics of governance of Ghana and Botswana and explains why these states, as well as others in the International system, lean more towards Liberal Democracy than other forms of governance. The scope of the study is taken from 2008 to 2018 in both countries. The study relies on data acquired through secondary and primary sources of data. It also underwent a purposive sampling because there was the need to seek expert opinions in the form of semi-structured interviews as well as assessing reports and articles already existing on the topic. The data was analyzed through a qualitative and quantitative method of analysis. They reveal that despite various governments' efforts in the form of policies and reforms to help improve and increase the socio-economic development of both countries in the areas of youth employment, public basic primary education and quality of healthcare concerning systems and prevalent health conditions in both areas, there are still certain loopholes being encountered. The indicators of youth employment, public basic education and quality healthcare were chosen because these three indicators divulge the socio-economic state of a country. Where any of these things are lacking or are not well placed, there is a likelihood for a disequilibrium in the socio-economic and even the political state of a country. This could be due to lack of commitment to the full implementation of these policies and reforms. The options available to both Ghana and Botswana include the exertion of the full force of political will. This will affect the rate at which these policies are realized, the establishment of strong institutions and a legal autonomous entity that will ensure accountability, transparency and regulate the implementation of these policies. Further, a sensitization of the citizenry of both countries as to knowing the benefits that come with participating and being concerned about education as well as practicing healthy lifestyles to curb the menace of malaria and Human Immuno-deficiency Virus and the Acquired Immune Disease Syndrome (HIV/AIDS) infections in Ghana and Botswana respectively. These initiatives will therefore help bridge the gap between liberal democracy and development by using the mechanisms provided by liberal democracy to affect the socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana.

Chapter One

Introduction

1.1 Background to the Research Problem

The ideologies of Liberal Democracy and Communism became the most dominant after the Great Depression of the 1930s and by the end of World War II in 1945. In a sudden turn of events, the Cold War and the collapse of the Berlin Wall brought a declining finish to the Communist ideology and championed the ideas of democracy to the forefront of politics in the international system.

According to Andrew Heywood democracy is the only system of governance, which has thrived with very little resistance from governments and citizens alike. Although democracy, as a system of governance has thrived for decades, its spread and practice do not conform to a single format for all states. Nonetheless, there are basic identifiable tenets, which include free and fair elections, rule of law, separation of powers and the protection of basic liberties such as the freedom of speech, association, religion, individual ownership of property and free market economy that is supposed to lead to economic growth and development¹.

Amartya Sen in his book “Development as Freedom” posits that, this kind of development needs the removal of major sources of oppression:

...poverty as well as tyranny, poor economic opportunities as well as systematic social deprivation, neglect of public facilities as well as intolerance or over activity of repressive states².

From this, it can be gathered that, development should gather all spheres of the life of an individual to make him completely whole and free on all fronts be they social, economic or political.

However, this is not the situation in most African countries as some tenets of development are upheld at the detriment of others. While some countries like Ghana appear to practice the whole gamut of liberal democracy, its socio-economic growth and development has been minimal whereas Botswana which has had just one political party in power since independence has seen some levels of socio-economic growth and development.

In Ghana and Botswana, periodic free and fair elections as prescribed by the constitution of the state are held and the freedom and rights of the citizens in the country is respected. In some other countries like Rwanda, Kenya and Zimbabwe, more attention can be seen to be focused on the organization of some semblance of free and fair elections whereas the basic fundamental freedoms and rights of the citizens are relegated to the back.

1.2 Statement of the Research Problem

Ghana, being the first country in the Sub-Saharan Africa region to have gained independence has had 60 years to have made a significant difference and headway in the running of all continental affairs. After 60 years and as the pacesetter of liberation and freedom in the sub-region, there should have been a significant improvement in the economic and social development of the country but this does not seem to be the case. Statistics have shown that other African countries like South Africa, Kenya, Rwanda, and Botswana have seen significant improvement in their economic and social standards. As a big advocate for liberal democracy in the region, it is quite alarming to observe that the full effect of liberal democracy on development is not fully exploited as other countries practicing other forms of governance have seen tremendous advancement in their societies and economies.

Botswana is one of the world's impressive growth success stories. A small, landlocked country of two million people, Botswana was one of the least developed countries in Africa with a per capita Gross Domestic Product of about US\$70 when it became independent from British rule in 1966. In the nearly 50 years after independence, Botswana has changed itself, steadily easing into the ranks of upper middle-income status to become one of the fastest moving economies in the world, with an average annual growth rate of about 9 percent³.

Botswana prides itself in its mature democracy. Free and fair elections are held consistently as and when they should be and the constitution makes room for fundamental rights and freedoms. In spite of a few challenges of poverty in some rural pockets of the country, Botswana has seen a steady progress in good governance and economic growth over the past 40 years which has steadily raised the standard of living in the country with poverty rates declining from over 50 percent at independence to around 21 percent today. The government recognized respect for rights to own property and the rule of law. It maintained a high level of transparency, which was reiterated by persistent respect of the Tswana tribal tradition of consultation. These advice-giving institutions, known as *kgotla*, created a grade of trust in the government—the sense that government is to help the people and encourage development and is not the tool of one group or individuals for the single-mindedness of getting hold of the riches⁴.

These are two distinct countries that are practicing the full gamut of democracy but have seen variant differences in their socio-economic development. The Democratic Index of 2017 which highlights the democratic state of a country by basing on a state's electoral procedure and diversity, civil freedoms, working of government, political involvement and political values ranks Botswana as the 28th democratic country in the world and Ghana as the 52nd worldwide⁵. The Democratic Index of the European Intelligence Unit is being used to access the democratic nature of these two

countries because it provides the backdrop against which Ghana and Botswana are being chosen and analysed. With both countries faring well globally with regards to democratic rule, it is expedient to see the effects of their democratic advancement on the society and the people in it.

According to Ms. Kathleen Addy of the Centre for Democratic Development, Ghana, the tenets of a good democracy entail more than just organizing successful elections but also include the existence of an independent legislature, executive, and judiciary, free media, strong institutions, economic justice and social justice⁶. She stated that another important aspect of a good democracy is the fulfillment of a social contract between citizens and their governments and the balance of power within the social contract is supposed to manifest in declining inequality but in Ghana's case, inequality is rather deepening⁷.

This study therefore seeks to examine liberal democracy in the socio-economic development of African states by assessing the socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana between 2008 and 2018 and the effect that liberal democracy has had on this sphere of development. This concentrates on three (3) economic indicators, being, youth employment rates, quality healthcare and public basic education, as propounded by Amartya Sen in his Human Development Index Report.

1.3 Research Questions

1. What has been the practice of liberal democracy in Ghana and Botswana from 2008 to 2018?
2. What has been the influence of Liberal Democracy on the socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana from 2008 to 2018?
3. How can liberal democracy be used to ensure consistency in the socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana?

1.4 Objectives of the Study

The following constitute the objectives of the dissertation:

1. Review the practice of liberal democracy in Ghana and Botswana since 2008 to 2018.
2. Assess the influence of Liberal Democracy on the socio-economic development of Botswana and Ghana from 2008 to 2018.
3. Examine how liberal democracy can be used to ensure consistency in the socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana.

1.5 Scope of the Study

The study covers the practice of liberal democracy in Africa specifically in Ghana and Botswana and assesses the socio-economic developments in both countries between 2008 and 2018. Ghana and Botswana have been chosen for this research because both countries, in their various sub-regions, are practicing some forms of liberal democracy. These two countries are noted for

upholding the tenets of liberal democracy doing well globally as asserted by the Democratic Index of the Economic Intelligence Unit as mentioned earlier in the Research Problem. However, there seem to be some glitches in the effects of liberal democracy on the socio-economic development of both countries. Despite the consistent practice of liberal democracy in Ghana and Botswana, they still record high levels of youth unemployment rates, certain lapses in their public basic education and health systems and conditions. These three areas constitute integral parts of the socio-economic life of a country and are linked to each other.

1.6 Rationale of the Study

The researcher looked at the salient role of liberal democracy on the continent, how it has influenced the development of Ghana and Botswana and how it can be used to facilitate socio-economic development in both countries. The study will add to existing scholarly work on liberal democracy by assessing the influence of liberal democracy on socio-economic development in Africa by comparing progress made in Ghana and Botswana. It will also help inform policy-making and the efficient practice of liberal democracy in the region.

1.7 Hypothesis

This research hypothesizes that liberal democracy has a positive influence on the social and economic development of Ghana and Botswana.

1.8 Conceptual Framework

The conceptual framework underpinning this study is Liberal Democracy. Although there has been a lot of research on the democratic transition and consolidation in the academic world, there is no clear-cut way to measure democracy as such definitions of democracy are always contested in ongoing and lively debates on the subject area.

The idea and definition of democracy can be divided into certain categories. According to Hague and Harrop, the modern meaning of liberal democracy includes a system of government based on a liberal philosophy in which the range of state powers is restricted by the constitution. This means that under liberal democracy, the constitution is supreme and then followed by the legislature⁸. Some major proponents of liberal democracy are Robert Dahl, Larry Diamond and David Held. For Hague and Harrop, liberal democracy, especially in modern times, means that citizenship is no longer restricted to the elite but is now extended to the large majority of the adult population. In that same vein, today's democracies are more representative rather than direct. Therefore, elections under this system of government are seen as an expression rather than a denial of democracy⁹. In this case, it is a direct reference to the modern concept of the "rule of law" which highlights the supremacy of the power of the law. Rule of law in this context is one of the basic concepts and important components of democratic governance under the liberal democracy construction¹⁰.

Aboubacar Abdullah Senghore posits that, the fight for liberal democracy by Africans was somewhat a reaction towards the growing ruthlessness and despotic manifestations by many African governments with their actions not being in conformity with the anticipated positive payoff of breaking away from colonial rule. These actions included the institution of one party systems

by many governments, limited rule of law, dwindling economies, growing abject poverty, domestic conflicts, and the absence of popular participation, and in cases where it existed, sometimes took the form of elections that were tainted by intimidation, fraud and so on. All these conditions served as a catalyst for a more intense call for democratic pluralism around Africa as a solution to our governance and development problems¹¹.

Seeing as the practice of Liberal Democracy in Ghana and Botswana is going to be measured using the Democratic Index of the Economist Intelligence Unit (EIU), it is expedient to highlight their concept of liberal democracy as propounded. The EIU asserts that there have been various definitions over time and as a matter of fact, the concept is still being debated. However, liberal democracy is not freedom even though both terms are often used interchangeably. They also posit that democracy is more than an entirety of its institutions. Thus, using five criterion i.e. electoral procedure and diversity; civil freedoms; the functions of government; political involvement; and political ethos, they measure and categorize countries under four types of liberal democracy, being, full democracies; flawed democracies; hybrid regimes; and authoritarian regimes¹².

A criticism that has been leveled against liberal democracy is, it can be identified with ‘multiplicity, concession and indecision’. This is because in this kind of governance, the decision-making is very drawn-out and weak. According to Schmitt, the conclusions made in this form of governance are short-lived and do not give a lasting solution for any problem¹³. It is stipulated that, currently, real decisions in this kind of governance are made by the executive power in secrecy and the parliament is being regarded like a debate house. This gives an indication that liberal democracy is moving from its primary objective of public decision making¹⁴. This means that the primary objective of liberal democracy has shifted to a more representative form where members

of parliament are elected by the people in order to represent their interests at the parliamentary level.

Nonetheless, liberal democracy is essential to this study because it highlights and touches on salient aspects of development in Africa and addresses the political system of African states adopted overtime. Also, it bears some tenets which African states can capitalize on to ensure smooth socio-economic development in the continent. Finally, with relation to the scope and choice of Botswana and Ghana as case studies, both countries are practicing forms of liberal democracy and therefore it can be used as a yardstick in analyzing some aspects of the socio-economic development of both countries.

1.9 Literature review

Existing literature are mainly focused on liberal democracy in general and its challenges. As part of this work, it is ideal to first of all understand the several differences pertaining to liberal democracy given by scholars and what the various tenets are. This will serve as a basis for understanding the framework within which this work stands in the case of Ghana and Botswana.

Greenberg and Page in “The Search for Democracy”, discuss the evolution of democracy as a system of governance particularly in the United States of America. They indicate how the United States of America prides itself as the lead proponent of liberal democracy but also generally in the international community. The authors however, admit that America did not attain its high laurels overnight¹⁵. This therefore goes to say that the full consolidation of liberal democracy by any country may well take time and efforts in order to be built to an appreciable level of recognition.

Greenberg and Page capture the beginning and development of democracy in the following words:

States, within and outside Africa, which had hitherto been governed through other less favorable systems, were either compelled or attracted to liberal democracy as a unique system, which came with its attendant benefits. If it was by compulsion, which oftentimes was the case, developing states in Africa gained economic and social aid. On the other hand, the tenets of liberal democracy has made it attractive as a more stable form of government; the declaration of human rights is enshrined, citizen's rights are prioritized and protected, minorities are also protected in the societies, governments are limited in their actions and held accountable, the Rule of Law prevails, pluralism is ever increasing, including social pluralism and lastly but most importantly, free and fair elections are conducted regularly, giving leaders the legitimacy to rule with confidence. Under such an arrangement, the interest of the governed is prime, hence protecting the basic rights of people¹⁶.

Fareed Zakaria in "The Future of Freedom: Illiberal Democracy at Home and Abroad", also describes America as a country whose culture and politics are deeply democratic but took centuries of reforms and challenges to get to where they are now. Similarly, since the late 1980s and early 1990s, the developing world, to which Africa belongs, has gradually been dispensing with the various authoritarian regimes in favor of Western democracy¹⁷.

As Samuel Huntington rightly puts it in his article "Democracy's Third Wave", he clearly states that there is a link between democracy and economy. Before making this connection, he believes that there are some evident reasons for the rise of the third wave that caused most states to move into the democratic circle. He states some major factors that have accounted for the manifestation and the timing of the third-wave changeovers to democracy as being as follows:

- 1) The deepening legitimacy problems of authoritarian regimes in a world where democratic values were widely accepted, the consequent dependence of these regimes on successful performance, and their inability to maintain "performance legitimacy" due to economic (and sometimes military) failure.

- 2) The unprecedented global economic growth of the 1960s, which raised living standards, increased education, and greatly expanded the urban middle class in many countries.
- 3) A striking shift in the doctrine and activities of the Catholic Church, manifested in the Second Vatican Council of 1963-65 and the transformation of national Catholic churches from defenders of the status quo to opponents of authoritarianism.
- 4) Changes in the policies of external actors, most notably the European Community, the United States, and the Soviet Union.
- 5) "Snowballing," or the demonstration effect of transitions earlier in the third wave in stimulating and providing models for subsequent efforts at democratization¹⁸.

He asserts that, there is a strong link between wealth and democracy. His assessment is that a greater number of countries which joined the democratic circle were economically developed even in Africa. Even though this may be true in most Southern and Eastern African countries on the continent, it is not the case in the Sub-Saharan African countries which practice democracy but are still poor. This could be due to international coercion to abide by certain economic and political reforms which are believed to invite the much needed economic aid. Huntington may then be right to predict a risk to the consolidation of democracy by the cumulative economic challenges around the globe and particularly in Africa¹⁹.

Delving into the democratic state of the African continent, Maxwell Owusu in "Domesticating Democracy in Africa", emphasizes on the principle of 'power sharing and adjusting traditional institutions to modern democracy'. In propagating this agenda, the writer talks about, both at the periphery and in detail, the variations of democratic principles and challenges beginning from several periods from pre – colonial days, through the Cold War era right to post-Cold War period²⁰.

In looking at the link between democracy and development and addressing the needs of the African people, Said Adejumobi states:

The democratic aspiration of the African people is not only confined to the arena of political democracy (of elections, and granting of civil and political rights), but involves the demand for economic empowerment, better living standards, and adequate social welfare. Indeed, for the majority of the people, democracy is meaningful only when it delivers socio-economic goods. In other words, political democracy must be linked to socio-economic development²¹.

He clearly posits that, the effectiveness of political democracy to the African people is its available socio-economic provision. In view of this, this dissertation will along the way weigh the effect that liberal democracy has on the socio-economic development of Africa. In his work, he states how the African people have begun to lose faith in the failing democratic system in the various countries on the continent because of the weakening social well-being and living standards of the people. Said in his work posits that there are two schools of thought when it came to the link between democracy and development. According to the modernization school, democracy correlates to the industrial phase of capitalist development where liberal democracy is viewed more as an effect and not a reason for development. The Marxist school of thought on the other hand states that liberal democracy is the most restricted form of democracy possible under industrial capitalism²².

According to Said,

To some, liberal democracy provides the basic foundation for economic development. It is argued that libertarian values like freedom of speech and association, the rule of law, multipartyism and elections, the protection of human rights and separation of powers create the institutional context and processes for economic development to take place. It facilitates economic empowerment, provides a stable investment climate, and ensures rapid mobilization of national energies and resources for economic development. In Africa, those who share this view, point to the fast and stable economic growth rate of countries like Botswana and Mauritius, which are two countries that have had stable liberal democratic polity in Africa²³.

Contrarily, he highlights the statistical works of Svante Ersson and Jan-Erik Lane that have proven that the link between democracy and development is still very weak. Marx Gasiorowski also argues

that the nature of the political system may not necessarily define the economic growth and development of a country since some authoritarian administrations have shown outstanding resilience for economic self-control and structural changes²⁴. Therefore, according to Adrian Leftwich, what makes a variance in economic development is not the government type or mode of governance but the nature of the state. He states that what Third World countries need is a developmental democracy that is both democratic and developmental²⁵.

Furthermore, Gyimah-Boadi in his book “Democratic Reform in Africa: The Quality of Progress” describes the adoption of democratic governance and neoliberal economic reform as a major reform period for the African continent. The book highlights the enthusiasm with which the continent has accepted liberal democracy at three different stages of postcolonial Africa with relation to what Maxwell Owusu raised in “Domesticating Democracy in Africa”. However, he mainly throws light on the new political reform in Africa since the 1990s, its challenges, impact on the development in the continent and the way forward. He goes on to stipulate and assess the impact of liberal democracy on some selected countries such as Nigeria, Botswana, Mozambique and South Africa²⁶.

Setting the concept of liberal democracy further in the African continent, it has always been a mystery how Botswana, a southern Africa country, has seen tremendous improvement and sustainability in its political and socio-economic life since independence. This is mainly due to the fact that her neighboring African countries have suffered series of political instability and declining levels of social and economic development. In this regard, Botswana has been described as “the African success story” and “an African model for progress and prosperity”²⁷.

Botswana is seen as an exceptional case in terms of political solidity. It has held free and fair elections every five (5) years since independence in 1966. Also, it is renowned for being almost completely free of corruption and the judiciary as well is independent. Furthermore, the human rights record has stayed moderately clean and there are no political prisoners. In that same vein, some major improvements have been undertaken in the past few years and a major one being the appointment of an Independent Electoral Commission to handle elections and also an independent office of the ombudsman has been formed to control abuses in public administration²⁸.

On the contrary, there have been some flaws including uneven opposition, a weak civil society and a weak media sector. The Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) has been in power since independence, and even though its support has gradually become unpopular, the opposition, because of ruptures and increase of political parties, has never succeeded in ousting it. Civil society has also not been very vocal. Also, even though the number of private owned media outlets has grown, the state still manages the major newspaper, the biggest radio station, as well as the only television station in the country²⁹.

Furthermore, Daron Acemoglu et al in their article, “An African Success Story: Botswana” assert that even though at independence, the situation in Botswana was not much to write home about, there has been a significant and fast-growing improvement of the conditions in the country. They believe that Botswana was able to achieve this remarkable growth performance because it managed to put good policies in place. Also, despite the large revenues from diamonds, this has not induced local political uncertainty or fight for regulator of this resource. The government as a matter of fact, maintained the minimal public service structure that it inherited from the British and developed it into a relatively non-corrupt and efficient bureaucracy³⁰.

They, however, go further to state that, not everything in Botswana has been rosy. Botswana has recorded the highest number of HIV/AIDS infections in the world with about 25% - 30% of adults being HIV positive. The government however has not turned a blind eye to this situation and as part of its initiatives, has instituted a system of free distribution of antiretroviral medication in the country³¹.

1.10 Operational Definitions

1.10.1 Liberal democracy

Lathi Jotia highlights that liberal democracy accepts the existence of three types of rights, as being political, economic and social. He explains them as the right to participate in the political process; to enjoy a fair distribution of resources; and to be free from oppression³².

He continues that, in this case we begin to see the link between democracy being understood in terms of it being a political system, as well as it being linked to capitalist economic system, whereby the participation of the people is also tied to having the freedom to participate in the enjoyment of those material benefits that accompany economic development³³.

1.10.2 Development

Amartya Sen describes **Development** as a process of expanding the real freedoms that people enjoy. He states that the focus on human freedoms contrasts with the narrower views of development such as identifying development with the growth of Gross National Product (GNP) or with the rise in personal incomes or social modernization, industrialization etc³⁴.

Jan Marie Fritz also defines development as a strategic and complete economic, social, cultural and political process, in a defined geographic area, that is rights-based and ecologically oriented and aims to constantly improve the well-being of the entire population and all of its individuals³⁵.

1.10.3 Socio-economic Development

According to Jan Marie, socio-economic development stresses progress in terms of economic and social factors within a geographical unit³⁶. Socio-economic development, she posits, should lead us to, primarily, an explicit obligation to important human values. She is of the view that socio-economic development should also lead to the creation or development of persistently responsive and sustainable organizations and social institutions that address human urgencies³⁷.

1.10.4 Social Development

Jan Marie Fritz defines Social development as the intricacy of social dynamics i.e. the interaction of social structures, processes and relationships and focuses on first of all, the social concerns of the people as aims of development and secondly as people-centered, involved approaches to development. She posits that social development is about inclusiveness, social justice and the

common good. Some indicators of social development, as stated in her document, provide relative information about areas such as income, poverty, employment, employment security, education, health, crime and civic participation³⁸.

1.10.5 Economic Development

Economic development as defined by Jan Marie is the process of nurturing the level of prosperity through increased production, distribution and consumption of goods and services³⁹. She posits that the tenacity of economic development is to improve the social and material well-being of all individuals and social institutions with the goal of achieving the highest possible combination of economic and social development. She believes that progress in the quality of social and economic life should only be seen as progress if it is rights-based and minimally affects, conserves or improves the natural environment⁴⁰.

1.11 Sources of Data

Secondary sources of data were gathered from books, book chapters, journal articles and the Internet. Primary sources of data were gathered from experts in the subject in organizations such as the Centre for Democratic Development, Ghana (CDD-Ghana), National Development and Planning Commission Ghana, and the Political Science Department of the University of Ghana, Legon among others.

1.12 Research Methodology

The approach used for this study was mainly quantitative and qualitative research methods approach. Quantitative research methods are characterized by the accumulation of information which can be analyzed numerically. The results thereof are shown using statistics, tables and graphs. In most cases, the bulk of quantitative data collected can be secondary sources of data and also primary sources from field questionnaires to gain information in addition to secondary sources of data already collected. With the help of statistical methods, the results of quantitative analysis can confirm or refute hypotheses about the influence of one variable on the other. Conclusions made from the analysis of quantitative data show how many are affected, where the greatest impact is felt and what a key sector requires⁴¹.

Qualitative research methods on the other hand, although based on empiric investigation and evidence, explores information from the point of view of both groups and individuals and comes up with case studies and summaries instead of numeric data. Qualitative research explores relationships and perceptions held by affected groups in a study. It also serves an eye-opener to the points of view, behavior, values, opinions and interpretation accorded events. These reasons therefore informed my decision to use both qualitative and quantitative research methods because they gave me the opportunity to analyze the data acquired through both lenses and come up with conclusive findings by testing the theory of the influence of liberal democracy on socio-economic development and the opinions held by various experts and persons of interest on the subject matter.

1.12.1 Case Study Approach

This study makes use of the case study approach. A case study research through reports of previous studies, allows for the exploration and comprehension of complex issues. Acknowledged as a tool in many social science studies, the importance of case study method in research becomes more evident when issues with regard to education and other social-based problems are raised. Through the case study method, the researcher is able to go an extra mile beyond the quantitative statistical results and understand the behavioral conditions through the author's point of view. Also, by including both quantitative and qualitative data, case study helps throw more light on both the process and result of a phenomenon through complete observation, reconstruction and analysis of the cases being studied⁴².

This study therefore concentrates on assessing the influence of liberal democracy, as a system of government, on the socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana. Ghana and Botswana were thus, selected as case studies because of the impressive practice of liberal democracy in their various sub-regions and its recognition in the international community. In order to fully understand this and its influence on a close level, the study centered on the influence that liberal democracy has had and can have on the promotion of youth employments, public basic primary education and quality healthcare in both countries.

1.12.2 Sampling Method

The sampling method that was used to collect the data for this study is purposive sampling. Purposive sampling, also known as selective sampling, is a technique used to gather information based on a particular area of interest. This work seeks to appreciate the influence of liberal

democracy in socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana and therefore the purposive sampling was used. This is because the various people of interest have in-depth knowledge on the subject matter and therefore are essential in the gathering of data for the study.

1.12.3 Sampling Populations and Sampling Size

The number of people interviewed during the collection of data for the study was 4 people. These were experts in the field of liberal democracy and development from the Centre for Democratic Development Ghana, Institute of Democratic Governance, National Development and Planning Commission and a professor from the Political Science Department of the University of Ghana. Furthermore, 10 pupils (5 boys and 5 girls) from the Akporman Model Basic School were interviewed. 5 parents (3 males and 2 females) of wards in Akporman Basic School were also interviewed since they were in the best position to relate to the initiatives put in place by governments with regards to education reforms in public schools in Ghana.

The method of data collection used to retrieve the relevant information from the above-listed correspondents is semi-structured interviews through an interview guide which aided the researcher in making enquiries that are in relation to the objectives of the research. These interviews were recorded electronically after which the data was transcribed and grouped based on the objectives of the study. The data and statistics obtained from Botswana were derived from reports and articles published by academics and governmental agencies of Botswana.

1.12.4 Procedure and Data Analysis

After the data collection, the transcribed data were analyzed thematically in line with the various research objectives stipulated above in order to assess the influence of liberal democracy on the socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana in the areas of youth employment promotion, public basic primary education and quality healthcare.

1.12.5 Ethical Considerations

In accordance with the ethics of social research, the researcher sought the permission from institutions in order to access information from their officials whose input would be beneficial to the study. It was firmly stated that, the recordings and information gathered would be privy to the researcher alone and all personal details would be excluded from the research unless the respondent stated otherwise. The intent of the research was clearly spelt out for the respondents that their inputs were for academic purposes.

1.13 Limitations of the Study

This study, like others, faced a few challenges during the process. One major challenge that was encountered was accessibility of primary sources of data from Botswana concerning the research work. In view of this, the researcher had to rely heavily on secondary sources of data in the form of journal articles and publications by other authors. Also, time constraint was another challenge since the researcher had limited time to carry out and analyze data. In spite of the above-mentioned limitations, the study tackled salient points that were meant to be attained at the end of the study.

1.14 Arrangement of Chapters

The work consists of four chapters.

Chapter one is the introduction. This chapter first looked at the background of the research study and the statement of the research problem. It then considered the objectives of the study by highlighting some questions pertinent to the realization of the research objectives. The scope, rationale and hypothesis of the research work are also highlighted. The researcher also introduced the reader to the theoretical framework on which the study is founded and how relevant the theory is to the study, the various authors that the researcher consulted and the various conceptual and operational definitions underpinning the study. Finally, chapter one addressed the sources of data, the research methodology and the arrangement of the various chapters that the study comprised of.

Chapter two discussed a general overview of liberal democracy and its evolution in Ghana and Botswana respectively and some socio-economic developments marked in both countries between 2000 and 2018.

Chapter three examined the influence of democracy on the socio-economic development of Ghana and Botswana.

Chapter four discussed the summary of findings, conclusion and recommendations.

ENDNOTES

-
- ¹ Heywood, Andrew. "Politics." *3ed. Palgrave Macmillan: New York*, 2007.
- ² Sen, Amartya. "Development as freedom." *Development In Practice-Oxford-* 10.2 (2000): 258-258.
- ³ "Botswana". *Web.Worldbank.Org*, http://web.worldbank.org/archive/website01321/WEB/0__MENUP.HTM. Accessed 12 Aug 2018.
- ⁴ Lewin, Michael. "Botswana's success: Good governance, good policies, and good luck." *Yes Africa Can* 81 (2011).
- ⁵ See Democracy Index 2017: Free Speech Under Attack pg. 6
- ⁶ "Ghana's Democracy Doesn't Have All Tenets Of A Good Democracy - CDD". *Modern Ghana*, <https://www.modernghana.com/news/488992/ghanas-democracy-doesnt-have-all-tenets-of-a-good-democrac.html>. Accessed 12 Aug 2018.
- ⁷ Ibid
- ⁸ Hague, Rod, and Martin Harrop. *Comparative government and politics*. Vol. 6. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004. Pg. 38-39
- ⁹ ibid
- ¹⁰ Senghore, Aboubacar Abdullah. *Liberal Democracy and Governance in Africa: A brief critique*. Safara No. 12: UFR Lettres et Sciences Humaines, Université Gaston Berger, Senegal, 2013. Pg. 166
- ¹¹ Ibid pg. 167
- ¹² Index, Democracy. "Free Speech under Attack". *The Economist Intelligence Unit* (2017) pg. 2
- ¹³ "Different Forms of Democracy." All Answers Ltd. ukessays.com, November 2013. Web. 4 August 2018. <<https://www.ukessays.com/essays/politics/different-forms-of-democracy-politics-essay.php?vref=1>>.
- ¹⁴ ibid
- ¹⁵ Greenberg, S.G. & Page, Benjamin I. "The Struggle for Democracy." *New York: Addison Wesley Educational Publishers Ltd.*, 1997.
- ¹⁶ Greenberg op. cit.
- ¹⁷ Zakaria, Fareed. *The Future of Freedom: Illiberal Democracy at Home and Abroad*, p. 15. W. W. Norton & Company Ltd, New York, 2004.
- ¹⁸ Huntington, Samuel P. "Democracy's third wave." *Journal of democracy* 2.2 (1991): 12-34.
- ¹⁹ Ibid
- ²⁰ Owusu, Maxwell. *Domesticating Democracy: Culture, Civil Society, and Constitutionalism in Africa: Comparative Studies in Society and History*. Vol. 39, No. 1 (Jan., 1997), pp. 120-152 Published by: Cambridge University Press, Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/179241>
- ²¹ Said Adejumbi. *Between Democracy and Development in Africa: What are the missing links?* Centre for African Studies, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa. 2000
- ²² Ibid.
- ²³ Ibid.
- ²⁴ M.J. Gasiorowski. "Democracy and Macroeconomic Performance in Underdeveloped Countries: An Empirical Analysis". *Comparative Political Studies*, Vol. 33, No. 3. April, 2000, pp. 319-349.
- ²⁵ Adrian Leftwich A. Leftwich. "Two Cheers for Democracy? Democracy and the Developmental State" in A. Leftwich, *Democracy and Development*. 1996
- ²⁶ Gyimah-Boadi, E. *The Quality of Political Reform in Democratic Reform in Africa: the Quality of Progress*. Edited by E. Gyimah – Boadi, London: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc., 2004, pp. 1-24.
- ²⁷ Cook, Amelia, and Jeremy Sarkin. "Is Botswana the Miracle of Africa-Democracy, the Rule of Law, and Human Rights versus Economic Development." *Transnat'l L. & Contemp. Probs.* 19 (2010): 453.
- ²⁸ See Country Report - Africa's best kept secret: Botswana as a shining liberal democracy, 2003. pg. 1
- ²⁹ Ibid. p. 2.

³⁰ Acemoglu, D., S. Johnson, and J. A. Robinson. "An African Success Story: Botswana" forthcoming." (2001).

³¹ Ibid.

³² Jotia, Agreement Lathi. "Liberal Democracy: An African Perspective." *Academic Research International* 2.3 (2012): 621.

³³ ibid

³⁴ Sen, Amartya. *Development as Freedom*. Anchor Books: New York, 1999.

³⁵ Fritz, Jan Marie. "Socioeconomic developmental social work." *PEACE STUDIES, PUBLIC POLICY AND GLOBAL SECURITY–Volume VII* (2010): 362.

³⁶ Ibid.

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ Ibid.

³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹ Brief, An Introductory. "Qualitative and Quantitative Research Techniques for Humanitarian Needs Assessment." (2012). P. 4-5

⁴² Zainal, Zaidah. "Case study as a research method." *Jurnal Kemanusiaan* 9 (2007): 1-6. P. 1

CHAPTER TWO

OVERVIEW OF THE PRACTICE OF LIBERAL DEMOCRACY IN GHANA AND BOTSWANA SINCE THE 4TH REPUBLIC

2.0 Introduction

The chapter discusses to a large extent one of the major themes of this study which is the concept of liberal democracy in general, its practices in Ghana and Botswana and how the various constitutions of both countries serve as a guide to making room for the key areas with the necessary authority to operate. Nonetheless, before examining this progress, the history of both countries are looked at in order to better understand the dynamics that have taken place so far. However, analysis is done in the areas of liberal democracy where Ghana and Botswana have thrived over the years. These include the rule of law, general elections, separation of powers, good governance, fundamental human rights and finally bringing into perspective their policies on socio-economic development. The chapter subsequently addresses the socio-economic developments that both countries have seen in the years after attaining independence.

2.1 General History of Liberal Democracy

The concept of democracy has been existent for a long time and has been a rather controversial one. Nevertheless, the version mostly used by political scientists is one propounded by Joseph Schumpeter in 1984. He describes democracy as being,

... that institutional arrangement for arriving at political decisions in which individuals acquire the power to decide by means of a competitive struggle for the people's vote⁴³.

This definition therefore posits that democracy is characterized by the occurrence of competitive elections for the executive and legislative positions in a state. The elections take place in the stead

of hereditary means of succession which are violent revolutionary means⁴⁴. The concept of democracy started in the days of the Greek empire where every male adult could vote with regards to the most pertinent issues in the city. This made democracy direct in the days of the Athenians since the whole citizenry could exercise power directly as in contrast to the former regimes where it was either a monarchy or tyranny and ruled by one man⁴⁵.

Liberal democracy took root in the 17th century when it was to allow participation of huge portions of the population as people who elected and participated in government positions, and at the same time restraining the government so that it would not become authoritative over the individual. Liberal democracy therefore became an indirect form of democracy since the population of nation-states began to grow in size and therefore became impossible for the citizens to directly exercise power like in the days of the Greek. Citizens therefore had to elect representatives to Parliament to represent their needs⁴⁶.

2.1.1 Types of Democracy

Some scholars have come out to state that there are five (5) types of democracy with the first being direct democracy which states that the government and the general public are one. This is because all the adult citizens in a nation-state come together to form and shape the laws and policies for the nation. This was practiced by the Athenians⁴⁷.

The second form of democracy discussed is the deliberative type of democracy where the general public as well as political personalities get involved in the decision making and problem solving process. Here, the citizenry as well as the political personalities arrive at a conclusion that is being made by both public and political opinion⁴⁸. This kind of democracy can be achieved through

public referenda where all opinions and suggestions are sought in order to discover how to make the country a better place for everyone.

The third type of democracy stated in this document is the representative democracy where people elect their own representatives who govern their affairs. This form of democracy, according to Schumpeter, gives the citizenry the right to accept or refuse the people who would rule them⁴⁹.

For the purpose of this dissertation, it is worthy to note that the Ghanaian and Batswana populace ascribe to the Representative Democracy. In Ghana, for example, as stipulated by the constitution, the people elect Members of Parliament from their various constituencies who represent their needs and interests at the parliamentary level. These are very often indigenes of the constituencies who can relate with the peculiar needs of the people and are therefore in the best position to address their concerns. The Constitution states that any Member of Parliament should be either a resident in the constituency for which he stands as a candidate for election to parliament or has resided there for about five years or hails from that constituency⁵⁰.

Next in this document is liberal democracy where the powers of government are limited. This is done in order to ensure the liberty and freedom of the public. This type of democracy seeks to defend and protect the rights of the minority from tyranny and oppression of the majority. This democracy is characterized by rule of law and constitutions which outline the rules regarding individual rights⁵¹. The final type of democracy discussed here is illiberal or electoral democracy where there is no respect of the rights and freedoms of individual citizens in the state. In such democracies, the process of democracy is only restricted to elections and in some cases, may see the election process being rigged in favor of a particular party⁵².

2.1.2 Some Tenets of Liberal Democracy

The tenets of liberal democracy could also be described as the characteristics of liberal democracy. These are the various pointers that help to identify the democratic nature of a government. These tenets or pillars include free press, respect for human rights, constitutionalism, regular free and fair elections, separation of powers, popular participation, pluralism, good governance and the rule of law.

2.1.2a The Constitution

In order to ensure the constant balance of power in a democratic setting, there should be, first of all, laid down rules and regulations. The constitution is therefore of high importance, be it written, as in the case of the Ghanaian constitution or in the form of conventions like in Britain, to serve as a tool for governance. The 1992 Fourth Republican Constitution of Ghana, in the Preamble, captures the principles of democracy while stipulating the various roles of the key sections of government. It outlines the various powers for them to operate with, limiting the powers in certain cases and in others listing the freedoms and rights of the citizens. Simply put, constitutions serve as the legal backing of the actions of the governor and the governed. It supersedes all other laws and is therefore the supreme law of the land. The 1966 Constitution of Botswana is the legal document with which the country is governed and outlines the political and civil rights of the people in the country as well as the responsibilities of the various institutions in the country.

2.1.2b General Elections

The principles of liberal democracy which are outlined in the Constitution have served as the guidelines for Ghana's democratic process as well as that of Botswana. The first manifestation took place in 1992 in the case of Ghana when the first general elections under the Fourth Republic was held after more than 10 years of military rule whereas in Botswana the first general election was held in 1965 when the country was still a British protectorate. Following this, six more elections have been held in Ghana and eleven in Botswana.

The constitution of Ghana clearly states in Article 42 that "every citizen of Ghana of eighteen years of age or above and of sound mind has the right to vote and is entitled to be registered as a voter for the purpose of public elections and referenda," whereas Article 43 establishes and mandates an Electoral Commission to manage the elections in the country. In the elections held in Botswana, all citizens over twenty-one years of age could participate with the exception of just a few people such as criminals.

For the case of Ghana, Mike Ocquaye discusses that the concept of democracy has come to stay through the fact that the country experienced the peaceful change of government in 2000 through the ballot box. He opines that the liberal state has the capacity to evade all potential electoral misunderstandings and attributes it to the ability of the Electoral Commission to attain elite-level consensus. He further states that, the establishment of the Inter-Party Advisory Committee (IPAC) in 1994 was useful in achieving consensus. As a matter of fact, the country went through another testing period when the presidential election won by John Mahama's National Democratic Congress (NDC) in 2012 was contested in court by the then opposition New Patriotic Party (NPP).

This was the first in the history of the country. However, Ghana's democracy was deepened and consolidated through the acceptance of the Supreme Court verdict by the NPP.

2.1.2c Separation of Powers

The Constitution goes on to make room for the Separation of Powers which is expedient in a democratic setting. Ocquaye makes reference to Montesquieu's assessment of the fact that humans are tempted to abuse the power vested in them⁵³. In order to avoid this from happening, the powers exercised by the three arms of government, being the executive, legislative and the judiciary, need to be in independent hands. Furthermore, the constitution makes room for checks and balances. Just like in several other African countries, the executive and legislature in Ghana have been able to hold their own against pressures but the judiciary is always faced with external pressures in its execution of justice⁵⁴.

The constitution of Botswana also recognizes the separation of powers by dealing with each organ of government in separate and distinct provisions. However, the norm of the separation of powers in Botswana is a mixture of the executive and legislative powers and provides for the relative independence of the judicial power and this is integral to the process of providing checks and balances. Although this mixing has, at times, led to the same persons performing functions under both the executive and legislative branches, the system also contains mechanisms by which two branches can control and thus check each other⁵⁵.

In Botswana, the state president is vested with "the executive power of Botswana" and on the other hand functions as an ex officio member of parliament with the power to speak and vote in all parliamentary proceedings. Other principal officers of the executive, made up of the vice president,

ministers and assistant ministers, are appointed by the president and are members of parliament. Although the president may appoint the vice president and up to four ministers and assistant ministers from persons who are not MPs, such persons must qualify for and seek election to parliament within four months of their appointment else they cease to hold executive offices⁵⁶. Also, the Attorney General who is responsible for conducting prosecutions on the state's behalf, is also an ex officio member of parliament. In effect, the president and ministers who are the chief executive officials are also members of the legislative branch⁵⁷.

2.1.2d Rule of Law

The principle of the rule of law ensures that the actions of the executive, legislative and judiciary arms of government as well as that of the citizenry, is according to the laws of the land. It is a common saying that the law is no respecter of persons and the Rule of Law must always stand first. It is expedient that in any democratic set-up, all the laws of the country are clearly laid down and known beforehand⁵⁸. It also implies that once all the laws of the state are passed, they become supreme and the consequences of the violation of these laws must be fully and equally meted on all culprits⁵⁹. The rule of law makes sure that there is fairness and equality in the judicial system.

Ocquaye outlines some basic tenets of the rule of law as being that,

...every adjudicator must hear both sides before arriving at a verdict relating to any controversy or accusation; every side in a controversy is entitled to have its case duly considered before a decision is taken. Additionally, no man can be a judge in his own cause; reasons must always be given for a decision reached and of course, justice should not only be done but it must manifestly be seen to be done⁶⁰.

2.1.2e Good Governance

According to Mander and Asif, governance is the interaction between formal institutions and those in civil society. They also define governance to be “a process whereby elements in society wield power, authority and influence and enact policies and decisions concerning public life and social uplift”⁶¹. For the World Bank, governance is the way in which power is exercised in the management of a country’s economic and social resources for development. Thus, the term governance includes public sector management, accountability, the legal framework, transparency and information⁶².

Democracy, in general, is all about good governance. This therefore means that the citizenry must undoubtedly attest to the fact that the government in power is doing everything possible to facilitate the political, social, economic and cultural aspects of human living.

Liberal democracy entails major key aspects of economic development. However, poverty or economic hardships destabilize the democratic nature of a state just as economic stability of a nation can consolidate its democracy. In African countries for instance, where there are major civil unrests and political instabilities and some of these may be caused by politics, religion or ethnic differences, the underlying cause has mostly been economic stagnation.

In like manner, Ghana’s democracy has been challenged by unrest and instability. Prior to the 1992 stability that the country enjoyed, major coup d’états were staged during times of severe economic difficulties with perpetrators naming corruption and lack of accountability as some of the reasons. There are some indicators that have shown that conflicts recorded in Ghana have been due to economic factors such as unemployment, social stagnation and financial hardships. As a matter of fact, according to the Labor Force Survey Report of the Ghana Statistical Service, more than 1.2

million persons from 15 years and older are estimated to be unemployed representing the total unemployment rate of 11.9%⁶³. However, Botswana since independence, has enjoyed a stable political system even though red flags have been raised concerning the democratic nature of the state with just one political party being voted into power.

2.1.2f Fundamental Human Rights

The concept of the respect for the Fundamental Human Rights of the citizens of a state, which is an undebatable aspect of liberal democracy, has been a major issue of concern for decades. Due to this, the 1948 Declaration of Human Rights has tried to address problems concerning the abuse of human rights⁶⁴. Rather sadly, the international system is plagued with a surge in the abuse of the rights of minority groups, be it political, religious, ethnic, gender, with the majority constantly exerting its will on the minority. Due to the history of the disregard for the rights of the citizens experienced in Ghana, subsequent constitutions have entailed fundamental human rights clauses. These provisions, however, have not been able to prevent human rights abuses in the country.

The fundamental human rights of citizens are clearly enshrined in the constitution and all the arms of government, persons, and institutions are obliged to respect them. Also, the constitution addresses the element of discrimination where the rights of the individual should be enjoyed without regard to his color, socio-economic status, race etc. however the respect of these rights is reciprocal and borders on the respect of the rights of others⁶⁵. In order to effectively consolidate a state's democratic process, there is the need to respect the right to life, personal liberty, the right to civil liberties and others as clearly enlisted in the Constitution's Bill of Rights.

In Botswana's case, the constitution clearly outlines the political and civil rights of the Batswana people. It covers the rights and freedoms of the individual which includes the right to life, the protection from inhuman treatment, protection of freedom of expression and the protection of freedom of movement⁶⁶.

2.2 Post-Independence Political History of Botswana

Botswana runs a very unique system of the Representative Democracy. Unlike most African states, Botswana was never really a colony of Britain. Rather, it was a British protectorate state which made the country avoid full colonization and enabled it preserve and inherit the Tswana state culture by the post-protectorate state agencies⁶⁷. Tswana state culture was important to Botswana's successful state development.

According to Robinson "the Tswana developed a state with relatively limited chiefs and with a political structure that was able to integrate other groups, such as the Kalanga, into the state via wars." Tribal policy was determined using an assembly of men, known as a "*kgotla*", in which anyone was allowed to speak thus representing different interests for the chief to consider when making decisions⁶⁸. Additionally, Tswana state culture viewed economic accumulation as a worthy state function; thus, functional institutions were established to allow for the creation and maintenance of new wealth. Tswana institutions such as these provided the framework for new state elites to emerge from the established indigenous state⁶⁹.

Botswana is seen as a unique case in terms of political stability. It has held free and fair elections every five (5) years since independence in 1966. Also, it has a reputation of being almost totally free of corruption and the judiciary as well is independent. Furthermore, the human right record

has remained relatively clean and there are no political prisoners. In that same vein, some major reforms have been undertaken in the past few years and a major one being the appointment of an Independent Electoral Commission to manage elections and also an autonomous office of the ombudsman has been created to curb abuses in public administration⁷⁰.

On the contrary, there have been some weaknesses including a fragmented opposition, a weak civil society and an underdeveloped media sector. The Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) has been in power since independence, and even though its support has gradually become unpopular, the opposition, because of splits and a proliferation of political parties, has never managed to oust it. Civil society has also not been very vocal. Also, even though the number of private owned media outlets has grown, the state still controls the major newspaper, the biggest radio station, as well as the only television station in the country⁷¹.

Furthermore, Daron Acemoglu et al in their article, “An African Success Story Botswana” assert that even though at independence, the situation in Botswana was not much to write home about, there has been a significant and fast-growing improvement of the conditions in the country. They believe that Botswana was able to achieve this spectacular growth performance because it managed to adopt good policies. Also, despite the large revenues from diamonds, this has not induced domestic political instability or conflict for control of this resource. The government as a matter of fact, maintained the minimal public service structure that it inherited from the British and developed it into a relatively non-corrupt and efficient bureaucracy⁷².

2.3 Post-Independence Political History of Ghana

The first three republics of Ghana were mainly characterized by short-lived military interventions, and democratic rule, taking the form of authoritarian and dictatorial rule. The CPP government led by Dr. Nkrumah was replaced by a military regime of the National Liberation Council (NLC) led first by Lt. General Ankrah and later by Lt. General Afrifa. The NLC then gave way for the civilian government of the Progress Party headed by Prof. Abrefa Busia as Prime Minister. The Busia administration was however overthrown by the National Redemption Council/ Supreme Military Council led first by General I. K. Acheampong and later by F. W. K. Akuffo and they ruled the country till June 1979 when Flt. Lt. Jerry John Rawlings overthrew their military regime. Rawlings then made way for the civilian People's National Party (PNP) headed by Dr. Hilla Limann as the Executive President but overthrew this government again in 1981 and toppled the newly elected government of Dr. Limann⁷³.

The Provisional National Defense Council (PNDC) being in power for eleven years sought to bring social and economic progress to the people of Ghana and to institute participatory democracy, economic development and social justice in the country. Eventually, it towed a similar line as its predecessors which was marked by the same impunity, regression, martial law, looting and pillage that had been portrayed by previous administrations. The PNDC administration therefore ended up recording the same repetitive events of abuse of civil and political liberties⁷⁴.

Boafo–Arthur, in assessing the Rawlings government, indicates:

However, contrary to its initial Marxist-Leninist agenda, the government of the PNDC that usurped political power in the early 1980s was compelled by the magnitude of the economic problems confronting the state to pursue a neoliberal or free market agenda after its initial socialist posturing, while at the same time supporting internal social democratic forces with an antithetical economic and

political agenda. The contradiction produced by that unnatural equation was resolved in favor of a liberal democratic state that would guarantee the growth of a neoliberal economy⁷⁵.

The PNDC government, however, did chalk some successes that led to the World Bank applauding Ghana as the success story and the democratic model of Africa. However these assertions happened to be relative because nearing the end of the 1980s, the political and socio-economic conditions in the country incited both internal and external pressures on the PNDC to establish major reforms⁷⁶. It goes without saying that Rawlings' idea of democracy did not meet the international standards. In his view, democracy meant participatory democracy and participation of the masses, and this notion of democracy rang clear throughout his PNDC reign until "global forces which were pressing for democratization and good governance in the developing world around 1988 suddenly turned Rawlings into a 'liberal multi-party democrat in 1992'"⁷⁷.

This liberal democracy, as according to Boafo-Arthur, was characterized by the following phases:⁷⁸

- a. the holding of district level elections in 1988 and 1989
- b. the collation of views on the democratic future of the country by the National Commission for Democracy set up by the PNDC
- c. The promulgation of a law on 17th May 1991 to set up a nine-member committee of Experts on the Constitution. The mandate of the committee was to put together a draft proposal of the constitution taking into consideration the previous

constitutions of Ghana since independence and any other relevant constitutions as well as matters referred to it by the PNDC.

- d. The inauguration of a 260-member Consultative Assembly on the 26th of August 1991 to draw up a draft constitution (based on the work of the Committee of Experts) for the country.
- e. The submission of the draft constitution on the 31st of March 1992 to the PNDC by the consultative Assembly. Also, the Interim Electoral Commission was set up.
- f. On the 28th April, 1992, a referendum was held on the draft constitution with 92.6 per cent of eligible voters voting in favor of the draft.
- g. The ban on political party activities was lifted on 15th May 1992 and Flight Lieutenant Jerry Rawlings, chairman of the PNDC, founded the National Democratic Congress (NDC) to contest the presidential and parliamentary elections
- h. Presidential elections were held on the 3rd of November 1992 and the parliamentary elections on the 28th of December 1992.
- i. The inauguration of the Fourth Republic on 7th January 1993 with Rawlings as President.

Kwame Ninsin in his “Ghana: Transition to Democracy” posits that the new wave of liberal democracy that Ghana experienced in the early 1990s was one of a pluralist democracy which was characterized by multiple actors and consisted majorly of some of the tenets of the system like regular free and fair elections, rule of law, separation of powers and protection of the freedoms of speech, assembly, religion, culture, media pluralism and economic development. Seeing as the country had a history of incomplete transitions, the new epoch of democracy, as explained by Ninsin, came with uncertainties with regard to its sustainability. According to him, this new era

was not simply a matter of replacing the old regime with its already existing norms ideas and sentiments with the new, but instead the challenge was in “converting the PNDC pseudo military structures into effective wings”⁷⁹. The outside world was interested in seeing Ghana’s democracy move beyond the political transition in 1993 since it was not the first in Ghana’s 35 years of independence from colonialism⁸⁰. The fourth Republic was fully backed and guided by a constitution which has been in force till present.

2.4 Liberal Democracy in Botswana

At independence, the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) and its leader, Seretse Khama, emerged as the leaders of the new Botswana. They took a disciplined and developmentally-focused approach in establishing an independent Botswana state. Due to Seretse Khama’s recognition as a hereditary chief to one of the largest Tswana tribes, the BDP gained legitimacy among the people.

According to John D. Holm⁸¹, Botswana has functioned as a liberal democracy since 1965, when the first national elections took place under colonial rule. Following this, other additional elections have been held to select representatives to both the national parliament and local councils. In these elections- all citizens, excluding just a few people such as criminals- over twenty-one years of age could participate. Additionally, two or more political parties could contest for most seats. Candidates campaigned in a climate of political freedom which gave room for honest criticism of the party in power. The only missing liberal democratic structure was an opposition newspaper, even though this was not due to legal restrictions. However, one major criticism that has been leveled against the liberal democratic practice in Botswana is the fact that since independence the

ruling party Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) has been returned to office each time by overwhelming majorities⁸².

An article published by the United Nations Development Program states that, Botswana is one of the African countries that have enjoyed a stable democracy. Since independence in 1966, the country has held free and fair elections every five years. Additionally, Botswana has never suffered any civil uprisings that has characterized the political life of many African countries⁸³.

In addition to this, the government of Botswana is willing to uphold the rule of law and affording its citizens and all the people in the country “the protection and the enjoyment of the fundamental freedoms and rights that injure to the human race, without any distinction whatsoever, as provided for by the Constitution of Botswana”⁸⁴.

2.5 Liberal Democracy in Ghana

All the core tenets of the conception of democracy and liberal or electoral democracy according to Schumpeterian concept are present and respected in Ghana. These tenets are political equality built in the right of franchise and periodic elections, reasonably free and fair, civil liberties, freedoms, and human rights guaranteed by the constitution which is respected by all Ghanaians as the fundamental law of the land, rule of law, separation of powers, free press and a relatively autonomous and vibrant civil society⁸⁵.

The practice of liberal democracy in Ghana has encountered many challenges along the road. This is most recently characterized by the petition filed by the then opposition New Patriotic Party (NPP) at the Supreme Court challenging the results of the 2012 elections which was settled

amicably when the party then in power, the National Democratic Congress, was declared the winner of the elections. Ghana passed yet another test on the strength of its democratic political stability when the sitting president, John Atta Mills died suddenly in July 2012. In line with the provisions of the Fourth Republic Constitution, his vice president, John Mahama was sworn into office as president, safeguarding the stability and continuity of the democratic system⁸⁶.

These two instances show the resilience of the practice of liberal democracy in Ghana where the constitution is allowed to take due preeminence of situations in the country.

2.6 The Main Features of the 1992 Constitution of Ghana

The new constitution which was rolled out, followed the American presidential structure with prescribed separation of powers and checks and balances except a few other features. According to Articles 57, 60 and 66, the constitution vested executive power in an executive president elected together with his vice president for four (4) years. They are also entitled to a second term only. Also in accordance with Article 93, legislative power resides in the Parliament whose members are also elected for a four-year term whereas judicial power lies in the judiciary with a considerable measure of independence and the power of judicial review. Very notable in the constitution as well is the wide range of Bill of Rights in Chapter 5 Articles 12-33 that highlight, among others, the social and economic rights of citizens in the country and how they should be executed. Additionally, the constitution outlines the provisions made for the property rights of spouses in Article 22, Women's rights in Article 27 and Children's rights in Article 28. The constitution to a large extent is considered as a major tool for the implementation of liberal democracy in a state.

2.7 The Main Features of the 1966 Constitution of Botswana

The 1966 Constitution of Botswana is the legal framework by which the country is governed. After Botswana gained her independence from being a British Protectorate since 1885, the Constitution was adopted in 1966. It contains the provisions which stand to protect and promote human rights in the country. These provisions are enshrined from Section 3 which deals with the Fundamental rights and freedoms of the individual to Section 15 which covers the Protection from discrimination on the grounds of race, gender etc. Botswana being a member of the international community and the Southern African Development Community (SADC), the African Union (AU), the African Commission on Human and People's Rights and the United Nations has committed itself to international human rights standards through signing various human rights documents. The Constitution of Botswana only contains civil and political human rights in Sections 3 to 15 and does not include economic, social, cultural, developmental and group rights⁸⁷.

2.8 Development

As already discussed in Chapter one, the basis of the definition of development in this dissertation is grounded in the definition of development by Amartya Sen. He states in his work, "Development as Freedom" that development is not only centered on income and growth. He stated that poverty involved a wider range of deprivations in health, education and living standards which were not captured by income alone. He went further to state that freedoms constitute not only the means but the ends in development. He also reminds us that democracy, as well as being an end in itself, plays an instrumental role in giving people a voice and a constructive role in shaping values and norms. In sum, he believed that development must be judged by its impact on people, not only by

the changes in their income but more generally in terms of their choices, capabilities and freedoms and this distribution should be concentrated to all members of the society⁸⁸.

Bordering on this argument, this work makes the deduction that Liberal Democracy can be an integral part of the development process of a country. This is due to the fact that Liberal Democracy serves as the grounds on which these freedoms and liberties can be generated and provided. This is because liberal democracy advocates for the freedoms of the people in a state by making sure that these freedoms are stipulated in a written document like the constitution and backed by the law. It inadvertently, holds the government accountable to the people by ensuring that they are able to provide these freedoms for the people.

However, according to Owen Barder of the Centre for Governance and Development (CDG), development also means that there should be a lasting change. He believes that it goes beyond the improvements in the well-being of citizens but rather to the provision of the circumstances for that well-being on a sustainable, long-term basis. In view of this, institutions and agencies of the government must ensure that conditions are favorable for the consistency of these freedoms of the people in a state⁸⁹.

2.9 Social Development in Ghana

According to the National Development Planning Commission of Ghana, the social development of Ghana constitutes the core of “national development,” namely, human development and welfare. Policies on social development therefore cover a broad range of issues, including (but not limited to) the following: education (including training); health (including nutrition); housing (including sanitation); employment (including decent work); cultural activities (including sports);

and social protection (both direct and indirect). The long-term objective of social development is to create safe, peaceful and sustainable communities where, in accordance with the Constitution, Ghanaians can live productive, prosperous, and fulfilling lives, in freedom and in peace⁹⁰. The Constitution of Ghana clearly outlines some social rights of Ghanaians as being, *inter alia*, educational rights, cultural rights and practices, women's rights and children's rights.

(1) The State shall endeavor to secure and protect a social order founded on the ideals and principles of freedom, equality, justice, probity and accountability as enshrined in Chapter 5 of this Constitution; and in particular, the State shall direct its policy towards ensuring that every citizen has equality of rights, obligations and opportunities before the law.

(2) The State shall enact appropriate laws to assure—

(a) the enjoyment of rights of effective participation in development processes including rights of people to form their own associations free from state interference and to use them to promote and protect their interests in relation to development processes, rights of access to agencies and officials of the State necessary in order to realize effective participation in development processes; freedom to form organizations to engage in self-help and income generating projects; and freedom to raise funds to support those activities;

(b) the protection and promotion of all other basic human rights and freedoms, including the rights of the disabled, the aged, children and other vulnerable groups in development processes.

(3) In the discharge of the obligations stated in clause (2) of this article, the State, shall be guided by international human rights instruments which recognize and apply particular categories of basic human rights to development processes.

(4) The State shall maintain a population policy consistent with the aspirations and development needs and objectives of Ghana.

(5) The State shall ensure that adequate facilities for sports are provided throughout Ghana and that sports are promoted as a means of fostering national integration, health and self-discipline as well as international friendship and understanding.

(6) The State shall—

(a) Ensure that contributory schemes are instituted and maintained that will guarantee economic security for self-employed and other citizens of Ghana; and

(b) Provide social assistance to the aged such as will enable them to maintain a decent standard of living⁹¹.

2.10 Social Development in Botswana

It is interesting to state that the constitution of Botswana does not outline the economic, social, cultural, developmental and group rights of the citizens of the nation. As a matter of fact, the constitution of Botswana only highlights the civil and political human rights of the citizens in Sections 3 – 15. The constitution however contains Human Rights which is considered as very important to protect the people. That notwithstanding, the country has attempted to put in place certain social policies that will aid in the social development of its citizens. According to a report on the social development policy for Botswana, the nation's social development framework borders around:

- **targeted programs that promote equity and inclusion for specific vulnerable groups**, including infants, school children, orphans and vulnerable children, the elderly, pregnant women and new mothers, people living with HIV/AIDS, people with disabilities, remote area dwellers and people living in chronic poverty;
- **programs to promote equity and inclusion across society as a whole** and ensure access to basic public services for all, including implementation of gender and development policy and the national population policy; programs to combat the marginalization of youth and to help them build sustainable livelihoods; the policies and regulations that protect the rights of workers; and those elements of education and health policies that strive to make these services equally accessible to all;
- **policies and programs that aim to build a strong and integrated society**, for example through strengthening community institutions, civil society and culture, promoting good social values or providing for sport and recreation⁹².

However, one important social aspect of Botswana's social development is the rise in the HIV pandemic in the country. It has been reported that females unlike males, are at a higher risk of being infected by HIV/AIDS⁹³.

Also, another issue that confronts Botswana is Gender-Based Violence. Research has shown that three out of every five women in the country are subjected to one or more forms of gender-based violence without regard for their social class, ethnic background and age. Women are also confronted with the issue of poverty⁹⁴.

2.11 Economic Development in Ghana

The Constitution of Ghana, in Chapter 5 Article 24, highlights the Economic Rights of all citizens in the country. It states that,

1. Every person has the right to work under satisfactory, safe and healthy conditions, and shall receive equal pay for equal work without distinction of any kind.
2. Every worker shall be assured of rest, leisure and reasonable limitation of working hours and periods of holidays with pay, as well as remuneration for public holidays.
3. Every worker has a right to form or join a trade union of his choice for the promotion and protection of his economic and social interests.
4. Restrictions shall not be placed on the exercise of the right conferred by clause (3) of this article except restrictions prescribed by law and reasonably necessary in the interest of national security or public order or for the protection of the rights and freedoms of others⁹⁵.

Furthermore, under the Directive Principles of State Policy, the constitution clearly enumerates the political, economic, social, educational and cultural objectives of the nation. Under the economic objectives of the nation, the Constitution highlights, among other things, that

the State shall take all necessary action to ensure that the national economy is managed in such a manner as to maximize the rate of

economic development and to secure the maximum welfare, freedom and happiness of every person in Ghana and to provide adequate means of livelihood and suitable employment and public assistance to the needy⁹⁶.

Also, the National Development Planning Commission of Ghana describes the economic development of Ghana as being about more than “GDP growth” or any of the standard measures of economic activity. In its broadest and proper sense, “economic development” deals as much with growth (the expansion in goods and services) as it does with opportunities for citizens to participate in the very process that generates that growth. It implies efficiency, international competitiveness, equality, equity, safety, good health, and the mutual responsibilities of employers and employees in the pursuit of common good. Where for whatever reason, such as disability, infirmity or disaster, some citizens are unable to participate in the process, the State must stand ready to support them out of a collective sense of moral responsibility.

This view of economic development implies inter-dependence between economy and society and the need for development policy to recognize this relationship at all times. For example, efficiency, which is a prerequisite for boosting productivity and competitiveness, requires at the very least a well-educated and healthy citizenry. Higher productivity in turn is a necessary, though by no means, sufficient condition for raising wages and thus moving the country closer to its goal of poverty eradication. These complex relationships between economy and society have guided development policy in Ghana for decades and continue to do so.

The structure of the economy also matters in the formulation of economic policy, especially within the contest of transformation. With a dominant informal sector that accounts for 80-90 percent of

employment but only about 40 percent of economic outputs, policies aimed at transforming the sector into efficient hubs of production and productivity become crucial⁹⁷.

In the early 1980s, the country's economy was viewed to have been recovering from an economic recession that came on the back of the economic reform and structural adjustment program. The sustained growth since then has earned the country a lot of commendations in terms of economic achievement⁹⁸.

Ghana's economic performance has been quite strong over the past three decades during which the country pursued market-led economic policies and programs with minimal involvement of government in direct economic activities⁹⁹. Furthermore, in 2011, the country began commercial production of oil and this development contributed 5.4 percentage points to the 15.0% real GDP growth in that year with Ghana taking an enviable position as one of the six fastest growing economies in the world that year¹⁰⁰.

Concerns have however been raised about the quality of economic growth especially in terms of employment, inequality and general improvement in the livelihood of the Ghanaian people. Moreover, the growth rates have not been matched with improved livelihoods thus raising doubts about the trickle-down effects of growth¹⁰¹. Baah-Boateng in his article has stated that the employment generation trails economic growth with most jobs created in the informal sector where earnings are low¹⁰². The labor market is characterized by high levels of informal and/or vulnerable employment, coupled with high incidences of poverty particularly in rural areas and the northern savannah regions of the country¹⁰³.

The country also continues to battle with the problem of maternal, infant and child mortality as well as high levels of malaria-related death. While enrolment rates at the pre-tertiary levels have gone

up considerably, the school system still faces problems of the lack of high caliber teachers and teaching aids. Similarly, the higher educational system continues to roll out a large number of unemployable graduates¹⁰⁴.

2.12 Economic Development in Botswana

It is worthy to note that, Botswana has made considerable progress economically as well as in the provision of social services. At independence in 1966, the country was so poor that it could not even meet its recurrent budget obligations and therefore depended heavily on foreign aid. However the discovery of minerals in the late 1960s and early 1970s, coupled with good economic management and democratic governance, contributed significantly to the country's economic growth such that, by the mid-1990s, Botswana was a designated middle income country by the World Bank¹⁰⁵. According to a report by the World Bank, Botswana owes the chunk of its economic development to its abundance of natural resources especially diamonds. The mining industry currently accounts for over one-third of the country's GDP and 70-80 per cent of the country's earnings. Unlike many other African countries, the discovery of these natural resources did not cause any political instability and conflicts in the country over resource control. According to Acemoglu et al¹⁰⁶, "the discovery of these resources led the government to invest heavily in infrastructure, education and health". Additionally, according to Robinson, "investment in the ranching industry, in mining and in human capital has been facilitated by highly prudent and competent macroeconomic policy and stable property rights"¹⁰⁷.

By following strict economic policies, the country has been able to build up considerable savings and experience remarkably high economic growth which has helped maintain the country's

political and democratic system. Furthermore, Botswana's democratic tradition and open economy has allowed it to establish positive international relationships on the global front and become an important regional figure in southern Africa.

Despite all these remarkable successes of Botswana's economy, the country has also had its fair share of challenges in terms of the economy. As a leading exporter of diamonds, the country's economy rests on the global demand of this resource. In order to support the country's economic growth, Botswana's leaders need to come up with projects in order to diversify their economy through other sectors such as agriculture, tourism, foreign investment etc. this initiative will take the political will of the country's elites but if well-implemented, will take the country out of her resource dependent status¹⁰⁸.

2.13 Conclusion

From the information available above, it is evident that Ghana and Botswana have a good adoption and practice of liberal democracy and both countries seem to be on a good track. However, there is still much room for improvement and to chalk greater successes in the various principles on which good governance and socio-economic development exist particularly with human rights. Botswana on one hand have more work to do in the area of Gender-based violence and the eradication of the HIV/AIDS pandemic in the country since it puts a dent on the country's steady economic and political stability. In Ghana, there is the need to also see a link between the steady political stability the country has enjoyed since 1992 and the economic growth that the country is experiencing.

ENDNOTES

-
- ⁴³ Segrillo, Angelo. "Liberalism, Marxism and Democratic Theory Revisited: Proposal of a Joint Index of Political and Economic Democracy." *Brazilian Political Science Review* 6.2 (2012): 8-27. Pg. 8-9
- ⁴⁴ Ibid pg. 10
- ⁴⁵ Ibid pg. 12
- ⁴⁶ Ibid
- ⁴⁷ "Different Forms of Democracy." All Answers Ltd. ukessays.com, November 2013. Web. 4 August 2018. <<https://www.ukessays.com/essays/politics/different-forms-of-democracy-politics-essay.php?vref=1>>
- ⁴⁸ Ibid
- ⁴⁹ Ibid
- ⁵⁰ See The Constitution of Ghana
- ⁵¹ Ibid
- ⁵² Ibid
- ⁵³ Oquaye, Mike. *Politics in Ghana, 1982-1992: Rawlings, revolution, and populist democracy*. Tornado Publications, 2004. pg. 70
- ⁵⁴ Ibid.
- ⁵⁵ Fombad, Charles Manga. "The separation of powers and constitutionalism in Africa: The case of Botswana." *BC Third World LJ* 25 (2005).
- ⁵⁶ Ibid pg.110
- ⁵⁷ Ibid pg.113
- ⁵⁸ Oquaye, Mike, op. cit
- ⁵⁹ Ibid pg.70
- ⁶⁰ Oquaye, Mike, op. cit., pp. 71 - 72
- ⁶¹ Mander, Harsh, Mohammed Asif, and K. P. Sasi. *Good governance: Resource book*. Books for Change, 2004.
- ⁶² See The World Bank 1992 Governance and Development
- ⁶³ See 2015 Ghana Statistical Labor Force Report
- ⁶⁴ See Declaration of Human Rights, 1948
- ⁶⁵ See Article 12 (2) of Chapter 5 of the 1992 Constitution
- ⁶⁶ See the Constitution of the Republic of Botswana
- ⁶⁷ Maundeni, Zibani. "State culture and development in Botswana and Zimbabwe." *The Journal of Modern African Studies* 40.1 (2002): 105-132.
- ⁶⁸ Robinson, James. "Botswana as a role model for country success." *Achieving development success: strategies and lessons from the developing world* (2013): 187-203.
- ⁶⁹ Maudeni., op. cit,
- ⁷⁰ Country report: Africa's best kept secret: Botswana as a shining liberal democracy. p. 55
- ⁷¹ Ibid.
- ⁷² Acemoglu, D., S. Johnson, and J. A. Robinson. "An African Success Story: Botswana" forthcoming." (2001).
- ⁷³ Oquaye, Mike. *Politics in Ghana, 1982-1992: Rawlings, revolution, and populist democracy*. Tornado Publications, 2004, p. 4.
- ⁷⁴ Ibid
- ⁷⁵ Boafo-Arthur, Kwame. *Ghana: One decade of the liberal state*. Zed Books, 2007.p. 2
- ⁷⁶ Ibid
- ⁷⁷ Mike Oquaye, op. cit, p. 58.
- ⁷⁸ Boafo-Arthur, Kwame, op. cit.
- ⁷⁹ Ninsin, Kwame Akon, ed. *Ghana: Transition to democracy*. African Books Collective, 1998.p. 3

⁸⁰ Ibid

⁸¹ Holm, John D. "Liberal democracy and rural development in Botswana." *African Studies Review* 25.1 (1982), p. 83.

⁸² ibid

⁸³ See Botswana Case Study: Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in Public Administration pg. 5

⁸⁴ Ibid pg. 9

⁸⁵ Ayelazuno, Jasper. "Two Decades of Liberal Democracy in Ghana: A Critical Political Economy Perspective." *National Democratic Reforms in Africa*. Palgrave Macmillan, New York, 2015. p. 64.

⁸⁶ ibid

⁸⁷ See Simplified Constitution of the Republic of Botswana, April 2014.

⁸⁸ Sen, Amartya K. *Development as freedom*. Oxford University Press, 2001.

⁸⁹ "What Is Development?". *Center for Global Development*, 2018, <https://www.cgdev.org/blog/what-development>. Accessed 4 Aug 2018.

⁹⁰ <http://www.ndpc.gov.gh/four-pillars/>. Accessed 4 Aug 2018.

⁹¹ See Article 37 Chapter 6 of the amended Constitution of Ghana

⁹² See A Social Development Policy Framework for Botswana Phase II: Framework and Strategy Report, 26 May 2010.

⁹³ Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in Public Administration. Botswana Case Study 2012 op. cit. pg. 11

⁹⁴ Ibid

⁹⁵ See Article 24 Chapter 5 of The Constitution of Ghana

⁹⁶ ibid

⁹⁷ <http://www.ndpc.gov.gh/four-pillars/#economic> Accessed 4 Aug 2018

⁹⁸ Alagidede, Paul, William Baah-Boateng, and Edward Nketiah-Amponsah. "The Ghanaian economy: an overview." *Ghanaian Journal of Economics* 1.1 (2013). p. 5

⁹⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid

¹⁰¹ Ibid

¹⁰² Ibid

¹⁰³ Ibid

¹⁰⁴ Ibid

¹⁰⁵ Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in Public Administration. Botswana Case Study 2012 op. cit. pg. 9

¹⁰⁶ Acemoglu, D., Johnson, S., & Robinson, J., (2001, July 11). *An African Success Story: Botswana*. Retrieved on November 10, 2009 from <http://econwww.mit.edu/files/284>. Accessed 3 Aug 2018

¹⁰⁷ Ibid

¹⁰⁸ Ibid

CHAPTER THREE

ASSESSING THE INFLUENCE OF LIBERAL DEMOCRACY ON THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF GHANA AND BOTSWANA BETWEEN 2008 AND 2018

3.0 Introduction

This chapter focuses on three major indicators of the concept of socio-economic development in African states particularly Ghana and Botswana between 2008 and 2018. This assessment is centered on employment rates, public basic education, and quality of healthcare and how liberal democracy has influenced these areas of interest. This is because these three indicators, if left unattended to, have a dire effect on the stability of any country and the democratic nature of the country specifically. These areas affect the economic stability of any country and thus, must be given critical attention. The performance of the democratic nature of Ghana and Botswana will be measured using the Democratic Index of the Economist Intelligence Unit. These indicators that are key to the socio-economic development of any country are reviewed in the light of the gradual progression or deterioration of these standards within the given period of 2008 and 2018. The chapter relies mainly on data acquired from different reports and studies conducted by some individuals, institutions and organizations as well as interviews with experts in these areas. In view of this, the chapter will delve into the achievement and progress made by both countries from 2008 to 2018 and the role of Liberal Democracy in this development. Furthermore, certain hindrances to socio-economic development as posed by Liberal Democracy will be addressed and eventually conclude with how Liberal Democracy can be further used to promote high levels of socio-economic development.

3.1 Socio-economic Development Achieved from 2008 to 2018 in Ghana and Botswana

The Botswana Social Development Policy Phase II published in 2010 clearly outlines the objectives of social development in Botswana and to the Botswana government. It states that,

...social development for Botswana encompasses all policies that seek to ensure the equitable access of citizens to services and opportunities that improve their welfare and wellbeing. It covers access to main stream social services such as education and health, as well as special programs for disadvantaged or excluded social groups. It builds on notions of individual and community rights and entitlements, as well as on the state's responsibilities to all its citizens. Social development is an important priority for Botswana - a nation that has achieved impressive economic growth but that still suffers widespread poverty and one of the world's most unequal income distribution patterns. It is important too, as a means for Botswana to address and shape the rapid social transitions that it is currently experiencing¹⁰⁹.

Botswana is a country whose government revenue and economy is mostly gained from mineral exploitation and therefore, the government makes conscious efforts to ensure that this revenue is plowed into the improvement of the socio-economic development of the citizens. Due to this, particular attention is paid to the improvement of the social amenities of the citizens and lump sums of money are invested into these projects. By 2014 and 2015, with the exception of health and education, the largest areas of investment have been electricity and water (i.e. 21 percent), housing and urban infrastructure (15 percent), and roads (12 percent)¹¹⁰.

In Ghana's case, as already stated in the previous chapter, social development is viewed by the National Development and Planning Commission (NDPC) as an integral part of national development which includes human development and welfare. Therefore, policies which are formulated in this regard, cover a broad range of issues which include education, health, housing, employment, cultural activities and social protection. Social development is viewed as a way

through which safe, peaceful and sustainable communities can be created in tandem with the requirements of the Constitution and therefore create an avenue where Ghanaians can live productive, prosperous, and fulfilling lives in freedom and in peace¹¹¹.

In like manner, the economic development of the country is considered very paramount. The NDPC again asserts that economic development encompasses more than just “GDP growth” of any of the standard measures of economic activity. However, it also comprises of inter-dependence between economy and society and therefore it is expedient that development policies recognize this at all times¹¹². This therefore means that a spike or decrease in the economic state of the country directly affects the society and the people in it. High rises in inflation means high prices of goods and services on the market. In like manner, when the economy of the country is relatively stable, this means that the prices of goods and services are moderate enough for the citizens of the country and thus, has an effect on their social life and development.

This work is largely based on three indicators of socio-economic development in Ghana and Botswana i.e. employment rates, public basic education and services in the health systems. It is key to note that between the years 2008 and 2018, the socio-economic state of both countries have seen various increases and decreases due to various factors.

The first indicator of socio-economic development to be discussed in this work is youth employment rates. This is because analysts have asserted that particular attention needs to be directed towards Africa’s youth. With Africa’s youth bracket being more than 200 million people aged between 15 and 24 years, Africa has the youngest population in the world¹¹³. In spite of this booming number of youthful exuberance, fresh energy and ideas, the rate of unemployment on the

continent is derailing as each year, graduates from various educational institutions are introduced into the labor market with minimal opportunities of getting employed.

3.1.1 Youth Employment Rates in Ghana

The year 2008 can be classified as another transitional year for the nation. It was an election year that saw power handed over to the John Atta Mills administration of the National Democratic Congress (NDC) after the New Patriotic Party narrowly lost the 28 December 2008 runoff election. This signified Ghana's second peaceful transition of power from incumbent party to opposition and confirmed Ghana's place as a beacon of hope for democracy in Africa¹¹⁴.

According to Amankrah, Ghana's population of 24.39 million people has a youthful structure with the youth being defined officially as aged between 15 to 24 years and thus constituting about one out of every four of the population¹¹⁵. Despite the country's rather steady economic growth between 2006 and 2011, Ghana continues to battle with high incidence of joblessness and job-seeking. Baah-Boateng goes on to say that, unemployment in Ghana gives an indication of the state of the economy since there are willing job seekers on one hand and thus, limited job openings available imply policy failure with socio-political and economic effects. He believes that, the unavailability of jobs to job seekers causes them to engage in social vices such as robbery, prostitution and political unrest. He goes further to state that unemployment undeniably means the underutilization of human resources in the country. In that light, these resources go to waste and this does not only make them vulnerable to poverty but also is a loss of potential income tax revenue to the country¹¹⁶.

Table 1: Youth Unemployment Rates in Ghana from 2008 to 2017¹¹⁷

Gender/Years (%)	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Male	8.234	9.055	9.766	8.265	6.764	4.159	4.16	4.16	4.353	4.518
Female	9.763	10.628	11.529	9.779	8.028	5.001	4.904	4.9	5.123	5.328

Source: <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.UEM.1524.ZS?locations=GH>

Also, Ghana’s unemployment menace is said to be more prevalent in urban areas than in rural areas. This is mainly because there is a constant movement of people, especially the youth, from rural areas to the urban and peri-urban areas in their bid to find and gain access to better economic prospects which may not be present in rural areas. Further, the rural economic activity produces low income and these activities mostly come in the form of farming and this pushes the rural youth to the cities¹¹⁸.

Amankrah posits that, there are a number of factors that account for the growing youth unemployment in Ghana. According to him, on one hand, historical evidence indicates that youth unemployment in Ghana is due to a more than a whooping increase in the youthful population over the last forty years, and on the other hand, he posits that the failure of the economy to generate sufficient employment outlets is another cause¹¹⁹.

According to the Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment the causes of youth unemployment in Ghana are:

the introduction of the Junior Secondary School and Senior Secondary School system without adequate planning for integration into the trades/vocations and job placement; education and training have no link to the needs of the important sectors of the economy; the near collapse of Ghana’s industrial base due to ineffective management of the divestiture process which resulted in the closure of many factories without a structural transformation of the

economy to generate alternative jobs for people; the shrinking of public sector employment opportunities coupled with a relatively slow growth of the private sector; and the lack of a coherent national employment policy and comprehensive strategy to deal with the employment problem¹²⁰.

A report compiled by Nsowah-Nuamah and Amankrah also highlights some of the reasons for youth unemployment as being that, firstly, the proportion of unemployed youth in the country desire to work but are unable to because they do not have the right work experience and also are not getting the opportunity to fine-tune their chances of gainful employment. Also, they state that a number of the unemployed youth desire to improve their grades to continue their education and to seek for formal sector jobs. Furthermore, most of the unemployed youth are seeking to travel outside the country in search for job opportunities¹²¹.

3.1.1a Initiatives of Various Governments

Also, there was a revision of the education sector reform program. This was undertaken with the objective of increasing the access and involvement in education by the youth. Additionally, other initiatives like the introduction of the National Youth Volunteer Program by the Ghana National Service Scheme, the establishment of the Youth Venture Capital Fund, the enactment of a new Labor Law (Act 561) to ensure a more flexible labor market environment, the Disability Bill to address the employment needs of young persons with disability and the introduction of a demand-driven law for technical and vocational education were put in place to help curb the challenge of youth unemployment considerably¹²².

In view of this, certain initiatives have been put in place to address the menace of youth unemployment in the country. First of all, the Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare was restructured and renamed as the Ministry of Manpower Development and Employment in 2001 and later modified as Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment. This restructuring was done in order to make clear the message of the crucial role of employment generation in the nation's human resource development agenda. This was aimed at redirecting policies and programs to enhance youth employment¹²³.

In recent years, various governments have also taken up initiatives to help curb the danger of growing youth unemployment in the country. In the year 2006, the government under the Kufuor administration, initiated the National Youth Employment Programme seen as a major program to deal with the unemployment problem among the youth who according to the nation's 2000 Population and Housing Census constitute about 60% of the population of about 20 million.¹²⁴ The objective of the programme was to help in the reduction of unemployment, under-employment, satisfy national needs such as food security and equip the youth with some work experience for permanent employment within local communities. It was designed to aid in the long-term achievement of the Millennium Development Goal One of reducing poverty and extreme hunger. This program was to cover a wide range of economic enterprises and social service activities within the local communities. Under the programme, young people who were recruited were to exit after two years in search for permanent jobs in other sectors of the economy or continue with their education¹²⁵.

In the year 2014, the Parliament of Ghana passed into law the Ghana Youth Employment and Entrepreneurial Development Agency (GYEEDA) Bill to help in the restructuring and proper management of the Agency¹²⁶. Similarly, under the John Mahama administration, the Youth

Employment Act 887 was passed by Parliament and assented to by the President in 2015 with the objective of setting up the Youth Employment Agency to “develop, coordinate, supervise and facilitate the creation of jobs for the youth in the country”¹²⁷.

The Akufo-Addo administration has rolled out a new initiative known as the Nation Builders Corps (NaBCo) aimed at addressing graduate unemployment in Ghana. The programme was launched by President Nana Addo Dankwa Akufo Addo in May 2018 and has as a priority to employ the raw capacities of unemployed graduates and furnish them with skills through a process of value addition and training¹²⁸. Under seven modules; namely, Educate Ghana, Heal Ghana, Feed Ghana, Revenue Ghana, Digitize Ghana, Civic Ghana and Enterprise Ghana, the scheme will employ 100,000 graduates in 2018 across all the regions of the country. It is scheduled to start in September 2018. These seven modules will engage various trained professional to help in these key areas of the nation’s development and is open to all Ghanaians who have successfully executed their national service obligations¹²⁹.

Furthermore, the main agenda for the Akufo-Addo administration is the creation of prosperity and opportunity for all with the Agenda for jobs. With this in mind, most of the government initiatives set up by this administration is tailored towards the creation of numerous job opportunities for all people especially the youth. This can be seen in the flagship initiatives of Planting for Food and Jobs where the youth are involved to help produce more food products to feed the Ghanaian populace and also provide employment through agriculture; the initiation of the One District One Factory Policy which shifts job opportunities from concentrated areas like Accra and Kumasi, and moves it farther into the district and local level of the country.

Tragically, the rate of youth unemployment in the country seems to be escalating with each passing year. It has been estimated that the youth unemployment rate came as close to 29% in 2009¹³⁰. Despite these laudable efforts, youth unemployment continues to be an issue of concern because of the growing gap between labor supply and the opportunities for wage employment at the firm level. Another disturbing phenomena is the increasing number of young persons who live, sleep and work on the streets which in turn increases the incidence of poverty¹³¹.

Also, the National Youth Employment Programme (NYEP) as initiated by the Kufuor administration has proven to be woefully inadequate in sustainably dealing with the huge problems of unemployment among Ghana's youth due to setbacks it suffers. By the end of 2011, the NYEP had offered jobs to only about 108, 000 Ghanaians but this can be considered as very minimal since this is statistically negligible and the program does not address the specific interest of the youth to secure good and sustainable jobs for a solid future. The youth are trained in a specific interest area and thus look out for jobs and opportunities within those areas of interest. In view of this, for the first time in history, the Unemployed Graduates Association of Ghana, an establishment which seeks to support the welfare of all unemployed graduates and unemployed youth in Ghana, was launched in 2011 to protest about the rapid rate of youth unemployment among all categories of youth in the country in spite of the existence and fully operational National Youth Employment Program¹³².

In view of all these developments, Ransford Gyampo posits that, the importance of governance and representative democracy is for elected leaders to formulate and implement appropriate policies on behalf of the people to deal with the challenge of poverty and under-development among them. He establishes that in doing this, it is sometimes expedient to consult the people, particularly, the group that a policy is targeted at, to ensure that first-hand and adequate

information is gathered to aid in the designing and implementation of appropriate policies to deal with that group's needs¹³³.

To a large extent, it can be asserted that these various initiatives as rolled out by various administrations have not fully addressed the problem posed by the increasing rate of youth unemployment in the country and therefore have to be revisited to solve the problem.

3.1.1c Place of Liberal Democracy in Employment Promotion

The issue regarding quality, security and dignity to work has been a subject of international conventions and declarations and national laws of which Ghana has signed on to. A typical example of this is the convention of the International Labor Organization (ILO) that lays down international standards on subjects such as the rights of workers to organize, to bargain collectively and to work in a secure, healthy and protected environment and also prohibits the use of forced labor and child labor. Ghana is a signatory to all the core conventions on International labor standards¹³⁴.

Furthermore, the 1992 Constitution of Ghana in accordance with Article 24(1) upholds the “right to work under satisfactory, safe and healthy conditions”, with “the assurance of rest and leisure”. Article 36 of the Constitution also stipulates that the state must put in necessary measures to ensure that the national economy is managed in such a way as to, inter alia, provide means of livelihood and sustainable employment to the needy¹³⁵.

The 2008 Manifesto of the New Patriotic Party highlights the various achievements made by President John Agyekum Kufuor during his tenure in office. The Manifesto states that the Kufuor

administration, under the National Youth Employment Programme, created 108, 000 new jobs for unemployed young people across the country and gave them the chance to earn a living and support themselves¹³⁶.

In that same vein, the 2008 Manifesto of the National Democratic Congress (NDC) under President John Evans Atta-Mills clearly highlights the fact that Ghana has the resources for all Ghanaians to enjoy a dignified livelihood through employment. Therefore, the NDC manifesto stated that their policies towards investment in agriculture, industry, forestry and mining would be geared towards the creation of employment and opportunity in all sectors¹³⁷.

In view of that, the NDC decided to:

1. Launch a major public works and infrastructure programme for job generation.
2. Attract outsourced computer-based contracts in the ICT “parks” across Ghana.
3. Train top Senior Secondary School graduates from all regions of Ghana in ICT and mobile phone technology.
4. Require more products to be assembled in Ghana, to provide jobs and support a machine tools industry in Kumasi and Sekondi for a sustainable manufacturing.
5. Invest in manufacturing of building materials in all regions of Ghana.
6. Expand nursing and midwifery colleges and increase new student intake for medical jobs.
7. Support small businesses in the trades (mechanics, electricians, drivers, hairdressers, dressmakers, masons, plumbers, carpenters and others) with credit and training.
8. Give cooperatives tax benefits, access to loans and grants, access to public works projects and special procurement linkages.
9. Complete the Sekondi Naval Workshop for refurbishment of ships, boats and trains.

10. Make school systems relevant to the needs of labour and industry to produce employable graduates in fields that require a high skills base.
11. Offer tax incentives for private sector employers that hire new tertiary graduates.
12. Review previous and current youth employment programmes, adding new programmes for targeted sectors and for Entrepreneurial Development among our youth¹³⁸.

Furthermore, the 2016 Manifesto of the New Patriotic Party (NPP) states that, one of the mandates of the party would be designed to help shape the youth to discover new technologies, innovation and growth in the future. They intend to do this through the development of “leadership skills, quality education, entrepreneurship, job skills, creative skills and sports.” The NPP Manifesto highlights the intention of the new government in the creation of a suitable environment to build the capability of the youth to involve themselves in more active roles in the country’s future and development¹³⁹.

In order to fully accomplish the above-stated objectives, the NPP government will concentrate on the following:

- a. setting up a Youth Development Authority (YDA) to harmonise and coordinate all government-sponsored youth initiatives and policies
- b. establishing a Youth Enterprises Fund (YEF) that will provide funding and business development services for businesses owned by young entrepreneurs, especially start-ups
- c. developing industrial parks in all regions targeting young Ghanaians, who start or wish to start small businesses, to provide them with access to workspaces, equipment and basic services, including electricity and water
- d. implementing our proposed policy that ensures businesses established by young entrepreneurs under the Youth Enterprise Fund (YEF) participate in bidding for the 30% of the required 70% of

Government-funded contracts to be sourced from entities owned by women, persons with disability and young persons

e. offering tax incentives to young entrepreneurs to encourage them to initiate start-ups

f. introducing tax credits and other incentives for companies that hire young graduates from tertiary institutions

g. concentrating on ICT training to create job avenues locally and offshore for our youth, and

h. instituting a Buy-Local policy for Government agencies with regards to ICT to ensure that applications and software are procured from local ICT firms¹⁴⁰.

These above-stated initiatives shows various governments’ commitment and efforts to help ameliorate the employment state of Ghana. These government interventions are all structured using the 1992 Constitution of Ghana as the spectacle through which all these objectives are viewed and based upon. Therefore, it is worthy to note that, the Constitution which is an integral part of Liberal Democracy is used to guide government’s interventions and policies on employment directed towards its socio-economic development at large.

3.1.2 Youth Employment Rates in Botswana

Table 2: Youth unemployment rates in Botswana from 2008 to 2017¹⁴¹

Gender/Years (%)	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Male	27.03	26.245	29.248	29.247	29.247	29.243	29.245	29.246	29.636	29.702
Female	39.461	40.458	42.947	42.793	42.7	43	42.679	42.405	42.725	42.571

Source: <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.UEM.1524.ZS?locations=BW>

Studies conducted have shown that since 1998, the unemployment rate in Botswana has seen a steady decrease. Statistics show that unemployment in Botswana seemed to have declined from 19.6 percent in 1998 to 15.8 percent in the year 2000 and this was achieved despite the slower growth of non-mining GDP¹⁴².

Similarly, Latang Sechele also reports that in spite of the impressive economic record of Botswana, the country continues to struggle with problems of poverty, inequality and high levels of unemployment. He highlights that while the unemployment rate for the whole country is 17.8 percent as according to the 2011 Population and Housing Census, unemployment rates for the different categories of youth are more than twice the national and adult rates. He believes that youth unemployment is considered to be a major concern among officials and politicians in the country¹⁴³. As expected, education significantly enhances the chances of being employed in Botswana. The smallest change in education increases the probability of being employed by a fraction. It is believed that less education is usually associated with lower-skilled and less permanent jobs. The results on education are reflective of the fact that Botswana's unemployment is largely structural. In that, most of the unemployed have less education and no useful skills¹⁴⁴.

Despite the persistent efforts of Government to pursue a policy of balanced growth, employment creation is concentrated in the urban areas. Most good jobs are found in the urban areas with the notion being that those jobs act as magnets to the labor force, but the jobs created are not enough for the growing labor force. Most of these jobs are found in the urban areas because basically, the infrastructure and facilities in the rural areas are not as developed as the ones in the urban areas and also because the market is limited in the rural areas and may not be as good as the ones in the rural areas because the people in the rural areas are relatively poorer than those in the urban areas¹⁴⁵.

A survey conducted by Siphambe indicates that the majority of the unemployed in Botswana were women. It was estimated, in the 2005-06 dated Labor Force Survey that female youth between the ages of 12 – 29, had an unemployment rate of 31.8 percent, while that of males was 23.3 percent. Unemployment was therefore concentrated among women and the youth. The youth are evidently unemployed because they have lower on-the-job experience¹⁴⁶. Despite all these statistics which go to show that the unemployment rate in Botswana is relatively high, it does not seem to be a major social challenge to the country. This is because most people who have declared the unemployment status are actually individuals who seem to have family support. They are people who would not want to work for just “anything” but rather have a specific wage expectation which they refuse to lower. This is mainly due to the existence of government relief programs and social safety nets which gives workers the opportunity to afford to remain unemployed and not take up work in agriculture because government programs are enough to sustain their daily livelihood¹⁴⁷.

Another reason for unemployment in Botswana could also be that, a large number of citizens see themselves to be too educated for some of the jobs available. This was mainly due to the fact that in past years, with a junior certificate, one could easily have worked in a white-collar job, given that the country started from a scarcity of human capital. But given the relative abundance of educated graduates in recent years, this is no longer the case and therefore more and more of the youth labor is beginning to accept these jobs though after some unsuccessful search for a white-collar job¹⁴⁸.

3.1.2a Initiatives of Various Governments

As part of his pledges to the citizenry upon his assumption of office, the then President of Botswana, Gen. Lt. Ian Khama Seretse pledged to vehemently address the issue of unemployment in Botswana. Every Ministry was mandated with incorporating these priorities into their various agenda. In view of this, the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs, in 2016, created opportunities that would help expose the youth to the job market. In view of this, by August 2016, a total of 1546 youth were attached under different youth empowerment programmes across the Ministry and its agencies¹⁴⁹.

The Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs under the auspices of the government of Botswana has tirelessly tried, however, to battle the menace of youth unemployment in the country. In November 2008, the government introduced the National Internship Programme for unemployed graduates in the country. The aim of this programme was to provide internship opportunities for graduates within the government and or private sector for a maximum of two years. This was to facilitate the acquisition of skills for youth employability and help in the smooth integration of graduates into the labor market¹⁵⁰.

Despite the government's initiative to help unemployed graduates, it happened that just a few have been integrated into the labour market after the stipulated two years and the rest went back to their unemployed status¹⁵¹. To correct the gap created by the National Internship Programme, the Botswana government in 2015 introduced a new programme known as the Graduate Volunteer Scheme. This programme was to help improve the employment abilities of graduates through their contribution to community projects. This was to help them gain on-the-job training and experience

and be given priority for placement in the National Internship Programme should they be on the waiting list¹⁵².

However, some analysts like Geomeone Mogomotsi and Patricia Madigele have come out to state that, these temporary interventions by the government do not help in providing solutions to the country's youth unemployment menace. Rather, they believe that there is the need for long-term employment initiatives which will do better in resolving the unemployment problem the country faces. These short-term programmes have been criticized as they are viewed as a means for the government and the private sector to recycle interns without giving them permanent jobs and thus exploiting these graduates by using them as qualified cheap labour¹⁵³.

3.1.2b Place of Liberal Democracy in Employment Promotion

The government of Botswana in its bid to improve employment situations in the country have ratified the core International Labour Organization conventions¹⁵⁴.

The Employment Act of Botswana which was first enacted and assented by Parliament in 2006 revises and consolidates the laws governing individual employment relationships. It highlights the basic minimum terms and conditions of employment for the private sector, parastatal corporations and public employees. It further outlines the role of parties to an employment contract, maximum hours of work, entitlement to various types of leave, minimum wages, and permissible ways of terminating contracts¹⁵⁵.

Furthermore, according to the Botswana Core Welfare Indicator Survey in 2009 and 2010, the overall total formal sector employment increased from 315,791 in 2008 to 323, 803 in 2009 and

then to 335,156 in 2011¹⁵⁶. This showed a large commitment of governments towards the improvement of employment rates in the country.

3.1.3 Public Basic Education in Ghana

The Ministry of Education is responsible for all policies on education, including apprenticeships and wider skills acquisition in Ghana. It is their mandate to provide education that ensure opportunity is equal for all, no matter what their background or family situations¹⁵⁷.

It is their vision:

...to provide relevant education to all Ghanaians at all levels to enable them to acquire skills that will assist them to develop their potential in order to be productive, promotion of technology culture at all levels of society to facilitate poverty reduction and to promote socio-economic growth and national development¹⁵⁸.

Due to this concept, the delivery of education in Ghana is considered a right for all citizens of school age. Therefore, no person of school going age must be denied education¹⁵⁹. In Ghana's bid to ensure that the relevance of education is not overlooked in the Ghanaian society, Ghana became a signatory to the Education for All policy and ascribed to the goals of the policy. The Six Dakar Goals of the EFA were:

1. Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children.
2. Ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to and complete, free and compulsory primary education of good quality.

3. Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life-skills programs.
4. Achieving a 50% improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.
5. Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality
6. Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills¹⁶⁰.

The Ministry of Education in 2017 redefined Basic Education as consisting of primary, secondary, technical. Vocational and agricultural education¹⁶¹. However, this work will only concentrate on primary education and initiatives made by various governments towards gaining easy access to primary education.

In order to improve the quality of education of Ghana, EFA was largely pursued by the country in 2000 but then, met some challenges which included lack of financial and material resources, inadequate school infrastructure, shortage of qualified teachers particularly in rural, remote and underserved communities, poor road networks linking rural communities, difficulty in obtaining credible and reliable data in schools and elsewhere, undue interference from outsiders in educational administrative matters, indifference of parents and community members on educational matters, and the lack of strong political will¹⁶². Therefore, the government decided to put together some strategies which would aid in the correcting and curbing of some of the challenges listed above that affected the earlier implementation of the EFA. Some of the strategies decided on were the training of more qualified teachers and ensuring fair deployment to underserved areas backed by incentives, putting in place measures to ensure effective record

keeping and management particularly in schools so that reliable data can always be gathered on both student and teacher performance, the making available of adequate infrastructure for schools to take care of the needs of remote communities, strengthening of education of parents and community members on the essence to support education in more positive ways¹⁶³.

3.1.3a Initiatives of Various Governments

In order to meet the international standards of education, Ghana's education sector went through a number of reforms and all these policies are enshrined in the Education Strategic Plan that was to run from the year 2010 to the year 2020. This plan was an update to an initial policy known as the Education Strategic Plan 2003 – 2015¹⁶⁴. In the year 2008, Parliament of Ghana passed the Education Act 778, which was to provide for the establishment of an educational system with the intentions of producing,

well-balanced individuals with the required knowledge, skills, values, aptitudes and attitudes in order to be functional and operational citizens for the total development and the democratic advancement of the nation, and for related matters¹⁶⁵.

This Act which was enacted by the President and Parliament, highlights three progressive levels of the country's education system:

1. basic education, which comprises of two years of kindergarten education
2. six years of primary education and
3. three years of junior high school education.

The Act also made second-cycle education a four-year program, even though that was later reverted to three years in 2009¹⁶⁶. Further, the Act made provisions for non-formal and life-long

education where the Ministry of Education and District Assemblies establish open colleges in the country's districts. Furthermore, the Act presented opportunities for every child of, at least, four years to have access to basic school education as recognized by the Minister of Education. The Act, again, through the FCUBE, makes room for free and compulsory access to basic education where the District Assemblies provide the necessary infrastructure and other facilities to help in educating the child. In order to ensure that every child enjoys quality basic education, the Act stipulates that parents who deny their children education will have to appear before the social welfare committees of the District Assemblies for the needed action to be taken¹⁶⁷.

The Act, therefore, makes provision where education is made available to all, regardless of one's sex, physical disability, tribe, geographic location, economic status or political affiliation. With that established, any parent who is found guilty to be impede the education of a ward will be considered to have committed an offense and may be tantamount to prosecution at the law courts¹⁶⁸.

Since 2008, various governments have allocated huge sums of money to the educational sector to aid in the establishment of a sound and solid education system. Below is a table entailing various budgetary allocations to education from 2008 to 2018:

ANNUAL BUDGETARY ALLOCATIONS FOR EDUCATION FROM 2008 TO 2018

YEAR	AMOUNT
2008	GH¢1,264,902,043
2009	GH¢ 1,693,735,829

2010	GHC1.7bn
2011	GHC1,983,217,447.00
2012	GHC2,871,680,218
2013	GH¢4,412,695,383
2014	GH¢5,816,315,034
2015	GHC6,740,437,383.00
2016	GHC6,532,352,029.00
2017	GHC8.33bn
2018	GHC9.26bn

Source: Budget Statement and Economic Policy of the Government of Ghana 2017 Financial Year pg. 101

The data above shows that there has been a steady increase in the annual budgetary allocation given to the improvement of the education system in Ghana. The budget shown above clearly shows that, over the years, various governments have been committed to the advancement of the education system in the country.

3.1.3b Place of Liberal Democracy in Public Basic Education in Ghana

With regards to education, the NPP government under President John Agyekum Kufuor, in their manifesto stated that their major achievement was the massive improvement and expansion in quality and affordable education. There was an introduction of the School Feeding Programme, Capitation Grant and the availability of free Metro Bus rides for children in the basic school so as to make education affordable and accessible to all Ghanaians. These policies stated above showed the commitment of the Kufuor government to make basic primary education very accessible to the

Ghanaian populace. For most, movement to school became quite easy since there was ready transportation and at vantage points. With regards to the School Feeding Programme, children whose parents could not afford feeding systems on their own had to rely on this initiative and this considerably reduced the burden on most parents who could not shoulder it¹⁶⁹.

As a signatory to the Millennium Development Goal 2, which advocates for universal primary education, Ghana was to ensure that by 2015, children of all gender and everywhere, had been able to complete a full course in primary schooling¹⁷⁰. With regards to the achievement of these targets through these government interventions, Ghana recorded an increase in school enrolment on the whole. The country saw an increase in enrolment from 86.3 per cent enrolment in the 2008/2009 academic year to 97.5 per cent in the 2013/2014 academic year¹⁷¹. However, the report went further to state that the country encountered some challenges such as inadequate infrastructure and basic tools, equipment and materials for teaching and learning in schools, high levels of absenteeism and lateness among teachers and the inability to retain trained teachers¹⁷².

In that light, the 2010 Population and Housing Census as organized by the Ghana Statistical Service showed that children in the age group 6 to 11 in primary school was 74.6 percent as compared to the 2000 Population and Housing Census which was 61.4%¹⁷³. This therefore indicate that over a period of 10 years, there has been a steady increase in enrolment of children at the primary level of education.

In 2012 also, the manifesto of the National Democratic Congress highlights some of the strategies that their government would put in place to ensure access to basic primary education in the country. They enumerated that there would be an establishing of schools so that no child would walk more than 3 kilometres to school. Also, they pledged to introduce transparency and strengthen management and operations of the school feeding programme and also expand coverage to include

all primary level education. By 2016, the NDC government had achieved some remarkable success with regards to their promises in 2012. Out of these achievements are the increment of 26% of educational institutions to cover not only primary education, but all levels of basic education. These institutions increased from 45,447 in the 2008/2009 academic year to over 57,270 in the 2014/2015 academic year. Also, there was an increase in the number of pupils who benefited from the School Feeding Programme from 440,000 in 2008 to 1.7 million in 2014. This shows the commitment level of the NDC government to the amelioration of the public basic primary education of Ghana.

3.1.4 Public Basic Education in Botswana

The Education for 'Kagisano' (social harmony) is Botswana's first educational policy which was anchored on four national policies of democracy, development, self-reliance and unity and provided policy framework for the development of education in the country from 1977 to 1993. However, in the early 1990s, the country's socio-economic situation changed significantly and this resulted in a review of policies and strategies for the country's educational development and thus the development of the 1994 Revised National Policy on Education and the Vision 2016 to provide direction for Botswana's educational system¹⁷⁴.

Botswana's basic education is made up of primary and junior secondary levels of education where the primary education is run for seven years while the junior secondary education runs for three years. After the completion of the junior secondary, students go through two years of senior secondary education. Botswana's education has the mandate of promoting universal access to primary and junior secondary education. However, there is a process of academic selectivity that

reduces entrance into the senior secondary schools and the tertiary levels of education and this includes the universities¹⁷⁵.

As at 2012, there were 812 public and private primary schools. 207 public junior secondary schools, 32 senior secondary schools. 44 unified private secondary schools. Also, there are 8 technical colleges, 37 vocational institutions/brigades and 43 tertiary institutions in the country. Furthermore, education is free yet not compulsory. The Ministry of Education and Skills Development has authority over Botswana's entire education system save the University of Botswana and other private basic and tertiary education institutions¹⁷⁶.

3.1.4a Initiatives of Various Governments

Like Ghana, Botswana is a signatory to the Education for All (EFA) movement which is a global commitment to provide quality basic education for all children, youth, and adults. EFA was initiated in 1990 at a conference which declared education as a fundamental human right and thus emphasized universal access to education. Nonetheless, during that era of the global declaration of education as a fundamental human right, Botswana had already identified education as a necessity for national development and declared education as a basic human right and thus necessary for both social and individual development. In that regard, the provision of basic education during that time meant that there was the need to organize learning opportunities to enable both children and adults to learn basic literacy and numeracy skills, and also to achieve an educational level which is similar to a junior certificate¹⁷⁷.

All these point to the fact that various governments of Botswana have consciously put measures in place to ensure that public basic education especially primary education is freely offered to all

citizens of Botswana in order that these citizens will have some basic reading and numeracy skills at their disposal. It is safe to say that various administrations have pursued and refined educational policies drawn since 1994 to fit the dynamic socio-economic life of the country and this is a laudable effort. Though old, these policies that have been modified over time still remain a priority to all governments.

These initiatives by various governments have positively influenced the education system of the country since the public investment in education is high and reaching as much as 9% of the country's gross domestic product (GDP). As at 2014, primary school enrollment stood at 90%. By 2009, this enrollment helped the government's aim to achieve universal basic education and thus, has resulted in between 96 – 1005 of students furthering their education to the secondary level¹⁷⁸.

3.1.4b Place of Liberal Democracy

Furthermore, Botswana took advantage of the Millennium Development Goal 2 which pushed for the achievement of universal primary education with a target of ensuring that children everywhere, boys and girls alike, would attain a full course of primary schooling by the year 2015. Therefore, the government of Botswana set up a 5-year Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan i.e. ETSSP: 2015 – 2020 to help guide decision makers and planners to easily identify several challenges within the education system and therefore work to reform and improve it. This Plan addresses issues in the light of quality, relevance, access, equity, and accountability with the intent of matching qualifications and labor market requirements “in order to align education outputs with future employment needs”¹⁷⁹.

With regards to innovations in the curriculum, policies were reviewed and reformed such that there was an introduction of pre-school education in Botswana. Even though pre-primary education was not a priority in the first national policy of Botswana, its importance was later recognized and incorporated into the education system. The ETSSP rolled out in 2015 strongly emphasizes the relevance of early childhood education, professional and pedagogical renewal¹⁸⁰.

Regardless of all these strides made in the increasing enrollment of students, Botswana still faces the problem of student learning outcomes. This is owed to the low quality and importance of education and training and this has affected Botswana's workforce in that it is plagued with inadequate skills to satisfy the current labor demands and this has led to a shortage of skilled labor¹⁸¹. This is mainly due to the fact that, the number of graduates churned out each year do not have the prerequisite skills to satisfy the job market. Very few graduates have acquired the necessary hands-on job knowledge and training that is needed to fit into the labor market mainly because there was no sync between the education and training available and the required skills needed by the labor market.

However, there are still some challenges that the education system of Botswana faces after the implementation of various reforms and adjustments, even though the government put in place the Vision 2016 policy which was to ensure that by the year 2016 there would be a transformation of the Botswana society to one which was educated and informed, the education system has fallen short of this vision. This is due to certain challenges such as the unavailability of education facilities to children in underserved areas and teachers also not being fully equipped with the necessary skills to train students on how to excel in their exams, facing the education system till date and thus not all Botswana are educated. Children from underserved communities still fail to complete their school program and there are still street children who have no access to any form

of education. Furthermore, this has translated into high rates of graduate unemployment due to the failure of most students and graduates rolled out yearly to satisfy industry requirements¹⁸².

More so, even though the government has allocated a sizeable portion of the budget to improving the quality of education in the country, the outcome is still questionable. Despite the remarkable investment of about 28.8% of the national budget in education, there are still cases of either several children still dropping out of school before completing their term of study or performing poorly in the national or international examinations. In view of this, many teachers have been sent for further studies to improve their teaching strategies¹⁸³.

3.1.5 Healthcare Quality in Ghana

In recent years, various administrations under various presidents have introduced policies to the improvement of the health systems in the country. His Excellency Nana Addo Danquah Akufo-Addo has stated that,

The health system in the country is critical for national development. Our vision is to see that the right to health of all Ghanaians is guaranteed through an established health sector with sustainable ability to deliver affordable, equitable and easily accessible healthcare. To realize this vision, we will expand health promotion programs, scale up disease prevention strategies and improve access to curative and emergency services, through vigorous human resource and health infrastructure development and strengthening of the National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS)¹⁸⁴.

Frank Drislane et al highlight that Ghana is a developing country in West Africa with a population of about 25 million. They posit that medical conditions in Ghana overlap with those in other

developed countries but the more prominent ones in Ghana include trauma, infection and women's health conditions¹⁸⁵. They assert that medical practice in Africa is faced with the extremity of limited resources, a multiplicity of languages especially in the case of Ghana and appearance of grave illnesses at later stages than seen elsewhere. But they agree that despite these hindrances, Ghana has established a relatively successful national medical insurance system, and the quality of medical practice is high in places where it is available¹⁸⁶. They state that Ghana has established a sophisticated administrative structure to oversee medical education and accreditation, but there has been some difficulty in extending medical training to rural areas, where health care establishments lack personnel. They clearly state that physicians are sorely lacking in rural areas since there are few because of the unfavorable working conditions and financial constraints. In such places, hospital wards and clinics are crowded and there is very limited time to attend to each patient's needs¹⁸⁷.

Ghana's medical system is concentrated mostly in Accra which is the capital of the country and Kumasi which is in the center of the country. It is very hard to retain medical practitioners and health facilities in rural areas even though that is where most of the population lives¹⁸⁸. Most of the illnesses within Ghana, as stated by Drislane et al, include infections very common to tropical areas, trauma, and women's health problems such as complications during pregnancy. Infections primarily dominate the regular visits of patients to hospitals and in these instances, malaria infections are very rampant. In this case, the ailment is easily cured over a three-day period with pills distributed by the government, but many people are infected with malaria consistently and if not treated can be deadly¹⁸⁹.

Sometimes, there are recurrent cases of tuberculosis infection as well as cases of typhus infection, filariasis and schistosomiasis. Also, there are common cases of HIV infection and studies have

shown that “about half of the patients in Ghana who die with HIV do so from consequences of tuberculosis”¹⁹⁰. Other types of illnesses that plague the Ghanaian populace are trauma, diabetes, heart disease and cancer, asthma and sickle cell diseases but these cases are on lesser scales as compared to the rampant events of malaria and HIV infections in the country¹⁹¹.

The National Healthcare Quality strategy together with key stakeholders of the nation’s health care system define healthcare quality as being,

...the degree to which health care interventions are in accordance with standards and are safe, efficient, effective, timely, equitable, accessible, client-centered, apply appropriate technology and result in positive health outcomes, provided by an empowered workforce in an enabling environment¹⁹².

3.1.5a Initiatives of Various Governments

Under the John Agyekum Kufour administration, the President charged the Ministry of Health and collaborators to establish a national ambulance service. Due to this directive and the commendable efforts of officers in the health sector, the National Fire Service, the Office of the State Attorney and others, the National Ambulance Service was initiated in 2004 and became fully operational in 2006¹⁹³. The National Ambulance Service was established in order to provide easy transfer options to patients who need complex care and have been referred to a higher level hospital from a first-level hospital¹⁹⁴. It is also to transfer patients from their homes to medical facilities to be given the necessary medical attention. It is worthy to note that the number of responses provided from National Ambulance Services increased from 205 in 2004 to 1,598 in 2005 to a significant 7,810 in 2012; 17,204 in 2013 and 20,236 in 2014¹⁹⁵.

To help facilitate these objectives stated above by the National Healthcare Quality Strategy, the MoH has put in place a number of policies and frameworks to help implement their set goals.

Some of these policies are Ghana National Healthcare Quality Strategy from 2017 – 2021, the Anti-Malaria Drug Policy, the National Community-based Health Planning and Services (CHPS) policy, the National Health Insurance Policy Framework and many others¹⁹⁶. These policies introduced by the MoH have been able to aid in the improvement of the healthcare quality of the country.

The establishment of Community-based Health Planning and Services (CHPS) in March 2016 has been one of the achievements of government under the Mahama administration. These CHPS centers were established to help government achieve its aim of fast-tracking the realization of universal health coverage and bridge the inequity gap to health services¹⁹⁷. The CHPS program was established based on the fact that over 70% of Ghanaians live more than 8 kilometers away from the nearest health care provider. The effects of living so far from health facilities is further exacerbated by poor roads and inadequate transportation systems. The government therefore demonstrated its commitment to the establishment of CHPS compounds through announcing voluntary 10% salary cut from the President, Vice President, Ministers and other appointees to support the vision. The government then further instituted that each District Assembly was to construct two CHPS compounds per year. Furthermore, the Ministry of Health and its key stakeholders were mandated to work closely to scale up the construction of CHPS compounds¹⁹⁸.

Also, since 1998, Ghana has committed itself to the Roll Back Malaria Initiative of the World Health Organization, which is established on the Global Malaria strategy with a focus on Africa and an aim to reduce the world's malaria burden by half by 2010. In view of that, Ghana drew up a “Medium Term Strategic Plan for Malaria Control in Ghana” in 2007, which was set to improve the coverage of malaria control activities by adopting an inter-sectoral approach involving and promoting partnership with the private sector and the community. Ghana has also signed on to the

Abuja Declaration on Roll Back Malaria in Africa which, in like manner, seeks to achieve set targets on malaria prevention and control¹⁹⁹.

However, according to the policy, in spite of all these initiatives to help curb the incidence of malaria in the country, it still remains hyper endemic and is the single most rampant cause of mortality and morbidity especially among children under five years, pregnant women and the poor. Apart from the health effects, malaria places a heavy burden on productivity and hence economic development in Ghana, therefore malaria control is identified as one of the key health sector interventions²⁰⁰. The objective of the Anti-Malaria Policy for Ghana is “to provide prompt, safe, effective and appropriate anti-malaria treatment to the entire population”. This has been achieved over the years through the distribution of various malaria drugs like artesunate-amodiaquine, which have been modified over the years to combat the changing levels of anti-malaria drugs resistance²⁰¹.

To aid in the effective minimization of the high rate of infections of malaria across the country, the Ministry of Health and other relevant agencies shall ensure the availability of all necessary anti-malarial for the treatment of uncomplicated and severe malaria. Also, the Food and Drugs Board (FDB) monitors the quality as well as any reported Adverse Drug Reactions (ADRs) resulting from the use of all anti-malarials in accordance with the provisions of the Ghana National Drug Policy.

3.1.5b The Place of Liberal Democracy in Quality Healthcare in Ghana

Ghana, as a signatory to the Sustainable Development Goals set up by the United Nations strongly believes that the compliance and achievement of these goals will go a long way to establish the development life of the country. With relation to health, Ghana believes that the ensuring healthy lives and promoting well-being for all at all ages is important to building flourishing societies²⁰². Ghana believes that access to good health care is a human right, and believes that the Sustainable Development Agenda presents a new chance to ensure that everyone has access to decent quality and reliable health care. Therefore, Ghana believes that the Sustainable Development Goal 3 is pivotal in order to help curb the menace of the various health conditions that affect the Ghanaian populace and due to this, has incorporated the goal into all developmental projects of the country²⁰³.

3.1.6 Healthcare Quality in Botswana

In order to monitor and facilitate the development of the health system as well as other systems in Botswana, the government of Botswana rolled out a National Development Plan, which is revised after every 5 to 7-year period. In health, the emphasis has been laid on consistently improving both the depth and breadth of public provision. The emphasis was initially laid on extending primary healthcare to the entire populace and then followed by upgrading of district, primary and referral hospitals. However, the HIV/AIDS epidemic that came up in the 1990s placed additional demands on healthcare and in view of that, Botswana introduced a program of free provision of anti-retroviral therapy to all affected citizens through the public health service²⁰⁴.

Between 1967 and 2014, there has been an exponential growth with regards to the improvement of the health system of the country. After independence, the country could only boast of 194 nurses but by 2014, counted 5,816 nurses nationwide. With regards to doctors, the country had 17 in the year 1967 but 819 in 2014. Counting hospitals, Botswana had 9 in the year 1967 but by 2014 had 31 nationwide²⁰⁵.

Various governments of Botswana view the health systems and conditions as a major priority and therefore consistently put measures in place to ensure that the health systems of the country are improved on a regular basis. This is evident in the Agenda 21 of Botswana that states that,

The government of Botswana has made significant investments in health infrastructure and services since its independence. The country has made a commitment to provide basic health services. The strategy places emphasis on health infrastructure as well as district health service provision. The government provides portable drinking water coverage throughout the country to rural and major villages, and water hygiene programs and sanitation disposal are in place and the safe water coverage is over 70%²⁰⁶.

In spite of this, the Botswana health system suffers from a number of health challenges some of which include the high rate of HIV and AIDS infections which invariably affects the rate of maternal deaths in the country, tuberculosis and malaria infections. Botswana has, despite all these set-backs in their health records, tried to curb the rampant rate at which these infections grow. Some of these infections have been attributed to poverty seeing as one in three Botswana live below the poverty line. Due to this, too many of Botswana's children are raised under poor conditions of extreme deprivation²⁰⁷.

Furthermore, there is a sparse distribution of Botswana's population which inhibits the full coverage of essential child health and survival initiatives and this cripples the efforts of the

government to make any significant difference since they are also plagued with the dilemma of lack of personnel to deploy to these areas. However, the health service has done extremely well to bring health services closer to the people. But in these cases, efforts are crippled due to shortage of personnel, rising demand due to a high disease burden and supply chain management challenges²⁰⁸.

HIV/AIDS infections have contributed largely to the regression of Botswana's health systems and services. In 2008, it accounted to 10.2% of maternal deaths in the country. Thus, HIV and AIDS poses a significant challenge to the maternal health situation in the country as well²⁰⁹. Seitio-Kgokgwe et al state that public hospitals are a key component of the Botswana health system and they account for over 60% of hospital beds and national health sector expenditure. These facilities play a leading role in delivering preventive, curative, diagnostic and rehabilitative services²¹⁰. They, however, go on to state that, in Botswana, communities are very skeptical of hospitals due to frequent negative media reports and increasing litigation cases but internationally, health policy-makers and managers are trying possible means of interventions with the aim of improving the performance of public hospitals²¹¹. Furthermore, they assert that the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Local Government are in charge of clinics and health posts and through these institutions, Botswana has a vast network of health establishments. This has increased physical access to health services between the years of 1997 and 2007. Despite this achievement, there are some inequalities in the distribution of facilities and this has created inequities in rural populations. This was evident in the years 2006 and 2007 where "96% of the urban population was within 5km radius of a health facility compared to 72% of rural population"²¹².

Though the number of hospitals has remained stable since 2000, the MoH has concentrated on upgrading structures considered to be in bad shape. In view of this, four district hospitals and a

psychiatric referral hospital have been upgraded²¹³. With regards to the physical infrastructure for health in Botswana, health facilities and buildings have been described as fairly adequate. District hospitals that have undergone upgrading have been described as some of the best in the region. However, these hospitals have been attributed with overcapacity and this has been due to ineffective planning processes. Also, issues with regards to lack of maintenance have been mentioned where only 35% of health workers felt their hospitals were well maintained²¹⁴.

Also, according to the report of Seitio-Kgokgwe et al in 2014, there have been reports of the shortage and erratic supply of medicines all across hospitals in the country. This, they stated, was mainly blamed on the inefficient supply chain management systems. This led to the movement of patients from one area to the other in their search for drugs. Due to this, there has been a sharp rise in the financial cost involved in getting medicines especially because of travel expenses and sometimes buying from private pharmacies and as such, has become a source of worry to the Botswana public²¹⁵.

3.1.6a Initiatives of Various Governments in Botswana

In order to ensure that the Botswana populace enjoy a level of health that allows them to lead an economically and socially productive life as in accordance with the definition of health by the World Health Organization (WHO), Botswana has been consistently trying to achieve this through improvements in the health sector. In 1995, the first National Health Policy (NHP) was rolled out and guided the health sector towards the achievement of the highest level of health status of all citizenry. Since the introduction of the first NHP which was later modified in 2011, there have been major shifts in both health status and in the organization of the health sector in the country.

There was a reorganization of the Ministry of Health and also the commencement of Primary Health Care within the Ministry of Local Government in 2002. The revision of the 1995 NHP became salient due to the many changes in health technologies for health promotion. Prevention and treatment.

3.1.6b The Place of Liberal Democracy in improving healthcare in Botswana

In the International Community, eight Millennium Development Goals were adopted and to be achieved by the year 2015. Setting this further in the African context, the Ouagadougou Declaration on Primary Health care and Health Systems lays emphasis on better health in this Millennium. Botswana, as a country in the international community, is a signatory to all these health protocols and has incorporated all these protocols into the country's NHP²¹⁶.

The Ministry of Health is in charge of the overall oversight and delivery of health services for Botswana. It is mandated to formulate policies, regulation and norms, standards and guidelines of the health services. It is also a major provider of health services through a wide range of health facilities and management structures²¹⁷.

3.2 How Liberal Democracy Can Promote Socio-Economic Development in Ghana and Botswana

Liberal Democracy, as already discussed in previous chapters, is regarded as one of the major tools that can be used to improve the socio-economic development of countries. Liberal democracy for many scholars, can be capitalized on to satisfy the needs of citizens in a given society. Liberal democracy engulfs the basic rights, freedoms and privileges entitled to citizens and if well utilized, can satisfy the wants and needs of people in a country. This aspect of the work is going to look at how both Ghana and Botswana can leverage on liberal democracy to promote and ameliorate the socio-economic standards of their countries while still using the three indicators of socio-economic development i.e. youth employment, public basic education and health services and systems of both countries.

To throw further light on this, the NDPC in Ghana believes that there is an unending link between liberal democracy, the economy of Ghana, Botswana and any other country for that matter, the society and the people who live in it. In an interview with an official at the Commission, he stated that the socio-economic development is considered paramount by the Constitution and therefore mandates the President upon assumption of power, to prepare and present his or her coordinated entire development plan for the nation to Parliament. This plan must be prepared within 24 months of assuming power and must be in line with the Directive Principles of State Policy. This plan guides the development plans of all other government agencies including the Ministries and their agencies within the next four years²¹⁸.

According to an official of the NDPC, in order to understand and assess the full extent to which these development policies had been achieved, annual progress reports collated by the

Commission, are published for the populace. This establishes a level of transparency between the “duty-bearer” and the “right-bearer”. Also, based on the information provided in the report, the Ghanaian populace can hold the government accountable if they deem it necessary to²¹⁹. Dr. Kojo Asante of the Centre for Democratic Development (CDD) goes on to indicate that, one way that Liberal Democracy can be used to promote socio-economic development is through education. He believes that if citizens of a country are made to know and understand their rights and freedoms and the fact that they can hold a government responsible and accountable for the development of the nation, it will go a long way to ensure that the government and current administration is always on guard²²⁰.

Some officials of the NDPC also believe that the Constitution should not be treated as a separate document when talking about development in a country. This is because the constitution provides the legal power and guidance on which all development projects must be built.²²¹ Also, they believe that the role of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) should not be underestimated. CSOs like ActionAid, Occupy Ghana and the like, they stated, help citizens voice out their opinions with regards to decisions taken by government and its agencies. They state that Liberal Democracy makes room for this kind of development since the Constitution allows for freedom of speech and expression and sets the grounds on which these CSOs function²²².

The Constitution, therefore, is the vehicle that drives the agenda of Liberal Democracy in the country. This is because liberal democracy ensures that the statutes enshrined in the constitution are adhered to. It also gives legitimacy to the concept of accountability which is a key tenet of liberal democracy, as discussed in the previous chapter, and ensures that the elected is answerable to the electorate. The governments will not only be answerable but also liable and accountable to the citizens of the country. This means that the citizens have the right to demand for various

governments to show proof for assurances and promises made with regards to the provision of employment, access to basic education and accessibility to quality healthcare systems, and other socio-economic amenities in the country in their various manifestoes and as per the dictates of the constitution as enumerated above. The concept of liberal democracy is essential to this study because it serves as the bridge between the practice of liberal democracy as a system of governance and how this system affects the socio-economic development of African countries. The ability of the citizenry to question and seek answers to their requests throws more light on the essence of liberal democracy in the provision and legitimization of the rights of the citizens regardless of sex, race, religious or political affiliations. In other systems of government that do not highlight the rights and freedoms of the people, the rights of the citizens are infringed upon to the point where people are expected to accept the rulings of the sitting government. The practice of rule of law, transparency and accountability does not exist in such regimes and as such, citizenry cannot question the actions and motives of their elected. Ghana and Botswana have consolidated their practice of liberal democracy through the continuous practice of inclusion and involvement of the citizenry as expected in a liberal democracy. Also, the two countries have consolidated their democracy through the ratification of and adherence to the various conventions of the international system. However, it seems that the full gamut of liberal democracy is not well implemented especially because of inconsistency and lack of political will by governments. In an interview with Dr. Kojo Asante of CDD – Ghana, he stated that, governments do not implement long-term policies and also do not put structures in place to ensure that these policies stand the test of time. From keen observation of the findings above, it is obvious that policies implemented are short-term and die off whenever there is a change of government in either country especially in the case of Ghana where governments are politically affiliated unlike in Botswana where the same political party has

been in power since 1960. However, if the elected will use the tool of liberal democracy and solidify the right institutions to ensure that policies implemented are able to stand the test of time, development will be consistent and progressive. This will have a ripple effect on the economy of the country and thus, affect the lives of individual citizens as well. The National Development and Planning Commission of Ghana believes that, the 40-year development plan of the country needs to be fully implemented and made to work in such a manner that, it will ensure a high level of progress in the country. In an interview with Goemeone Mogomotsi of Botswana, he asserted that the short-term employment plans and programmes instituted by the government of Botswana is in no way a means of solving the unemployment problem of the country because, it just provided a temporary solution to the problem at hand. He believes that, one of the components of liberal democracy is the presence of an open market. He asserted that governments need to take advantage of this and also practice it as well. He believes that governments in Africa at large must open up the economic market to allow for the establishment of private-owned businesses and must also encourage their citizens to engage in entrepreneurial ventures. Not only will the establishment of these businesses aid in the development and boosting of the continent's economic standing but also provide employment opportunities for the youth as well²²³. Tshenolo Madigela from Botswana as well, in an interview, stated that the fact that women represent a higher number of unemployed youth in the country was something to be worried about. She believes that, the need to empower women in the country was long overdue and the government needs to invest time and resources to ensure that women assert their rightful place in society. She stated that, entrepreneurship among women must be encouraged and women must be given the platform to step out of their shells. She believes that the constitution, as an advocate for equal rights of individuals regardless of sex, race, political or religious affiliation, functions as the perfect tool

and framework within which this agenda can be promoted. She asserted that sensitization tools must be used and women must be taught their rights and made to understand their role in society as well. She also went further to state that, constant education of citizens about the essence of observing good health practices would also be important. She believes that when the people are taught that their health is their wealth and therefore there is the need to constantly ensure that they are in good health, it will affect their level of productivity and reduce the rate of illnesses in the country especially HIV/ AIDS infections²²⁴.

3.3 Conclusion

This chapter has discussed in some detail three indicators of socio-economic development in both Ghana and Botswana and how Liberal Democracy has influenced these three areas. However, the study also revealed that despite the numerous efforts of various governments to improve upon the employment rates, public basic education and health systems of the two countries, there seem to be some challenges that need to be carefully eliminated in order to achieve the full realization of government impact on socio-economic development in the two countries. Further, during the study, it has been revealed that on the indicators of employment rates, quality of healthcare and public basic primary education, both countries are having challenges with maintaining a steady increase and high improvement levels. Also strategies and policies will have to be re-thought out and reformulated in order to achieve the set target of progress in both countries.

ENDNOTES

-
- ¹⁰⁹ See A Social Development Policy for Botswana: Phase II: Framework and Strategy 2010
- ¹¹⁰ See Botswana's Mineral Revenues, Expenditure and Savings Policy. Pg. 14
- ¹¹¹ "Four Pillars | NDPC". *Ndpc-Cms.Herokuapp.Com*, 2018, <http://ndpc-cms.herokuapp.com/four-pillars/#social>. Accessed 6 Aug 2018.
- ¹¹² "Four Pillars | NDPC". *Ndpc-Cms.Herokuapp.Com*, 2018, <http://ndpc-cms.herokuapp.com/four-pillars/#economic>. Accessed 6 Aug 2018.
- ¹¹³ "Africa's Youth: A "Ticking Time Bomb" Or An Opportunity? | Africa Renewal Online". *Un.Org*, 2013, <https://www.un.org/africarenewal/magazine/may-2013/africa%E2%80%99s-youth-%E2%80%9Cticking-time-bomb%E2%80%9D-or-opportunity>. Accessed 6 Aug 2018.
- ¹¹⁴ Gyimah-Boadi, Emmanuel. "Another step forward for Ghana." *Journal of Democracy* 20.2 (2009): 138-152.
- ¹¹⁵ Amankrah, John Yaw. "Youth unemployment in Ghana: Prospects and challenges." *Center for Policy Analysis Working Papers* (2012).
- ¹¹⁶ Ibid
- ¹¹⁷ "Unemployment, Youth Total (% Of Total Labor Force Ages 15-24) (Modeled ILO Estimate) | Data". *Data.Worldbank.Org*, 2017, <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.UEM.1524.ZS?locations=GH>. Accessed 13 Aug 2018.
- ¹¹⁸ Ibid pg. 389
- ¹¹⁹ Amankrah op. cit. pg. 3
- ¹²⁰ Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment Ghana Youth. "Working to Build our Future" (2006).
- ¹²¹ Amankrah, J. Y., and N. N. N. Nsowah-Nuamah. "Survey of Unemployed and Underemployed Persons in Ghana, 2001." *Report, Ghana Statistical Service, Accra* (2003).
- ¹²² ibid
- ¹²³ Ibid
- ¹²⁴ Gyampo, Ransford. "Youth participation in youth programmes: The case of Ghana's national youth employment programme." *The Journal of Pan African Studies* 5.5 (2012): 13-28.
- ¹²⁵ ibid
- ¹²⁶ "Parliament Passes GYEEDA Bill - Government Of Ghana". *Ghana.Gov.Gh*, 2014, <http://www.ghana.gov.gh/index.php/media-center/news/309-parliament-passes-gyeeda-bill>. Accessed 30 July 2018.
- ¹²⁷ See Youth Employment Act, 2015 pg. 3
- ¹²⁸ See National Builders Corps 2018
- ¹²⁹ ibid
- ¹³⁰ Gyampo op. cit. pg. 14
- ¹³¹ Amankrah op. cit
- ¹³² Gyampo op. cit. pg. 14
- ¹³³ Ibid
- ¹³⁴ Adu-Gyamfi, Ernest. "Socio-economic and Political Development in Ghana under the 1992 Republican Constitution of Ghana." *Journal of Power* 2.1 (2014): 13-31.
- ¹³⁵ Ibid pg. 28
- ¹³⁶ See NPP Manifesto 2008 Elections pg. 5
- ¹³⁷ See National Democratic Congress Manifesto 2008 pg. 5
- ¹³⁸ ibid
- ¹³⁹ See New Patriotic Party Manifesto for Election 2016 pg. 163
- ¹⁴⁰ Ibid pg. 163-164

-
- ¹⁴¹ "Unemployment, Youth Total (% Of Total Labor Force Ages 15-24) (Modeled ILO Estimate) | Data". *Data.Worldbank.Org*, 2017, <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.UEM.1524.ZS?locations=BW>. Accessed 13 Aug 2018.
- ¹⁴² Kufigwa Siphambe, Haappy. "Understanding unemployment in Botswana." *South African Journal of Economics* 71.3 (2003): 480-495.
- ¹⁴³ Sechele, Latang. "In their own words: Unemployed young people on tackling youth labor market entry constraints in Botswana." (2015).
- ¹⁴⁴ Kufigwa. op. cit. pg. 484
- ¹⁴⁵ Ibid
- ¹⁴⁶ Siphambe, Happy K. "Growth and Employment Dynamics in Botswana: A case study of policy coherence." *International Labour Office, Policy Integration and Statistics Department*, 2007.
- ¹⁴⁷ ibid
- ¹⁴⁸ ibid
- ¹⁴⁹ "Republic Of Botswana - Government Portal". *Gov.Bw*, 2018, <http://www.gov.bw/en/Ministries--Authorities/Ministries/Ministry-of-Local-Government-MLG1/News/MINISTRY-EMPOWERS-ITS-YOUTH/>. Accessed 28 July 2018.
- ¹⁵⁰ Mogomotsi, Goemeone EJ, and Patricia Kefilwe Madigele. "A cursory discussion of policy alternatives for addressing youth unemployment in Botswana." *Cogent Social Sciences* 3.1 (2017): 1356619. Pg. 3
- ¹⁵¹ ibid
- ¹⁵² 2015, <http://www.botswana.se/News/PRESS-RELEASE-GRADUATE-VOLUNTEER-SCHEME->. Accessed 6 Aug 2018.
- ¹⁵³ Mogomotsi et al op. cit. pg. 3
- ¹⁵⁴ Van Klaveren, Maarten, et al. "An overview of women's work and employment in Botswana." *Amsterdam: AIAS Working Paper* (2009): 09-81. Pg. 18
- ¹⁵⁵ ibid
- ¹⁵⁶ See Botswana Democratic Party Election Manifesto 2014-2019 pg. 8
- ¹⁵⁷ "About Us - Ministry Of Education Ghana". *Ministry Of Education*, 2016, <http://moe.gov.gh/index.php/about-us/>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.
- ¹⁵⁸ Ibid
- ¹⁵⁹ See Draft Inclusive Education Policy
- ¹⁶⁰ See National EFA 2015 Review Report: Ghana Country Report
- ¹⁶¹ See The Budget Statement and Economic Policy of the Government of Ghana 2017 Financial Year pg. 101
- ¹⁶² ibid
- ¹⁶³ ibid
- ¹⁶⁴ ibid
- ¹⁶⁵ See Education Act 2008: Act 778
- ¹⁶⁶ Ibid
- ¹⁶⁷ ibid
- ¹⁶⁸ Ibid
- ¹⁶⁹ Interview with some parents and teachers of Akporman Model Basic School, Abokobi
- ¹⁷⁰ See 2010 Population and Housing Census Report Millennium Development Goals in Ghana. Ghana Statistical Service, 2013. pg. 17
- ¹⁷¹ See 2015 Ghana Millennium Development Goals Report p. 30
- ¹⁷² Ibid p. 32
- ¹⁷³ 2010 Population and Housing Census Report Millennium Development Goals in Ghana. Ghana Statistical Service. Op. cit. pg. 18
- ¹⁷⁴ See Education for All 2015 National Review: Botswana
- ¹⁷⁵ ibid
- ¹⁷⁶ ibid

¹⁷⁷ *ibid*

¹⁷⁸ "Improving The Quality Of Basic Education And Skills Development In Botswana". *World Bank*, 2014, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2014/12/02/improving-the-quality-of-basic-education-and-skills-development-in-botswana>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

¹⁷⁹ Makwinja, Veronica Margaret. "Rethinking Education in Botswana: A Need to Overhaul the Botswana Education System." *Journal of International Education Research* 13.2 (2017): 45-58.

¹⁸⁰ *ibid*

¹⁸¹ *Ibid*

¹⁸² *ibid*

¹⁸³ *Ibid*

¹⁸⁴ "Initiatives". *Presidency.Gov.Gh*, 2017, <http://presidency.gov.gh/index.php/initiatives>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

¹⁸⁵ Drislane, Frank W., Albert Akpalu, and Harry HJ Wegdam. "The medical system in Ghana." *The Yale journal of biology and medicine* 87.3 (2014): 321.

¹⁸⁶ *Ibid*

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid*

¹⁸⁸ *ibid*

¹⁸⁹ *Ibid*

¹⁹⁰ *ibid*

¹⁹¹ *Ibid*

¹⁹² See Ghana National Healthcare Quality Strategy Report: 2017 - 2021 (2016)

¹⁹³ Zakariah, Ahmed, et al. "The birth and growth of the National Ambulance Service in Ghana." *Prehospital and disaster medicine* 32.1 (2017): 83-93. Pg. 3

¹⁹⁴ *Ibid* pg. 6

¹⁹⁵ *Ibid*

¹⁹⁶ "Policy Documents | Ministry Of Health". *Moh.Gov.Gh*, 2016, <http://www.moh.gov.gh/policy-documents/>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

¹⁹⁷ See National Community-based Health Planning and Services (CHPS) Policy, March 2016.

¹⁹⁸ *Ibid* pg. 2

¹⁹⁹ See Anti-Malaria Drug Policy for Ghana pg. 1

²⁰⁰ *ibid*

²⁰¹ *Ibid* pg. 7

²⁰² See The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Ghana: Why they matter & How we can help 2017 pg. 8

²⁰³ *Ibid*

²⁰⁴ See Botswana's Mineral Revenues, Expenditure and Savings Policy. *Op. cit.* Pg. 20

²⁰⁵ *Ibid* pg. 21

²⁰⁶ "Agenda 21 - Botswana". *Un.Org*, 2014,

<http://www.un.org/esa/agenda21/natlinfo/countr/botswana/social.htm>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

²⁰⁷ "African Health Observatory". *African Health Observatory*,

http://www.aho.afro.who.int/profiles_information/index.php/Botswana:Issues_and_challenges_-_Progress_on_the_Health-Related_MDGs. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

²⁰⁸ *ibid*

²⁰⁹ *ibid*

²¹⁰ Seitio-Kgokgwe, Onalenna, et al. "Assessing performance of Botswana's public hospital system: the use of the World Health Organization Health System Performance Assessment Framework." *International journal of health policy and management* 3.4 (2014): 179.

²¹¹ *ibid*

²¹² *ibid*

²¹³ *ibid*

²¹⁴ *ibid*

²¹⁵ *ibid*

²¹⁶ See National Health Policy Towards a Healthier Botswana, 2011. Pg. 1-2

²¹⁷ *Ibid* pg. 7

²¹⁸ Interview with an official of the National Development and Planning Commission

²¹⁹ Interview with an official of the National Development and Planning Commission

²²⁰ Asante, Kojo (July 27, 2018). Personal Interview

²²¹ Interview with an official of the National Development and Planning Commission

²²² Interview with an official of the National Development and Planning Commission

²²³ Mogomotsi, Goemeone (August 27, 2019). Personal Interview

²²⁴ Madigela, Tsehnolo. (August 19, 2019). Personal Interview

CHAPTER FOUR

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.0 Introduction

The first three chapters of this work have discussed in some detail the state of Liberal Democracy in Ghana and Botswana from independence till date and also, some socio-economic development indicators and how Liberal Democracy has affected the three indicators of youth employment, public basic education, and health systems and services in both countries from 2008 and 2018. Therefore, this final chapter concludes with summaries of findings, conclusions and some recommendations as to how to leverage on Liberal Democracy to better promote socio-economic development in both countries.

4.1 Summary of Findings

The summary of findings from this research are as follows:

- The Constitutions of Ghana and Botswana clearly stipulate the individual's right to certain freedoms, rights and liberties and the functions of various arms of government and agencies to help in the easy facilitation of the implementation of various measures to ensure that citizens of these countries enjoy their stated rights. The Constitution therefore acts as the legal foundation on which these rights are built.
- Also, the Constitution highlights the responsibilities of these government agencies. Among other things, the socio-economic development of both countries is paramount and top-of-

the-list of all the various administrations that have been in power from independence and specifically from 2008 to 2018.

- In addition, Ghana and Botswana have signed on to various international frameworks that seek to promote the socio-economic development of their citizens. Both countries are bound to the various Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) as well as the Labour laws as stipulated by the International Labour Organization convention and thus become accountable not only to the people but also to the international community. Both countries are expected to uphold and put strategies in place to attain the goals set by these international bodies and agencies.
- In that same light, on the national front, various policy papers and frameworks have been passed to guarantee the progressive socio-economic development of citizens of both countries and consistently, the efficacy of these policies are checked through constant reviews and reforms to shape the policies and working papers to the evolving dynamics of society. Also in collaboration with some international stakeholders like the International Labor Organization and the United Nations Development Programme, both countries have consistently put measures in place to ensure that these policy papers work and are implemented to the benefit of their citizens.
- However, in spite of the national and international efforts to ensure that there is constant rise in the socio-economic standards of Ghana and Botswana, it can still be observed that the progress is still slow in certain areas like employment rates and stagnant in the case of public basic primary education particularly in Botswana. Though policies and frameworks have been constantly rolled out and implemented, there was an observation that in the case

of both countries, there was no significant link between the education system and the demands of the labor market.

- Also, there is a definite link between the health statuses of the citizens of both countries and the socio-economic state of the country. Economically, the health status of the country determines the level of productivity in the economic sector of the country.
- Also, in the case of bad health affecting a large number of the citizens of the country, it forces the government to spend huge sums of money on the provision of adequate medication and health structures to cater for the ailing populace.
- The study also revealed that there have been significant efforts of governments to improve the quality of education, increase youth employment and improve the quality of healthcare in both countries.
- Furthermore, the study also revealed that there is the need for the equal distribution of social amenities i.e. hospitals and schools throughout the countries in that, in the end, there are no underserved communities and rather that every community has equal access to schools, hospitals and other social amenities.
- The study also revealed that, inasmuch as various governments seemed committed to improve the socio-economic development of their states, there was a clear lack of consistency and longevity when it comes to the formulation and implementation of policies.
- It was also observed that there is an apparent need for the establishment of strong institutions as allowed by the constitution, which is a major tool of liberal democracy. It is believed that this will pave the way for consistency and progress in the socio-economic development of the state as well as have an effect on the lives of the citizenry.

4.2 Conclusion

The efforts of various administrations of both Ghana and Botswana to improve the socio-economic development of their countries cannot go unnoticed. Each and every administration comes with a new drive and urge to improve upon the quality of life of their citizens. Within the 10 year period of 2008 and 2018, a lot of significant change has been made towards the achievement of this particular goal. Both countries have consistently engaged the international community through the implementation of statutes enumerated by these international organizations, as well as their own national policies to implement their various socio-economic policies.

However, there are some challenges that seemingly impede the progress of the full implementation of these strategies. Issues arising normally circle around lack of political will, lack of sensitization of the populace and the inability of governments to confer with policy targets before rolling out certain policies.

4.3 Recommendations

The practice of Liberal Democracy in both Ghana and Botswana are far advanced and remarkable to say the least. Both countries have shown very impressive levels of the capacity of their Liberal Democracy through the smooth transfer of political power from one government to the other, the use of democratic tools like the Constitution as the foundation to build and establish various policies and frameworks for the development of the socio-economic state of the countries.

The various recommendations derived from this study are as follows:

- Some of the tenets of Liberal Democracy like the concept of accountability and transparency can be exploited to facilitate the socio-economic development of both countries.
- There should also be a periodic review of all policies and frameworks put in place by the various governments to ensure that the stated objectives enumerated in these policies are strictly adhered to.
- There is also the need to establish the link between the various socio-economic development indicators to ensure fluidity in development.
- With regards to political will, there should be evident commitment on the part of the various governments to ensure that socio-economic development is paramount to all political and governmental agencies.
- In the case of healthcare, there is the need for more society-centered programmes and sensitization of citizens especially in the rural areas where the people are made to understand and value the notion of good health and therefore make conscious efforts to remain in good health.
- Liberal Democracy can be employed in the area where various district and municipal representatives of both Ghana and Botswana will make efforts to identify the peculiar needs and problems of their municipalities and districts and tailor solutions that fit the specific problem in the vicinity.
- Finally, the education system should be sharpened to the extent where students are not trained to be box-minded and only thinking about how to seek and work white-collared jobs. Rather, the interests of students should be piqued towards other ventures like agriculture, entrepreneurship and other modernized traditional occupations. Students must

be tutored to be innovative individuals and think out of the box and be solution givers to help solve the problems of the societies in which they find themselves. Vacation classes organized by schools should be geared more towards sharpening the innovative, entrepreneurial and artistic skills of students so as upon their completion of primary education, their skills would have been honed as well as their intellect improved.

This will go a long way to re-shape the Ghanaian and Batswana societies we have and broaden the mindset of the youth and this will have a ripple effect on the development of the society and the economy.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. Books

Boafo-Arthur, Kwame. Ghana: One decade of the liberal state. Zed Books, 2007.

Greenberg, S.G. & Page, Benjamin I. "The Struggle for Democracy." New York: Addison Wesley Educational Publishers Ltd., 1997

Hague, Rod, and Martin Harrop. Comparative government and politics. Vol. 6. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.

Heywood, Andrew. "Politics." 3ed. Palgrave Macmillan: New York, 2007.

Ninsin, Kwame Akon, ed. Ghana. Transition to democracy. African Books Collective, 1998

Oquaye, Mike. Politics in Ghana, 1982-1992: Rawlings, revolution, and populist democracy. Tornado Publications, 2004

Sen, Amartya. "Development as freedom." Development in Practice-Oxford- 10.2 (2000): 258-258.

Zakaria, Fareed. The Future of Freedom: Illiberal Democracy at Home and Abroad, p. 15. W. W. Norton & Company Ltd, New York, 2004.

B. Journals and Articles

Acemoglu, D., S. Johnson, and J. A. Robinson. "An African Success Story: Botswana forthcoming." (2001).

Adrian Leftwich A. Leftwich. "Two Cheers for Democracy? Democracy and the Developmental State" in A. Leftwich, *Democracy and Development*. (1996)

Adu-Gyamfi, Ernest. "Socio-economic and Political Development in Ghana under the 1992 Republican Constitution of Ghana." *Journal of Power* 2.1 (2014): 13-31.

Alagidede, Paul, William Baah-Boateng, and Edward Nketiah-Amponsah. "The Ghanaian economy: an overview." *Ghanaian Journal of Economics* 1.1 (2013)

Alhojailan, Mohammed Ibrahim. "Thematic analysis: A critical review of its process and evaluation." *West East Journal of Social Sciences* 1.1 (2012): 39-47. P. 10

Ayelazuno, Jasper. "Two Decades of Liberal Democracy in Ghana: A Critical Political Economy Perspective." *National Democratic Reforms in Africa*. Palgrave Macmillan, New York. (2015)

Brief, An Introductory. "Qualitative and Quantitative Research Techniques for Humanitarian Needs Assessment." (2012). P. 4-5

Cook, Amelia, and Jeremy Sarkin. "Is Botswana the Miracle of Africa-Democracy, the Rule of Law, and Human Rights versus Economic Development." *Transnat'l L. & Contemp. Probs.* 19 (2010)

Drislane, Frank W., Albert Akpalu, and Harry HJ Wegdam. "The medical system in Ghana." *The Yale journal of biology and medicine* 87.3 (2014): 321

Fombad, Charles Manga. "The separation of powers and constitutionalism in Africa: The case of Botswana." *BC Third World LJ* 25 (2005).

Fritz, Jan Marie. "Socioeconomic developmental social work." *Peace Studies, Public Policy and Global Security*—Volume VII (2010): 362.

Gyampo, Ransford. "Youth participation in youth programmes: The case of Ghana's national youth employment programme." *The Journal of Pan African Studies* 5.5 (2012): 13-28.

Gyimah-Boadi, Emmanuel. "Another step forward for Ghana." *Journal of Democracy* 20.2 (2009)

Holm, John D. "Liberal democracy and rural development in Botswana." *African Studies Review* 25.1 (1982),

Huntington, Samuel P. "Democracy's third wave." *Journal of democracy* 2.2 (1991)

Jotia, Agreement Lathi. "Liberal Democracy: An African Perspective." *Academic Research International* 2.3 (2012): 621.

Kufigwa Siphambe, Happy. "Understanding unemployment in Botswana." *South African Journal of Economics* 71.3 (2003): 480-495.

Makwinja, Veronica Margaret. "Rethinking Education in Botswana: A Need to Overhaul the Botswana Education System." *Journal of International Education Research* 13.2 (2017): 45-58

Mander, Harsh, Mohammed Asif, and K. P. Sasi. *Good governance: Resource book. Books for Change.* (2004).

Maundeni, Zibani. "State culture and development in Botswana and Zimbabwe." *The Journal of Modern African Studies* 40.1 (2002): 105-132.

Mogomotsi, Goemeone EJ, and Patricia Kefilwe Madigele. "A cursory discussion of policy alternatives for addressing youth unemployment in Botswana." *Cogent Social Sciences* 3.1 (2017): 1356619.

M.J. Gasiorowski. "Democracy and Macroeconomic Performance in Underdeveloped Countries: An Empirical Analysis". *Comparative Political Studies*, Vol. 33, No. 3. (2000)

Owusu, Maxwell. *Domesticating Democracy: Culture, Civil Society, and Constitutionalism in Africa: Comparative Studies in Society and History*. Vol. 39, No. 1 (Jan., 1997), pp. 120-152
Published by: Cambridge University Press, Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/179241>

Said Adejumobi. *Between Democracy and Development in Africa: What are the missing links?*
Centre for African Studies, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa. (2000)

Segrillo, Angelo. "Liberalism, Marxism and Democratic Theory Revisited: Proposal of a Joint Index of Political and Economic Democracy." *Brazilian Political Science Review* 6.2 (2012):

Seitio-Kgokgwe, Onalenna, et al. "Assessing performance of Botswana's public hospital system: the use of the World Health Organization Health System Performance Assessment Framework." *International journal of health policy and management* 3.4 (2014): 179

Senghore, Aboubacar Abdullah. *Liberal Democracy and Governance in Africa: A brief critique*.
Safara No. 12: UFR Lettres et Sciences Humaines, Université Gaston Berger, Senegal. (2013).

Siphambe, Happy K. "Growth and Employment Dynamics in Botswana: A case study of policy coherence." International Labour Office, Policy Integration and Statistics Department. (2007).

Zainal, Zaidah. "Case study as a research method." *Jurnal Kemanusiaan* 9 (2007): 1-6

Zakariah, Ahmed, et al. "The birth and growth of the National Ambulance Service in Ghana." *Prehospital and disaster medicine* 32.1 (2017): 83-93. Pg. 3

C. Working Papers/ Reports

2010 Population and Housing Census Report Millennium Development Goals in Ghana. Ghana Statistical Service. (2010)

A Social Development Policy Framework for Botswana Phase II: Framework and Strategy Report. (2010).

Amankrah, John Yaw. "Youth unemployment in Ghana: Prospects and challenges." Center for Policy Analysis Working Papers (2012).

Amankrah, J. Y., and N. N. N. Nsowah-Nuamah. "Survey of Unemployed and Underemployed Persons in Ghana, 2001." Report, Ghana Statistical Service, Accra (2003).

Anti-Malaria Drug Policy for Ghana (2002)

Botswana Democratic Party Election Manifesto 2014-2019 (2015)

Botswana's Mineral Revenues, Expenditures and Savings Policy (2016)

Botswana Case Study: Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in Public Administration (2016)

Budget Statement and Economic Policy of the Government of Ghana 2017 Financial Year (2018)

Constitution of Botswana (1966)

Constitution of Ghana (1993)

Country Report - Africa's best kept secret: Botswana as a shining liberal democracy. (2003)

Declaration of Human Rights, 1948

Democratic Index 2017: Free Speech Under Attack (2017)

Draft Inclusive Education Policy (2013)

Education Act 2008

Education for All 2015 National Review: Botswana (2015)

Ghana National Healthcare Quality Strategy Report: 2017-2021 (2016)

Ghana Statistical Labour Force Report (2017)

Lewin, Michael. "Botswana's success: Good governance, good policies, and good luck." Yes Africa Can 81 (2011).

Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment Ghana Youth. "Working to Build our Future" (2006).

National Builders Corps 2018

National Community-based Health Planning and Services (CHPS) Policy, March 2016

National Democratic Congress Manifesto (2016)

National EFA 2015 Review Report: Ghana Country Report (2014)

National Health Policy Towards a Healthier Botswana (2011).

New Patriotic Party Manifesto for Election (2016)

NPP Manifesto 2008 Elections

Sechele, Latang. "In their own words: Unemployed young people on tackling youth labor market entry constraints in Botswana." (2015).

Simplified Constitution of the Republic of Botswana (2006)

Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Ghana: Why they matter & How we can help (2015)

Van Klaveren, Maarten, et al. "An overview of women's work and employment in Botswana." Amsterdam: AIAS Working Paper (2009): 09-81. Pg. 18

Youth Employment Act, 2015

D. Internet Sources

"About Us - Ministry Of Education Ghana". Ministry Of Education, 2016, <http://moe.gov.gh/index.php/about-us/>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

"African Health Observatory". African Health Observatory, http://www.aho.afro.who.int/profiles_information/index.php/Botswana:Issues_and_challenges_-_Progress_on_the_Health-Related_MDGs. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

"Africa's Youth: A "Ticking Time Bomb" Or An Opportunity? | Africa Renewal Online". Un.Org, 2013, <https://www.un.org/africarenewal/magazine/may-2013/africa%E2%80%99s-youth-%E2%80%9Cticking-time-bomb%E2%80%9D-or-opportunity>. Accessed 6 Aug 2018.

"Agenda 21 - Botswana". Un.Org, 2014,
<http://www.un.org/esa/agenda21/natinfo/countr/botswana/social.htm>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

"Botswana". Web.Worldbank.Org,
http://web.worldbank.org/archive/website01321/WEB/0_MENU.PDF. Accessed 12 Aug 2018.

"Different Forms of Democracy." All Answers Ltd. ukessays.com, November 2013. Web. 4 August 2018. <<https://www.ukessays.com/essays/politics/different-forms-of-democracy-politics-essay.php?vref=1>>.

"Four Pillars | NDPC". Ndp-cms.Herokuapp.Com, 2018, <http://ndpc-cms.herokuapp.com/four-pillars/#social>. Accessed 6 Aug 2018.

"Four Pillars | NDPC". Ndp-cms.Herokuapp.Com, 2018, <http://ndpc-cms.herokuapp.com/four-pillars/#economic>. Accessed 6 Aug 2018.

"Ghana's Democracy Doesn't Have All Tenets of a Good Democracy - CDD". Modern Ghana,
<https://www.modernghana.com/news/488992/ghanas-democracy-doesnt-have-all-tenets-of-a-good-democrac.html>. Accessed 12 Aug 2018.

<http://www.botswana.se/News/PRESS-RELEASE-GRADUATE-VOLUNTEER-SCHEME->
Accessed 6 Aug 2018

"Improving The Quality of Basic Education and Skills Development in Botswana". World Bank, 2014, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2014/12/02/improving-the-quality-of-basic-education-and-skills-development-in-botswana>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

"Initiatives". Presidency.Gov.Gh, 2017, <http://presidency.gov.gh/index.php/initiatives>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

"Parliament Passes GYEEDA Bill - Government of Ghana". Ghana.Gov.Gh, 2014, <http://www.ghana.gov.gh/index.php/media-center/news/309-parliament-passes-gyeeda-bill>. Accessed 30 July 2018.

"Policy Documents | Ministry of Health". Moh.Gov.Gh, 2016, <http://www.moh.gov.gh/policy-documents/>. Accessed 10 Aug 2018.

"Republic Of Botswana - Government Portal". Gov.Bw, 2018, <http://www.gov.bw/en/Ministries-Authorities/Ministries/Ministry-of-Local-Government-MLG1/News/MINISTRY-EMPOWERS-ITS-YOUTH/>. Accessed 28 July 2018.

"Unemployment, Youth Total (% Of Total Labor Force Ages 15-24) (Modeled ILO Estimate) | Data". Data.Worldbank.Org, 2017, <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.UEM.1524.ZS?locations=BW>. Accessed 13 Aug 2018.

"Unemployment, Youth Total (% Of Total Labor Force Ages 15-24) (Modeled ILO Estimate) | Data". Data.Worldbank.Org, 2017, <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.UEM.1524.ZS?locations=GH>. Accessed 13 Aug 2018.

"What Is Development?". Center For Global Development, 2018, <https://www.cgdev.org/blog/what-development>. Accessed 4 Aug 2018.

E. Interviews

Asante, Kojo. Director of Policy and Advocacy Engagement of the Ghana Center for Democratic Development. Accra – Ghana, Interview, 27 July 2018.

Gyampo, Ransford. Associate Professor of Political Science and Director of the Center for European Studies, University of Ghana. Accra – Ghana, Interview, 13 July 2018.

Interview with five parents of wards, Akporman Model Basic School, Abokobi, 30 July 2018

Interview with ten pupils of Akporman Model Basic School, Abokobi, 30 July 2018.

Interview with two officials of the National Development and Planning Commission. Accra – Ghana, 20 July 2018.

Madigela, Tshenolo. Lecturer at the Department of Theology and Religious Studies, University of Botswana. Gaborone – Botswana, Interview, 19 August 2019.

Mogomotsi, Goemeone. Legal Officer, University of Botswana. Gaborone – Botswana, Interview, 27 August 2019.